Encounters
Representations of the Others in Modern European History

Edited by MADELEINE HURD
Encounters

Representations of the Others in Modern European History

Edited by Madeleine Hurd

Södertörns högskola 2003
Table of Contents

*Madeleine Hurd*
Introduction ................................................................. 5

*Madeleine Hurd*
Masculine Spirit, Feminine Flesh:
Women as Objects of Newspaper Gaze ................................. 19

*Christian Widholm*
Encounters with Masculinity:
The Display of Self and Others at the 1893 Chicago World Fair....... 53

*Alexander Cavalieratos*
Encountering Palestine: Swedish Pilgrim-Tourists between
Orientalism and the Bible .................................................. 91

*Sanjin Kovacevic*
East Meets the East in Swedish Media’s Afghanistan ................. 133

*Kerstin Olofsson*
The Russian Intelligentsia in Focus .................................... 161

*Kajsa Klein*
World Wide Web Encounters with the Eastern Other:
From Shock to Post-Post-Communism .................................. 187
Acknowledgements

This book is a product of the academic world of Södertörns högskola – in work done by researchers, teachers, and students. I would like to thank those who have helped the book take form. First, of course, the contributors, with all of whom I have worked in different ways, and from all of whom I have learnt a lot. Second, I am grateful for the support of my co-researchers in the Östersjöfond-funded project Media Societies Around the Baltic Sea (two of whom have contributed to this volume). Third, my teaching colleagues, who have helped create the seminars in which the three student essays included here were produced – Lars Björlin, Robert Sandberg, and Lisa Öberg. All have been helpful in introducing discourse analysis into the C-level of history teaching at Södertörn. Special thanks to Robert, for his openness for new theories, and warmth of heart during difficulties. I also owe thanks to the C-level students of 2001 and 2002, who were willing to listen to, work through, and discuss various aspects of Cultural Studies’ social and linguistic philosophy, and its applicability (if any) to historical research. Finally, I want to express my gratitude towards the Södertörn history department as a whole – its supportive and creative collegial atmosphere – and, in particular, to Department Chair Christine Bladh, whose careful and caring attention for her colleagues makes possible both the department’s high research productivity and its dedication to teaching.
Encounters is the key word in this anthology, which consists of studies exploring the connection between identity and difference. Each documents an encounter with an Other, ranging from disembodied male readers encountering fictional females to World Fair visitors observing the ”primitive”, Swedish travellers writing about Palestinians, Western newspapers conceptualising Afghanistan, Russian intellectuals meeting the masses, and web-site tourists visiting the Baltic. The articles use these encounters to ask basic questions about identity: how is the encountered group described, and what does this description say about the observer and, by implication, the cultural group and discourse which the observer represents?

Encounters and Identity
Sketching historical actors’ encounters with various others is, in fact, a fruitful way to understand identity. For identity is constructed, not least in contradistinction to “those who are unlike us”. This aspect is stressed in recent thinking about historical identities, as the idea that (for instance) class or ethnic identities are given – the one by the means of production, the other by language and history – has been increasingly challenged. Identities are no longer seen as inherent, inherited, or “natural”. Not least local studies have indicated the discrepancies between the ”objective” class identity of, say, a nineteenth-century male worker, and his own perception of his identity. Similar disparities appear between the “natural” patriotism expected of a historical group, and its demonstrated allegiances. The last few decades have, indeed, witnessed a slaughter of those “objective” (often, quantifiable) classifications which were once so useful in helping the historian sort his or her historical actors, neatly,
into inherently oppositional classes, warring nations, or active versus not-yet-awoken ethnic minorities.

Increasingly, instead, historians are turning to history, culture, and language in order to understand the construction of identity. Not that history, culture, or language pre-determine identity. Identity is, rather, constructed through history, culture, and language; while, simultaneously, history, culture and language are used to express identity. This has shifted much of the historian’s focus to how historical actors themselves formulated and perceived their identities; which has meant an increasing emphasis on a historical understanding of media, symbols, and discourse.²

Much of focus is, moreover, on definitions of differences. When people share history, culture, language, and other important symbols, they can be said to constitute a common group, to share a discourse of common identity. The members’ discourses of identity deal, however, not only with who they are, but also — implicitly or explicitly — with who the others are; with differences, margins, and borderlines. Or, to use the language of discourse analysis: we organize our conceptual maps by categorizing things (including our group, and other groups) into “similar” and “dissimilar” — on the one hand, finding sets of correspondences and, on the other, finding oppositions and contrast. Thus, masculine is associated with a number of linked attributes (strength, initiative, rationality, soldiering); but it is also very much defined by its immediate opposite, feminine, and its linked attributes (weakness, passivity, irrationality, motherhood). Similarly, being Swedish may be, perhaps, linked to being democratic, secular, modern and egalitarian; but it is also opposed to the immigrants, who are (supposedly) authoritarian, tradition-bound, religious and patriarchal. According to critical theory, such polarities are seldom neutral. They are usually connected to a system of hierarchical power relations. The pairs linked in opposition – Men vs. Women, Westerner vs. Easterner, Normal Heterosexual vs. Homosexual – are unsymmetrical. One category has more power (in terms of both resources, and culture and language) than the other: White People vs. Black People, Adults vs. Children, etc.³

The power invested in these polarizations, as constitutive of identities, helps explain their obdurate staying-power. They can defy “realities” — anti-Semitism, the fear of homosexuals, and racism, for instance, survive

² “[I]dentities are about questions of using the resources of history, language, and culture in the process of becoming rather than being /…/ Precisely because identities are constructed within, not outside discourse, we need to understand them as produced in specific historical and institutional sites within specific discursive formations and practices, by specific enunciative strategies.” Stuart Hall,” Who needs identity” in Questions of Identity, eds. Stuart Hall and Paul du Gay (London: 1996), 3-4.

³ This can mean power over resources, but also, very much, power over meaning: one group usually has more control of media, schools, the definitions of “truth”, etc.; see Gramsci or Foucault for definitions of hegemony and paradigms of truth.
independently of people’s experiences of, say, actual Jews, gays or blacks; they are equally defiant of the arguments, otherwise venerated, of scholarly or scientific authority. They can survive even the disappearance of the group disliked. All this, alas, is understandable, for anti-Semitism, homophobia and racism are integral to the self-perception, the perceived group-belonging, the chains of correspondences that make up the identity of the anti-Semite, homophobe and racist him- or herself. To surrender the prejudice would involve a fundamental and unwelcome dislocation of self.

Nonetheless, identities (like language, culture, and history) are in flux; and they can be drastically destabilized. All meanings are negotiated and pluralistic; they can be modified by active opposition. Blacks, gays and Jews have aggressively challenged the meanings imposed upon them. “Black is beautiful”, the celebration of the term “queer”, the presentation of Jews as sympathetic “fiddlers on the roof” – all can be seen as attempts (more or less successful) to destabilize polarities by challenging the meanings read into the older, hierarchical categorizations of us and others, good and bad. Academics contribute to this political battle in their own minor way, by charting how certain polarities have arisen, spread, and gained dominance; by creating maps, so to speak, of various discourses of prejudice, their chains of correspondences and polarities. The most famous discourse historian is, perhaps, Michel Foucault; while Nancy Fraser and Edward Said are among the most politically significant in the Anglo-Saxon world. These and other luminaries have inspired, and are complemented by, work done in universities throughout the world; in studies that apply, amplify and nuance their findings. This anthology is part of that work.

The West and Its Others

Much of this anthology is particularly concerned with a specific set of stereotypical polarities: the West and its Others. Thus, a World Fair can be analysed according to the Western display of “primitive” peoples; travel accounts betray a Western, Orientalist view of “the Arab”; Swedish newspapers see only timeless fanaticism in the Afghan rebel; modern Western websites define the East as a suitable place for “shock tourism”. In each, of course, additional questions arise, often illustrating the potential instability of the polarities implied: the extent to which the World Fair was simultaneously a display of different types of Western masculinity; the way in which Swedish travel accounts nuance our understanding of Orientalism; the analysis of how newspapers deal with the invasion of Afghanistan by another Easterner, the Russian; or the manner by which travel websites, by nature both regional and global, create new methods of defining both normal and Other.

But not all studies of the West and its Others must concentrate on a Western representation of a non-Western object. The discourse about the Eastern or foreign Other also influences discourses within and outside the West. The
ideals of the West have often, for various reasons (often, having to do with power over technology, economic resources, and formal education) been internalised by elites in non-Western countries. It could be argued that so powerful has been the discursive, political and military hegemony of the West that many non-Westerners have accepted Western tutelage in how to “advance” and “progress”, according to Western visions of science, democracy and capitalism. Thus, studies of, say, Russian intellectuals, discover tensions that mirror Western discourse on the Orient; in, for instance, the examination of the tension between the rational, progressive, abstract thinker and the essentially Russian but often violent and ignorant masses.

The polarization of the West and the Other has, of course, also affected internal Western discourse. The perceived differences between West and Orient have been influenced by, and borrowed aspects of, locally constructed oppositions between male and female, spirit and body, rationality and emotion, entrepreneurship and passivity. Thus, the celebration of the Western male’s rational, logical, and self-disciplined project of dominating and teaching non-Western peoples is linked to his equally important, patriarchal project of dominance over females and children. The Western Others were, thus, to be found at home – in the opposition between the rational male and irrational female, or the autonomous, self-disciplined middle-classes versus the infantile, hard-drinking, and superstitious workers. Hence, to trace the “normal” Westerner’s relationship to his local others – the female, the poor, the insane – is to further explore and understand the construction of the West, and its Others.

Discourses, in short, overlap, shift, and mirror each other. One interesting result of this is the mapping of the comparative degree to which the less powerful (“subaltern”) group can actually break altogether free of the terms of the discriminatory discourse which so consistently degrades it. In general, historians have found that opposition on completely new terms is rare. One tends, rather, to continue to speak – even in opposition – in the terms imposed by those with power. This is understandable. They are often the only terms around that are acknowledged to “make sense” – to oppose excessive police violence in the language of, say, medieval Christianity would not be effective. Further, so much might these terms of discourse make sense that they might, in fact, not be seen as elements of ideology at all; they would be unnoticed, “common sense”, simply true. Finally, those in opposition may agree with their oppressors in many things – everything, indeed, except for their own oppression. They would therefore not want to jettison their oppressors’ entire world of meanings.

There are untold historical examples of this. Feminists have sought liberation by becoming “like men”; this was the only language they found to voice their opposition, and besides, many agreed with many so-called “male” values. Colonized intellectuals have embraced the civilizational ideals of their colonizers, using the very language of civilization against their oppressors.
Those who celebrated the liberal “public sphere” (as described by Habermas) conceived of its discourse as rational, individualized, autonomous, wholly based on natural laws and on the force of intelligent argument. They neither could nor did see that liberal discourse was deeply influenced by the tropes, expressions, prejudices and norms of the Ancien Regime – down to the public performance of ceremonies and rituals of power. Socialist working-class identities similarly incorporated elements of the bourgeois discourse they were supposed to oppose and despise. Nineteenth-century workers were discriminated against for being unruly, drunken, impolite and unchivalrous; many fought back by presenting a ‘respectable’ (skötsam) public persona. The terms of their resistance was, in this as other cases, framed by the dominant, oppressing discourse. Nonetheless, their resistance affected the dominant paradigm, and often led to something altogether new; as critical theorists remind us, resistance is a motor of historical change.

**Discourse as Community and Form**

Discourses do not exist independently of actors. It makes sense, rather – as evident in the examples discussed above – to treat the discursive negotiation of identity as group projects. The groups are defined by their shared prejudices, meanings, and cultural codes. One could call such groups “discourse communities”. Robert Wuthnow uses this term in his study of the networks of discourse-producers who promoted the Reformation, the Enlightenment, and early socialism. Similar international discourse communities were formed by the publicists who discussed, formulated, and communicated varieties of liberal, national, socialist, or gender identities.

Such international communities created and influenced many of the identities discussed in this anthology. When Swedes traveled to Palestine, for instance, they were influenced by an international discourse community – that of European Orientalism, as propagated, not least, in travel guides. When books on housewifery celebrated the woman’s civilizing mission, this, also, could be seen as participating in an international, separatist-feminist community of discourse. Similarly, Prussian newspapers’ peculiar and

---


particular treatment of women, as excluded from the world of rational-critical debate, reflected a discourse community of liberal newspaper politicians, readers and writers.

Both the personnel, content, relevance and impact of discourse communities change, of course, over time. Power relationships shift; paradigms of knowledge and truth replace each other. This is due to more than resistance. One of the most important causes of change lies in changes in the means available for discursive communication, i.e., changes in the forms of mass communication (the rise of “print capitalism”, charted by Benedict Anderson, being only the most famous example). The Catholic priests who commanded Latin, and, hence, the European-wide language of power, constituted a very different type of discourse community than that provided by, say, the consumers of a modern web site.

It is, accordingly, essential, when looking at changing discourses and discursive communities, to pay attention to available genres and forms of communication – that is, to media. The media’s formation of identities is, thus, complex and multi-layered. First, media is an expression, and reinforces the identities of, the politicians, spokespersons, publicists and intellectuals who (often) constitute its immediate producers. Media further creates and upholds identities among its consumers, as a group. It is, of course, also part of a social context: it reflects identities extant in society, and must speak to, or challenge, the dominant discourses. And, finally, media’s genres and forms frame and influence the identities thus challenged, upheld, and created.

The medium, in short, influences the message. However banal, this tenet remains fundamental to research on identity. Identity is formulated in symbols that are spoken, written, read, and performed – in sort, communicated. Hence, it is important to notice changes in how identities are communicated; for these influence how identities are formulated. It also influences their reception; MTV encourages a very different type of group identification than did, say, nineteenth-century Marxist pamphlets. One must, therefore, be sensitive to the forms by which identities are formulated, organized, encapsulated, and communicated.

Media’s multi-faceted role is emphasized in Anderson’s seminal work, in which the nation, as an imagined community, is unthinkable without print capitalism. Anderson’s study emphasizes the new print medium, the book. By the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, mass-produced printed texts were the predominant form of community discourse; books, newspapers, and pamphlets underlay much of group consciousness. The printed travel-guide,

---

8 Ibid.
which had long helped define imaginary geographies and, hence, the identity of the West, reached its apogee around 1900; while the advent of the daily newspaper had already created a new liberal power, one which allowed its imaginary community to unite, in a single gaze, all relevant political speech, action, and behaviour. A century later, print is under serious attack. Russian intellectuals are sorely hurt by the devaluation of so-called thick journals, in preference to Western-style commercial publications and, above all, television. Web-sites, finally, create new weapons for both defining the abnormal in, and enforcing globalised normality on far-off foreign places. Thus, to the discomfort of text-prefering historians, students of identity must follow Cultural Studies and New Cultural History in widening the scope of study: to include pictures in popular magazines, statues, parades, soap-operas, museums, advertising.\(^9\) It is challenging, to be sure, to look at the community of discourse (of producers, and consumers) propagated by a statue; but this, too, is an expression, and upholder, of modern identities.

Each of the present authors is careful, accordingly, explicitly or implicitly to consider the nature of the media analysed – its genres, structures, and strategies of communication – and their influence on the construction of identities. Each form has its own internal logics. World Fairs were meant to categorize, encapsulate, and symbolize. They exist in a context of visitors, entertainment, and political statements; discursively, they survive in maps, newspaper commentary and pictorial guides. Travel guides have a given form, which strongly influence travel accounts. They are supposed to start with arrival, continue with street encounters, tell of encounters with beggars, waiters, and porters, and not least, describe (and rank the view of) monuments, buildings and towns. Tourist Web sites, likewise, are often assumed to be interactive; the user decides on which of their links to click, and thus co-determines their context.\(^10\) Mass media thus gives us a picture of group identity; it reproduces

---

10 Of course, each can only give a sampling of the productions of its discourse community; one Prussian newspaper can scarcely represent the entire discourse of liberal sexism, just as one World Fair cannot be taken as “typical” for all Western masculinities, or four travel accounts for Western travel literature in general. Only when the history of discursive identities has been as thoroughly studied as has, say, the history of politics, will we be able to pass final judgement on these case studies’ “representative” value. But they can, in the meantime, provide interesting examples, which can, in their turn, function as working hypotheses; and thus be used for further work in testing, elaborating, or disproving existing generalizations about identities.
and portrays its various expressions. But this picture is complicated and enriched by the fact that the medium itself influences the expression of identity.11

The Contributions

My own essay, accordingly, puts its study of gender identities into the context of the way in which nineteenth-century liberal newspapers functioned as a medium – one anchored in middle-class, masculine forms of communication. It also assumes that certain newspapers participated in the discourse community of a larger, liberal public sphere. This sphere, I postulate, although supposedly open to all, had definite exclusions. It excluded women; females were not seen as legitimate public participants. It also excluded criminals, drunkards, beggars, certain ethnic minorities, and royalty. None of these were really welcome in the world of public, political debate.

These exclusions were linked to forms of communication, which in turn influenced the norms of journalistic reporting. The “normal” reader, the accepted discussant, was – according to these norms – quite disembodied. He (almost always a male) was covered as a voice, not an object to be seen. Long-winded political discussions formed the bulk of the newspaper’s material – summarized or quoted, word-by-word. This left room for only passing references to the news of the gross, material world. It was to the latter, however, that women were relegated. The sphere of words, argument and reason was all-male; women only appeared in other types of news, discussed with another type of language. In what news, in what language, and in what company, is the subject of my analysis, in an attempt to find out how this particular encounter – male with female, spirit with body – was structured.

Christian Widholm’s article deals with a different set of statements – the geography, architecture, monuments and human exhibits of the Chicago World Fair of 1893. He uses contemporary texts to do this, while not neglecting the world-view presented by the texts themselves. He turns the map of the Fair into a map of contemporary humanity: we progress from the primitive, ethnic and childish, through the feminine, civilizing, and small-scale, in order to end in that apogee of triumphant rational-Western Americanism: “White City”. Widholm is primarily interested in how, and in what ways, the different parts of the World Fair presented masculinity – the way in which different types of masculinity (primitive, Orientalist, Western, non-female) were to be met with, in different forms, as one read about or experienced the Fair. But how powerful and hegemonic were these statements? Were there internal inconsistencies; might, indeed, a “native” on live display as “primitive” be using the Fair for a statement of opposition?

The visitors studied by Alexander Cavalieratos are of a very different sort: Swedish “pilgrim-tourists” wandering about Palestine. He is studying the genre of travel-writing, and has chosen four travel books from the nineteen-teens. If
Widholm is primarily interested in testing various theses about the constitution of masculine identities on the World Fair. Cavalieratos is interested in seeing if Swedish pilgrim-tourists conformed to the patterns of Orientalist “us” and “them” identities described by Edward Said (among others). He finds significant similarities; but also important deviations. Prejudices were not simple. On the one hand, for instance, the Orient was – in accordance with Said’s thesis – seen as stagnant, passive, and timeless; but, on the other, it presented an Arcadian, Biblical world of ancient simplicity which the travellers enjoyed, indeed hoped for and expected. One must consider the influence of the *Biblical paradigm*, Cavalieratos concludes, in judging these travellers’ Orientalism; a conclusion that raises questions about how further careful consideration of various types of travel literature might nuance Said’s model of Western contra Eastern identities.

Sanjin Kovacevic is also studying Orientalism, but in a very different context – the year is 1980, and the subject Russia’s invasion of Afghanistan. He has used two Swedish tabloids to chart the stereotypes applied to the actors: the Afghan rebel, the “Westernised” Afghan, the “Sovietized” Oriental, and the Soviets themselves. He finds that certain gradations apply. The Afghan rebel, for instance, is seen as a hypermasculine, rifle-bearing, wild and romantic Oriental; but his masculinity gives way to that of the steel-encased Russians, who, in massive formation, and accompanied by large numbers of high-technology weapons, manage to “rape” Afghanistan. These Russians are more modern, more recognizably like us, than the Afghan rebels; but still they are not Western. They are brutal but laughable, Easterners trying to imitate their betters – their representatives dress with out-moded flashiness, resembling ice-hockey players of the 1950s. A similar middle position is occupied by the Afghan President Babrak Karmal, and “Anahita”, his Minister of Education. They wear Western clothes, and are much more modern than the Afghan rebels; but they are also lovers, adulterers, nepotists, even slightly incestuous (their children have married each other). Their “embodiment” – indeed, the aggressive embodiment of all the actors, from the “hawk-profiled” rebels to the “blue-eyed” Russians – show their distance from the community of normal, Western, Swedish newspaper readers and writers.

Kerstin Olofsson’s case study of the Russian intellectual Vladimir Makanin’s book *Escape Hatch* analyses the current – or is it century-long? – crisis of identity among Russian intelligentsia. The group is torn, as she describes it, between being pro- or anti-West, international or nationalist, self-hating or self-celebratory. Throughout, however, despite constant research, critique, and discussion of themselves, they have difficulties defining what the intellectual *is* – which redounds on the question of what his or her role is or has been, historically, and at present. During the Soviet Era, with its veneration of the Word (the object of censorship, underground publishing, and reading-between-the-lines), the answer seemed relatively clear: the intellectual would
present the truth, and the nation and its people would be guided accordingly. During the 1990s, however, this mission became dim, and the discussion of the responsibility, influence, mission and identity of the intellectual reverted to a state of confusion reminiscent of the debates preceding World War One. In Makanin’s book, we find similar ambivalence. On the one hand, we have a clear differentiation – reminiscent of Ortega y Gasset’s – between the masses (bad), and the intellectuals (good). On the other hand, however, only the masses breathe real air and are healthy, and only he who can pass between the two worlds can hope to save either. Thus, the encounter between the intellectual and the masses continues to pose a central problem for the identity of the Russian intelligentsia.

Kajsa Klein rounds off the anthology with a comparative analysis of three websites, dating from the fall of 1999. Each site deals with the Baltic Sea region, especially the newly-accessible East. She is interested in tracing these sites’ contribution to the continuing dialectic between regional and global identity, earthly and cyber geography. She finds evidence of region-building (with the site producers, not surprisingly, situated at the new “region’s” center) and of traditional, Orientalist, West-East divides (where the West constructs the East as “shocking”, an object of “shock tourism”). When the East is not “shocking”, it is the object of a “project mentality” – the target of Western exports of, for instance, models of folk-movement based democracy, or Western standards of the hospitality industry. But Klein also finds evidence of the normalization of post-post-communism. As the West’s imagined geography of the East loses its blank spaces, so does the “shock” value of the East decline. The websites help fill these blanks. They include the East in global, media-directed scrutiny and shaming. They also contribute to the penetration of global discourses, symbols, systems and institutions (the English language, neoliberal phraseology, the provision of “phone books”, the systematization and publication of investment and purchase opportunities, the creation of Western-style business and institutional networks, etc.). The websites can thus be used to trace the East’s transition from “shocking”, the object of paternalistic care, to more “normal” – although Klein is a bit wary of defining what “normal” might be.

These articles’ common focus on encounters is not coincidental. They were not produced by a single workgroup or project, but they appeared within a shared context. Three of the articles, including my own, were written within the Östersjöstiftelse project Media Identities around the Baltic Sea. This project has been largely concerned with discourse and identity within mass media; its geographical focus has been Scandinavia, Germany, the Baltic nations, Poland and Russia. The remaining articles are the work of outstanding Södertörn students, writing C- and D-essays under the advisorship of myself, on the same themes of discourse, identity, and East-West differences. Tom Olsson and I hope in our next, proposed Östersjöstiftelse project – “Creating Citizens,
Communities, Outcasts and Heroes: Mediated Identities around the Baltic Sea” – to further the same fruitful symbiosis between teachers and students, in the hopes that a continued combination of scholarly research and student guidance will encourage and inspire both ourselves and a future generation of scholars who, as is only proper, bid fair to outdistance their mentors.
Bibliography

See also article bibliographies.


Andersson, Lars M., En jude är en jude är en jude... Representationer av ”juden” i svensk skämtpress omkring 1900–1930. Lund: Nordic Acameic Press, 2000


—. The Location of Culture. London and New York; Routledge, 1994


Dahlgren, Peter, and Colin Sparks, eds. Communication and Citizenship: Journalism and the Public Sphere in the New Media Age. London: Routledge, 1991


Foucault, Michel, *Diskursens ordning*. Stockholm/Stehag: Symposion, 1993


——. *Nation and Nationalism Since 1780*. Cambridge: Cambridge U Press, 1990


Larsson, Jan, _Hemmet vi ärvde: Om folkhemmet, identiteten och den gemensamma framtiden_. Stockholm: Arena, 1994


—. _The image of man – the creation of modern masculinity_. Oxford: Oxford University, 1996

Peters, John Durham, ”Distrust of Representation: Habermas on the Public Sphere.” _Media, Culture & Society_ 15 (October 1993): 541-71


Siltanen, Janet, and Michelle Stanworth, eds. _Women and the Public Sphere: a Critique of Sociology and Politics_. New York: St. Martin’s Press, 1984


Walzer, Michael, _On Toleration_. Yale: Yale Univ. Press, 1997

White, Hayden, _The Historical Imagination in Nineteenth-Century Europe_. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins Univ. Press, 1973

Wuthnow, Robert, _Communities of Discourse: Ideology and Social Structure in the Reformation, the Enlightenment, and European Socialism_. Cambridge, Mass./London: Harvard University Press, 1989
Masculie spirit, Feminine Flesh: 
Women as Objects of Newspaper Gaze

MADELEINE HURD

We have heard a lot about the body recently. The history of the body, once seen as a purely anthropological concern, is now used to help us understand the construction of insiders and outsiders, stereotypes, polarized differences and infringed boundaries – that is, much of the history of gender identity. In this article, I will investigate the gender implications of media’s treatment of the body. My specific examples are culled from my current study of pre-war Prussian media; but, as I shall indicate, the implications reach into modern media politics.

My analysis uses the body to juxtapose two worlds. One is abstract, masculine, and public; the other is embodied, feminine, and private. The first, I argue, belongs to the world of political media – the (supposedly) rational-critical editors, journalists, and reading public. The second belongs to the feminized, irrational, embodied world that is defined as belonging outside this self-constituted group of active, responsible citizens.

Many of these polarities were established during the Enlightenment. As has often been pointed out, Enlightenment thinkers gave men and women separate natures, and assigned them, accordingly, to separate spheres – men to the public, women to the private. The revolutionaries quickly established a political and legal apparatus that excluded women from public life. The attack on public women was, as Carole Pateman, Dorinda Outram, and others have argued, part of the backlash against the Ancien Régime politics of noble patronage, family, and status; a manly republic of equals was to replace the woman-dominated back-stairs and bedroom intrigues, the over-civilized salons and gallant flirtations, that supposedly made and unmade the fate of nations during the bad, old days of noble privilege.¹ As Jean-Jacques Rousseau so convincingly argued, the path forward was a return to a more natural order of things: and nature meant “woman” to be home. Her recent invasion of the political sphere had perverted both it, and her. Politics had become over-civilized, over-sexualized, and unmasculine; while woman, far removed from

her proper sphere of home and family, had lost her feminine essence. The result was a long, but ultimately successful, process of exclusion of women from open participation in politics. As the horrific account of the trial and execution of Marie Antoinette demonstrates, this attack on public women could be accompanied by public hysteria about how publicly active women actually *perverted* the state: the queen’s prosecutor joined scurrilous Parisian newspapers in juicy descriptions of the national threat posed by the queen’s bodily lusts, her sexual monstrosity.2

Media was affected by this division between public and private, for newspapers were given a special role in the new political republic. The media were part of a four-fold liberal vision. First, liberals fought for universal, secular education, which would endow its students with autonomy, reason, and true scientific knowledge.3 This education would enable men to exploit the liberal economic system, which, free of patronage, guilds, and restrictive privilege, provided equal opportunity to prosper. These men would also be educated and independent participants in representative government, where they would meet their equals (for privilege of family and birth was to be abolished) in well-informed and disinterested discussion of the common good. All this, finally, presupposed freedom of speech and association; for just as labor-market competition rewarded the most talented and hard-working, so would competition in the market-place of ideas make evident the best arguments, the most rational truths.

This public discussion, of course, presupposed a public vehicle – print media. The political newspaper, with its self-declared mission of providing a forum for rational, well-informed discussion of public concerns, was born about the same time, and in the same spirit, as the ideal of the new republic. Media retained its essential role throughout the nineteenth century, as liberal economic, social and political reformers continued the European-wide struggle against “reaction”. Newspapers were one of their main weapons; in this respect, liberals long remained superior to conservatives. This powerful liberal media was – like the liberals’ education, labor market, and government – inherently male.

---


3 Much could, and has, been written about the gendering of this “universal” education. On the one hand, only boys really needed it, since only they were active citizens. But what about the mothers – surely they had to be able to teach the boys the facts of public life? The latter argument was soon picked up by advocates of women’s education, and was one of the more powerful arguments for training women, as well, in the tenets of active citizenship.
These are the newspapers investigated in this article. Liberal, political newspapers were, of course, not the only media available; their competition ranged from scandalous penny-dreadfuls to the high-toned publications of churchmen. They were, however, among the most successful, for they had a ready-made audience of self-consciously liberal bourgeoisie, voluntary associations, “folk movements” and political parties. This liberal media also set the norms for the modern conception of what newspapers should do – a set of norms with impressive staying power. The discussion of how well media fulfills its liberal norms has survived to the current day, as media theorists join their Enlightenment forebears in coupling well-functioning, liberal-type media to the well-being of liberal citizenship. The media, then as now, is supposed to investigate, publicize, and inform; for the active citizen needs relevant information. How well does it do this? What facts, events, or processes are reported; and how does the choice of facts, the framing of the narratives, affect the information provided? Media, further, is supposed to provide an open forum for citizens’ objective, rational discussion. But is this discussion truly open to all comers? Are not certain groups excluded? If so, how is this done – by what rhetoric, slant, or unstated assumptions are the exclusions “naturalized”? In short, how does media contribute to creating an “in-group” of competent, normal political citizens, while putting others – say, women, the homeless, or invandrare – outside? And to what extent (one might continue) do such exclusions derive from, and reflect, implicit, and age-old, liberal assumptions about the gender of the public sphere?4

These are the questions I examine here, through a case study of a single, quintessentially liberal nineteenth-century newspaper. The Danziger Zeitung, the durable voice of that West Prussian harbor city, was founded and edited by Heinrich Rickert, a long-time leader of Germany’s left-liberal parties. Like most harbor-city newspapers, it defended secularism, free trade and parliamentary democracy, advocated peaceful, noncompetitive international relations, disliked Russia and admired New York and London, and was thus to the oppositional left of the Berlin government. It was very dull. Its refusal to indulge in political polemic, scandal, or patriotic exhortations, and its late, reluctant and sparse use of humor, literature and satire, coupled with its full-page, meticulous accounts of associational, party and legal doings – the activities, in short, of the liberal political sphere – made it a model liberal newspaper. In this article, I concentrate on an in-depth study of several weeks in 1862 and 1902 (using the “tableaux” methodology developed by Tom Olsson and Jan Ekecrantz).5 My assumption is that the public sphere, together

---

4 For a collection of such analyses, see Madeleine Hurd, Tom Olsson and Patrik Åker, eds., Storylines: Media and Power in Modern Europe (Stockholm: Hjalmarsön & Högberg, 2002).
5 For a sample of this method, see Tom Olsson, “The Right to Talk Politics in Swedish Journalism, 1925-1995”, in Storylines, op.cit.
with liberal, political media, were reserved to men. Given this, how did the Danziger deal with women – those quintessentially private persons? Where did they appear, and in which guise? What sort of company did they keep? Did their treatment resemble that of other “suspect” groups – ethnic minorities, criminals, drunkards?

Readers who would like an idea of the newspaper’s format might give Appendices I and II a glance. These provide translated summaries of two sample newspapers, which may prove useful in negotiating the discussion that follows.

Charting the Liberal Public Sphere in 1862

The first thing that strikes one about the Danziger of October 1–7, 1862 is the extensive space given to public debates and speeches – the newspaper consists, primarily, of pages of painstaking, verbatim, speaker-by-speaker accounts of state, parliamentary, city council, and associational debates. This coverage often constitutes more than 50% of the newspaper – a single Landtag debate might take up an entire newspaper page, in an edition (morning or evening) consisting of 4 to 6 pages. The remainder of the newspaper consists of extensive quotes from pamphlets, official laws, and parliamentary findings; “telegraphic dépêches”, coverage of stock market, shipping and financial facts; short notices of public doings and events; and a last page of advertisements. But mostly, it is debate.

This is a newspaper, in short, that celebrates public speech. It is, moreover, the speech, not the speakers, that matters. This is not a world of media personalities. The speakers remain undescribed; the extensive accounts of debates give no debater more than his title and last name. To be sure, an audience can be recorded as showing “amusement” or interjecting “Hear!”, but the speakers themselves remain abstract. One receives no impression of their age, social standing, appearance, or behavior; the debaters’ political careers, future and past, are passed over in silence. The provision – so popular today – of “candid” observations of unguarded moments, manners of speech, public appearance, at-home descriptions, mention of personal background, family or home, are altogether lacking. Nor are there any pictures in the newspaper, except among the advertisements. The speakers, despite the fact that they are all, obviously and implicitly, male, are disembodied.

This abstraction of speakers is continued by the newspaper’s editors and journalists. No articles are signed; editorial comments are indirect and

---

6 Danziger Zeitung, 1 October 1862, evening edition, e.g., “Landstags-Verhandlungen”.
8 See ibid., editorial, “Berlin, 30 Sept.”
interjected. The editors prefer, indeed, to allow their opinions to appear by quoting what other newspapers have to say about this-or-that event, law or debate.\footnote{E.g., \textit{Danziger Zeitung}, 2 October, 1862, morning edition, commentaries on “Die deutsche Abgeordnete-Versammlung in Weimar”.
} This was taking disembodied public discussion a step further: invisible parliamentary speakers were complemented by the disembodied voices of print. If one is to believe the \textit{Danziger}; in short, the liberal public sphere performed as it should: arguments, not persons, are what matter.

Nonetheless, the \textit{Danziger} seems to be closely associated with the persons and associations whose words it reports, and on familiar terms with its readers. The editor remarks, cozily, that “We will report more, later, about the eventual outcome of this, as well as other matters.” Public actors seem familiar: notices such as “We have heard that a meeting of liberal electors will take place within the next few days” or “Representative Dr. Gneist will shortly publish a brochure on this question” betray the editors’ personal anchorage in the world thus dryly reported.\footnote{E.g., \textit{Danziger Zeitung}, 1 October, 1862, evening edition: “Wir werden über den verlauf der angelegenheit, so wie einiges andere, später berichten”; for Dr. Gneist, \textit{Danziger Zeitung}, 2 October 1862, morning edition.
} To understand this simultaneous distance and familiarity, as well as the focus on abstract (male) speakers and speech, it helps to put the liberal newspaper in its local context.

During their nineteenth-century heyday, liberal newspapers were firmly anchored in, and functioned as an extension of, a pre-existing world of associational and debating politics. Editors and journalists provided a bridge between the reader and this world of liberal urban politics. The newspaper editor was himself influential in politics, even, often, a politician; he and his staff were closely involved in local liberal associations, petitions, elections, brochures, and political parties. This is one reason why the public speeches of liberal politicians formed the core of the liberal newspaper.\footnote{For examples of how both Hamburg and Stockholm liberal newspapers conformed to this pattern, see Madeleine Hurd, \textit{Public Spheres, Public Mores, and Democracy: Hamburg and Stockholm, 1870–1914} (Anne Arbor: Univ. of Michigan Press, 2000).
}

This political environment not only influenced the newspapers’ subject matter; it also affected their form. First, of course, it mirrored a world that was “naturally” male. But second, it reflected a world whose participants consciously celebrated the preeminent importance of gentlemanly verbal exchange. Neither high birth, good looks, fine clothes, nor other bodily signifiers of status, wealth, or power, were to pollute this world of spoken (male) reason. Such things belonged to the old, outmoded, world of aristocratic and royal rule. For liberals, it was words, not persons, that mattered.

Let me illustrate this with a quote from an earlier and funnier newspaper, written at the inception of the Prussian public sphere. Danzig’s \textit{Der Krakehler}
(The Trouble-Maker) appeared in 1848, a time when a sudden lift of censorship encouraged a plethora of new left-wing, anti-authoritarian newspapers. Der Krakehler was a self-consciously pioneer attempt to create a Danzig and Prussian political public sphere. It used broad satire to define its audience and supporters. In one issue, the editor gives a long list of those who were no friends of the newspaper. These included the bureaucrat, who thinks that he, like a god, commands the world by raising an eyebrow; the “Stockphilister,” with his highly-beloved Nachtmüsse, whose thoughts are only on the next card game. The newspapers’ friends, by contrast, participate with eagerness and engagement in the (newspaper-dependent) public sphere. “Around tables laden with newspapers /.../ sit men and youths, powerful forms full of life and spirit.” These men speak with passion and spirit; but “if sometimes the bounds of the parliamentary are breached, this spirit still willingly immediately gives way to the opinion of the friend, when recognized as superior.” The debate goes unfailingly on: “all the questions of the present are handled without preconceptions, and spirit and wit make the hours into minutes.”

The Krakehler is celebrating male, middle-class norms of language and interaction. Its manly conversationalists, however impassioned, argue as equals, without preconceptions, always ready to acknowledge superior reasoning; and although they may occasionally breach them, they acknowledge the bounds of the parliamentary. These all-male, middle-class, liberal norms of communication have been carried over into the liberal newspapers. It is important to note that these debaters – unlike the eyebrow-raising bureaucrat and the nightcap-loving philistine – are more or less disembodied; they are “forms”, “powerful”, with “life and spirit”. What is important is the discussion, the spirit of open, nonprejudiced, friendly debate. Their clothing, appearance, and body are invisible; they have no age, class, ethnicity, or family.

This fits with the universalism of the liberal public sphere; men were to be judged by their arguments, not by their relative looks, status, family connections, or wealth. To mention any of this, or to bring up any symbolic representations thereof in clothing, fashion, or possessions, would mar the world of liberal debate. Such things belonged to the alternative, bad, old “representative publicness” of the Ancien Régime – when Kings displayed themselves to the multitude and aristocrats competed in finery and lace, when a gesture or a shoe-ribbon meant more than the logic and force of one’s arguments. This was all to be condemned. Those who chose to join these

12 Der Krakehler, 17 June 1848. For further discussion, see Hurd, „Reasonable Speakers, Those Who Can’t Talk“, in Storylines, op.cit.

13 Newspapers that deviate from this disembodied ideal were publicly chastized: public figures are to be judged on their words, not their appearance or private lives. The Krakehler took its contemporary, Die Wogen der Zeit, to task for “daring” to discuss “not only the public, but even the private lives of generally respected persons”. Der Krakehler, 17 June, 1848.
“powerful forms” in debate would have, so to speak, to abandon such illicit means of influence – in short, abandon their bodies. But did all people have this option? What about women?

Women do not appear, in 1862, in the Danziger’s accounts of abstract speech; they seem to be irrelevant to liberal, abstract debate. But they are not altogether banished. They have no place, of course, in the extensive, dry “business section” – which consists primarily of lists of changes and movements in stocks, prices, goods, and finances. Similarly, only males appear in the notices of recent political appointments, visits and deaths. The short reports of Berlin horse-races are equally free of females. But they do appear in other, less central parts of the paper. They show up in the fairly long reviews of art, music, and theater; in short notices concerning police arrests and the movements of royalty; in notices of death, marriage, and engagements; and in certain advertisements.

The public circulation of art, music and theater critique had, as Jürgen Habermas pointed out, antedated the political public sphere. The language used here is very different from that of liberal politics. Actors and actresses, in both theater and opera, are given the kind of personal, detailed, critical, bodily scrutiny that is so conspicuously absent in the Danziger’s coverage of political speech. Actresses’ and singers’ voice, gestures, and general deportment are evaluated, painstakingly, in terms of their roles; their voices critiqued as too hoarse, shrill, or weak. Art, too, often seen as bearing a social or moral message, is often described in terms of the clothing, behavior, and expressions of the persons portrayed. In art, as in theater, it seems, the body still fulfilled its role as representing reality. Here, women had a place – and body.

But these are fictional women, or women portraying fictional characters. What about real women, being themselves? There is another world, besides that of art, where embodiment still seems natural: that of royalty. European royalty was still quite powerful, despite the efforts of liberal republicans; and it seems that “representational publicness”, that is, the public display and notice of royal bodies, lived on. Frequent notices on royal doings show royal men hunting, eating, playing, traveling, being rained on, and associating with women. Italian kings defy court etiquette, in order to meet their daughters at railway stations. Women even appear on their own: princesses, about to be married, receive formal congratulations from Workers’ Associations. This type of reporting survives, undiminished, for decades; it even increases. In 1902,

---

14 Danziger Zeitung, 3 October, 1862, evening edition, “Stadt-Theater”.
15 Danziger Zeitung, 4 October, 1862, evening edition, “From Berlin”. “But also the two boys who are sitting on the floor [in the painting] are true types of the Polish-Semitic race”, etc.
16 Father to railway station: Danziger Zeitung, 3 October, 1862, evening edition; princess receiving, Danziger Zeitung, 2 October, 1862, morning edition.
for instance, the *Danziger* tells of the Belgian queen, denied – despite her piteous, death-bed laments – the sight of her banished daughter. In 1902, such notices might be further embellished by *feuilletons* describing the dramatic past of the Prussian kings. “The Flight of the Prince of Prussia” (a supposedly historical account of the revolution of 1848) tells of women getting out of bed, half-dressed, to receive the child prince from his mother; she says, stretching out both hands, “I bring you the most precious that I own”. Women, emotion, clothing, gestures, are all here. European royalty, in short, was far from being removed as an object of public scrutiny, embodiment and imagination (a picture of the Kaiser, or of the imperial family, appeared in every German classroom); “representational publicness”, the public display of royal bodies, lived on.

Embodiment, however, also seems the norm for persons on the other end of the social scale: impoverished criminals. Notices of arrests and trials also include women. Here, they keep more dubious company; the *Danziger*’s police reports mention women together with danger, illicit sexuality, drunkards, and bloody violence. The notice that tells of how the sailor Maatz was held down and branntwein poured into his eyes when he refused to join a fellow-worker for a drink, and describes the knife-stab that sent another worker, bleeding profusely, into the gutter, is followed by one mentioning the danger posed by a drunken crowd of workers to a “foreign woman”, walking along the street with her child on her arm. Other women have been arrested for stealing clothes or jewelry (the latter, which ended up with a brother, the property of a “Jewish merchant”) or for killing their out-of-wedlock babies. Women, here, keep company with Jews, drunkards, and the wounded; there is nothing abstracted here.

Marriage, engagement, birth and death notices constitute another deviation from the all-male impersonal. This is equally true of 1862 and 1902. Birth notices might give only cursory or indirect mention to women – in 1862, the mother might be altogether absent, notices being limited to lists noting “A son has been born to Herr X / A daughter has been born to Herr Y”. Sometimes, however, the women are active and in focus, in notices merely signed (prominently) by the men. On the whole, however, the women’s dynastic role is emphasized, as in the 1902 advertisement

18 Police reports from *Danziger Zeitung*, 1 October 1862, evening edition; 2 October, 1862, morning edition (*branntwein* in the eyes).
19 *Danziger Zeitung*, 4 October 1862, morning edition.
A daughter has been born to

**Dentist Fechner**

and his wife, née Mestwerdt,

on October 7, 1902.\(^{20}\)

Marriage, engagement, and death notices give women more formal treatment (they receive both first and second name). Here, indeed, as in the world of royalty, women matter. This is, again, according to a logic alien to the clear, open world of liberal publicity. We enter, here, the murky, body-infested waters of familial alliances, inheritances, and patronage that continue to surround (and undermine) the high, dry island of disembodied liberal discourse. The upper classes’ power centers remain at least partially familial, and thus a matter – quite literally – of bodies; and this allows room for women.\(^{21}\)

Women, finally, appear in advertisements. Not very many, to be sure: in 1862, the majority of advertisements address men (if one makes the – possibly sexist – assumption that the primary market for liberal newspaper subscriptions, horses and carriages, anthracite coal, large parties of turnips, insurance policies and railroad shares is male). Educational opportunities – stenography, the “Handels-Akademie” – are addressed specifically to men; so are most of the “help wanted” and “jobs sought” advertisements. Women appear on this public job market, if at all, as governesses, servants or wet nurses – dependent and familial positions. There is one exception. The pre-political public sphere of cultivated conversation and literature had survived, in Danzig, in English-speaking *salons*; here, women were still welcome. Hence, in 1862, Mrs. Taylor’s advertisement inviting participation in “an evening circle for ladies”, to learn English, in her home; as well as another invitation, for Wednesday evenings, to “ladies and gentlemen /…/ for the purposes of conversation and the reading of Shakespearean tragedies”, signed “Friedländer”.\(^{22}\) On the whole, however, women have, as yet, little part in the Danziger’s public commercial and labor-market spheres. The advertisements are quite male.\(^{23}\)

Women’s appearance in this newspaper is thus highly regulated. They take

---


\(^{21}\) One is reminded, here, of Walter Lippmann’s classic analysis of media and politics. Much of international politics, he pointed out, was decided through familial connections and private socializing; a hostess’s power over a guestlist had deep political consequences. He, also, was skeptical about the power of the liberal political sphere and its spokesperson, the media. As this analysis shows, the 1862 newspaper was not. The women, the familial, and the personal, were neatly relegated to the outside; the liberal public sphere belonged to the inner circle of talking men. Lippmann, *Public Opinion* (New York, 1920).

\(^{22}\) Ladies’ circle in, e.g., *Danziger Zeitung*, 4 October 1862, morning edition; Shakespeare, *Danziger Zeitung*, 3 October, 1862, evening edition.

\(^{23}\) See, e.g., *Danziger Zeitung*, 1 October, 1862, evening edition.
no part in the main business of the paper – the nation’s business, formed by argument and debate. They appear, rather, in private circles, as servants – or, if ladies, family members, cultivated and respectable; in public, either as royalty, actresses, victims or criminals. But royal, respectable or thieving, they are grouped among those without a place in the liberal public sphere; they are purely incidental to the newspaper’s main aim of presenting abstract (male) political arguments.

This focus on parliamentary debate can be understood. The year 1862 was one of great liberal parliamentary activity: Prussia’s so-called “constitutional conflict”, which would determine the balance of power between Germany’s Emperor, and the Reichstag, had just begun. The Progressive Party was mobilizing its forces, not least through its many newspapers, against Bismarck. The fact that the Danziger was edited by one of the major liberal combatants in that struggle helps explain its preoccupation with (all-male) political matters, parliamentary speech, laws and petitions – and, hence, the marginalization of women. Like royalty, criminals, the dead and newly-born, women were seen as irrelevant to the battle for the liberal political and public sphere. Like royalty, families, drunkards and babies, they were often, moreover, embodied.

Forty Years Later:
Women and the Liberal Public Sphere in 1902
Had things changed by 1902? Heinrich Rickert had just died; the newspaper was now edited by a liberal consortium. Meanwhile, the Progressive Party had been definitively bested by Bismarck; it was still fighting for representative government and the free market, but as a fairly marginal force, squeezed between new, anti-liberal parties. The conservatives had entered the public sphere with force. Their newspapers were scarcely rational-critical; they were, rather, coupled to emotional, militarist rhetoric, well bolstered by public nationalist ceremonies. Most liberal-political newspapers faced further competition from papers with names like the Danziger Neueste Nachrichten – supposedly apolitical, and bent, primarily, on providing general, “objective“ news.24

The past forty years had also seen significant advances by formerly marginal groups. Workers now had their own political organizations, consumption market and newspapers. The same applied to women. Powerful women’s organizations were demanding political influence, and themselves holding conferences, writing petitions, and publishing newspapers. They were

---

24 By the 1890s, the Danziger Neueste Nachrichten, which, although more right-wing liberal, was supposedly objective, had three times the subscribers of the Danziger Zeitung; for this, as well as a thumb-nail history of the Danziger, see Albrecht Wien, Die Preussische Verwaltung des Regierungsbezirks Danzig 1870-1920 (Köln: Grote, 1974), 75; Erich Keyser, Danzigs Geschichte (Danzig, 1921), 95.
entering the better-paid labor market; a few had become professionals. Meanwhile, a female consumption and reading public had gained public recognition; there was a large, public traffic in goods, magazines and books aimed specifically towards women. To all this, the *Danziger* had had to adjust.

 Nonetheless, the *Danziger* seems, in 1902, to be holding the liberal fort. Its editors still provide very substantial space to all-male debate, and the same rules apply: no personalities. The speakers, although wordy, remain abstract. They are, however, occasionally female. In 1862, there had been no female public speakers. In 1902, the *Danziger* covers the debates of local women’s philanthropic associations and congresses. The female debater is, it seems, given the same treatment as the male. She receives only name and title; she is disembodied.

 Well, not quite. Her title does provide information on her family status (Frau or Fräulein); and she is rendered more personal by the habit of giving both her first and second name (e.g., “Frau Helene Lange” as opposed to “Oberpräsident von Gossler”). Sometimes, also, the journalist goes further, as in: “This speech, which was proclaimed openly, courageously, and yet with much tenderness, was met with lively applause”. The speaker has, to be sure, urged mothers to give children sexual guidance. Nonetheless, this type of affective description, which allows one (however briefly) to picture the speaker, is, as far as I have seen, never accorded male speakers, even when discussing similar intimate things.

 By 1902, however, verbatim reports of debates had been somewhat curtailed. Other, more colorful material was allowed to proliferate. The paper, in short, had begun to break free of the liberal associational-political world which once formed its hothouse. Notices of royalty and sport, art reviews, information on families and advertisements, were now complemented by descriptions of public events (funerals, festivals); an increased number of light and humorous notices of various kinds; the *feuilleton* (often, a sentimental novel, sometimes a historical description); and, on Sundays, a special insert for the farmer, housewife and hunter. Much of this, as can be imagined, is a departure from the hyper-abstract world of (all-male) rational argument. And, as in 1862, it is primarily here that one finds the women.

 Women’s advances in the formal economic sphere, both as workers and consumers, show (to begin from the back of the newspaper) in the advertisements. The advertisement section remains startlingly unchanged in format and appearance. The intrusion of women into the formal, individualized liberal employment- and consumption market has, however, left its mark. Some of the advertisements for educational and job opportunities now openly address women; while, to make another possibly sexist assumption, the advertisements

---

for sewing-patterns, perfumes and corsets probably address a female market. Some of the advertisements for clothes include pictures of women. Interestingly, however, in view of the modern advertising obsession with the female body, these pictures are the exception, even when advertising clothing. Shoes, for instance, are shown without the wearer. Further, when fashion pictures do appear, they are almost equally proportioned between men and women.²⁶

The acknowledgement of women as a group with significant consumption power is evident, further, in special advertisements for women’s non-fictional magazines and books. These even make it into the otherwise dry “business section” – as in the notice which very warmly recommends the unsubtly titled This Magazine Belongs to the Housewife! The editors are full of praise (did the newspaper own shares?) – “we are astonished by the number of practical articles, that cover the entire area of household and fashion and that constitute, when one includes the sections of entertainment and illustrations, not less than 1280 pages per year”.²⁷ A four-page pamphlet insert, meanwhile, presents another women-friendly book, The Woman of the Future. The text begins by asserting that although women have advanced in many professions, they are still often treated as a “a piece of, more or less useful, more or less valuable, household goods”. This is because of their ignorance – something this book will help cure. The work of Mrs. Doctor Anna Fischer-Duckelmann, it is written “not from a neutral, factual [sachlich] point of view, but rather from the standpoint of your personal, even deep-reaching and exclusively personal” concerns. “Relentlessly frank”, it presents, “as only one woman can express it to another woman”, “the most secret concerns of the wife and of married life”. It provices chapters on health, including information on “the body, nutrition, clothing, housing, sexual life”, as well as the “achievement and heightening of bodily beauty”; while the chapter on pregnancy and birth tells the reader “how one achieves children of spiritual and bodily beauty”, and ends with advice on

²⁶ Corset: Danziger Zeitung, 5 October, 1902. Pictures of two small girls, advertizing stockings, Danziger Zeitung, 3 October 1902; of a mustaschioned, well-dressed male contemplating fashion plates of suits, Danziger Zeitung, 1 October, 1902, morning edition. Business school and dancing lessons for women, as well an additional picture of a woman, for fashionable outfits, Danziger Zeitung, 3 October 1902, morning edition. Business school for women and Mädchen, and Higher School for girls, Danziger Zeitung, 1 October, 1902, morning edition. Women are becoming professional: A notice of “A daughter from our city, Miss Johanna Schwanan”, has just graduated from a Realgymnasium; “the young woman” intended to study medicine (note the familiar, familial “daughter”, the mention of her youth, and the nature of her title and name), in ibid; this edition’s advertisements include “Sought for a local law firm, a lady” among the jobs offered.

²⁷ “Geschäftsteil”, Danziger Zeitung 3 October 1902.
how to limit the number of one’s children.28 (The fact that the *Danziger* would include an advertisement for such a book demonstrates its relatively woman-friendly, progressive character.)

Otherwise, women are still most apparent in the worlds of family, art, and public appearance – in 1902 as in 1862. They are still prominent in notices about royalty, as well as of prominent people’s marriages, deaths and births. This world of ritual and representation, family and female influence – the world of “representational publicness” the liberals were supposed to abolish – has survived, and even gained ground. It has even expanded (in the week I examined) to include what could be called public, urban rituals – parades, town festivities, and, above all, public funerals. In edition after edition one can read continued, detailed descriptions of the funerals of local notables or international stars (such as Oberpräsident von Gossler, or Zola), complete with full accounts of the illnesses that brought death, the results of the autopsy, and the appearance (usually, “peaceful”) on the face of the corpse. Women appear in these accounts, usually as wives of the deceased, whose physical condition in the face of the terrible event is often described in some detail.29 The processions, the speeches, the church, the decorations, all are given. Rituals in public space belong, in short, by no means solely to the bygone world of royal absolutism, when the body of the King was the embodiment of power. The ritual of bodies (at least corpses) remains as an undertow, and one that includes woman; a complement to the formal, impersonal world of verbal male liberal politics, as shown by its unapologetic and complete coverage in even the driest of liberal newspapers.

The art and theater reviews remain, as well, and are done in much the same style and tone. These have been complemented, however, by an extensive use of *feuilletons*. These are sometimes historical accounts of major battles or national events (as in the “Flight of the Prince of Prussia”, cited above). More commonly, however, they consist of mushy novels. Openly sentimental, they often center on men’s relationship to some lovely, high-minded young woman (complemented, often, by an attractive but worldly, superficial woman). The tone is intimate, the main concern is human relations (between young people, and in the family), and the mention of the females’ physical attractions legion. The world of disembodied reason is left far behind. This is an arena for the free play of bodies.

Finally, there is the new section of Sunday entertainment. Here, of course, one finds women. “The Berliner. Here and There. From the Comic Theater” is a sort of *flaneur’s* account of doings in the country’s capital. The article begins

---

29 Throughout the week of October 1–7, 1902; see, e.g., *Danziger Zeitung*, 1 October, 1902, morning and evening editions.
with a comment on all the brightly-lit advertisements – “Our grandmothers knitted
the most intricate pieces by candle-light – our mondaine wives study the effects
of electrical light on their toilettes and coloring and maintain, the highest
illumination is scarcely light enough for the superficial productions of the
times.”30 Such pieces are complemented by another insert, The West-Prussian
Friend of Countryside and Household, directed to the male and female farmer.
The first two pages address the male. Starting with a poem which is a sort of
miniature farmer’s almanac (“If the tree keeps its leaves for long, I fear the
winter will be late”, and so forth), it provides two pages of practical advice on
harvesting, etc. The third page is “For the Housewife”, and starts with a poem
“For a Mädchen“. This reads, in part, roughly translated, “No, not with its fiery
glow has love approached you; your blood, which pulses softly, did not want to
run in wild floods /…/ The more lovely is, and should be, the mildness, that
burns in the hearth of the house [Herd des Hauses]”. The housewife gets a page
on processing food, getting rid of bats and rats, and the like. Finally, a
splendidly illustrated page (of a rabbit in the woodlands) addresses the hunter
and his concerns.31

Women, finally, appear in the expanded section dedicated to humorous
notices and jokes. This has, in fact, been the case throughout, in all the
newspapers examined. To be sure, there are also jokes about students, soldiers,
peasants, drunkards, etc.; but the jokes about women tend to focus on “typical”
gender attributes (rather than those of a particular profession, age, or mental
state). Feminine clothing is a perennial subject of fun. In 1862, there were the
usual, internationally popular humorous notices on crinolines.32 In 1902, in
“No more revealing toilettes”, we are told that “skin is no longer the fashion”
at elegant American dinners, although due to the cold winter rather than from
any “suddenly awoken sense of shame”.33 Other humorous notices concentrate
likewise on “typical” gender appearance and behavior. “A Comic Smuggling
Affair” describes a “young, elegantly clad lady”, who tries to smuggle her fox-
terrier through English customs as a baby. A paw sticks out; the terrier is sent
back to Belgium, while the lady, “crying”, boards the train for London.34 Frau
Hilda v. Decker, dressed in short hair, a man’s hat and “reform clothing”, got
herself manhandled and arrested in Wiesbaden; the police accused her of being
a man impersonating a woman.35

These light notices emphasize women’s personal appearance, emotions, and

30 Danziger Zeitung, 5 October 1902, “Sonntagsblatt: Unterhaltungs-Beilage der Danziger
31 Ibid., “Westpreussischer Land- und Hausfreund”.
32 Crinolines: e.g., Danziger Zeitung, 7 October 1862, morning edition.
33 Danziger Zeitung, 5 October, 1902, morning edition.
34 Danziger Zeitung, 3 October 1902, morning edition.
35 Danziger Zeitung, 8 oktober 1902, morning edition.
childish illogic. Women remain the objects of male gaze, as in the joke: “Judge: ‘You deny stubbornly, that you are the perpetrator, and yet the description suits you quite exactly: pretty face, youthful appearance, tender small feet’. The accused: ‘Herr Judge, I confess!’”36 This is, it seems, only appropriate, as women themselves are primarily interested in appearance. They cannot, for instance, resist a man in uniform. In 1848, to step outside the *Danziger* for a minute, the *Krakehler* had joked, “Warning! Wives and maidens of Danzig, be on the look-out!” The Danzig militia had attained the right to wear its uniforms when off-duty – “Especially however you, pitiable, plagued married men /…/ be on your watch!”37 In 1902, the joke is still going strong, as in the *Danziger* theater review of *In a Brightly Colored Coat*.

Yes, the bright coat! How it has it all over simple civilian dress! It not only strikes the eye of our German maidens… the ladies like to see “the officers” unusually well /…/ And the women, then, with their sympathy for the bright coat! Already for a generation the Berlin cooks have sung, “To swank on Sundays, *unter dem Linden*, with the slim military man…”

and so on.38 Here, we have returned, via a roundabout route, to the world of public ritual. Women, it is assumed, are among the most eager spectators of that public spectacle, the military parade; here, far from the dry and logical world of public debate and reason, public appearance, along with women, finds its logical place.

I have quoted these sections at some length in order to illustrate my central point: that in 1902, women, despite entering the public sphere (as workers, as readers, as public speakers) were still treated differently from men. They remained, above all, described; one examined their dress, hair, skin, feet and tears. They are, in short, embodied. Indeed, it seems – on this admittedly slender evidence – that the more women enter the newspaper (in *feuilletons*, in advertisements for magazines and books, as the objects of *flaneur* gaze and comments, in humorous notices and in “housewife” sections), the more embodied they become. The *flaneur* discusses women’s reactions to the effect of electric light on their *toilette*; the theater critic, their love of a uniform. Women’s magazines, richly illustrated, are about private, household, and fashion concerns. Women’s books speak to them alone, woman-to-woman, and

36 *Danziger Zeitung*, 5 October 1902, morning edition.
37 *Der Krakehler*, 15 Juli, 1848.
38 *Danziger Zeitung*, 6 October 1902, evening edition. (This preoccupation with the superior sexual attraction of a uniform on display goes against the grain of the liberal conception of male virtue, incidentally highlighting the anomalous status of the army in a world of equal, reasoning males.)
discuss secret things, personal to them only, but which all have to do with the body (and, of course, its appearance). The farmer is addressed with a poem on the weather; the poem to his wife talks about her pulsing blood.

**Tentative Conclusions: The Body and the Media**

The evidence is, of course, minimal; much further research is needed. But one can at least speculate on possible ways of understanding this increased mention of women and women’s bodies. One approach would constitute a “sunshine story”. The *Danziger Zeitung* was simply starting to include women in the public sphere, albeit on somewhat special terms – but you have to start somewhere, and women were thus set upon the path towards becoming fully respected public actors. The *Danziger* allows us to trace this progressive change. In 1862, its editors still believed that the world of debating males was the only world that mattered, or was worth covering in newspapers. In that exciting decade, when the economic and political control of Germany seemed to be within the liberal parties’ reach, this all-male, exclusionary focus might seem natural. (Until quite recently, indeed, it was shared by most historians.) It was, of course, unfortunate for women that they were seen as too embodied, too illogical, too concerned with appearances and with family life to be allowed to participate. But this misconception was in the process of being corrected. In 1902, women were demanding, and getting, public sphere attention. Their economic and political power was such that the *Danziger*, like other newspapers, now turned to them as co-players, if not equals, in the public sphere. To be sure, they were still treated primarily as mothers and daughters, housewives, coquettes and comics; but this was at least a beginning. After all, the women’s suffrage movement itself had recourse to arguments based on women’s special nature and separate sphere. In both cases, it was a step in the right direction: women were at least beginning to be *seen* in the liberal public sphere.

Another, more pessimistic line of analysis would approach the evidence rather differently. It would focus on the fact that throughout these forty years, the *Danziger* had demonstrated the continuing public power of “representational publicness” – that is, the illiberal world of royal and family power, appearance, and ritual. The liberal public sphere was, in short, always surrounded by a sea of non-liberal power, in which public display and private, familial status still played a major role. And the tide was rising, as biologist racism, mass nationalism, military display, public ritual, celebrity and royal power began to swamp the liberal world of rational-critical debate. By 1900, liberal newspapers, once models of impersonal rationality, reflected this change. According to this interpretation, then, the *Danziger*’s increased attention to women – thoroughly embodied women – could be coupled to a *general* degeneration of the liberal public sphere.
This is, of course, an application of Jürgen Habermas’s thesis of the progressive deterioration of the “bourgeois public sphere”. According to Habermas, the media’s rational, abstract discussion was supposed to replace the authoritarian and irrational “representational publicness” of the Ancien Régime. It had been able to do so only briefly, during the era of the political newspapers (of which the Danziger of 1862 is an excellent example). By the turn of the century, such newspapers had been replaced by commercialized bastardizations. They no longer represented political parties, they represented commercial interests; and what sold best was not rational-critical discussion, but scandal, crime reports, humor, descriptions of public ritual, royalty and celebrities. In short, to go a step beyond Habermas, the liberal newspapers gave up; they allowed their high, dry island of rational-critical discourse to subside into the ever-threatening sea of representational publicness. This general “re-embodiment” explains the increased discussion of and appeals to women. This was not an advance for women; rather, it was a symptom of the immanent collapse of rational-critical political discussion. Of course the women were embodied; so, increasingly, were the men. The inclusion of women was a stage in the re-establishment of anti-liberal, mystical, ritualistically embodied state authority, which should have culminated in fascist racism, but which, unfortunately, has lived on in the personal celebrity politics, pictures and rituals that dominate the “political reporting” of, e.g., modern television.

Another, third, equally pessimistic assessment agrees with the perniciousness of women’s continued embodiment, but puts it in the context of systematic gender inequality. This analysis is deeply skeptical of the universalist claims of the liberal public sphere, finding it suspect at inception; and it uses the example of embodiment to prove its point. It postulates that embodiment is an expression of basic power inequalities. Embodiment is a means to exclude women – along with other suspect groups (criminals, Jews, colonized subjects) – from full political citizenship.

The dividing line between the media’s accepted political actors, and those who were excluded from public sphere citizenship, was drawn, according to this line of reasoning, by the body. As Michael Warner puts it, liberal publications postulate abstract, generalized readers and authors. Newspaper readers see themselves as part of an anonymous public; editors and journalists affect an impersonal voice as more generalizable, and hence more authoritative.

---

40 For critique and discussion of the moral viability and actual performance of Habermas’s “bourgeois public sphere”, see the contributions to Craig Calhoun, ed., *Habermas and the Public Sphere* (Cambridge and London: MIT Press, 1992); the foremost feminist critic has been Nancy Fraser; see, e.g., her contribution to the volume. For a discussion of how “embodiment” affected socialist workers, Hurd, “Class, Masculinity, Manners and Mores: Public Space and Public Spheres in Nineteenth-Century Europe,” *Social Science Review* (Spring 2000).
This “strategy of impersonal references” is a necessary convention in public print culture. As a result, those included among the readers are disembodied. They have neither gender, ethnicity, nor race; they display no class signifiers. This in-group public had no body; it is “disincorporated” – as opposed to those who are the objects of gaze, described and discussed.\textsuperscript{41}

This is wholly consonant with the public sphere’s ideal of universality: those who participate in public debate should transcend the particularities of their bodies, status, and life experiences. What matters is one’s argument, not one’s person. But, as Warner points out, not everyone has equal opportunity to abstract him- or herself in public discussion. Disincorporation comes most easily to those who are non-ethnic, male, propertied, and possessed of middle-class education, taste, and manners. Their bodily and private-life traits are considered normal and are, hence, invisible. Visibility is retained for those whose relationship to the public sphere is suspect. In the nineteenth century, as now, those who were female, lower-class or “ethnic” retained their bodies – unable to join in the select “us” group of the non-described and disembodied.

Indeed, to be described at all was to be rendered an outsider, suspect and odd. It was often enough to paint the person, to envision his or her body, clothing, house, etc. Royalty was thus excluded from the liberal in-group. Of course, given its centuries-long exploitation of public display, this might be a source of royal strength. But for non-royals, embodiment was a sign of inferior status. Indeed, given the modern, biologist preoccupation with the body, it could be doubly fatal. As David Green argues, media visualization allows people to locate social-cultural differences within the body, and to brand them innate and hereditary; the body identifies social-cultural differences and becomes “the totemic object, and its very visibility the evident articulation of nature and culture.”\textsuperscript{42} Opening the doors to an envisioned body allows one to speculate on the outcast’s bodily functions, his or her lusts, habits, smells and appetites – all of which serve to lend them “humiliating positivity” while further excluding them from the realm of disinterested, disincorporated discourse.

Women inhabit the quintessential body. This is what made them so utterly unsuited for the liberal public sphere. Indeed, so embodied were women, supposedly, by nature, that simply associating with women embodied – feminized – the men, as well. Women, so to speak, became the virus in the


system. This is why they had to be relegated to the fringes of liberal discourse, to associate with royal families, criminals and babies. And this is why the terms used to discuss them were necessarily different from those used for men. Women were associated with the secret, on one hand, and appearances, on the other; they had special, private concerns, which, if given the chance, they would pursue in public – one of the many things that made them illegitimate political participants. Any article with a woman in it, any meeting or speech, was contaminated; women (as argued Marie Antoinette’s public prosecutor) perverted, sexualized, and particularized the public sphere.

The increased mention of (embodied) women in the Danziger of 1902 is thus, according to this line of argument, neither a sign of the advance of women, nor of any fundamental change in the liberal public sphere. The public sphere had always been hostile to women. At most, the increased mention of women shows an increase in hostility – perhaps (to climb still further out on this analytical limb) in reaction to women’s increased penetration of economic and political life. Such hostility might be manifested by a greater coverage of embodied women; liberal editors might find it natural to make women still more the object of male gaze, to “out” their bodies, so to speak – and thus demonstrate, repeatedly and aggressively, their non-membership in the in-group of “us”, the disembodied readers, the inhabitants of the high, dry island of normal and powerful citizens.

This may not be altogether far-fetched. There may be cycles in media’s representation of women’s bodies. One such was surely the proliferation of political pornography that presaged the French Revolution. The second may be the more “respectable” type of embodiment found in the 1902 Danziger Zeitung. Recently, Anja Hirdman has identified a similar increase in preoccupation with women’s bodies in contemporary Swedish media. In each case, the backlash was, arguably, after a period of advance by women; during the Enlightenment, to be followed by the execution of the queen, the outlawing of all women’s clubs, and the anti-woman Napoleonic laws; during the decades immediately before World War One, to be followed by the fascist backlash; and during the progressive 1970s, to be followed by the commercial, biologist backlash of the 1990s.

This is probably too simplistic, and certainly too much to read from the limited evidence at hand. But it is worth considering as a working hypothesis; and it might alert women to the media’s power. Being embodied is no joke. I do not want to give a false impression: women were not the only thoroughly embodied group to appear in 1902. They jostled elbows with other outcasts from the liberal public sphere, such as the inhabitants of colonized countries. In 1902, a lead article in the Danziger gave its dismissive opinion of the “indolent blacks” of German West Africa, with their air of “injured majesty”.43

---

43 Danziger Zeitung, 8 October 1902, morning edition.
To end on a suitably macabre note, indeed, let me summarize the most body-ridden set of articles I found in the *Danziger Zeitung*.

They appeared in 1902, and concerned a trial. The trial concerned the *Staatsbürger Zeitung’s* libellious coverage of what it termed a “Jewish ritual murder”. The editor stands accused of slander. First, the *Danziger* gives us background information. A piece of a young man’s corpse had been found close to a synagogue (other pieces were found elsewhere). Many of the townspeople, incited by the openly anti-Semitic *Staatsbürger Zeitung*, believed that the student had been killed so that his blood could be used for Jewish ceremonies, and that the authorities were involved in a “philosemetic” cover-up. The whole ended with street riots; the guilty party was never found. Shortly thereafter, the Berlin authorities and a Jewish resident sued the *Staatsbürger* for slander. As libel could only be claimed if it could be established that the authorities had not, as the anti-Semitic newspaper claimed, run a cover-up in favor of the Jews, the German public was given ample opportunity to rehash the entire murder at length; for the *Danziger* followed its normal practice of reporting (in, perhaps, unnecessary detail) what everyone said.

No other articles feature bodies so heavily (and this includes descriptions of other murders and trials). Let us leave aside doctors’ descriptions of the pieces of dismembered student, the fact that he had been proudly promiscuous and visited prostitutes, the fact that his pants were found with semen on them, the fact that the police assumed that he had been murdered while performing *coitus* – a Lustmord. The anti-Semitic editor’s words are equally interesting. The cover-up originated (he argued) in familial relations, involved many women, and was caused by Jews’ unusual relationship to Christian blood – or, possibly, by their desire to revenge “their” daughters’ seduction by a Christian.44 Women figure prominently. Thus, the key phrase, “Nothing is supposed to come out”, was uttered by a wife of one of the investigators, whose own “philosemetic” tendencies were supposedly induced by his liberal, “philosemetic” father-in-law; while the Mayor of Konitz was influenced directly by his Jewish wife. The authorities had, in the face of evidence which pointed directly to Jews, proceeded instead against Christian suspects, the daughter of one of which had been forced to “expose” herself during a house-search. Most striking, however, was the behavior attributed to the “flat-footed Egyptians”. It was one of these, the Butow merchant Grossman, who, according to a female servant, had returned from a trip with bloodied pants and a bottle of blood, which he showed to his wife while making many “suspicious remarks”. The rumor was that the dead man had been drained, with the help of two men and a woman, of twelve liters of blood.45

---

44 *Danziger Zeitung*, 1 October 1902, morning edition.
45 *Danziger Zeitung*, 1 October 1902, evening edition; *Danziger Zeitung* 2 October 1902, evening edition.
This was rhetoric typical of popular anti-Semitism. A recurring theme is the blending of secretive, female family influence and false, male public face; deception, the opposite of the liberal public sphere, could be called a feminine (or, in this case, feminized Jewish) trait. One has, further, the feminization of the Jews in the role played by evilly complicit or traitorous women (while the Christian women are sexualized victims); and the constant references to both sex and blood. The fact that this anti-Semitic rhetoric paralleled, in drastic and vile fashion, the mild “embodiment” which the Danziger visited on its own out-groups, shows how liberal prejudices drew at least part of their strength from illiberal wells. “Flat-footed Egyptians” was only one of many insults offered contemporary Jews; why the insult was rendered so much worse by the addition of “flat-footed” is part of what this article has been about. Embodiment, and its corollary, association with the female, is dangerous; it excludes its actors from the in-group realm of the abstracted, normal and rational; an exclusion which media has helped to maintain.
Telegraphic News of the Danziger Zeitung

Hanover, 4 Oct. Today's "Hannöverische Zeitung" declares, that the government has not turned down the German-French trade treaty; they stubbornly continue to hold to their earlier standpoint . . .

London, 4 Oct. The report, that came with the "Australastan" from New York on the 23rd of this month, informs us that the rumor, that the Union Army had quickly passed the Potomac.

From New York on the 24th of this month it is reported, that the Unionists have not managed to . . .

Our External Relations

The situation is unchanged. The House of Representatives, assuredly with full justice, does not wish to curtail the power of the Crown, nor put itself in the place of the Monarch, but also does not want to give away, in this locked position, any of its own rights. Always ready to proffer the hand of peace, as soon as the government agrees to the well-known demands . . . [The article is a general commentary on the Constitutional Conflict, giving the reader background on the relationship between the "Prussian opposition" and the Prussian King. It then goes through what the newspapers in South Germany, France and England have to say about this internal Prussian political conflict; and the way in which Bismarck has allowed the "German people" to become dangerously isolated – a situation that will not be improved "because a Prussia, which is ruled by the party of the Kreuzzeitung" – a conservative, state newspaper – "is a passive Prussia, and that is why the situation appears to be threatening."]

Landtag-Debates.

55. session of the House of Representatives on 4 Oct. Commission-Report, on the petition of gymnastic organizations. The petition maintains that German gymnastics, as an integrated part of school instruction, be made obligatory. The reply of the Commission is thus: [quote agreeing, because of role of gymnastics in training soldiers, etc . . . ]

Repr. Dr. Techow: He recommends the amendment: that the recommendation to the government to review this petition be accompanied by the House's judgment on the matter, which it has a right to. . .

Repr. Dr. Virchow: The House has already expressed its opinion of the role of gymnastics in the military . . .

Government-Commissioner: The government does not intend to make the introduction of gymnastics in the school dependent upon military gymnastics . . [etc. etc.]

Landtag-Debate, cont’d; it is now a matter of church prerogatives

Landstag-Debates, cont’d

55. session of the House of Representatives on 4 Oct. Commission-Report, on the petition of gymnastic organizations. The petition maintains that German gymnastics, as an integrated part of school instruction, be made obligatory. The reply of the Commission is thus: [quote agreeing, because of role of gymnastics in training soldiers, etc . . . ]

Repr. Dr. Techow: He recommends the amendment: that the recommendation to the government to review this petition be accompanied by the House’s judgment on the matter, which it has a right to. . .

Repr. Dr. Virchow: The House has already expressed its opinion of the role of gymnastics in the military . . .

Government-Commissioner: The government does not intend to make the introduction of gymnastics in the school dependent upon military gymnastics . . [etc. etc.]

Landtag-Debate, cont’d; it is now a matter of church prerogatives

Landstag-Debates.

55. session of the House of Representatives on 4 Oct. Commission-Report, on the petition of gymnastic organizations. The petition maintains that German gymnastics, as an integrated part of school instruction, be made obligatory. The reply of the Commission is thus: [quote agreeing, because of role of gymnastics in training soldiers, etc . . . ]

Repr. Dr. Techow: He recommends the amendment: that the recommendation to the government to review this petition be accompanied by the House’s judgment on the matter, which it has a right to. . .

Repr. Dr. Virchow: The House has already expressed its opinion of the role of gymnastics in the military . . .

Government-Commissioner: The government does not intend to make the introduction of gymnastics in the school dependent upon military gymnastics . . [etc. etc.]

Landtag-Debate, cont’d; it is now a matter of church prerogatives

Landtag-Debates.

55. session of the House of Representatives on 4 Oct. Commission-Report, on the petition of gymnastic organizations. The petition maintains that German gymnastics, as an integrated part of school instruction, be made obligatory. The reply of the Commission is thus: [quote agreeing, because of role of gymnastics in training soldiers, etc . . . ]

Repr. Dr. Techow: He recommends the amendment: that the recommendation to the government to review this petition be accompanied by the House’s judgment on the matter, which it has a right to. . .

Repr. Dr. Virchow: The House has already expressed its opinion of the role of gymnastics in the military . . .

Government-Commissioner: The government does not intend to make the introduction of gymnastics in the school dependent upon military gymnastics . . [etc. etc.]

Landtag-Debate, cont’d; it is now a matter of church prerogatives

Landtag-Debates.

55. session of the House of Representatives on 4 Oct. Commission-Report, on the petition of gymnastic organizations. The petition maintains that German gymnastics, as an integrated part of school instruction, be made obligatory. The reply of the Commission is thus: [quote agreeing, because of role of gymnastics in training soldiers, etc . . . ]

Repr. Dr. Techow: He recommends the amendment: that the recommendation to the government to review this petition be accompanied by the House’s judgment on the matter, which it has a right to. . .

Repr. Dr. Virchow: The House has already expressed its opinion of the role of gymnastics in the military . . .

Government-Commissioner: The government does not intend to make the introduction of gymnastics in the school dependent upon military gymnastics . . [etc. etc.]

Landtag-Debate, cont’d; it is now a matter of church prerogatives

Landtag-Debates.

55. session of the House of Representatives on 4 Oct. Commission-Report, on the petition of gymnastic organizations. The petition maintains that German gymnastics, as an integrated part of school instruction, be made obligatory. The reply of the Commission is thus: [quote agreeing, because of role of gymnastics in training soldiers, etc . . . ]

Repr. Dr. Techow: He recommends the amendment: that the recommendation to the government to review this petition be accompanied by the House’s judgment on the matter, which it has a right to. . .

Repr. Dr. Virchow: The House has already expressed its opinion of the role of gymnastics in the military . . .

Government-Commissioner: The government does not intend to make the introduction of gymnastics in the school dependent upon military gymnastics . . [etc. etc.]

Landtag-Debate, cont’d; it is now a matter of church prerogatives

Landtag-Debates.

55. session of the House of Representatives on 4 Oct. Commission-Report, on the petition of gymnastic organizations. The petition maintains that German gymnastics, as an integrated part of school instruction, be made obligatory. The reply of the Commission is thus: [quote agreeing, because of role of gymnastics in training soldiers, etc . . . ]

Repr. Dr. Techow: He recommends the amendment: that the recommendation to the government to review this petition be accompanied by the House’s judgment on the matter, which it has a right to. . .

Repr. Dr. Virchow: The House has already expressed its opinion of the role of gymnastics in the military . . .

Government-Commissioner: The government does not intend to make the introduction of gymnastics in the school dependent upon military gymnastics . . [etc. etc.]

Landtag-Debate, cont’d; it is now a matter of church prerogatives

Landtag-Debates.

55. session of the House of Representatives on 4 Oct. Commission-Report, on the petition of gymnastic organizations. The petition maintains that German gymnastics, as an integrated part of school instruction, be made obligatory. The reply of the Commission is thus: [quote agreeing, because of role of gymnastics in training soldiers, etc . . . ]

Repr. Dr. Techow: He recommends the amendment: that the recommendation to the government to review this petition be accompanied by the House’s judgment on the matter, which it has a right to. . .

Repr. Dr. Virchow: The House has already expressed its opinion of the role of gymnastics in the military . . .

Government-Commissioner: The government does not intend to make the introduction of gymnastics in the school dependent upon military gymnastics . . [etc. etc.]

Landtag-Debate, cont’d; it is now a matter of church prerogatives

Landtag-Debates.

55. session of the House of Representatives on 4 Oct. Commission-Report, on the petition of gymnastic organizations. The petition maintains that German gymnastics, as an integrated part of school instruction, be made obligatory. The reply of the Commission is thus: [quote agreeing, because of role of gymnastics in training soldiers, etc . . . ]

Repr. Dr. Techow: He recommends the amendment: that the recommendation to the government to review this petition be accompanied by the House’s judgment on the matter, which it has a right to. . .

Repr. Dr. Virchow: The House has already expressed its opinion of the role of gymnastics in the military . . .

Government-Commissioner: The government does not intend to make the introduction of gymnastics in the school dependent upon military gymnastics . . [etc. etc.]

Landtag-Debate, cont’d; it is now a matter of church prerogatives

Landtag-Debates.

55. session of the House of Representatives on 4 Oct. Commission-Report, on the petition of gymnastic organizations. The petition maintains that German gymnastics, as an integrated part of school instruction, be made obligatory. The reply of the Commission is thus: [quote agreeing, because of role of gymnastics in training soldiers, etc . . . ]

Repr. Dr. Techow: He recommends the amendment: that the recommendation to the government to review this petition be accompanied by the House’s judgment on the matter, which it has a right to. . .

Repr. Dr. Virchow: The House has already expressed its opinion of the role of gymnastics in the military . . .

Government-Commissioner: The government does not intend to make the introduction of gymnastics in the school dependent upon military gymnastics . . [etc. etc.]

Landtag-Debate, cont’d; it is now a matter of church prerogatives

Landtag-Debates.

55. session of the House of Representatives on 4 Oct. Commission-Report, on the petition of gymnastic organizations. The petition maintains that German gymnastics, as an integrated part of school instruction, be made obligatory. The reply of the Commission is thus: [quote agreeing, because of role of gymnastics in training soldiers, etc . . . ]

Repr. Dr. Techow: He recommends the amendment: that the recommendation to the government to review this petition be accompanied by the House’s judgment on the matter, which it has a right to. . .

Repr. Dr. Virchow: The House has already expressed its opinion of the role of gymnastics in the military . . .
The Crown Prince and the Frau Kronprinzessin left Coburg early this morning and have started a lengthy journey towards Switzerland, Italy etc. The Crown-Prince children will arrive here, in the first days of the next week, with their Ober-Gouverneur, Miss Freein v. Dobeneck.

(R.Z.) [This indicates the newspaper, from which the news is taken. The notice is about the new Finance Minister v. Bobelschwingh, who had shown decisive opposition to the "demands of Reaktion".]

(B.u.H.Z.) [Ditto. The appointment of Herr v.d. Hendt to Minister of Trade.]

[And further small notices of this type; all political, mostly the doings or appointments of high politicians, and all taken from other newspapers; the news includes the notice that a new comic newspaper, The Small Reactionary, has been established in order to compete with the liberal Kladderadsch. "The Independence has the following to say about the Budget and Gap theory of the Sternzeitung" . . . . several Offenbach burghers have sent a petition to Garibaldi.]

England.
London, 1 Oct. The "Morning Herald" says, in relation to the Prussian Constitutional Conflict: In the great question, which today has put all of Prussia in movement, the representatives are decisively in the right . . . .

Russia and Poland.
Warsaw, 8 Oct. We learn from Zamoyski that he had an audience with the Emperor the day before yesterday. His reception was portentous, and the Emperor said to the Baron: "I know the honorable nature of your character and now, that you are incapable of doing anything that is unright . . . ." [The notice continues to discuss the political conditions in Petersburg and their relationship to Poland; of special interest, it is stated, is the desire to get members of different confessions to the Staatrath, which involves different religious swearing-in ceremonies for the Christians and the Jews.]

Danzig, the 6th of October.
The members of the Magistrate and the City Council gave a soupe to the visiting Government Council Herr v. Winter.

[The meeting on the petition to the House of Representatives, cont’d., including the petition itself, reproduced in full.]

England.
London, 1 Oct. The "Morning Herald" says, in relation to the Prussian Constitutional Conflict: In the great question, which today has put all of Prussia in movement, the representatives are decisively in the right . . . .
– The renovation of the interior of our Maria-Church... [cost, etc]
– The heating of larger churches, as been, for instance, common in Berlin, has been up to now impossible for our city. But within a short period...
– The leather merchant Rosenfeld has been declared innocent in today's trial, which had concerned his bankruptcy...
– Two workers were taken yesterday evening, towards 9 o'clock, by a tailor master in Röpergasse. They had wanted to steal various kitchen goods. The stolen things had, however, already progressed to a third, unknown hand, and are the subject of an investigation. – Half an hour later there was a fight in the bar of the pub owner H. at Olivaerthore, in which, among others, two workers employed at the hospital were also involved, of which one stabbed the pub-owner, who was attempting to intervene. [Etc: all crime notices in this issue involve workers.]
– A corporal, who had been fired from the military, knew how to get himself whole boots: in that he went to the quarters of a soldier he knew, sent the two soldiers who were there away, by giving them a silver groschen for schnapps, and then put on a pair of new boots, instead of his old ones, and left.
– Thorn, 4 Oct. We have finally received a definite answer in the matter of our bridge...

--------------

Stock-Exchange notices of the Danziger Zeitung.


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Stock and trade exchange figures, international, continued</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Shipping News.
[Long list of ships, their destinations and cargoes.]

| xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx |
| xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx |
| xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx |
| xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx |
| xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx |
| xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx |
| xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx |
| xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx |
| xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx |
| xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx |

Railway-Report.

Berlin, 4 Oct. (B- u-H-Z.) The business was, this week, somewhat in decline... [A long paragraph giving details of what and how much was shipped.]

| xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx |
| xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx |
| xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx |
| xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx |
| xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx |

Product-Market.
[The Danzig prices of various types of goods]

| xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx |
| xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx |
| xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx |
| xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx |

[Additional financial information: the local stock exchange, the price of shipping to various countries]
This morning at 4 o'clock our only little son John died, 1 year 14 days old, in gastric fever. Danzig, 5 October 1862. L. Haberkant and wife.

The death of our dear son Richard, on 3 October, 4 in the afternoon, we announce, very sadly, to our sympathetic friends and acquaintances. Lissau. Cremat and wife.

Official Notice. The bankruptcy proceeding of the fortune of . . . .

The bankrupcty proceeding of the fortune of . . . .
Official Notice. The Granting of the Right to Serve Food for the 3rd Quarter . . .

The Magistracy.

At the beginning of the new scool semester we recommend, as used by local and non-local schools School Books, Atlases etc. In long-lasting bindings and at the cheapest prices. Léon Saunier Book-store for German and Foreign Literature. Danzig, Stetting and Elbing.

[Followed by three more bookstore advertizements]

At Th. Anhuth, Langemarkt No. 10, has arrived:
The Prussian Constitution-Text, published by the Association for the Friends of the Constitution of the Königsberg-Fischauer Electoral District. Price 3 Groschen.

[Private advertizement for sale of land, “to be sold as soon as possible because of family circumstances”, signed A. Derzewski in Dameran by Elbing]

The Hamburg-American Packet-Ship-Stocks-Association

Direct Post- Steamship Line between Hamburg and New York

[Additional advertizements for:
- A public auction
- Of a piece of farmland
- Invitation to take out bank loans]

The undersigned allows himself in his travel through the city to make the honored public aware of the new invention of Metachrome-Pictures. [For a small sum, you can have your picture ready after 8 days . . .

SMALL PICTURE OF A PIG and Piglets

A few, 1, ?, and ? Prussian Lottery tickets . . . are still to be bought cheaply. Stettin, G.A. Kaselow.

"Mrs. Taylor has the pleasure of announcing that she continues to give English Lessons at her residence 82 Langgasse. An evening circle for Ladies will be held once a-week. For particulars, apply to Mrs. Taylor . . ."

Stadt-Theater.

[Will show "Allessandro Stradell, romantic comic opera in 3 acts by Flatow…]

The State of the Life-Insurance Bank of Germany, in Gotha

(An account of finance, dividends, capital, etc.)

[Notice of a public auction]
xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx
xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx

The Gymnastic and Galvanizing Heilanstalt of Dr. Lenz.
The rational treatment of such illnesses, which cannot or could not be cured through doctoring, such as . Our methods of curing are, as indicated, medical gymnastics and the scientific use of different types of electricity . . .

[An additional advertizement for a bookstore, for school-books]

The Gymnastic and Galvanizing Heilanstalt of Dr. Lenz.
The rational treatment of such illnesses, which cannot or could not be cured through doctoring, such as . Our methods of curing are, as indicated, medical gymnastics and the scientific use of different types of electricity . . .

[Additional advertizements for:
- restoration of sidewalks and gardens
- "An elegant race-horse"
- "Two elegant brown horses"
- for cows
- for "Strong Dutch Bulb-Flowers"
- for Perl-Caviar
- For dried cherries
- For the Royal Lottery

An experienced governess, who has received instruction in all scientific areas, as well as music [seeks a position]

An unmarried, trustworthy brewer, who has a good understanding of beer brewing and can show satisfactory credentials . .

A young man who is fully versed in accounting and in correspondence, with good letters of recommendation . .

Zuckau, the 9th of October. The General Meeting of the members of the Danzig Racing-Association Will take place on . . .

The Association of Young Merchants and Traders.
Appendix II: Danizger Zeitung. General-Anzeiger für Danzig sowie die nordöstlichen Provinze, Mittwoch, 8 Oktober 1902, Morgen-Ausgabe:

After the Opening of the Railroad in German-Southwest-Africa.
From Windhoek, at the end of August, one writes to us: Windhoek has, after the completion of the railway, taken on a substantially different appearance. Daily there come, from the side rails that branch off the main rails, mercantile goods . . . This means that our most debt-ridden native wagon owners have lost the possibility of paying their creditors by transporting goods. May the merchant look to getting his money back, the indolent black worries little about it. Calmly he mortgages his ox and wagon. The idea of seeking another “Paad” (line of work) than transporting goods from the coast to Windhoek appeals only to the fewest; they would prefer to remain, lazily, in their old line of work, selling one piece of property after the other and pulling, at most, their belt a couple of notches tighter, when hunger attacks too fiercely. The strong communism that rules in relation to goods and property means that the poor can simply demand his food from the well-to-do, and receive it also. Thus is ruined unavoidable; here helps no countermeasure of the government, nor the ideas of missionaries and such whites, even those brought up to sympathy; the well-to-do supports his poor relations and friends and colleagues have to al excuses to be so. 

Feuilleton.
The two gentlemen are alone. The Colonel, without knowing it, exhaled, relieved. "No, but that girl was gotten one upset!" "How? Who?" asked Alfredo, surprised, yoke of the Herrschaft of Ramaquas and Hereros, and find out themselves about the difference in serving natives, and European masters. The impoverished Herero, by contrast, never forgets that he once possessed one hundred oxes, and always remains inclined, as servant of the whites, to pass his days in lazy nothing-doing. Both state officials and private people who have to depend on them for work material – the railway and the administration etc. of the Northern District – could sing a song about this. [Nonetheless, the building and administration continues satisfactorily; details.]

Germany.
The "Handelskammer in Halle“ had already, in March this year, by the request of the Magistrate of the city, written a report on the effect of the increase of the tariffs on grain. [The reaction of the Magistrate; excerpts quoted showing that the tariffs have made food substantially more expensive for the poorer parts of the population; in strong language.]

The Party of Order in Saxony.
The issue of [political] cartels in Saxony is in the latest explanation of the official Party newspaper made only more unclear. The anti-Semites – and, it seems, the "Bund der Landwirte" – are working in noble competition to present the efforts of their supporters in the correct light. [About electoral politics, compromise candidates, between the two parties – whom the newspaper dislikes – on the platform "Parties of Order". The dismissive opinion of another newspaper is quoted.]

[Feuilleton, cont’d]

It seems that his thoughts are somewhere else entirely. “Well, Fedora”, answered the Colonel, while lighting himself a cigar. “The girl has something mysterious, something fascinating, about her. Sometimes I am even frightened by her nature.”

Saxon report, cont’d.]

* Berlin, 7 Oct. The "Berliner Tageblatt" reports from Norway: Our Kaiser enjoys the generally expressed Norwegians’ truly sincere tendency towards, one can probably safely say, love. [He has donated money to finish Norwegian churches; other info.]

* On the Origin of the War 1870/71 We find the published memoirs of the Admiral and General v. Stosch in the "German Review". [A letter is quoted, on how the General learnt of the war, what Bismarck was doing at the time, etc.]

* The Political-Economic Testament of the Representative Dr. v. Frege-Weltzien. On Saturday the Leipzig Economic Society report on the parliamentary representative Dr. v. Frege-Weltzien on agriculture and tariffs. [A long quote. After the quote, a discussion of the man’s influence on the conservatives; the fact that he is against tariffs should therefore weigh heavily – “What will his political friends and colleagues have to say to this!?"

[Feuilleton, cont’d]

*[Frege-Weltzien, cont’d.]

* The Decline of Agriculture in Saxony. In the year 1882 567500 persons were active in agriculture . . . [a long paragraph of numbers showing declining employment] The "Dziennik Poznański" has turned, in today’s editorial, against the planned Polish Congress in Lemburg. The newspaper warns, above all things, against the participation of Prussian and Russian Poles in this Congress. [The Galician Poles are planning to establish a committee; but the revolutions, rebellious actions, etc., that usually follow, have always been unrealistic and never benefited the Poles – argues the Polish editorial - which goes on to say that German anti-Polish newspapers in fact want this Congress to take place, for that reason. These newspapers will continue to be anti-Polish, even without an All-Polish Congress; but it would be as well not to give them additional excuses to be so.]
Conference on the Fight against Traffic in Girls. Frankfurt a.M., 7 Oct. At the conference taking place here, the German-National Preparatory Conference to the International Conference to Fight against Traffic in Girls, a resolution of Burgkhardt Berlin was passed, which demanded the employment of a capable professional worker or agent for this national committee, with juridical or police schooling . . . Further, another resolution was passed, proposed by the State Under-Secretary, D. v. Mayr, in the name of the Danish sub-committee . . . [The preparatory conference ended with a thanks to the Kaiser.]

Berlin, 7 Oct. The "Nord. Allg. Ztg." confirms, that the notice [on tariffs, is incorrect]
- The second son of the Kaiser [will be arriving in Bonn to start his studies]
- The amount in the Charity Lottery [is x Marks]
--The Eltestenkollegium der Kaufmannschaft in Berlin [has come out against legal closing hours for shops]
- The Berlin Handelskammer [will ask the state to look into increased meat prices]
- The Bezirksausschuss [ruled against the local police, who had shut down of the play "Maria and Magdalena"]
- Hagen i.W., 7 Oct. The 15. General Congress of the Evangelical Association [was opened today . . .]
- Meiningen, 7 Oct. [The appointment of a Kapellmeister]
- Paris, 7 Oct. [Which minister had met with the Siamese diplomat]

Roosevelt’s Health. London, 7 Oct. As the London newspapers report, one can see a slight worsening in Roosevelt’s condition. The healing of the wound in the knee leaves much to be desired. The doctors have ordained for him, after the latest, work-heavy days, eight days of complete rest.

Danzig, 8 October. City Council Meeting of 7 Oct. Chairman Herr Keruth; from the Magistrate are present the Herren Lord Mayor Delbrück, Mayor Trampe, Council members Toop, Ehlers, Dr. Baal, Dr. Ackermann, Meckbath, Misslauff, Dr. Mayer etc. The council passed the several laws, after a short debate; long accounts of speeches which justify buildings, expenditures, a petition to allow the import
[The City Council, cont’d, now about building barracks, and the pension of a city administrator.]

Testament of Herr v. Gossler. Through his will Herr Over President v. Gossler has remembered the city in a touching way, and in a large-hearted way documented, how much he felt himself to be a burgher of Danzig…[bequests, traillements, etc.]

Promotion of Forest Creation. The Prussian State Administration sees it as one of its duties in the agrarian culture and provision of wood in the communal-owned forests…[etc.; how many trees will be planted, etc.]

Police Reports for the 7. Oct. Arrested: 8 persons, whereof 2 persons for theft, one for personal violence, 1 person for drunkenness. – Homeless: 5. – Arrested: 8 persons, whereof 2 persons for theft, one for personal violence, 1 person for drunkenness. – Homeless: 5. – Arrested: 8 persons, whereof 2 persons for theft, one for personal violence, 1 person for drunkenness. – Homeless: 5. – Arrested: 8 persons, whereof 2 persons for theft, one for personal violence, 1 person for drunkenness. – Homeless: 5. – Arrested: 8 persons, whereof 2 persons for theft, one for personal violence, 1 person for drunkenness. – Homeless: 5. –

Berlin, 7 Oct. (Tel.) In the Konitz trial, today, the case of Matthias Meyer was discussed. [He denied the accounts of the witnesses. “His daughters, also, Rosa and Franziska Meyer, termed the account completely untrue.” The state prosecutor in Berlin then formally terminated the process against the Family Meyer for lying under oath. The termination report mentioned how unlikely it was that the Family Meyer, if they really had been co-witnesses of a murder plan against Winter, would have betrayed the carefully kept secret in their barn in the way described.]

Agrarian Business. Turf Coal. (Landwirtschaftliches original correspondence of the “Danziger Zeitung”) One has called the treasure of combustible material, stone-coal and brown coal, that lies in the lap of the earth, packaged sunshine, and this description is in certain ways just…[a long description thereof, with reference to the findings of geologists, etc.]

[The report on turf and stone-coal, continued, including speculations as to business exploitation thereof. It is termed a question of great importance for Germany.]

Various. Hamburg, 6 Oct. The High Military Tribunal of the Ninth Infantry Division gave a verdict of guilty to the treasurer Horst, born in Berlin, Horst, from the Fusilier Regiment “Queen” Nr. 86 in Flensburg [2.5 years in Zuchthaus, etc.]

Sport. [Notices from Berlin: the results of horse races. Long list of names of horses.]

Shipping News. [News of ships: where they are bound, with what cargo, whether they got there, which have leaks, which have sunk and why.]

Railway Shipping of Grain in Danzig. [Three lines giving what and how much.]


Raw Sugar. [Private report by Otto Gerike, Danzig. Prices at various German harbor towns.]

Starch. [Prices and types – potato, etc. – in Berlin, by Max Sabersky.]

Wool and Cotton. From Liverpool. Responsible for the political part, literature and the “various”, Dr. W Herrmann. – For “Critical Miscellany”, feuilleton and provincial news, Eduard Winterfeldt. [Etc.]

Most valuable nutrition for Kufeke Child-Flour Healthy and intestinal-ill Children
Family News
The birth of a daughter took place to Dentist Fechner and wife born Mestwerdt Danzig, the 7th of October 1902.

Official Notices
[Narrative of dispossession and auction of possessions of Fräulein Clara Johannsen, probably due to bankruptcy and non-payment of debts]
[Notifications of various business openings]
[Notification of bankruptcy proceedings of the bookseller Anton Berling of Danzig]

Education
General Higher Education Business School for Mädchen
The instruction for this year’s winter semester will begin... Includes:
1. German (letter style)
2. Commercial accounting
3. Book-keeping
4. Calligraphy
5. Instruction in typewriting
6. Drawing and ornamentation
7. Natural sciences
8. Trade geography
9. Stenography
10. Gymnastics...
The Director of the School, Miss Helen Farr, can be reached at certain hours...

Dancing Instruction
[Marie Dufke, Teacher]

Miscellaneous
[Small advertizement for patterns, with PICTURES]

[Large advertizement for "Force", the foodstuff, that is ALL nutrition, with PICTURE of table, sun, harlequin, box of "Force"]

Shipping
To Stockholm
Immediate shipping opportunity send notification of goods to Wilh. Ganswindt

At Home
[Very fancy frame and script]
A German Family Magazine Illustrated Rundschau
From this time – for this time Novels and Novellettes [etc.]
Artistic, Decorative Pictures
Women at Home – House music – House garden – Children at Home – The Collector at home [details on subscription, etc.]

Knitting-Wool Orderer
"Always in Order"
Great savings in knitting wool and time [etc, details]

[Advertizement for metalwork, fences, balcony decorations, etc.]

[Advertizement for Dr. Brehmer’s famous, international curing-institution for tuberculosis, in Schlesine]

OPENING FOR BUSINESS
I would like to inform my esteemed public in Danzig and surroundings, that I on Wednesday, 8th October etc. will be open for business; for the occasion, a "Large Military Concern" will be on offer.

[This notice – of a restaurant 啃house – has a large, fancy frame]

[Medium and small advertizements for a Sanatorium at Zoppot; a notice that Dr. Schröter is "Returned"; for the Royal, Prussian Lottery; for a steam-laundry; for texts for every opera;]

[Small advert for patterns for dresses, "Fertige Schnitte", with "Force" continues here]

City Council Elections in Danzig
[Date, place, “The below-signed recommend that their honored co-citizens re-elect the existing City Council-members...”]

Monetary Matters
1000 Marks
I seek for completely secure investment in town. Answer [postbox]

Entertainment
City Theater
[What is being offered – “The Weapon Smith” – with list of characters, female and male]

Kaiser-Panorama
[Exhibition in Dusseldorf]

Associations
[Meeting of the Association for the Maintenance of Building- and Art-Heritage Monuments in Danzig, with details of what will be discussed]

Entertainment
City Theater
[What is being offered – “The Weapon Smith” – with list of characters, female and male]

Kaiser-Panorama
[Exhibition in Dusseldorf]

Associations
[Meeting of the Association for the Maintenance of Building- and Art-Heritage Monuments in Danzig, with details of what will be discussed]

Entertainment
City Theater
[What is being offered – “The Weapon Smith” – with list of characters, female and male]

Kaiser-Panorama
[Exhibition in Dusseldorf]

Associations
[Meeting of the Association for the Maintenance of Building- and Art-Heritage Monuments in Danzig, with details of what will be discussed]
Nach Putzig

Deutsche Anstaltungsbaank
zu Berlin.

Gr. Wollwebergasse 13.
Schuh-Industrie

Allerbeste Schuhwaren
Nutzen Preußen
Walter Bahrendt.

Laudinen
Staats-Postamt,
Garde-Kommandant
in der Liste.

Ernst Croden, Leipziger Str. 22.

Jockey Club

Blauberger

Karlheiner Zoppot

Kleeberger

Klein Anzeiger.

Walters, Berliner Straße 28.

Verleger

Makelkuren

Hausleben

Kisten

Dortheaus & Richter Berliner

Makelkuren

Richter

Dortheaus

Kisten
Encountering Masculinities: The Display of Self and Others at Chicago’s 1893 World Fair

CHRISTIAN WIDHOLM

This is an article about the social construction of gender, or more specifically, the social construction of bourgeois man, based on an analysis of a North American World Exhibition that took place towards the end of the nineteenth century. The article focuses on the construction of masculine gender: how man was opposed to woman, and how the idea of uncivilized was contrasted with civilized masculinity. These ideals of masculinity would have significant social consequences; the political, industrial and military structures of North America and Western Europe were influenced by the bourgeois male ideal that gained recognition during the last decades of the nineteenth century.

My analysis concentrates on the World Exposition in Chicago, 1893, which commemorated the four-hundredth year anniversary of Columbus’s arrival on the American continent. This is a particularly interesting time, a formative one for the new mass society.1 An examination of the United States increases our understanding of this universal Western phenomenon, for the U.S. was a relatively new actor both as empire-builder and world-exhibitor.

Essentially, world expositions served two purposes: individual nations gained a forum for showing off their achievements in competition with other nations; and the contemporary power elite got the opportunity to present its dream of the ‘perfect’ society. Technology, architecture, colonial conquests and economic strength were exhibited at most expositions, as were – often – those human beings that were seen as being the opposite of the Western male ideal. My analysis of the Chicago Exposition in its cultural context is meant to nuance our picture of world expositions, exploring a world where great men built a ‘city’ of magnificent edifices, while the world of women was represented separately, by a building positioned between the ‘real’ Exposition grounds and amusement fair-like area that housed the colonized people from the peripheries of the empires. Everyone was present, but not equal, at this exposition: the masculine, the feminine and the colonized – gender ideology in the making.

---

1 For a good description of “mass” society, see e.g., Eric Hobsbawm, Kapitalets tidsålder (1994), Chapter 12.
Men and Masculinity

Who were these people, who could represent a whole nation, maybe a whole world, at a world exposition? One might simply term them the male white middle class: the men who inhabited the offices, the editors’ and management positions, the universities, the military academies and the political institutions. The wives (a ‘real’ woman was married) of these great men participated as well, as representatives of their world, gender and nations, but they were not given nearly the same exposure as the men.

Anders Ekström describes this bourgeois culture in *Den utställda världen: Stockholmsutställningen 1887 och 1800-talets världsutställningar* [The Exhibited World: The Stockholm Exhibition 1887 and Nineteenth Century World Exhibitions]. Ekström believes that the Victorian era, which epitomized bourgeois culture, represented a certain moral pathos and a regrettable double moral standard, which originated in the discourse and the social customs of the bourgeoisie. This bourgeois discourse dominated Western public life during the nineteenth century. As Joan Landes and others have pointed out, masculinist bourgeois discourse has its roots in the Enlightenment. In the early bourgeois societies, men with social positions and/or capital gained leading positions. Women were associated with either the decadent monarchy/nobility or with the female domestic reproductive role, and were therefore excluded from the public sphere. Male workers, a fast-growing social group during this period of industrial expansion, were considered much too uneducated to be included in government. While excluding these two large social groups, the ruling men nevertheless viewed the state as an institution that should serve the people.

Bourgeois discourse served to legitimize this distribution of power – by ‘inverting’ it, i.e., by transforming this essentially cultural and ideological phenomenon into something that was ‘natural’ and ‘historical’. This is how the ideology of a powerful social minority came to stand for an entire nation’s history. This history was then constantly re-enacted. Rituals and symbols, such as opening ceremonies and monuments, remain a part of this discourse of power to this day. State and political rites and symbols are almost always associated with something ‘historical’ – something ‘original/natural’ or something new and yet ‘historical’. New states, elites and eras invent new rituals and symbols, which serve as rhetorical confirmations of the ‘original’ and ‘natural’. For example, during the Enlightenment, republican architecture and the politics of antiquity were celebrated as original and manly – as opposed to the ‘feminine’ monarchies of the baroque era; further examples are the late nineteenth century cowboy myth of the United States and the Scandinavian...

---

Viking myth. It should be noted that all of these myths enforce a particular masculine ideal.\(^3\)

Much of this myth-making has been informed by the modern division between public and private. Inasmuch as there was a public sphere – the masculine – there had to be a private sphere. The private sphere was represented by the women, who gave birth to and brought up the children (preferably boys). A ‘real’ woman was a mother and the characteristics that distinguished the woman from the man could be ‘proven’ scientifically – the man became woman’s biological opposite. The natural sciences likewise played an important part in legitimizing the building of empires. Natural sciences could often ‘prove’ that the native peoples of the colonies were inferior, that their subordination was natural. Thus, rational men ‘proved’ that woman was man’s opposite and that colonized people were inferior to the white bourgeois male.

To a large degree, this (bourgeois and male) discourse defined the premises of public debate. However, it did meet opposition. Not everyone agreed that there was one public sphere and that everything else either belonged to the private sphere, or was to be banished to the wilderness. During the nineteenth century, for example, two relatively strong discourses questioned the dominant one: the discourse of the growing number of propertyless wage laborers, demanding representation; and the feminist discourse, which demanded equality between the sexes.\(^4\)

During the late nineteenth century, the dominant discourse of manliness was, for this and other reasons, aggressively on the defensive. Michael Kimmel’s *Manhood in America* tells the story of late-nineteenth century American male identity. According to Kimmel, North America’s foremost male ideal was that of the self-made man. This male ideal thrived among East Coast

---

\(^3\) Maurice Agulhon describes how, during revolutions, the substance rather than the articulation of symbols and rites are changed. See “Politics and Image in Post-Revolutionary France” in Rites of Power: Ritual politics since the Middle Ages (1985). Eric Hobsbawm clarifies the reasons why some traditions are invented: “it is often not because old ways are no longer available or viable, but because they are deliberately not used or adapted. Thus, in consciously setting itself against tradition and for radical innovation, the nineteenth-century liberal ideology of social change systematically failed to provide for social and authority ties taken for granted in earlier societies, and created voids which might have to be filled by invented practices.” Hobsbawm, “Inventing Traditions,” in The Invention of Traditon, ed. Eric Hobsbawm and Terence Ranger (1997). For cowboy and Viking myths see Michael Kimmel, *Manhood in America – A Cultural History* (1997), 148 and Uffe Østergård, ”The Geopolitics of Nordic Identity – From Composite States to Nation-states” in *The Cultural Construction of Norden*, ed. Øystein Sørensen and Bo Stråth (1997).

\(^4\) The opposition to the male, public sphere was not always overt. Research shows, for example, that bourgeois women used their "women only"-organizations, such as charity organizations, as ways of getting entry to the public sphere. See amongst others M. Ryan’s and N. Fraser’s articles in *Habermas and the Public Sphere*, ed. Craig Calhoun (1996).
entrepreneurs who felt that one achieved manliness by being an actor in the public sphere or in the economic sector. This male ideal supplanted that of the previous century, i.e., the *gentle patriarch*, the rich landowner with his roots in the European aristocracy. According to Kimmel, this new male ideal encountered its first transformative crisis right at the time of its inception, around the middle of the nineteenth century. At this time the white middle-class male felt secure in his masculine identity – when acting in the public sphere. However, in the private sphere, in the home, he felt threatened. Here the woman ruled.5

This crisis led to the formation of a male cult that celebrated the wilderness and the noble savage who, supposedly, had escaped the feminizing effects of the home – adventure stories about the West and the actual demographic move to the West contributed to this cult. The men who chose to stay in the East confirmed their masculinity by, to an ever greater degree, using the economic market as a refuge from the feminine home. The male ideal, which existed in a European context as well, had moved further away from the feminine and closer to the wilderness of the romances.6 This longing included a relationship to the ‘colored’ and ‘uncorrupted’ guide or noble savage; homoerotic, maybe, but never egalitarian. Women, insofar as they occurred, were passive and weak; while the concentration on male socialibility could emphasize violence, fistfights and drinking, all of which were taboo in the Victorian home.7

After the Civil War, the male ideal went through further serious crises. There were now new threats such as ‘crowds of uneducated workers’, ‘loud-mouthed women’, ‘homosexuals’, ‘emancipated slaves’, ‘immigrants’, and ‘hoodwinking aristocrats’ from the South. If one were to keep one’s dominance in society, these groups would have to be excluded from the public sphere; they became ‘the Others’, the *self-made man*’s opposite.8

The *self-made man* now began to find refuge in homosocial, antifeminist and racist societies. Around 1900, the various brotherhoods and men’s clubs

---

6 For the masculinization of the wild Northern landscape, see Tallack Moland, ”Kontruksjon av mandighet i det nordlige landskapat – Om Fritjof Nansens polferder ved århudresskiftet,” in *Manligt och omanligt i ett historiskt perspektiv*, FRN Forskningsnämnden Rapport 99:4. See also Kimmel, 14–78.
7 Kimmel, 61-64ff, 124ff, 141ff.
8 These masses also included the unmarried and/or unemployed men, who, in a Swedish context as well, were abhorred by the bourgeois middle class. In the 1890s there was a motion in the Swedish Riksdag to institute a bachelor tax on unmarried men over 25. A bourgeois middle class family was the norm; the concept family was considered synonymous with virtue and morality, and the family father was considered the best proponent of law and order. See Maja Larsson: ”En förgörande ensamhet – Om ogifta män och det moderna livets sköra gränser”, *Manligt och omanligt i ett historiskt perspektiv*, 99:4.
could boast five million members. These all-male societies would occasionally be organized around leisure activities such as baseball and golf. According to Kimmel, this focus on physical activities was a result of a fear of ‘feminine weakness’, which shifted the male ideal towards physical appearance – a muscular body.9

George Mosse’s The Image of Man gives the European version of a similar process. Kimmel traces the incipient focus on the manly body to the last turn of the century. Mosse locates it much earlier, and establishes it as a running theme in what he terms the “normative society’s” (the dominant discourse’s) view of the manly.10

According to Mosse, this ideal was formed in mid-eighteenth century, in part thanks to the influence of the art theoretician Johann Joachim Winckelman, himself inspired by antique Greek statues of athletes. This idea of the manly body fused with the knightly ideal propounded by, for instance, Sir Walter Scott, to compose the manly ideal of the early nineteenth-century middle classes. It was strengthened by authorities such as Rousseau – who considered woman weak and helpless – and the paintings of Jacques-Louis David (who was an admirer of Winckelmann). This background helps us understand the dedication to men’s gymnastics that swept Sweden, Germany and England during the middle of the nineteenth century – the male body was to be molded in the image of the Greek athlete of antiquity.

During the latter part of the nineteenth century, national militarization and the advance of natural science added nuances to this ideal. Using the methods of natural science, anatomist Robert Knox managed to equate the antique Greek athlete to the ‘races’ of northern Europe, while Freidrich Ludwig Janh, a central figure in the gymnastics movement, was instrumental in creating the conception of the conscript soldier and army, being of the opinion that men should be “chaste, pure, capable, fearless, truthful and ready to bear arms”. These characteristics were articulated not only in the (unarmed) individual gymnast, but perhaps even more so in the (unarmed) male community of the soccer field and (armed) soldiers in the trenches. In his deconstruction of this ‘modern masculinity’ Mosse further postulates that it, like the modern nation-state, needed enemies to keep going.11 A ‘we’ implies a ‘they’.

The late nineteenth-century’s supposed decadence, i.e., the growing cities and industrialization, provided a group of ‘others’ of massive proportions. Mosse postulates that dominant men saw ‘women’, ‘workers’, ‘homosexuals’ and ‘Jews’ as their opposites – something that could supposedly be

11 Ibid., 12–55.
scientifically proven. The natural sciences, which were mostly practiced by the dominant men, constantly focused on the man’s physical appearance – men were healthy and strong, like the athletes of antiquity, not like the ‘others’, nervous and sickly.

These are some of the masculinities, and their opposites, that influenced the 1893 World Fair. Crises or no crises, in Chicago 1893 the white, heterosexual middle-class male evidently still made up the dominant social group, as he had during most of the century. Before discussing the Chicago fair, however, some mention must be made of its background and genre.

World Fairs as Genre

By 1893, world fairs were nothing new. In his work on the Stockholm fair of 1897, Anders Ekström sees world fairs as one of the industrialized world’s most important manifestations, a contemporary expression of the “the exuberant joy” of human reason, mirroring order and social hierarchy. He likens the expositions to positivistic churches celebrating progress, optimism and rationality.

This was the apex of an exhibition tradition initiated by England and France during the late nineteenth century. These exhibitions nestled within an earlier well-established tradition, anchored in the Enlightenment, of offering a profusion of much-frequented museums and cabinets, permanent as well as temporary, which exhibited everything under the sun – folk art, ‘freaks’ and ‘exotic peoples’. Their modern roots lay in didactic national industrial exhibitions; as exhibitions of industry, the fairs soon expanded in symbolic, national and economic importance. At world expositions, nations scrutinized each other’s exhibitions; an ongoing “peaceful competition” was carried on with “war metaphors”.

12 Ibid., 80–91. It should be mentioned that Mosse also describes the emerging labor movement’s view on masculinity (122ff), and reaches the conclusion that it might have found nuanced alternatives to the prevailing ideal, but that, ultimately, labor embraced an existing hyper-masculine ideal.
13 Mosse (1996a), 78-82.
14 Ekström 20ff, 57ff.
15 In 1837, the Mechanics’ Institute in England introduces didactic exhibitions in order to ”civilize” the nation’s workers by aid of rational sciences and esthetic edification. The entrance fees were adjusted so as to attract the working-class. Ekström, 28ff.
16 In ”Rituals and representation: Ethnic stereotypes and colonized peoples at world’s fairs” in Fair Representations – World’s Fairs and the Modern World, ed. Robert W. Rydell & Nancy E. Gwin (1994), Burton Benedict expresses the opinion that the tradition of exhibiting human beings might have its roots as far back as Roman times. According to Benedict, there are four ways in which humans can be exhibited as objects: they can be curiosities ("freaks"), craftsmen ("the German blacksmith"), objects of conquest (colonized peoples – this tradition has its roots in antiquity) and/or objects of science (these may also be colonized peoples: "wild", "wilder", "wildest").
Between 1855 and 1900, France assumed the role of patron of world culture. It was in France that the encyclopedical exposition was created, i.e., an exposition that presented an amalgamation of all the new insights of the time, a meeting-place for knowledge. The combination of classically constructed buildings, modern technology – specifically, electricity - with exotic peoples, all contained within defined national identities, became standard features of expositions to come, and would draw great crowds of people. In the late nineteenth century, the American elite made its debut on this international exposition arena.

In Philadelphia in 1876 and Chicago in 1893, the North American elite defined its vision of the world with the aid of symbols, mythology and esthetics. Both expositions were informed by an evolutionary ideology. Classical buildings were juxtaposed to exotic peoples, in order to emphasize the difference in degree of civilization between the industrialized world and its colonies. In *Fair Representations*, David Scoby analyzes the gender aspects of these expositions. He emphasizes two gendered features of the 1876 Philadelphia Exposition. One was “Election Day”, when men participated in parades and ‘voted’. Women, meanwhile, were termed “the key-stone of civilization”, but kept to the background – they stayed in their pavilion and socialized amongst themselves. The Philadelphia Exposition’s Women’s Building was comparable to an ideal middle-class home, a place where women were not only virtuous, but where they were also trained to be mothers, to willingly nourish and serve the Republic (although this Women’s Pavilion simultaneously and anomalously displayed women’s achievements in various economic professions). A second feature of gender division was the controversy over the presentation of the exposition’s ‘ideal home’. As Scoby describes it, the competition was between two architects, Andrew Jackson Downing – who saw it as his task to preserve male authority – and Catherine Beecher. Downing wanted to protect middle-class men against feminine influence and to create a home that primarily served as a place of recreation for men – a place where they could recuperate after a hard day of acting in the public sphere or in the world of finance. Esthetically his house was not unlike the castle-like hotel edifices of the era. Beecher, however, was of the opinion that Downing’s luxurious buildings were too costly and that their kitchens were impractical. In other words, Beecher envisioned the home as a work place for women, which should be designed accordingly. Downing built his house around a masculine library while Beecher built hers around a feminine kitchen. Downing’s model won out. All of this mirrored current pictures of – as well as challenges to, and negotiations within – national gender stereotypes,

---

17 See David Scobey’s article in *Fair Representations*.
oppositions, articulations and hierarchization. In the following, we shall look for similar symbolism in the Chicago World Fair.

A Tour through the Chicago Fair

Tools of gender and discourse analysis allow us to uncover the normative manliness displayed at the 1893 Chicago World Fair. Our analysis will be based on seven contemporary primary sources: four illustrated albums / periodicals (Martin’s World Fair Album, Portfolio of Photographic Views, Svenska Tribunens Pictoral Guide and World’s Columbian Exposition Illustrated), one newspaper (The New York Times), and three sources chosen to nuance the dominating masculine voice: the Swedish cookbook Hemmets Drottning [The Queen of the House] and the pamphlets Reports from the Swedish Ladies’ Committee and The Social Conditions of Swedish Women (all of which were published in conjunction with the fair).

Our tour will work on a geographic principle (see the map of the fair). We shall start at the fair’s outskirts – the pleasure grounds and freak shows of the extremely popular Midway Plaisance, situated at the border of the fair. From here, we will work our way inwards, past the Woman’s Building, in order to end up at the fair’s power center, White City.
Midway Plaisance: Displaying the Uncivilized

As Burton Benedict pointed out, the provision of a public pleasure ground was nothing unique to the Chicago Fair. This was the area where the general public could amuse itself with carousels – and where the civilized world would exhibit ‘its’ savage and exotic peoples. It is the latter aspect we shall focus on here. In Midway, the colonized peoples were exhibited in such a way as to indicate that they were outlandish, odd, primitive and simple – and also savage and dangerous. At the same time, it was emphasized that the exhibited people were kings and queens from the wild regions of the world – this demonstrated the superiority of the white race, which could make use of royalty in an exhibition. It was here, at the amusement fair-like part of the exposition, that the imperialist world demonstrated its power – to both visitors and the local population.

Stereotypes were constructed and reproduced at Midway. For example, Bushmen were shown forth as the missing link in the (social-darwinistic) evolutionary chain, while Native Americans were displayed in a manner indicating that their future depended on their becoming civilized by the American administration. These people were not considered persons. Certain types of Europeans were displayed, as well. According to Benedict, the display of European peoples served a specific purpose; they gave the American public an understanding of its own cultural background.

Posters, post cards and pamphlets reproduced both sorts of stereotypes. For the arrangers of the exposition, both provided a lucrative business. Benedict warns against simplifying the relationship between the exhibited people and the public. It should not be seen as a simple power relationship. Often the relationship was purely

---

commercial: the public paid for watching and the exhibited people took their fees – neither audience nor performer would have recognized our version of the underlying power relationship.19

The various ‘natives’ were meant to interest and intrigue. We find the ‘native’ American portrayed as an object of some respect in a popular publication picturing the Exhibition, Martin’s World’s Fair Album-atlas (see Picture 1). Here he appears with a woman, carefully placed in an exotic wilderness. The woman is scarcely feminine by Victorian standards; but she is certainly less manly than the ‘savage’, who appears complete with gun between his legs.

Respect for the manly savage was integral to the part he was supposed to play in the elite’s theater of power. The New York Times reported on the inauguration of the fair, during which a parade carried President Cleveland through the streets of Chicago. The inauguration ceremony included living decorations:

   Along the front of the Administration Building, just below the spring of the dome, stood fifty Indians in full war paint and feathers, silent and immovable, waiting the coming of the great white chieftain.20

The noble savage, silent and immovable, is here acknowledging his superior. His occurrence does more than connote the conquest of North America by Europeans. It is also reminiscent of the longing away from the home to virgin territories of homosocial sociability described by Kimmel. The native’s self-discipline and manly silence is also reminiscent of Winckelmann’s classic athlete; during the First World War the male ideal would be the silent, strong men who were sent to the Front, so self-disciplined and manly as to prefer fists to weapons. This silent, strong male can be contrasted to some of the other figures that met the President on his way through the exhibition (to continue with The New York Times):

   There was a sharp contrast between the crowds of the [Michigan] Boulevard and the quaint figures in their bizarre dress, of the denizens of the Plaisance. Arabs, Egyptians, Javanese, Nubians, Congolese, Soudanese, Moors, Chinese […] were grouped on either side of the roadway ready to do obedience to the ruler of the great American Nation.21

Here we have on display peoples who were less savage, less noble, and less

19 Benedict, 28-44.
20 New York Times May 2nd 1893.
21 Ibid.
This corresponds to a contemporary hierarchization of colonized peoples – all seen from the viewpoint of the colonizing white male, who sees and describes, while himself giving physical proof of the strength, self-discipline and self-sacrificing rationality necessary to the colonizing male.22

In the popular World’s Columbian Exposition Illustrated, an article on Midway Plaisance in fact comes close to being a replica of the colonial travel account, rather like a distillate of an entire discourse. In the article, the author ‘travels’ through Midway Plaisance and reports on the simulated colonies and their inhabitants. Each people, each culture is given its expression and place; the women appropriately grouped in the Beauty Show, the men doing their various fantastic things (and note the passing insertion, in this motley company, of the American Working Man):

---

22 The historian Koht writes about Fritjof Nansen: "Ingen mann kan vel hete en mann i så full og dyp mening som Fritjof Nansen. Manns mot, mans vilje og mans styrke, mans djervhet og mans [...] ofervillighet – alt er samlet [...] i Nansens [...] gjerning [...]". Quoted from Tallak Moland’s "Kontruksjon av mandighet," in Manligt och omanligt i ett historiskt perspektiv. See also, in re colonialism, Mills, 100, 109ff.
Let us take a walk through this nearly a mile of separate entertainments and see what we can find. [...] We will boldly enter the Beauty Show where forty ladies from forty nations are said to be dressed in their native costumes, singing their native songs and doing such work as represents some of their native industries. Passing a small model of the Philadelphia Working Men’s Home, we come to the Hindoo jugglers, snake charmers, and prestidigitators, who performed many feats never before seen in America.

The more primitive peoples, such as the Javanese, are displayed as whole villages.

The Javanese Village with its population of 125 strange little people was very interesting. Some twenty bamboo cottages encircled the space assigned to them, and in the center they had a theater with native orchestra and dancing girls. A few steps further west we saw a man beating a drum on the back of a camel.

The Orient, of course, can only be displayed as a bazaar; here, in a mode that Edward Said would recognize, we find not only odd men, children and animals, but also still more “dancing girls”:

Going with the crowd we found ourselves in the “Streets of Cairo,” not Cairo in Egypt, but an exact reproduction of one of their streets, shops, bazaars, hotels, private residences, theaters, wrestlers, jugglers, camels, donkeys, donkey boys and dancing girls. [...] While great crowds were enjoying a ride 262 feet skywards in that monster Ferris Wheel, we filled our pockets with trinkets from the Algerian merchants and heard the story of their theater attractions. The Japanese bazaar was full of the skill and cunning of that people in native wares and no wonder they found good patronage.

As the mention of the Ferris Wheel indicates, all this is interspersed with a ‘fun’ and ‘boyish’ masculinity. In the midst of the civilized writer’s report on all the peoples of the world we find Tivoli-like attractions that are evidently the most fun for the boys, and perhaps even for the adult male writer:

[...] after looking for a moment at the encampment of American Indians, we visit the Ostrich Farm, pick a feather from one of those twenty-six mammoth birds, tarry a moment next door to hear the native Brazilians sing [...] The Ice railway [...] fun for the boys.

Such fun is interspersed with additional Oriental delights (as well as Oriental
greed), of a colorfulness and variety that makes the observer question the idea of a Single Creation.

[Then] we have the Mohammedan Temple, Turkish Village and Bazaar, full of everything interesting, from that far away land and here also the Turkish theater with a full troupe of performers, dancing girls, wrestlers and jugglers, Armenians, Turks, Persians, all mixed up together, and all striving to fill their pockets with American dollars […]. [L]et us inquire how it is, that all these strange people could have been descended from Adam and Eve.23

The article’s sometimes exuberant tone (which gives the impression that the author participated in the amusement) does not hide the fact that he feels a certain suspicion towards the “odd peoples”. There is little mention of the noble savage here. Rather, timeless, half-civilized and exotic peoples seem to cluster around the author, dancing, juggling, bargaining and singing. One catches a glimpse of the uncivilized workers, as the author passes a model of a worker’s home.24 The novel’s manly savage – he who is silent and immobile – is not the subject here. The unmanliness of those portrayed might, rather, serve to confirm the masculinity of the ‘manly author’.

The masculinization of the gazer, when confronted with these slightly effeminate peoples (among whom one could enjoy oneself, as were one a child) can also be tied, in some contemporary descriptions of Midway, to the conflation (mentioned by Kimmel and Mosse) of the feminine with the encroaching masses. In an earlier issue of World’s Columbian Exposition Illustrated, some of the Midway’s exhibited inhabitants were described as “people of Oriental extraction […] a commercial race from their very foundation”. The writer saw these commercial (feminine) people, who evidently shared so regrettably little with the literary world’s male savage, as a threat, as “a large number of them are planning to become permanent citizens.”25

This brings us to the role immigrants played in the construction of contemporary white North American manliness. The large numbers of immigrants in

---

24 Towards the end of the nineteenth century, when masses of workers flocked to giant factories, there were expressions that stamped untrained labor and laborers as unmanly. The dominant middle- and upper-class men often felt that manliness inhered, to a large extent, in one’s profession; the new jobs in the giant factories implied an arbitrary subjugation which was scarcely manly. See, among others, Kimmel (1997), 83ff. The same point is mentioned in Inger Humlesjö’s ”Manlighetskonstruktion i arbetarihistoria och fackföreningar” and Kimmel’s ”Manlighetens ’osynlighet’ i amerikansk samhällsvetenskap” in Manligt och omanligt i ett historiskt perspektiv 99:4.
Chicago, quartered right next to the exposition, some of whom were even to be found amongst its visitors, might occasion a certain apprehension. Not all immigrants were equal. Northern Europeans, the descendants – as one writer puts it – of Vikings, were much to be preferred to (feminized, Oriental, Southern European, Catholic) riffraff. For an expression of this view, see Martin’s World’s Fair Album, “Discourses on the life of Columbus,” subheading “Columbus and Washington.” Here, a number of Christian ministers were invited to describe their vision of Columbus’s life and the effects he had had on the present. They obviously wish he had been Protestant.

Although we cannot fail to admire his intrepidity, let us not forget the Norsemen who settled in the borders of our own territory, and to them belong the first honors. We are their descendants. At the beginning of our second century of national life, we are beset with dangers arising from the presence of the inferior races of southern Europe. These races desire to rule, and if they should gain that power in this country, we would rapidly find ourselves in the same position as the countries of South America. We have lost much of the zeal which belongs to the Catholic Church of this nation. That which our forefathers cast aside we have taken up, and we have taken much which we ought to have left alone [...].

The people from Southern Europe were considered inferior, and were therefore less welcome as immigrants. Northern Europeans, by contrast, if still sometimes ethnic and colorful (as, in the quote below, peaceably and merrily singing), were received with more benevolence. *World’s Columbian Exposition Illustrated* described Chicago’s “German village” as being jovial and pleasant, and *Svenska Tribunens Pictorial Guide to Chicago and the World’s Fair* viewed the very large numbers of “Cousin Hans” in Chicago with pleasure:

> With a population of at least 390,000 Germans resident in Chicago [...]. Peaceable, merry, and musical as our best citizen the German is, his biergarten is worthy of a visit to watch him, home again in Vaterland in spirit, in beverage, and in song.

The fair, and Midway in particular were, in short, places where the male gender was constructed. A couple of principal signifiers emerge: ‘the manly savage’, who seemed to hold a certain place within the bourgeois male community, and

---

26 Martin’s World’s Fair Album-atlas.
‘the unmanly, exotic creature’, who accentuated the white man’s masculinity by functioning as a contrast. The ‘manly savage’ who was even allowed to be present in the White City’s gala hall (if merely as an ornamental extra) during the inauguration, was seen as determined, strong and potent and, at the same time, of noble, innocent and uncivilized character. The others, ‘the unmanly, exotic creatures’, were considered nervous and agitated. They would be dancing and juggling and would be loud and perhaps even sly. The ‘unmanly, exotic creature’ did not appear to be sufficiently savage to be noble. He already belonged to a sort of civilization – an inferior (feminine?) half-civilization.

These discursive identities may be expressions of the ideology described in Mosse’s *The Image of Man*. With growing urbanization and industrialization, the “others” began to be perceived as the ‘masses’. The ‘others’ were the homosexuals, the women, the Jews and the workers. They were the opposite of the dominating man. He was healthy and strong like the antique athlete – or like the silent immovable Indian. The “others” were nervous, agitated and maybe even sickly.

But Midway also seemed to allow the expression of a playful manliness. It functioned as an amusement park where men were allowed to act like boisterous boys, among its many attractions. Midway was a place where the male gender was constructed, but it was not a place informed by a didactic, civilizing spirit. Rather, it was the place where strict bourgeois control was somewhat loosened. This is not the case for the next stop of our journey from the periphery, to the center of the fair – the Woman’s Building.
**Bourgeois Woman as Civilizing Male Antipode**

When members of the public walked from Midway to what a writer in *World’s Columbian Exposition Illustrated* called “the real exposition”, their first encounter with the latter was probably the Woman’s Building (see *Picture 3*). This bastion of civilization, which was explicitly didactic and civilizing in character, could be seen as a sentry between the chaotic Midway and the White City with its high culture. And, insofar as the man was the opposite of the woman, this building added characteristics to the desirable types of manliness.

During the latter half of the nineteenth century, Women’s Buildings at world expositions illustrated middle-class women’s multifaceted struggle to gain access to the public sphere. The Chicago Fair was no exception. The fact that candidates for the leading positions in *The Board of Lady Managers* were chosen by men hardly made this struggle less complex.²⁹

Here, the separation between the women’s and men’s spheres was clearly demonstrated. The Woman’s Pavilion symbolized ‘the ideal home’ – a place where women not only remained virtuous but also developed their abilities to be mothers and to fulfill their role as carriers of civilization, their ability to nurture and serve the Republic.³⁰ If one imagines that a visitor to the exposition had started out by visiting Midway Plaisance and then made his way by foot towards the White City, the first building he would encounter would be a strong contrast to the amusement fair-like Midway.

Fair publications both pictured, described, and commented on the Women’s Building. *Martin’s World’s Fair Album-atlas* describes the building as ”mellow decorated […], bathed in the bright sunshine, grace and harmony are depicted from all standpoints.”³¹ *Portfolio of photographic views* informs us that ”[i]t is considered noteworthy that the female sex, celebrated for its love of ornament, placed in Jackson Park the plainest of its buildings. The style is called Italian Reneeissance [sic]”.³² The *World’s Columbian Exposition Illustrated* wrote further on feminine beauties (see *Picture 4*) and women’s ability to organize.

Of course, the women were to be congratulated on this organizational ability:

> The advancement of this work from the start, has reminded one of the science with which a weighty body is started to roll, guided by a steady hand […] perfect management and a clearly directed course. The ambiguousness that characterizes the business system of the majority

---

²⁹ Gilbert, James: ”World`s Fairs as historical events” in *Fair Representations*, 22. See also Judy Sund’s article in *Art Bulletin*, Sep 93.

³⁰ But, as I mentioned above, the Pavilion combined both the conservative knitting and cooking and, to some degree, the radical – in celebrating the increased fields of paid work, women’s increased access to professions earlier “forbidden”. See Scobey, 95-101.

³¹ *Martin’s World’s Fair Album-atlas*.

³² *Portfolio of photographic views of the World’s Columbian Exposition Chicago 1893.*
of women’s associations, has been noticeably exempt here [...].\textsuperscript{33}

Martin’s World’s Fair Album, meanwhile, further particularized the Pavilion by describing it as containing ”such things as women are particularly and vitally interested in, and which do not properly belong to the general competitive classification” (this is, the competition for awards between industrial products, machines, art, etc., which otherwise characterized world fairs).\textsuperscript{34}

These male writers clearly perceived a polarization between male and female. This polarization is only somewhat modified by the contemporary publications of visiting and participant women. Articles in the fair-related pamphlets Reports from the Swedish Ladies’ Committee and The Social Condition of the Swedish Women and in the advisory cookbook Hemmets Drottning both enforce and nuance this picture of polarization. Most of all, these publications articulate woman’s duties as a carrier of civilization – civilizing the entire world, it would seem, as the publications deal with ”exotic peoples”, ”workers” and ”the entire family of man” in turn. Reports from the Swedish Ladies’ Committee explains the duties and responsibilities of public women in Sweden. Here, we find areas where ”Swedish women” held

\textsuperscript{33} World’s Columbian Exposition Illustrated Vol II no 8, “The Illinois Woman’s Board.”

\textsuperscript{34} Martin’s World’s Fair Album-atlas, ”General information”. However, some of the objects shown in the Women’s Pavilion seem to appear in other places, as well; at the exhibition of Manufacture and Art 62 Swedes displayed their products – which included embroidery, curtains, plaster figurines, water-colors, laces, dolls and table-cloths. See Manns’ appendixes VII-XI. On the division, stemming from the mid-1700s, between “manly” and “womanly” art, Mosse (1996a), 28ff and idem., The nationalization of the masses (1996b), 52. For Rousseau, e.g., Landes, 46.
significant positions. Under the heading *Philanthropy* we find them promoting civilization. One of Swedish women’s duties was to mold the ‘wild’ northerners, as is apparent in the list and description of various women’s organizations:

The Lapland Mission Friends of Stockholm, established in 1880 by Princess Eugenie [...] for bringing up the children of Laplanders into useful Christians. [...] The Five Farthing Society for establishing Charity Boarding Schools in Lapland, founded at Stockholm in 1864 [...] to bring up the children of Laplanders into Christian members of the community.35

Laplanders, on the one hand; but workers were an object, as well. We remember passing (in the article on Midway in *World’s Columbian Exposition Illustrated*) ”a small model of the Philadelphia Working Men’s Home”. The workers, uncivilized, seem to be presented like an exotic people. They were not present in the ‘salons’ of the White City, but rather in the fairground-like area of Midway. But these, the masses, were not hopelessly lost to civilization. Rather, it was the duty of bourgeois women to civilize them. One way to achieve this goal was to make working-class women adhere to bourgeois styles of housekeeping. In the following quote from *Reports from the Swedish Ladies’ Committee*, we find special schools that attend to this:

After this model, and generally, on the same principles, with modifications, schools [of Practical Housekeeping] have been founded in several towns of Sweden. [...] At Gothenburg the largest brewery, Carnegie, founded in 1891 just such a school for daughters of workmen of the brewery, with the special purpose to teach them everything necessary to become good and useful housewives for workmen, and, if unmarried, good servants.36

General education would, indeed, make ‘truly womanly’ civilizers (or servants) out of females of all classes. To be sure, civilized women were to be properly patriotic, as well, which entailed education beyond rough housework:

The object of the People’s High Schools for Women [*Folkhögskolor för kvinnor*] is to develop the mental faculties of the pupils, to make them comprehend true womanliness and excite an interest in subjects

---

35 *Reports from the Swedish Ladies’ Committe to the World’s Columbian Exposition at Chicago 1893*, 36.
36 “Philanthropy”, 21, in ibid.
relating to: 1. General education and 2. Training in manual work. It is no housekeeping school and does not want to be considered as chiefly aiming at imparting such knowledge to the girls as exclusively belongs to the province of housework. The object in view is principally to develop the mental faculties of the girls as far as this can be achieved by a knowledge of the language, history and character of the native country, by acquaintance with the laws of nature, and by reading the best that our literature offers. [...] The schools is [sic] however far from overlooking the importance of the rougher housework most women have to take part in.37

The girls were, further, given exercise. It seems that much attention was being paid to physical exercise, since "[a]ttention has been drawn to the danger of intellectual over-exertion and attempts have been made to arrange school-work so as to allow the pupils out-of-door exercise during the earlier part of the day".38 However, only boys were subjected to the Ling gymnastics’ system of ‘military drill’.

Of course, as The Social Condition of the Swedish Women pointed out, other types of women’s initiative would have to be shown in cases when civilization through schooling did not work. Those of the European working class who did not allow themselves to be civilized, of which the majority were probably the “by nature, unwilling men” mentioned elsewhere in the publication,39 should at least be neutralized.

The Swedish women’s association for the defence of their country […] inspired by patriotism […] to oppose certain tendencies of cosmopolitan and nihilistic character regarding the defence of the country, to be met with in Sweden as in other parts of Europe.40

Here we find a didactic, conservative national discourse, with its roots in the Enlightenment and natural sciences, which valued open engagement on behalf of hierarchical nationalism. This was by no means a gender-neutral discourse. Rather, ‘the real woman’ was the goddess of the nation and ‘the real man’ was her protector; organized workers were therefore unmanly and, sometimes, anti-national nihilists.41

37 Ibid., 31.
38 “Education,” 49-55, in ibid.
40 Ibid., 29.
The woman described and defended in these pamphlets was the teacher of the nation’s children (both child and adult); a morally superior person, with a particular nature that limited her, but provided her with significance. Special women’s organizations and schools would channel women’s ‘natural’ ability to civilize anyone – the heathens of the wilderness and the workers of big cities (directly, through general education, or indirectly, through their wives and daughters). The powerful woman (the specter, if Kimmel is right, haunting late nineteenth-century masculinity) was emerging from the home. In the home, meanwhile – according to books such as the Swedish Queen of the Home – her power was near-absolute. Here, her mission extended to those men who, although supposedly at the forefront of civilization, were still to feel the bourgeois woman’s civilizing hand – for even the noble, manly savage was an inappropriate inhabitant in the woman’s domestic realm.

The Queen of the Home gives us a good picture of this realm, the realm that the men described by Kimmel were attempting to flee. Here, the war of civilization was taken into the very bed-chamber. “Night caps are a relic from barbarous times.” Nineteenth-century advisory publications for women often reproduced the image of ‘the weak woman’: she could not cope with a job on the masculine labor market, nor did she have the strength to travel in the colonized regions. But in Hemmets Drottning, she appears as a mighty ruler. One of the major weapons wielded only by woman, a weapon that allowed her to control and civilize ”the entire masculine gender”, was, it seems, her physical appearance – combined with good dinners. In the introduction to the chapter Toilette, the writer stresses the importance of looking good – through beauty ‘we’ gain power and become capable of governing the men – these men who were considered ‘creaters in a new world’.

Ever since the memorable day when the Queen of Sheba paid a solemn visit to Solomon […] beauty has decided the fate of dynasties and

---

42 Concerning the Republic’s, and all the reformed monarchies’ ”national, real woman”, see Landes 169-205 and M. P. Ryan’s article in Habermas and the Public Sphere, ed. Craig Calhoun (1996). Reports from The Swedish Ladies Committee, “Public Service, Trade and Business”, says about woman’s “natural” limitations that “[she] seldom makes any inventions”; in “Literature and Art”, that “[i]n Sweden, as elsewhere, outward circumstances often put a check on the artistic activity of women. Her physical strength is inferior to man’s, she is subject to domestic restraints”. The same section also described ”the real man”. The pamphlet does include accounts of women of importance to Swedish literary history, but not only as successful authors, but also as married. Saint Birgitta’s husband is described as ”a man of high standing and noble qualities”.

43 Hemmets Drottning, 587. Translation, throughout, by editor.


45 Hemmets Drottning. In the Introduction, the goal is described as ”the government’s great home for unprotected children”: the boys should be taught educated to be creators and the girls ”should be endowed with an intelligence that should follow her from her earliest childhood to her last, dying day (the late day of old age).”
men’s lives. To become beautiful and thus powerful is therefore for women a more important issue than predestination, the origin of the species or the question of tariffs. If women are to govern and guide men, fathers, brothers, lovers – in short, the entire masculine gender – and to keep their admiration, then they must always and under all conditions stay as lovely as possible.46

This fits well with the (male and female) tradition of women achieving power through sexual attraction. In this case, however, less through vanity and make-up; that was not worthy the bourgeois woman. Rather, through a somewhat puritanical attention to cleanliness:

Any woman can look good, and it is possible, to a large degree, to make up for physical defects and to develop the figure. The first step towards a beautiful appearance is good health, and the foremost condition for good health is cleanliness. Wash often, bathe regularly.47

The book’s presentation of feminine gender identity links an advantageous appearance to health, water, and artfully arranged meals: beauty civilized – with the aid of good dinners. Indeed, sometimes the link between food and the female exterior seemed intimate. Before the food was consumed, the fair teacher could use it for so much else: ”pimples”, ”blackheads”, ”beauty-spots” and ”freckles” could be kept down with amongst other things ”honey”, ”salt”, ”lily bulbs”, ”flour”, ”horse radish”, ”lemon”, ”water [!]”, ”whiskey”, ”Bay rum”, ”oil of bergamot”, ”root of violet” and ”carbolic acid”. 48

Once her exterior had been attended to, the woman could concentrate on exerting her civilizing effect at the dining-room table. This was women’s domain, according to a strict division between (masculine) science and (female) civilization: for, as the Queen admonishes us, “[o]ne can be an excellent scientist and yet lack proper table manners.”49 The chapter Table Manners provides all the necessary instructions. The surroundings were to breath order, symmetry, pleasant harmony, and a sort of kindergarten atmosphere of domestic tolerance:

A table can be set tastefully and elegantly as quickly and effortlessly, as when platters and plates are just thrown on, so to speak, without the least consideration of order or symmetry. The dining room should be

---

46 Ibid., 580.
47 Ibid., 580.
48 Ibid., 587f.
49 Ibid., 39f.
joyful and pleasant, its mistress should show her most joyous countenance. All questioning, worries and unpleasantness should be banned from the table.\textsuperscript{50}

This was to be combined with the actors’ own internalized, moderate, easy, polite and graceful self-discipline, all part of the instructive performance of civilization (“noblesse in action”):

Furthermore, one must not wolf down the food in five or ten minutes. [...] Act in a relaxed manner at the table, neither too free nor too forced; one must not show any conscious anxiety about following the rules of good table manners, and yet one must be guided by them, both at home and abroad, and thus show true nobility of character, where so often the opposite is being demonstrated. One must avoid appearing “particular” and affected, be it in clothing or behavior, and must take pains to overlook other people’s faults.\textsuperscript{51}

Seen from the perspective of woman being superior in terms of morality and refinement, even the bourgeois, civilized man was presented as a supposed pupil of the real woman. No wonder men fled to the Wild West, or – at world fairs – to the public and powerful world of the Great White Chief.

**Next Stop: White City**

In Midway we met the man who perhaps had something ‘wild’ in him. He was comparable to both the noble savage, and an amusing and somewhat unruly boy. In the Woman’s Pavilion and in contemporary literature on women’s roles and nature we find one antipode: the civilizing woman, who in schools did publicly what the \textit{Queen of the Home} instructed her to do at the dining room table: she tamed both barbarian and boy. It is time to turn to “the real exhibition”, as \textit{World’s Columbian Exposition Illustrated} puts it, a place aptly described by Anders Ekström as

An articulation full of meaning, a didactic and educational show that called for the consent of the public and the socialization (of the public) in a collective project [to] create a broad and stable foundation for a new social system – the bourgeois-capitalist industrial society. \textsuperscript{52}

Women might seek to domesticate men; but in the fair’s White City, white, middle-class, ethnically centrist men sought to establish their political power.

\textsuperscript{50} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{51} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{52} Ekström 215f. Translations by the editor.
Others became national subjects, worthy objects of openly articulated male power. Or, as Ekström put it,

World’s fairs performed a hegemonic function precisely because they propagated the ideas and values of the country’s political, financial, corporate, and intellectual leaders and offered these ideas as the proper interpretation of social and political reality.53

In the White City one found the great monuments, the exhibition halls for art, agriculture, machinery, woodworks, etc. The White City was a shrine to positivism – here ruled rationality, progress and optimism. This was an encyclopedical exhibition, a great amalgamation of the era’s knowledge. Here one found the classical-style buildings and the electricity. But not everyone was included in the White City – one did not find the strange peoples here, those were confined to the distant Midway Plaisance. The Woman’s Pavilion was only slightly closer.

The White City was used, not unexpectedly, for the display of archaic rituals of national power – wedded, incongruously, to positivistic celebrations of technology. On the day of inauguration, the first of May, President Cleveland accompanied Chicago’s Mayor, exhibition arrangers and organizers and other dignitaries in a carriage-driven, police- and cavalry-supervised procession through Chicago. They had entered the Fair by way of Midway Plaisance. This provided contrast enough, as we have seen above, according to the writer in *The New York Times*:

> The route lay down the boulevard to Washington Park and through the Midway Plaisance to the Administration Building. There was a sharp contrast between the crowds of the [Michigan] Boulevard and the quaint figures […] of the Plaisance […] grouped on either side of the roadway ready to do obedience to the ruler of the great American Nation.54

When the President and the other dignitaries were all present, the inauguration ceremony could commence. By pressing a button, President Cleveland started the machines and the fountains, and the public streamed in. *The New York Times* portrayed the great and manly President in the midst of his combined archaic and technocratic symbols of power:

> Grover Cleveland, calm and dignified, in a few eloquent words

53 Ekström 215f.
delivered in a clear voice, which was heard by a great multitude gathered before him, declared the World’s Columbian Exposition open a few minutes after noon to-day and touched the ivory-and-gold key which alerted the machinery, gave play to the fountains, and unfurled the flags and banners of the ”White City”.55

The calm, dignified and articulate President seemed to have attracted other men, who were also of the opinion that manliness was a virtue that was distinctive to the public sphere. Indeed, there was some competition for this (media-heralded) stage of manliness and power. The New York Times reporter described men on the platform who did not seem to pay enough attention. This was not the case of Chicago’s mayor, Carter H. Harrison:

He pushed himself forward and spoke to president Cleveland, so that by no possibility could he be overlooked. His strategy was successful. He got a magnificent reception.56

The quotes describe male rites that highlight positions of power and, in extension, produce subordination. The use of ‘historical’ public rituals was a conventional method for consolidating power. Its grammar was well-known – public rituals had been well established during the Middle Ages, and further refined during the era of Absolutism. Throughout, the coronations of kings and their associated ritualized tours of the country had served to legitimize them as rulers. In Chicago in 1893, these articulations appeared to be deeply rooted in tradition. However, their content was not particularly traditional. Rather, rituals and symbols developed by monarchies were used to legitimize a new, masculine and Republican order. In order to demonstrate their power, the bourgeois elite employed traditional rites of power.

We can trace the mixing of signs, traditional and modern, in this articulation. According to The New York Times, the dignitaries rode in solemn procession, while regular people took the streetcar: this was filling old bottles of aristocratic ritual with manly, republican wine. The inauguration ceremony itself could be seen as a coronation. However, this was not the coronation of some effeminate monarch. Rather, this was the celebration of the ideal masculine world where everything was in its right place: there was Midway Plaisance, an amusement fair-like area for the ‘others’, not part of ”the park proper”; there was a Pavilion for the women, built in a somewhat unmasculine architecture ”called Italian Renaissance.” In the White City, one found all the innovations of the positive sciences exhibited in halls that resembled antique

55 Ibid.
56 Ibid.
temples, presided over by a giant statue representing idealized Republican womanliness—Republica. (See Picture 5.)

These ceremonies of power were, of course, reported, narrated and amplified by that new and powerful actor, the mass media. Indeed, the (male) journalists seemed to be interested, not only in reporting, but also in getting in on the act. This was certainly true of the journalist from *The New York Times*. During the inauguration, the crush of the crowd had been such that the press lectern had become virtually a camp hospital. And imagine what would have happened to the poor audience, had the press not been there! "[I]f they [including fainting women] had not been dragged out of the crowd by the newspaper men [they would have succumbed]". The journalist becomes a manly hero, saving the helpless, at the same time as he describes the rituals that constructed and reproduced the male, public power that created subject-citizens. On the whole, male order reigned over (feminine) weakness; that is, as the *New York Times* journalist put it, "[i]f the terror of the crowd could be forgotten for a moment".

**Rites, Monuments and Authority**

Social domination was articulated through rites, ceremonies and pomp. But it was also articulated through symbols, and in this case the great buildings can be seen as the dominant men’s symbols of power. The monuments of the White City fit into a grammar that has its roots in antiquity. Monuments were
buildings that, in ancient times, served to communicate the ruler’s demand for compliance to an illiterate people.59

Republica, the gigantic statue, could be a representation of the virtuous, pure woman who knew that her place was in the home where she could produce soldiers for the nation. As the most grandiose of all the statues in the White City, the goddess Republica could be seen as a contrast to the frivolous femininity of Midway. The White City was, to a great extent, the men’s exhibition, and the statues of women were ornaments on the masculine Republic’s uniform, as was, to some extent, the Women’s Building.

The White City exhibited, however, some variations on the themes of archaic and classic masculinities that may be primarily American – in particular, that of the self-made man. The character of the buildings, as well as their cost in dollars, was a recurring topic in several of the sources. According to The New York Times, the entire exhibition had cost three million dollars. Martin’s World’s Fair Album-atlas mentioned that the foreign contributions, counted in dollars, so far were the greatest of any world exposition.60 In Portfolio of Photographic Views calculations were likewise made. For example, the author described the Administration Building (Picture 6) and The Statue of Republic as follows:

The administration building. This structure nobly sustained the expectations of the public, and held a sovereign position among all the wonders of the Fair […] serving as headquarters for the chief officers of the Exposition […]. The rotunda was ornamented with panels that bore the names of nations and celebrated men, with didactic inscriptions; and the upper part of the vault were Dodge’s allegorical paintings. At night the dome was lighted with incandescent bulbs so as to define its panels, and a corona shone on its crest, making a memorable illumination - the chief beauty of the Fair. The total cost was $650,000.61

This description can be contrasted both to the words used by Martin’s World Fair Album-atlas to describe the Woman’s Building – it was ”mellow decorated […], bathed in the bright sunshine, grace and harmony are depicted from all standpoints”, and to another description of the Statue of Republic – a male-created female symbol, which likewise cost a lot of money:

---


60 Martin’s World’s Fair Album-atlas, “Foreign Participation.”

61 Portfolio of photographic views of the world’s Columbian exposition Chicago 1893.
The ancients delighted in heroic statues, such as the Colossus of Rhodes, the Egyptian Sphinx and Memnon, and the statues of Jupiter at Athens and Olympia, which made the fame of Phidias. But the moderns, until the day of Bartholdi, did not undertake great effigies, and the success of Daniel C. French in creating the figure of a woman [The Statue of Republic] for the central statuary of the Fair […] The sculptor received $8,000 for his services, and when it came to the gilding of the statue – for it appears as a golden image, after the methods of Phidias – it was found that no less than $1,400 worth of gold-leaf was required for the labor. The total cost was about $25,000. The face is fifteen feet long, the little fingers a yard. The total height from the water is one hundred feet.62

Here masculinity was constructed, a masculinity that created grand wonders

62 Ibid.
and tiny subordinates. And in this context the dollar seems to be of importance.

As discussed above, the bourgeois ideal of the *self-made man* was he who had earned, rather than inherited, his money. Money certainly takes an important place in the discourse quoted above. According to Kimmel, the *self-made man* was, when in public, on a market where his masculinity was to be steadily proven, and this masculinity was equated with monetary riches. This was especially true of the American North-East, where, during the Civil War, the ”silly Southerner”, who was contaminated by European aristocratic ideals, was opposed to the “*self-made Yankee*” – who (with the help of industry) won a victory over the ineffectual patriarch.63 But the *self-made man* also had his opposite in the slums of the city, where one could find those unmanly men who had failed in the market of manliness – ‘those’ who drank, not as an antidote to femininity, but rather to unemployment – ‘those’ who could not live up to the dominant male ideal and therefore were not ‘real men’. Maybe this latter category was envisioned as the proper subordinates of the male White City – the working, or unemployed, lower classes.64

‘Real men’ abounded in descriptions of the White City, indeed in descriptions of the import and significance of the Fair. They had (a lot of) money; they paraded down streets in horse-driven carriages; they gilded enormous statues of female Republica; they stood on center stage during opening ceremonies. They created order; they raised great buildings, scientifically envisioned and militarily described; their works were legion, rooted in antiquity, and building towards a uniquely, gloriously progressive future.

The *Svenska Tribunens Pictorial Guide* and the two photo albums describe the monumental buildings’ dimensions in great detail – the entire exhibition, almost, was measured in feet and inches, in an ostentatiously scientific language. And for readers who did not think in numbers, there were always the military metaphors – yet another male discourse: ”the building for Manufactures and Liberal Arts [...] is the largest in the world [...]. It is theoretically possible to mobilize the standing army of Russia under its roof.”65

The ideal character of the great man is further illuminated in the introduction to *World’s Columbian Exposition Illustrated*. The author seems to think that this journal would, much like a family father, provide for the future. And as ‘the creators of a new world’, it was, moreover, groundbreaking. ”The

---

63 Among others, owners of factories and industry, financiers, engineers and practical scientists.
64 For the “real” self-made man, Kimmel (1997), 17, 23, 75ff, 101; for the “manly” public market, ibid., 96f. Kimmel cites *The Ladies’ Home Journal* of 1893: ”The number of women in business who lose their gentleness and womanliness is far greater than those who retain what, after all, are woman’s best and chief qualities.”
complete volumes will be handed down to generations to come. As a work of art alone it stands without a peer.”

But while one was awaiting this grand future, one had to think commercially, and spread customs and laws. The author in the *World’s Columbian Exposition Illustrated* was of the opinion that the exposition had helped put the nation on the right course:

The Centennial Exposition of 1876 was the beginning of commercial relations that have since grown to gigantic proportions. The Columbian Exposition of 1893 will give those relations an impetus that will result in the commercial supremacy of the United States before the dawning of the twentieth century. By careful examination of the amount of space occupied and the extent and variety of exhibits made by the different foreign countries it will be found that they take the lead.

The rest of the world apparently wanted to ‘imitate’ the United States, something that had to be pointed out to the ordinary man:

The average man can not realize the great changes that have taken place in the relations between this country and foreign countries during the past fifteen years. […] Remote countries and provinces, semi-civilized islands and people and inhabitants from all corners of the earth have come to the Exposition and are taking an active part in making it a success. […] It is not only the commercial relations that will be enlarged and broadened by the Exposition, but the political and social. Our customs and laws, at least many of them, will appeal to the intelligence of foreign nations and the result will be a desire to imitate.

Other nations – insofar as they possessed (manly) intelligence – would strive to imitate the United States; while superior men ruled their subjects at home. Here was the President, described by *The New York Times* as ”calm, dignified, well-expressed and with sufficient vocal resources”, a “modern patriot” who with the aid of machines handled flags and fountains, occasionally accompanied by the Mayor of Chicago, ”a successful strategist”. If woman’s civilizing function was relatively diversified, then man’s character was strictly disciplinarian. In White City, the signifiers linked to the master signifier *man* were associated with the execution of power. Rites, processions and inauguration, symbols, giant buildings and monuments all carried connotations

---

66 *World’s Columbian Exposition Illustrated* vol II no 4.
67 Ibid., “Foreign Countries at the Exposition.”
to the men who governed the nation and demanded obedience of their underlings. In the White City, man was neither boyish, nor a noble savage, nor was he restricted by the feminine home. In the White City, man was modern (associated with new technology) and eternal (associated, as well, with archaic rituals and symbols).

**Shifting Signifiers in a Possible Life-World: Three Examples**

In the above analysis, I pictured the dominant masculinity as being openly opposed only by the moralistic and civilizing woman of the Women’s Building, an opposition that could be incorporated into the dominant masculine discourse – the ‘real’ man could feel secure in himself vis-à-vis the woman. Or could he?

At this point, I would like to turn to previous scholarship to nuance the picture of the strict power hierarchies delineated above. According to one important thread of analysis, the exhibition included several expressions of significant opposition to the dominant discourse – threatening to transform master signifiers into *shifting* signifiers. This antagonism could be very complex; it was certainly relevant as an expression of additional challenges to the dominant paradigm of manliness.

Above, I tried to show how Midway Plaisance and the Woman’s Building constructed ‘manliness’, to a certain degree, in contrast to the colonized people and ‘lovely and unpractical woman’. But Midway contained more than ‘noble savages’ and ‘odd half-civilized creatures’; nor were all women at the exhibition ‘real women’, fit companions for the ‘real man’.

In his article ”Theaters of contact: the Kwakwaka’wakw meet colonialism in British Columbia and the Chicago”, Paige Raibmon (using letters and contemporary documents) gives a more nuanced picture of the colonized people in Canada at the end of the nineteenth century – and of their participation in the exposition in Chicago 1893. According to Raibmon, the Kwakwaka’wakwes, who come from the North-Western Territories of Canada, did not let themselves be subjected to the Christian church and the colonial state. In Chicago, they made use of their ‘traditional ceremonies’ as a means of resistance.

At Midway, the Kwakwaka’wakwes performed the “potlatch”, a performance of which the Canadian authorities did not approve. The potlatch comprised ceremonies for various occasions, such as marriage, public penance, rites of passage, payment of debts and a winter ceremony. Both church and state had been trying to eradicate these ceremonies because they were considered to contain elements of “cannibalism”, “prostitution” and an altogether “uncivilized” relationship to private property. Some of the

---

Kwakwaka’wakwes were dressed up in “real” uniforms adorned with the Union Jack and were given the task of preventing these ceremonies – nevertheless, the potlatch continued to take place. According to Raibmon, Kwakwaka’wakwes benefited from the fact that the potlatch was of great interest to anthropologists. The anthropologists from Harvard University, who had their own department at Midway, invited the Kwakwaka’wakwes to perform the potlatch. In a non-national context and in spite of the protests from the Canadian authorities the ceremonies were performed – arguably, as an articulation against the Canadian state. The official Canadian exhibition, by contrast, consisted in a mock classroom where native children, who had previously been ‘savages’, did handicrafts.

However, I believe that the Kwakwaka’wakwes’ performance can also be seen as a protest against something else, namely the male image that was being constructed at Midway with the aid of images such as ‘manly, noble savage’ and ‘odd, half-civilized colonized creature’. The Kwakwaka’wakwes had been invited to be wage-laborers at an exposition that carried a political message – among others, the idea of ‘the silent immobile Indian’ described in *The New York Times*. However, they used the occasion to question this ideal image of the ‘noble savage’. And when the Kwakwaka’wakwes – nine men and five women, amongst these Chief Johnny Wanuk and his wife Doqwayis – performed, they attracted audiences in the thousands, which shows that some aspect of their message found some resonance in the public. But, according to Raibmon, *The New York Times* journalist seemed confused by the Canadian uniforms: “Several thousand visitors were quickly drawn to the scene. The throng of spectators could not understand why the British flag should be floating over such a fierce and savage looking lot.”

This renders the Midway, as a space to be enjoyed by real men, more complex. The Kwakwaka’wakwes seem to have been neither noble nor odd. Here, we may be approaching the ‘irrational’ (or counter-hegemonic) experiences ascribed to the Habermasian life-world. The “life-world”, as described by Jürgen Habermas, consisted of direct experiences, in turn created through the communication, physical and emotional experiences of the practical activities of every-day life. These stand in contrast to the dominant discourses’ indirect re-representation of experience; and this may have been part of what was communicated by the Fair’s Kwakwaka’wakwes.

A similar direct confrontation with unmediated, experienced reality seems to be recorded in *World’s Columbian Exposition Illustrated*, in an account of the author’s conversation with some of the ‘savages’ on display. These did not really fall into place as either ‘noble’ or ‘strange’ – some of them seemed almost sexless, spoke English and were intelligent. They lived in

69 *New York Times* of May 25, quoted in Raibmon.
a country without railways, a mail system, banking, stores or trading shops of any kind whatever. [...] Their mode of dressing is in the warm, soft furs of the reindeer, seal and sable. When they are dressed for out-of-doors they are so completely bundled up in furs there is no possible way of distinguishing the sexes. They all look alike. [...] Surely, of all the exhibits ever offered to a civilized visitor, this is the most marvelous and wonderfully interesting. [...] They are intelligent, interesting people and many of them talk very good English. It is a rare treat to converse with them.\textsuperscript{70}

Here, the author encountered a ‘real’ experience, one that destabilized the manly discourse. But only to a degree: ‘they’ were devoid of individuality and stood outside of time, furthermore ‘they’ did not understand what a ‘real man’ understood so well: that some clothes are fitting for women while others are for men.

My third example of Exhibition articulations that destabilized the dominant male discourse is taken from Judy Sund’s article "Columbus and Columbia in Chicago, 1893: Man of Genius meets Generic Woman."\textsuperscript{71} Sund writes that at the World Exposition in Philadelphia, in 1876, the conservative representation of woman had led to protests from suffragettes/feminists such as Susan B. Anthony. According to Sund, Anthony had consequently started, in 1889, to try to entice Congress to exert its influence on the Chicago National Exposition Committee, in order to induce it to grant men and women equal rights as individuals at the coming exposition. During the preparations for the exposition, and before the National Committee had reached a decision concerning women’s possible representation, a number of suffragettes/feminists, amongst these Anthony, founded the Isabella Association – named after the Spanish queen who financed Columbus’s journey. A sculptor was entrusted with the task of making a statue of the queen. In other words, Sund describes the celebration of a Southern European, Catholic monarch who was, moreover, a woman. Would this be permissible amidst the discourse of Northern European/American manly republicanism?

According to Sund, it was not. Almost in reaction, it would seem, to the foundation of the Isabella Association, the all-male National Exposition Committee founded the Board of Lady Managers. The Board’s leading echelon was made up of women from the white upper middle-class. This eliminated any chance for a more nuanced representation – the president of the Board of Lady Managers, Bertha Palmer, supposedly declared that she was not interested in "politics, emancipation or other irrelevant issues." But, according to Sund, the

\textsuperscript{70} World’s Columbian Exposition Illustrated. vol III no 5.


84
statue of Isabella did appear at the fair – in an out-of-sight place, however, in diminished scale and in plaster, as there was no money for casting it in bronze.

What did such expositions have to say to those who fought for the right of people to be seen and treated as individuals? The Chicago Fair’s White City can be seen as strictly a man’s exhibition where the statues of women, like the far-off Women’s Building, primarily functioned as ornaments on a masculine, republican uniform – ‘the uncivilized’ were placed at the periphery, like Isabella, the diminutive plaster statue. The gender-loaded world of the Exhibition did, however, encompass actors who articulated opposition to the dominant discourses, and in both success and failure, communicated their life-world of individual, personal experience. In the world outside the fair, Chinese immigrants experienced institutionalized racism, while industrial workers experienced monotonous labor in giant factory halls. In Midway, ‘others’ such as ‘Chinese’ and ‘workers’, etc., were presented as a contrast to ‘man’; but outside of the exhibition area ‘they’ could not be treated as exhibition objects, nor as easily serve to nourish the hegemonic discourses on gender identities.72

But, irregardless of attempts to communicate the real experiences of life-worlds, the Exhibition served, down to its very geography, as an articulation of a very dominant male discourse. The map provided by semi-official publications (reproduced as Picture 1) gives a very clear picture of the viewpoint of the dominant male – the chosen perspective places Midway in the remote background, where it appears tiny; the Women’s Building is somewhat more visible, but still in a miniature scale. The White City, the ‘real’ exhibition, functioned as a stage for the white, well-to-do men. The women had their building at the outskirts of the ‘real’ exhibition, in juxtaposition to Midway where the colonized non-white people could entertain the masses with dancing and juggling. This obvious ghettoization of the non-white males might, indeed, have been experienced by them as an accurate, symbolic representation of their real-life experiences – the Chicago Exhibition’s geography mirrored the physical and emotional experiences of their everyday activities.

Conclusion
I have shown how an image of masculinity, a masculine ideal, was articulated at the World Exposition in Chicago in 1893. Even the physical layout of the Exposition grounds demonstrates gender ideology: the centrally located White City (the ‘real’ exposition) was preserved for the important ‘white’ male and the peripheral areas were preserved for the Women’s Building and for the colonized peoples. The Women’s Building was the feminine home and school, to which the male could flee, to find security in his firmly non-male opposite; or from which he could flee, to Midway, to reinforce his manliness by other

72 On Chinese immigrants and industrial workers outside the fair, see: Kimmel (1997) 82–85.
means. In the Exhibition, the arrangers tried to create a Utopia, capable of materializing and thus stabilizing the eternal contingency of identities. The subject position man was forced into a congealed position of eternal strength, while woman became the domestic goddess – certainly not a co-founder of an Isabella Association; just as the ‘half-civilized exotic creature’ was a funny juggler, certainly not capable of a performance that embodied protest against colonization.

This materialization of discourse was, of course, powerful. It drew an enormous public, and was well covered in the international mass media (which spoke, more or less, for the white male elite). Just as London exhibitions had had “shilling” entrance days, in order to attract and influence British workmen, so did the Chicago Exhibition seek to civilize the masses – in this case, into appropriate subjects-citizens.

White City buildings were very masculine, and here masculine rites and symbols were articulated. It is hard to tell to which degree these rites and symbols appeared natural to the visitors. However, the fact that a number of critics had made an attempt to answer the dominant language with a statue of Queen Isabelle, indicates that the dominating discourse had not become universally accepted as natural.

But it was not easy to frame, let alone materialize, an oppositional discourse. The publications available in the Women’s Pavilion might have envisioned a publicly active, organizing, powerful woman; but simultaneously were so caught in the division between the ‘creative’ male and ‘domestic’ female, that they seemed rather to reinforce the idea of natural differences between the sexes. Women Pavilion pamphlets seemed, on the whole, to celebrate the ideal that placed the real man in the public sphere (supplied, in addition, with a wilderness he could both flee to and from), while placing woman in the home; and, by implication, agree that Isabella was scarcely an appropriate ideal for a republican goddess.

I have, at the end of the article, attempted to trace an alternative vision, deriving not from dominant discourse, but from the life-world of direct, active experience. Scholarly studies have indicated that the Exhibition’s discourse of manliness could be challenged by direct experiences and confrontation – particularly in the case of the Isabella Association. Thus, even in the artificial world created by the Exhibition, the contributions of diversifying articulations were so intense that the artificial included the real. This forced the Exhibition, despite itself, closer to its ultimate goal: the representation of an entire world.

Translated and edited by Madeleine Hurd
Bibliography

Primary Sources
Hemmets Drottning – World’s Columbian Exposition. (Chicago, Ill., 1893)
Martin’s World’s Fair Album-atlas and Family Souvenir; Illustrated
New York Times 2 May 1893
Portfolio of photographic views of the World’s Columbian Exposition Chicago 1893
Reports from the Swedish Ladies’ committee to the World’s Columbian Exposition at Chicago 1893. World’s Columbian Exposition 1893 Chicago. (Stockholm, 1893)
Svenska Tribunens Pictorial Guide to Chicago and the World’s Fair
The Social Condition of the Swedish Women, Prepared with a design to the World’s Columbian Exposition A. D. 1893
Worlds Columbian Exposition Illustrated vol II nos. 4, 5, 8; vol III nos 4, 5, 8, 11.

Secondary Sources
Agulhon, Maurice. “Politics and Image in Post-Revolutionary France”, in Rites of Power: Ritual politics since the Middle Ages (University of Pennsylvania, 1985).
Calhoun, Craig. “Introduction: Habermas and the Public Sphere”, in Habermas and the Public Sphere, ed. Craig Calhoun (London, 1996)
Ekcrantz, Jan and Tom Olsson. Det redigerade samhället (Stockholm, 1998)
Fraser, Nancy. ”Rethinking the Public Sphere: A Contribution to the Critique of Actually Existing Democracy”, in Habermas and the Public Sphere, ed. Craig Calhoun (London, 1996)
Geertz, Clifford. ”Centers, Kings and Charisma: Reflections on the Symbolics of Power”, in Rites of Power: Ritual politics since the Middle Ages (University of Pennsylvania, 1985)

Hettne, Björn, Sverker Sörlin and Uffe Östergård, eds. Den globala nationalismen (Borgå Finland, 1998)

Hobsbawm, Eric Kapitalets Tidsålder (Falun, 1994)
—. ”Inventing Traditions”, in The Invention of Traditon, ed. Eric Hobsbawm and Terence Ranger (1997, Cambridge)

Humlesjö, Inger. ”Manlighetskonstruktion i arbetarhistoria och fackföreningar”, in Manligt och omanligt i ett historiskt perspektiv (FRN Forskningsnämnden, Rapport 99:4)


Kimmel, Michael S. Manhood in America – A Cultural History (New York, 1997)
—. ”Manlighetens `osynlighet` i amerikansk samhällsvetenskap”, in Manligt och omanligt i ett historiskt perspektiv (FRN Forskningsnämnden Rapport 99:4)

Landes, Joan. Women and the public sphere in the age of the French revolution (London, 1988)

Larsson, Maja. ”En förgörande ensamhet – Om ogifta män och det moderna livets sköra gränser”, in Manligt och omanligt i ett historiskt perspektiv (FRN Forskningsnämnden Rapport 99:4)

Ljunggren, Jens. ”Mellan kultur och natur. Mannens kropp och gymnastikens uppgift”, in Ekenstam et al., Rädd att falla. Studier i manlighet (Södertälje, 1998)

Manns, Ulla. De svenska kvinnorna vid världsutställningarna i Philadelphia 1876 och Chicago 1893 (Idéhistoriska uppsatser nr 11, Stockholms universitet, 1986)

Mills, Sara. Discourse (London, 1997)

Moland, Tallak. ”Kontruksjon av mandighet i det nordlige landskapet – Om Fritjof Nansens polferder ved århudresskiftet”, in Manligt och omanligt i ett historiskt perspektiv (FRN Forskningsnämnden Rapport 99:4)

Mosse, George L. The image of man – the creation of modern masculinity (Oxford University, 1996a)
—. The nationalization of the masses – Political symbolism and mass movements in Germany from the Napoleonic wars through the Third Reich (New York, 1996b)

Nordisk Familjebok Band 27 (sökord: Svenska Tribunen) (Stockholm, 1918)


Thörn, Håkan. *Modernitet, sociologi och sociala rörelser* (Göteborgs Universitet, 1997)


Webbplats: *American Memory from the Library of Congress*
http://memory.loc.gov/ammem/amhome.html (sökord: Bird’s eye view of the World’s Columbian Exposition, Chicago, 1893)


Østergård, Uffe. ”The Geopolitics of Nordic Identity – From Composite States to Nation-states”, in *The Cultural Construction of Norden*, ed. Øystein Sørensen and Bo Stråth (Oslo 1997)
Since the collapse of Communism, there has been general agreement that the West has been actively seeking a new vision of an enemy, an opposite, to fill the vacuum left by the Soviet Union. This has revivified the concept of the enemy Arab, fundamentally unlike the inhabitants of the West. The image is, of course, not altogether new. Throughout Western history, encounters between Europeans and "Orientals" have been characterized by the drawing of borders between us, and them. Many of these borders have resulted from prejudices, themselves anchored in the need to mark different cultural traditions. The ethnocentric result most often views the Other’s culture as poor and negative, while one’s own is seen as right and sensible.

Most historians of this phenomenon base their findings on expressions found in history books, schoolbooks, newspapers and literature. This article uses a source that has been perhaps still more influential: travel accounts. Travel accounts provided, before the advent of radio and television, the easiest access to imaginary travel, the best way vicariously to experience foreign places, cultures and peoples. Travel accounts gained, thereby, decisive importance in forming the European view of the Other.

In the beginning of the twentieth century, many Swedes traveled to Palestine. The travel accounts they have left behind give their picture of the Muslim Orient and of the Arabs they saw and met. This is the picture upon which this article will focus.

Swedes as Tourists, Pilgrims, and Missionaries

Before 1800, most Swedes experienced the Holy land as an abstract, remote myth. But within Protestant circles we can see how an older, transcendental idea of the Holy Land was eclipsed by a land that was more physically real.¹ This change in the Swedish relationship to the country was caused, in large part, by the growing numbers of visits to the Holy Land, an increase in which the nineteenth-century industrialization and improvement of transportation played a substantial role. The nineteenth-century Swedes who visited Palestine

in these increasing numbers were pilgrims, tourists, Bible students and – towards the end of the century – settlers.\(^2\)

Up to the beginning of the nineteenth century, travel had been reserved, primarily, to the upper classes. The introduction of the steam engine modernized and democratized nineteenth-century travel. In mid-century England, entrepreneurs such as the Baptist minister Thomas Cook began to organize charter trips. His business grew quickly, and Cook became one of the most successful travel agents. In 1868 he offered the first charter tour of the Holy Land. The advantage of the charter tour was that it made travel possible for a tourist without knowledge of foreign languages or previous experience in traveling, as well as offering the lower cost of group trips.\(^3\)

The concept of the charter tour reinforced and nuanced the distance that was maintained between visiting tourists and the local population. This distance was, of course, already great; colonial expansion had already defined the Middle East as a weak and inferior entity. Swedes, however, differed in their relationship to Palestine, insofar as Sweden had neither colonial nor foreign-policy interests in the country. Sweden had, at this point, no colonies at all, and this affected Swedes’ travel mentalities. Swedish relations with Palestine tended, therefore, to be personal, unofficial, and have primarily religious aims.\(^4\)

Religion played a not insignificant part in Swedes’ contacts with the outer world. Around the turn of the last century, the dissenting free-church folk movement in Sweden created a number of new organizations for a so-called "outer mission" (yttre mission). Some examples of these are Svenska Missionsförbundet, which engaged itself in the Congo, Persia, Algeria and China; the Fosterlandsstiftelsen in Eritrea, Abyssinia and India; and the Svenska kyrkan’s missions in South Africa, Rhodesia and India.\(^5\) Under the protection of King Oscar II the Svenska Jerusalemsföreningen began, in 1902, its special mission in Palestine. The activities of the Swedish colony and the missionaries increased Sweden’s contact with Palestine, and Sweden soon thereafter installed its first Palestinian consulate.\(^6\)

The influence of religious interest is also apparent in much of the travel literature. Two major Swedish authors were interested in Palestine: Fredrika Bremer and Selma Lagerlöf.\(^7\) Bremer wrote in 1859 on her pilgrimage to the Holy Land, describing how she experienced the country as piously religious.

---

2 Ibid., 49ff.
3 See Göran Andolf, "Turismen i historien" and Orvar Löfgren, "Längtan till landet Annorlunda", in Orvar Löfgren (ed.), Längtan till landet Annorlunda, Stockholm 1990, p. 75ff, 11
4 Kark, p. 50ff
5 Åke Holmberg, Världen bortom Västerlandet. Svensk syn på fjärran länder och folk från 1700-talet till första världskriget, Göteborg 1988, p. 424ff
6 Kark, p. 50f
7 Ibid., p. 54
She accompanies her description with a good deal of criticism of the heretical Christianity and the Arabs she encountered there. Subsequent travel accounts have much in common with her description, and were probably influenced by it. In her two books, *Jerusalem I-II*, Lagerlöf describes the dissenting Swedes and Swedish-Americans who, in 1896, had united in a small American colony, the ”Spaffordite colony”, in Jerusalem. Here, also, previous travel accounts influenced subsequent travelers: the authors discussed in this article made contact with this colony, in different ways, when they visited Jerusalem.

This was all part of an intensification of Swedish contacts with the Holy Land during the nineteenth century. The contacts both caused, and were a result of, a new understanding of Palestine’s physical reality and of the industrialization of the means of transport. In the forefront of these contacts we find, above all, pilgrims, missionaries and authors. The Swedish travelers who form the subject of this article visited Palestine, as did Fredrika Bremer and the dissenting Swedish colonizers, in a spirit of religious expectation. This is part of the bibli cal paradigm which I shall discuss, at length, below. First, however, I will analyze two other important mental constructs: the traveling paradigm, and Orientalism.

**Travel Accounts as Genre and Paradigm**

The modern travel account originated with the Renaissance, and lasted until the 1950s. In their earliest forms, travel accounts were written by explorers who, influenced by ancient models, emphasized adventures and encounters with monstrous and fantastic beings. They were also often interested in demonstrating their merits as authors, sailors and conquerors to those who had commissioned the journey. The breakthrough of natural sciences and the new genre of scientific description led to a toning down of the dramatic aspects; more modern travel accounts were written with an eye to natural history, with much systematic classification of flora, fauna and human habits and morals. The author was usually a European; the heyday of travel accounts coincided with the highpoint of European imperialism. Most authors fell, accordingly, into one of three categories of colonial representatives: military men, merchants, or missionaries (although this did not exclude researchers and adventurers, also endemic to the colonial process).

The rise of collective travel affected the production of travel accounts. There

---

8 Sigrid Kahle, “Orientalism i Sverige”, foreword to Said, p. 21f
9 Kark, p. 54
11 Luis Ajagán-Lester, “*De Andra*. Afrikaner i svenska pedagogiska texter (1768-1965)*, Stockholm 2000, p. 112f
was a dramatic increase, during the second half of the nineteenth century, in the number of books familiarizing Swedes with the Muslim Orient; during the two hundred-odd years between 1700 and the first decades of the twentieth century, Europeans wrote approximately 60,000 books about the Near East.12

The increased numbers of travelers created an additional market for travel guides. During the nineteenth century, John Murray and Karl Baedeker can be seen as the two great rivals among numerous different travel-guide publishers. Baedeker’s guide was the cheapest, however, and therefore the best selling.13 The Baedeker travel guides were characterized by a special style, with easily available information about the quality of hotels, and so on, provided within parentheses. In the Palestinian guidebook these parentheses are used, not least, to present historical and biblical information about places and monuments. Baedeker’s guidebooks were highly influential within the tourism business, as shown by hotel owners’ strong interest in being appropriately represented. They reached their apex of popularity between 1860 and 1914. The First World War ruined the travel empire, although it did recover somewhat after 1918.14

It is worth remembering these guides, as they patently influenced the view of the Other expressed in various travel accounts.15 Baedeker’s guide openly influenced at least two of the travelers discussed in this article. The Palestinian guide is structured so that every place is furnished with numerous biblical references and anecdotes, which the travelers have probably copied, at least in part, in their own works. Those who were primarily responsible for the content of the travel guides were, after all, prominent professors in Orientalism or scientists.16 This, and the historical and religious content of the travel guides, reveals a good deal about the travelers’ probable expectations of their trips. A comparison with modern travel guides demonstrates how little they had in common with today’s travel to, for instance, the beaches of the Mediterranean.

The travel-guides provided an important part of what travelers saw, or did...

---

12 See Jarring, p. 84; Mohammad Fazlhashemi, “Monolog över kulturmöten – två västerländska kvinnors reseskildringar om Orienten” in Lena Eskilsson and Mohammad Fazlhashemi (eds.), Reseverättelser. Idéhistoriska resor i sociala och geografiska rum, Carlsson Bokförlag, Stockholm 2001, p. 177
15 For instance, it seems certain that Yolanda Colliander had her Baedeker open when she wrote on the fish in the Sea of Gennesareth; the accounts, and fish names, show close similarities. Colliander, Ögonblicksbilder, p. 65. Similar similarities are evident in Maria Brusewitz’s description of the sea, although her description is so brief that it could, here, be a memory of an oral account or even of Colliander’s book. Brusewitz, Från de Heliga Minnenas Land, p. 120
16 See, for example, the foreward to Karl Baedeker, Palestine et Syrie. Routes principales à travers la Mésopotamie et la Babylone, L’île de Chypre. Manuel du voyageur, Leipzig/Paris, 1912, 4 :e edition, p. V
not see, and how they chose to report it. In other respects, as well, one can trace influences that colored travelers’ first-hand experiences. It is evident, for instance, that the authors’ descriptions of, for example, ”Mohammedanism” or ”the eastern woman” depended on information above and beyond what the authors could garner from first-hand street observations. All the people with whom the authors had contact influenced their descriptions of and information about Arabs and Muslims. Local guides, in particular, played a part. It is important to note that the guides were probably all Christian; belonging either to one of Palestine’s many Christian minorities, or being Westerners employed in Palestine. One sometimes catches a glimpse of them, as with Oscar Dreiwitz’s ”pater Taeppe”, a Swiss Catholic monk who guided Dreiwitz and his company on the mountain Tabor.17

The travelers were thus influenced by travel guides and travel experts as genre and paradigm. But broader European mentalities also influenced the travelers. Sweden was not exempt from contemporary ideas of the necessity of categorizing the peoples of the world in a civilizational hierarchy, both racist and cultural, in which the European stood pre-eminent and the Arab or Muslim occupied an equivocal position.

Colonial Mentalities: Civilizing the Others, Enjoying the Natural

During the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, Sweden was, culturally, a fairly homogenous country. It had few immigrants. Foreigners were treated with suspicion; if not seen as spies, then as thieves or swindlers. This view of the foreigner was spread both in literature and mass media, as well as in letters from Swedes abroad.

This suspicion of the foreign was combined with steadfast appreciation of one’s own society, its present and its future. The decades around the turn of the last century were characterized by a strong faith in progress, in a new industrial world based on logic and science. In this ideology of optimism about progress, it was assumed that civilizations progressed from one stage to another, and that those cultures that had progressed the furthest up the ladder towards development were superior. Cultures were organized, thereby, on a hierarchical scale, with “civilization” at the highest end, and “nature” at the lowest. This way of thinking had its roots in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries, when thinkers compared Native Americans and blacks, both, supposedly, living close to and in harmony with nature, with apes. One well-established image at the turn of the last century was, accordingly, that the ”white” man had a moral obligation to spread civilization and Christianity to the inferior natives. This is the image we recognize in Kipling’s famous phrase “the white man’s burden”.18

This imperialistic world-view was, simultaneously, a masculine vision, which was informed by a patriarchal, two-fold division into rulers and the ruled. Just as the family father had an obligation to take care of his wife and children, so would he likewise care for colonized peoples. In return he expected both family and the colonized to bend to his norms. This expectation of humble adjustment could, of course, also influence the fear of the insubordinate: those who refused to become civilized were dangerous. In Swedish newspapers’ coverage of foreign countries, it was typical to emphasize, on the one hand, the civilizational project led by the ”white” people in the colonies; and, on the other, the brutally violent deeds of the uncivilized.19

No stereotype is altogether one-sided. Some of this fear and contempt was tempered by a fascinated envy of the uncomplicated, harmonious child of nature. The social changes caused by industrialization had given new life to an older, idealized view of nature. English natural-history essays were pervaded by the search for a lost, idyllic asylum in an inhospitable, threatening world. The perusal of natural history transported the reader to the silence and calm of

19 Ibid., p. 109, 105
hay-barns, fruit orchards and green valleys. This genre was characterized by a strong longing for bygone times; it took explicit distance from city life, which was dominated by technology, and from a science that reduced nature and humans to mechanical objects. It emphasized, as a contrast to industrial society, pastoral idylls where humans were at one with nature. This criticism of modernization and industrialization might also view industrial society as degenerate, and call for a “natural”, agrarian life. But, even if the welfare of modern civilization led to weakness and indolence, it was difficult fully to support this “cult of nature”; for it would mean regressing to a lower degree of civilization.

To summarize: ideological power inhered in the “white” middle-class male. His view of the natural, biological and scientific hierarchy of societies and cultures was only partially tempered by a nostalgic admiration for an untechnical, idyllic nature. His point of view provided, moreover, the soil in which the special view of the Near East – Orientalism – was rooted. Together with faith in progress, and its adjuncts, social Darwinism and racism, Orientalism gave a special cadence to Swedish travelers’ perceptions of the Middle East.

Orientalism

According to Edward Said, Orientalism should be understood as a collection of theoretical limits and categories that teach us both how and why the Western world is superior to the Oriental, and prevent us from perceiving any alternative to this vision. ”The Orient” is one of Europe’s (or the Western world’s) most deeply imprinted and oft-recurring pictures of the different. By serving as the embodiment of Europe’s opposite, ”the Orient” has contributed to the self-definition of Europe and the West. But the Orient is not only a conception. It is an integrated part of Europe’s material civilization and culture, a method of discourse with its own institutions, vocabulary, scientific and scholarly research, visual tropes, doctrines and, not least, colonial bureaucrats and style. Authors, theoreticians, politicians and the administrators of empire have, within different branches of culture, espoused the vision of a similar division between East and West, and used it as a central point in their scientific, literary or political accounts of the Orient. In the exchange between the academic and the literary world, Orientalism also became an institution for handling the Orient, a way for the West to dominate and structure it.

Said shows how the two geographical entities, the Orient and the West, support and to a certain degree mirror one another. The idea of Europe is a

---

21 Horgby, p. 107
collective concept that defines all of us Europeans vis-à-vis those who are not Europeans. The myth’s most important component is the superiority of European identity to that of non-European peoples and cultures. The systematic knowledge given about the Orient communicates the Orient not as geographical place but as a *topos*: a collection of referents or a gathering of characteristics originating, variously, in quotes, text fragments, references to someone’s work on the Orient, bits from earlier representations, or a mixture of all these.\(^{23}\)

Said emphasizes that neither ideas, cultures nor history can be understood or studied without analyzing their relative power; the discourse about the Orient is rooted in Westerners’ political and economic dominance over Orientals. He emphasizes, however, that Orientalism should not be mistaken for a simple tissue of lies, automatically dispelled by the discovery of the truth. Orientalism exercises cultural hegemony. This means that Orientalism is endemic to the power of the European-Atlantic seaboard over the Orient, a discourse that is deeply rooted in socioeconomic and political institutions. It is a powerful form of cultural expression, able to drown out other ways of seeing; an accepted filter that allows Westerners to see only certain types of knowledge about the Orient.\(^{24}\)

Said has had his critics; but his ideas have had decisive influence on our understanding of Europeans’ view of the Orient, Islam, and Arabs. It may be fruitful, however, to look more closely at the application of Orientalism. How did Orientalism function in the Swedish case? Did Swedish travelers share this general, colonial picture of the Orient? Or is it necessary to nuance the picture which Said provides?

**Small-Power Status, Lutheranism, and Swedish Orientalism**

Two things, it seems, might or should affect the Swedish view of the Orient. The first is the fact that Sweden had no colonies. The second is the strong influence of revivalist Christianity, itself rooted in Sweden’s Lutheran traditions.

Previous research into Swedes’ views of non-Europeans has been unambiguous on the influence of European colonialism. In his dissertation “*The Others*” – *Africans in Swedish pedagogical texts (1768–1965)* (”De Andra” – Afrikaner i svenska pedagogiska texter), Luis Ajagán-Lester uses discourse analysis to elucidate the view of Africans in Swedish text- and schoolbooks over a period of 200 years. For 1850–1920, Ajagán-Lester concludes that the Africans are discursively constructed – in contrast to the ”white race” – as a people without history, and with no ability to create culture.

\(^{23}\) Ibid., p. 287

\(^{24}\) Ibid., p. 69f
The texts are rhetorically constructed so as to demonstrate that it is fate that Europeans enjoy victory over the world. They bear a strong imprint of dualistic thinking, where the African is represented as a (bad) opposite to all that the European is. Ajagán-Lester argues that these texts show that Sweden, despite its peripheral status among the colonial powers, displays colonial mentalities and strategies fully consonant with those described for England, France and Germany.

Mohammed Fazlhashemi’s collection of essays shows the results of his research on the early twentieth-century Swedish view of Persia. The view can be summarized as presenting Swedish culture as the correct and natural. In other words, Swedes viewed the Other – in this case, the Persian – from a position of ethnocentrism. Fazlhashemi thus agrees that Swedish Orientalism is part and parcel of a more general Western or European Orientalism.

Åke Holmberg’s broader work, *The World beyond the West: Swedish views on foreign countries and peoples from the 1700s to the First World War* (Världen bortom Västerlandet. Svensk syn på fjärran länder och folk från 1700-talet till första världskriget), presents an investigation into the Swedish view of foreign countries from the eighteenth century to the outbreak of the Second World War. He bases his study on books, newspapers, magazines, schoolbooks and miscellaneous other printed materials. During the early nineteenth century, argues Holmberg, it was popular to envision the Orient as sleeping. Put bluntly, this reflected the European conviction that Orientals could not participate in Western progress. According to Holmberg, this view was supported by a popular psychological construct, which attributed to the Oriental a passivity which was fated and permanent. This explanation reflects the evolutionism and racism that reached its apogee in Sweden during the heyday of European imperialism, that is, the decades around the turn of the century. Here, again, Sweden was not exempt from European colonial thought.

Holmberg reminds us, however, that there did exist opponents to the dominant ideologies, including those who maintained that cultural differences were caused by environment and history, rather than by biological-racist factors. This is consonant with James Clifford’s critique of Said’s *Orientalism* as being too unnuanced. According to Clifford, there co-existed substantially different ways of seeing the Orient. The concept was under constant contestation and redefinition; and different sources could express quite different views. Holmberg, similarly, argues for different points of view.

---

25 Ajagán-Lester, p. 113, 134ff
26 Ibid., p. 138
27 Fazlhashemi, “Kolonialt medvetande utan kolonier /.../ ”, p. 111
28 Holmberg 1988, p. 469, 472.
29 Holmberg 1994, p. 28ff
30 Ibid., p. 26f
31 James Clifford, "Orientalism, Edward Said", in *History and Theory*. 
According to Holmberg, Swedish works of reference and other sources focused primarily on places where Swedes had lived and worked. This helped create a Swedish view of the surrounding world that differed, to some degree, from English, French or German. On the other hand, Holmberg maintains that Swedes simultaneously adopted the colonial powers’ prejudice-laden views of exotic countries and peoples. Holmberg thus joins Ajagán-Lester in maintaining that the Swedish discourse on the Others was anchored in the discourse of the colonial powers.

Holmberg emphasizes the importance of religion in defining the Oriental "other". According to Holmberg, nineteenth-century European authorities declared Islam to be a relatively appropriate religion for Africa, as it suited the Africans’ (low) abilities. Holmberg finds several Christian opinion-makers who, in the beginning of the twentieth century, sometimes maintain that Islam has a few good points. He puts this in the context, however, of the desire to create a contrast, upon which background Christian authors can then launch a subsequent harsh condemnation of the religion Christianity. Leading experts on Islam attributed a certain power to the religion, but emphasized its destructive sides, viewing it overall as a strange outgrowth on the trunk of Christianity. The position of Muslim women was a constant object of critique. In general, indeed, the bulk of Western publications on Islam were altogether dismissive of everything Muslim, Holmberg concludes.

**Religion**

I would like to emphasize one of Holmberg’s points: the importance of religion in nuancing, forming, and influencing this general ethnocentric and European-colonial point of view. For, as other scholars have pointed out, ever since the time of Karl XII, the Swedish view of the non-European world has been pistocentric. Pistocentrism denotes prejudices that originate in the belief that one’s own faith provides the measure by which other cultures and religions should be judged. Conversely, pistocentrism tends to attribute all the characteristics of other cultures to their faith. The stereotypical statements about the Arabic world, for instance, often attribute to the religion the region’s supposed destruction of culture, fanaticism and fatalism. The belief in Islam’s destruction of culture can be traced to bitterness over historical defeats by “Muslims”, and a need to establish that the countries that had been lost in battle were, under ”Muslim rule”, reduced to ruins. The recurring picture of fanaticism becomes a way of explaining ”the Muslims” military successes, while furnishing a critique of the entire religion. Finally, Islamic fatalism

---

32 Holmberg, p. 44, 23
33 Holmberg 1988, 506f, 508f
provides the explanation for the "Muslims’” subsequent lack of progress.34 Islam as religion was, moreover, something that it was natural for the supporters of the pure, Lutheran religion to oppose.35 Pisto-centricism was thus joined to ethnocentrism, as, during the later half of the nineteenth century, historians and others began to concentrate on national and racial characteristics and specialties. Such studies of national character were often pistocentric: religion was seen as playing a major role in defining people and nation. On the whole, the verdict was clear – and eurocentric: freedom, progress, intelligence and beauty were contrasted to the rest of the world’s slavery, stagnation, provincialism, closedness, and ugliness.36

Said himself links pistocentrism and eurocentrism to the modern travel account. According to Said, the major French and British travel accounts derived, during the entire nineteenth century, their form, style and intentions from the idea of a pilgrimage.37 Both French and British pilgrims, meanwhile, continued to use the Orient in their works, as a foundation for their existential call. The Orient was used to advance the romantic idea of the Christian’s duty to save souls and revive a dead world, to awaken it to consciousness of its own potential, now hidden under a lifeless and degenerate surface – something that only a European could do. This meant that the modern traveler naturally referred to religion, and the Bible, in his or her quest through places like Palestine. The degeneration of the Orient could be overcome, in part, through the Bible and through religion – at least, according to some travel accounts.38

Four Travel Books

These are the analytical themes of my article. We will be doing a close analysis of four Swedish and Finnish-Swedish travel books, taken from the 1910s and 1920s, in accordance with these themes, and in an attempt to nuance Edward Said’s picture of Orientalism with insights into what may be an expression of a particularly Lutheran view of the residents and fate of the Holy Land. Or, to put it another way: should we complement our discussion of Orientalism with something that could be called the discourse of the Holy Orient? Like Said, I am not looking for a description of the "real" Orient, nor do I want to assess the degree to which the travelers’ accounts deviate from this "reality". Rather, I am, like Said, interested in the collection of ideas about the Orient.39 Travel accounts should give a good insight into these. According to Said, all texts are political – even literature is affected by the dogmas that influence all of society.

34 Ibid., p. 24f
35 Jarring, p. 84
36 Holmberg 1994, p. 25f
37 Said, p. 275
38 Ibid., p. 278ff
39 Said, p. 68f
This is because the political world is discussed in a voice of authority, one that assumes its own highest importance and relevance to the rest of society. A literate European meets the Orient, or writes about it, first and foremost as a politicized European, and only thereafter as an individual. Orientalism is thus not only an expression of a certain political view; it is a broadly spread geopolitical consciousness, one that informs cultural and social institutions. As critics have pointed out, however, it is necessary, nonetheless, to nuance one’s understanding of Orientalism. One way is to look at the way in which prejudices and stereotypes of class and gender – as well as race – inform the literature about the Orient. Another is to be careful not to assume the uncontested hegemony of the great European colonial powers. These, as well as other points, will be taken up in the following analysis.40

The four authors I have chosen wrote between 1913 and 1923.41 The period is of special interest, for it is the apogee of colonial power and arrogance. They can all be described, more or less, as Christian pilgrims – I call them ”pilgrim-tourists” – because their books describe a combination of pilgrimage and tourism. They concentrate on places of evangelical or biblical interest, but also wander about in nature, photograph fascinating architecture, describe their hotel experiences, and so on. (The two illustrations on the next page may give a picture of the type of books involved.)

There are two women and two men. Yolanda Colliander, author of Ögonblicksbilder från en resa i Orienten (Momentary Impressions from a Journey through the Orient, Helsinki 1913) is a Finland-Swede; her account is particularly judgmental and hostile. The same year, Nobel-Prize winner Klas Pontus Arnoldson wrote Jerusalem’s själ (Jerusalem’s Soul, Stockholm 1913); he tends to plead for international brotherhood, mild and reconciliatory. In 1922, another women, Maria Brusewitz, wrote of her experiences in Från de Heliga Minnenas Land (From the Land of Holy Memories, Stockholm 1922); she is politely argumentative and censorious. Finally, there is Oscar Dreiwitz and his Med kamera och penna genom faraoners och Israels land (With Camera and Pen through the Land of the Pharoahs and Israel, Stockholm

---

40 Said, p. 76f. (For a detailed description and discussion of discourse analysis and theory, and its application to Said’s Orientalism by critics such as Magnus Berg, Veronica Trépagny, Valerie Kennedy and James Clifford, see my C-utpats, Den bästa kommentar till Bibeln som kan ges, Södertörns högskola, 2001.)

41 The choice of travel accounts derives from a perusal of two bibliographies in Svenska Orientällskapets yearbooks for 1925 and 1926/27. All four accounts concentrate on Palestine, although all travellers also visit other Middle Eastern countries, primarily Egypt but also Syria and Lebanon. This essay will not differentiate by country, but will treat Egyptian, Syrian, Lebanese and Palestinian Arabs and Muslims similarly, for this is what the authors do. The only exceptions are a few Turks, then in their capacity as Muslim administrators of the Islamic society. See Svenska Orientällskapets årsbok 1925, nr I, Stockholm 1925, p. 57–61 and Svenska Orientällskapets årsbok 1926/27, nr IV, Stockholm 1927, p. 96–99.
1923). His primary interests are in Christianity, archeology and history. He is the most active Bible-reader of them all. He is relatively uninterested in the Arabs, but romanticizes and exoticizes them when he does comment on them.

I begin by analyzing these travel accounts according to two main themes. The first is “People and Society” – the pictures of the Arabs, Muslims, and their beliefs, with attention to the role played by class, race and gender. This theme is linked, throughout, to particular perceptions of time; in particular, the eternal Orient. I then go on to the view of religion, in ”Islam and Muslim Society”, with an eye to the influence of pistocentrism on the authors’ perceptions of Palestine.

**People and Society**

Old Cairo, which goes back several thousands of years, is of a distinctive Eastern type /.../. Here, people live their lives in the same forms and conditions as they did thousands of years back.42

---

42 Gamla Kairo, som går tillbaka flera årtusenden, har en utpräglad österländsk typ /.../. Här lever man livet under samma former och förmållanden [sic!] som för årtusenden tillbaka. Dreiwitz, p. 31. All translations by editor.
The above shows how Dreiwitz emphasizes the eternal aspect of the Orient (“which reaches back several millennia” and which is of “pronounced Eastern type”). According to Fazlhashemi, among others, this indicates an understanding of the Orient’s culture as belonging to the past, a phase that has been bypassed in the development of civilization.43

This view of timelessness is bolstered by, and redounds on, the travelers’ characterization of the Arabs. The stereotype of the lazy Arab is a constituent part of the sleeping Orient. The people are passive, incapable of doing anything to better their situation. Thus, for instance, the Middle Eastern women’s lives are mostly filled with sitting with their dirty, fly-covered children in front of the family’s primitive abode. According to Colliander, the women are so lazy and feckless that they do not even wave away the flies that plague the children whom they are nursing, and take no effort to keep the children clean (see the text and picture on the preceding page).44 They are also lazy, for, besides being content to sit idle all day, they do nothing to better their primitive homes. The same picture of fatalistic passivity is to be found with Arnoldson, who maintains that a contributory cause to the blindness, which is extensive in the East, as we often remarked in Egypt, is a fatalistic insouciance among the parents, to not concern themselves over the children’s eyes, which are often dirty, and plagued by flies.45

The passivity of the Arabs is a theme that pervades the travel accounts. The Western travelers debate on Jaffa’s poor harbor, generally concluding, according to Arnoldson, that the Arabs who fail to improve it are too limp and indifferent. Some discussants believe that the new, Young Turkish government might do something to improve conditions; but most agree that Westerners should intervene to ensure that improvements are carried out, an idea linked to the idea that the Orient cannot progress and modernize without Western help.46 The contrast between the energetic European and the feckless male Arab is reinforced by constant resort to stereotypical images, such as that of the waterpipe-smoker. Dreiwitz describes how what he calls ”the eastern life / det österländska livet” includes the form of a motionless Arab drinking mocha-coffee and smoking a waterpipe.47 There are almost as many descriptions of the

43 Ibid., p. 150f
44 Colliander, p. 26f
45 bidragande orsak till den i österlanden mycket utbredda blindheten, som vi ofta bemärkte i Egypten, är en fatalistisk sorglöshet hos föräldrarna att icke bry sig om barnens ofta av flugor hemsökta och smutsiga ögon. Arnoldson, p. 39
46 Arnoldson, p. 25f
47 Dreiwitz, p. 29f
waterpipe as there are, for instance, of palms and camels. It seems to be part of the exotic canon out of which the authors take their images, a canon complemented by the historical and biblical; in this case, in order to embody the passive, unchanging, sleeping Orient.

Being timeless does not, however, mean being idyllic, harmonious, or noble. The authors usually join Dreiwitz in linking the timeless with the disorderly, dirty, lively, corrupt and cruel. Most of them provide illustrative street scenes, resembling the following from Dreiwitz:

The streets are extremely narrow and dirty. All that bears the name of garbage is thrown onto the street and if one is lucky, one can receive an involuntary shower over oneself, when some-one empties a slop-bucket from a roof or a window. Here people live their lives under the same forms and conditions as thousands of years ago. Here the story-teller collects constantly listening crowds. The Mecca-pilgrim, performing as joker, always has his public, and the snake-charmer is sure of one too. It is, as if one saw a new world, when one wanders through these labyrinth-like alley-ways. If one is lucky, one may witness a marriage procession, that draws past with loud music. If I then am to stop in front of a funeral procession the picture is complete. In front of the procession walks a beggar and praises the charitableness of the dead person. Professional women mourners [gråtorskor] tear their hair. The dead person is carried on a pall on the shoulders of the men. The corpse is buried in variously colored cloth.

The streets of old Cairo are narrow and dirty, garbage is thrown on the street and one is at risk from the slop-buckets that are emptied from windows. The Orient, here, threatens the civilized visitor with its aggressive dirt. On the other hand, we see in the old Cairo a ”new world” whose exotic excess complements the rawly primitive with marriage processions with loud music, funeral processions with professional female mourners who tear their hair, corpses that are borne on the shoulders and which are wrapped in colorful cloth, story-tellers, snake-charmers and ”Mecca-pilgrims, who perform as clowns”.

Brusewitz also introduces her tale with the meeting of an exotic world. She begins her account of her arrival in Egypt with a description of the time differences between Egypt and Sweden, and concludes by explaining that the Orient is the "land of the sunrise / soluppgångens land" and that "[i]t is an entirely new world, one is met with there / [d]et är en helt ny värld, som där möter en." She notes, as part of this new world, women covered in black veils, and village houses that look like earth-huts or derelict ruins. That every village has a minaret from which, five times a day, the hour of prayer is announced, and that one sees palms and blooming trees, is also part of the exotic gallery.\(^49\)

Arnoldson’s arrival, with his wife, at the dock in Jaffà, touches similar themes:

Around here crowds all sorts of people, white, brown and black. They maintain a terrible racket, worse, in its way, than the noise on board the ship. Already a while before docking we could, in our boat, hear this hubbub as a disorderly din, increasing in power as we approached the shore. Now it is as a confused tumult. Angrily upset voices and shrill whistlings, arguments and a running here and there and a deafening rattling with all sorts of rolling and scraping rubbish. Many all-too-willing-to-serve arms were stretched out at my and Edit’s travel goods, two trunks.\(^50\)

... a confused crowd of burnished-brown faces and thin arms and legs. It is the country-folk (fallaher), dressed in coats (armless, black- and white-striped) or sheep-skins (with the wool on the inside) and on the head a high fez, tied round with a flowered cloth. It is not so easy, here, to get through the crowds of people and mud, and between the many animals, who everywhere leave behind unpleasant marks. /.../

Otherwise, there is nothing else worth noticing in this motly stream of people, that flows past without interruption.\(^51\)

\(^{49}\) Brusewitz, p. 8
\(^{50}\) Här omkring vimlar det av allehanda folk, vita, bruna och svarta. De håll ett förfärligt oväsen, i sitt slag värre än larmet ombord å fartyget. Redan en stund före landstigningen ute i vår båt hörde vi detta stoj som ett oredigt buller, tilltagande i styrka allt efter som vi närmade oss stranden. Nu är det som ett förvirrat tumult. Häftigt upprörda röster och gälla visslingar, gräl och springande hit och dit och ett bedövande skrammel med allehanda rullande och skrapande otyg. Många alltför tjänstvilliga armar sträckas efter Edits och mitt resgods, två väskor. Arnoldson, p. 31

\(^{51}\) ett vimmel av blankbruna ansikten och magra armar och ben. Det är landsfolket (fellaher), klädda i rock (ärmlös, svart- och vitrandig) eller färskinnspäls (med ullen på insidan) och på huvudet en hög fez, omslutnen med en blommig duk. Här är icke så lätt att ta sig fram i folkträngseln och gyttjan, och mellan de många djuren, som över allt lämna otrevliga märken efter sig. /.../ För övrigt är här ingenting annat aktivt än den brokiga folkströmmen, som oavbrutet böljar förbi. Ibid., p. 36
Here we see two recurring themes. Disorder and dirt, that is, lack of the discipline and cleanliness that the travelers perceive as characterizing their own societies. In the manifold complaints about the disorder and dirt, and about the bad smells, one can sense the authors’ bourgeois background – they come from well-to-do, clean and orderly homes. Had they come from more impoverished urban conditions, or from the Swedish countryside, they would presumably have said less about dirt and disorder. Another recurring theme we see, above, is the notation of exotic skin-colors and clothes. The people are interesting just because they make up a motley mass, and have dark skin. Finally, again, we have the slight sense of threat – the ’many all-too-willing arms that are stretched out for’ the travelers’ baggage; arms which, we later hear, are thin, and belong to people with ’shiny-brown faces’, among whom it is ”not so easy to make one’s way”. In general, this type of street-scene is a common way of representing the exotic, primitive Orient. The authors all recur to the open street-market. Dirt – possibly threatening dirt – is a prevalent theme. Colliander tells how a female bird-seller pressed water from her own mouth, into the beaks of the birds – something she seems to have experienced as very unhygienic.  

Equally unpleasant, it seems, are experiences of the polluted Arab character.

---

52 Colliander, p. 21f
The many unsympathetic characteristics of the Arabs are personified in a few constantly recurring stereotypical figures. One of these is the beggar. Colliander speaks of the people one met on the street, whose

.../ stubborn cries rang out: ”bakschisch”, ”bakschisch”. A large part of the gladness and enjoyment in a journey in Egypt is lost because of this constant call for “coins”. I have seen breast-feeding children leave the breast in order to stretch out the little hand and ask for ”bakschisch”.

”Bakschisch” is an Arabic word for gift, and is a way of asking for alms. Colliander adds that the children (whom she describes as begging) nurse up to the age of three, and can be seen running about eating oranges or bananas. This is a way of emphasizing that their begging is a matter of pure greed; the children, she implies, have plenty of food. Dreiwitz also notes that ”[b]eggars are abundant / [t]iggare finns i massor” in Jerusalem.

Baedeker’s travel guide to Palestine warned travelers about the beggars. This probably influenced our authors. The guide presents begging as an institutionalized problem, and suggests different strategies to save the traveler from being overwhelmed by beggars yelling ”bakhchîch, bakhchîch”. Neither Colliander nor Dreiwitz seem to attribute the begging to true need. Colliander is eager to inform us about the Arab’s peculiar relationship to money: ”the poor Arab saves all his gold coins, never exchanges them, but uses only his small change”, she tells us when an old man sulks because he has received the wrong type of money. Dreiwitz describes the Aras’ graspingness thus:

A woman wanted to read our fortunes from our hands. If she was related to the fortune-telling woman in Saul’s time I do not know, but it is, after all, possible /.../ Her arts had no effect on us. As for the woman, it was probably most immediately a question of our piasters.

Corrupt begging is coupled to corrupt marketing. Bazaars constitute a

53 enträgna rop ljödo: ”bakschisch”, ”bakschisch”. En stor del af fröjden och njutningen vid enresa i Egypten går förlorad genom detta ständiga rop på ”slantar”. Jag har sett barn som diat sin moder lämna bröstet för att sträcka ut den lilla handen och be om ”bakschisch”. Ibid., p. 33
54 Ibid.
55 Dreiwitz, p. 129
56 Baedeker, p. XXV-XXVI
57 Colliander, p. 64f
58 En kvinna ville spå i händerna. Om hon var en ättling till spåkvinnan på Sauls tid vet jag ej, men det är ju möjligt .... Hennes konst inverkade icke på oss. För kvinnans vidkommande, gällde det väl närmast våra piastrar Dreiwitz, p. 207f

108
stereotypical environment described by all the authors. Here we find both the usual motley, colorful Oriental life, and the corrupt marketer. Dreiwitz asserts, in passing, as a fact, that one is cheated at the bazaar irregardless of what one buys, and at what price.\textsuperscript{59} Arnoldson describes with some irritation how a salesman waved to him in an obsequious way, and assured him that he knew him, in order to get Arnoldson to pay attention to his wares.\textsuperscript{60} However, Arnoldson also writes things that oppose the picture of greedy locals. These people are, he concludes, "neither better nor worse than people in general":

The much writing and talking about the greed [snikenhet] etc. of the Turkish civil servants is, for the most part, nonsense. They are in this respect neither better nor worse than people in general, irrespective of their nationality and social status.\textsuperscript{61}

Corruption shades, in some accounts, over to cruelty. Cruelty towards animals is another, immoral Arab characteristic. Descriptions thereof occur more often in the women’s travel accounts. Colliander tells of the Cairo street, upon which walks a camel with grave steps and with the little head with the large, beautiful eyes high-borne;\textsuperscript{62}

The lovely camel "is, however, very subordinate to the Arab or negro, who sits up there on its back". This subordination is, in this context, something negative; the camel is humbled, grave, has large pretty eyes, and a small, high-borne head (characteristics reminiscent of descriptions of women), yet is ridden by an "Arab" or "negro", "who sits up there on its back". Both Arab and negro had negative connotations in Europe in 1910. This interpretation is bolstered by other, similar assertions. We hear, elsewhere, of a donkey which is carrying a large burden of white clover:

After the ass had unloaded its green burden, the poor thing had, itself, to be content with the dry desert-plants and thistles.\textsuperscript{63}

\textsuperscript{59} Dreiwitz, p. 25f
\textsuperscript{60} Arnoldson, p. 36
\textsuperscript{61} Det myckna skrivandet och talet om de turkiska tjänstemännens snikenhet o. s. v. är mestadels struntprat. De är i detta hänseende varken bättre eller sämre än människor i allmänhet, oberoende av nationalitet och samhällsställning. Arnoldson, p. 32. He may be referring to Baedeker’s statement that bribery makes everything in the Orient work (p. XXV-XXVI)
\textsuperscript{62} vandrar en kamel med gravitetiska steg och det lilla hufvudet med de stora vackra ögonen högtburet; dock är djuret mycket undergivet den arab eller neger, som sitter däruppe på ryggen. Colliander, p. 23.
\textsuperscript{63} Sedan åsnan aflastat sin gröna börda får den stackarn själf nöja sig med de torra ökenväxterna och tistierna. Ibid., p. 8f
Both Brusewitz and Dreiwitz agree that the donkeys are “immeasurably heavily burdened / ofantligt hårt lastade”. The women show the most empathy, however. Oriental cruelty also appears in Dreiwitz’s description of how the Egyptian police use whips, and that the Egyptians are traditionally used to whips – something he proves by describing a monument, which depicts workers being whipped by an overseer.

Many of these aspects of Arab society and character can be linked to existing prejudices about non-Europeans and Oriental life. Many, however, have to do with the perception of the Arabs’ alien religion – which introduces our second theme.

**Islam and Muslim Society**

The travel accounts often refer to Islam, using, throughout, the terms “Mohammedanism” and “Mohammedan”. This pietocentrist vocabulary ties in with the authors’ remarks on Muhammad’s personal actions, which, taken together, reduce Islam to something akin to a personal cult. Christianity’s central figure, Jesus, is, by contrast, referred to more impersonally as the ”Master” or ”Son of Man”.

We often come across detailed discussions comparing Christianity and Islam. The veiled woman, and women’s position in Muslim society, are often the kernel of the analysis of the foreign religion. Colliander compares the Muslim, Eastern woman to the Finnish, and concludes that the Finnish woman would in no way benefit by an exchange of places. In the East the woman is, she writes, a complete slave to the man’s will and passions. On the other hand, less is expected of her in terms of caring for house and home, working and nurturing than in Finland; but in this context, this scarcely appears as a real advantage. We are further informed that the agricultural laborer buys his wife, and this for the same price he gives for a camel. The girl is bought at the age of nine or ten, and when she is full-grown married life begins; this consists of boiling beans, baking bread, help with the harvest and, above all, sitting with her dirty children in front of the family’s lowly dwelling. When the women are over thirty, they have, furthermore, placidly to accept the man’s buying himself a new, younger wife. This is, writes Colliander, true of the lower classes, but things are scarcely better among the higher: there, the woman is incorporated into the man’s harem.

Brusewitz is equally suspicious. She describes how the Muslim woman never appears at prayers, and does not, it seems, participate in public religion.

---

64 Brusewitz, p. 54f; Dreiwitz, p. 129
65 Dreiwitz, p. 26
66 See, for instance, Brusewitz p. 71, Dreiwitz p. 211
67 Colliander, p. 20, 26f
No, writes Brusewitz; she is scarcely seen as having a soul in the same way the man does. Further, polygamy is permitted, and it is, she maintains, considered a great honor for a man to have many women. She further criticizes the Muslim women’s belief in superstition. Their religious duty is to keep the home and children safe from the influence of evil powers through different magic rites, for instance those meant to protect against ”the evil eye”. Brusewitz gives further descriptions of rituals meant to protect against evil – blue glass beads, blue-painted figures over the doors, etc. Her contempt is unmistakable.68

Class prejudices probably played a role here, as well; for a European’s most intimate knowledge of ”the Eastern woman” might well derive from Eastern servants. It is worth noting that Brusewitz exemplified the superstition of Muslim women with a story of a German woman who had ”native female servants / infödda tjänarinnor”. One of the servants had called out in happy surprise with the German woman’s small child had taken its first independent steps; whereupon another female servant chastised her, and began gabbling magic formulas to protect the child from any harm caused by the joyous cry. Here we can trace Brusewitz’s class-based outlook: the whole passage is reminiscent of upper-class women complaining about their servants.

Dreiwitz and Arnoldson give only fleeting glimpses of Eastern women, but the authors do not avoid frequent comments on how veils cover their faces. Dreiwitz reports on one occasion that one seldom sees an unveiled Muslim woman in Jerusalem. Her religion forbids her to show her face to a foreign man, and if one meets an unveiled woman after dark, she is either a foreigner or a ”public woman” (he is probably referring to prostitutes). For us Westerners, writes Dreiwitz, it is strange to see the cafés filled with men without women, and no Easterner unthinkingly exposes his family life to foreign gaze. If one is invited to an Eastern home, one is not allowed to see the wife; to ask how she is would be a breach of etiquette.69 This shows Dreiwitz’s more superficial analysis of the status of Eastern women – much seems, indeed, to center on the degree to which Eastern men were willing to show him ”their” women. Here we find no evidence of the empathy we find with Colliander and Brusewitz. The latter discuss the women’s souls and their sale on the marriage market, while Dreiwitz notes, in passing, that the women are not as visible as he is used to. Arnoldson’s statements about women, finally, put him in a middle position between Dreiwitz and the two female authors. He describes how the travelers discuss the Muslim woman. Different opinions are expressed.

---

68 Brusewitz, p. 68f. The descriptions of the Eastern woman seem to be different according to the gender of the author. The women give longer and more detailed descriptions of the Eastern women’s oppression. This is in accordance with Fazlhashemi’s conclusions about Western women’s picture of Persian women during the 1930s. See Fazlhashemi “Monolog över kulturmöten /.../ ”, for instance p. 180
69 Dreiwitz, p. 131ff
Basically, the conversation centers on the Palestinian woman’s lack of legal rights. Even if most of the natives are "good-natured / godlynta" and "tender / ömsinta", the man has the right to when he so wishes drive the woman from his house, something which is judged unjust towards the woman. Neither is it understood why the woman should wear a veil – “if now God has given her a pretty face the men should be allowed to look at it / om nu Gud givit henne ett vackert ansikte ska väl mannen få betrakta det”.70

That Muslims pray five times a day, and take off their shoes each time, is something that all the authors comment on. After Colliander has done so she throws off the following judgment:

As long as Muhammedanism rules over these groups of people [folkslag], no real development can take place in this country. The control of the country’s economy, industry and farming is almost completely in the hands of foreigners.71

The fact that foreigners, or rather (as is apparent from the context) Westerners lead the country’s economic and industry, is proof that Islam hinders progress. Colliander goes on to state that there are no Arabic primary schools or other educational institutions, except for the recently opened Cairo university, which is led by European professors. The only Arabic university, also in Cairo, concentrates on exegesis of the Qur’an, something to which Colliander attaches little value. Real education, it is apparent, means scientific education on a European model. The Arabs who really want to study, it follows, must do so in Europe. The Arabic boy gets, in general, a very "poor/knapphändig" education. The girl gets the worst education of all. Only a few girls, from the richer families, go to school at all.72 Here, again, Colliander applies a female-centered perspective.

Dreiwitz has no information to give about girls’ schooling. There are, on the other hand, other similarities between him and Colliander. In Egypt, we are told, "[s]cientific study, in the European sense, does not occur / [n]ågot vetenskapligt studium enligt västerländskt begrepp förekommer icke". Muslim universities concentrate, rather, on studying the Qur’an. After a visit to a Qur’an school Dreiwitz tells how he and his companions were forced to put on yellow slippers, so as not to profane the room with their feet. Dreiwitz observed how the students, during the reading, rocked their bodies back and forth, and he states his belief that the students looked upon him and his companions as

---

70 Arnoldson, p. 47f
71 Så länge muhammedanismen härskar öfver dessa folkslag, kan ej någon egentlig utveckling ske i detta land. Ledningen af landets ekonomi, industri och landbruk är nästan helt och hållet i utlänningsarnas händer. Colliander, p. 25f
72 Ibid., p. 26
"unbelieving dogs / otroga hundar". This picture of religious hostility is repeated when Dreiwitz wants to visit a certain mosque: "Until very recently, the 'unbelieving’ were prohibited to visit the mosque / Tills för helt kort tid sedan voro 'otroga ' förbjudna att besöka moskén." Such expressions fit the common view, described by Holmberg, of Muslims as fanatics. Like Colliander, so also does Dreiwitz hold up science as the norm for what a university should dedicate itself to, while studies of the Qur'an are not seen as especially worthwhile. Both have an obviously eurocentric view of education. Dreiwitz surprises the reader, however, a few pages after his dismissive evaluation of Egyptian universities, by giving a "positive" judgment of Egyptian students from the Technical and Agrarian Colleges outside of Cairo:

These people were all wide-awake and intelligent. By the discussion one could understand, that Egypt has the possibility of once again becoming a great and powerful nation, if its 12 millions become imbued with modern legal and social concepts.

It is apparent that it is, however, necessary that Egypt draw closer to the West, if it is to become a great nation – there is little doubt that the "modern conception of law and society” mentioned here is equivalent with Western concepts of law and society. He further hopes that the recently independent Egypt will have luck and success in the nations’ battle for progress and justice. One can note, in parenthesis, that when Dreiwitz speaks of Egypt’s potential to ”once again” become great and powerful, he reaffirms that the Orient is in a state of regression. There is, however, no dismissal of the Egyptians as an inferior race.

The authors provide further illustrations of Muslim fanaticism; Arnoldson, for instance, describes a Muslim priest as a great bear, who considers Arnoldson ”a Christian dog / en kristen hund”. He also tells of two lady tourists who were refused entrance to a mosque because the hour of prayer had begun. They defied the prohibition, and were, because of their impudence, shot and wounded by "a fanatic Mohammedan / en fanatisk mohammedan". Brusewitz uses a similar violent anecdote to show the fanaticism of Islam: a girl who had attended a Christian mission school, Brusewitz writes, confessed that she

73 Dreiwitz, p. 27
74 Ibid., p. 186
75 See Holmberg 1994, p. 24f
76 Det var idel vaket och intelligent folk. Av samtalet förstod man, att Egypten har möjligheter att än en gång bli en stor och mäktig nation, om dess 12 millioner bliva genomsyrade av moder-na rätts- och samfundsbegrepp Dreiwitz, p. 36f
77 Ibid., p. 37
wanted to convert to Christianity, whereupon her parents tried to get her murdered, so as to free the family from the great dishonor. Brusewitz treats the killing of those who abandon the right belief as if it were something akin to Muslim law.\textsuperscript{79}

The Muslims are, however, not the only violent group; the violence of the Christian crusaders is a topic discussed in several of these travel accounts. Dreiwitz criticizes the bloodthirstiness of the Crusades, for instance, in order to explain the Muslims’ great hatred of Christianity. It is interesting that he presents the Muslim Saladin, who reconquered Jerusalem from the Christians, as, in comparison to the crusaders, a substantially more peaceful and humane ruler.\textsuperscript{80} But this should not be seen as presenting Islam as in any way superior to Christianity; rather, it ascribes good Muslims a certain worth in comparison with \textit{bad} Christians. The purpose is to use Islam as an example in order, in this case, to criticize errant Christianity.

But there are other clear examples of praise for aspects of Islam, primarily by Brusewitz and Arnoldson. Brusewitz tells that the first time one hears the call to prayers, one might wonder what kind of ”shrieking / skränande” this was, but once the words (”There is no God but Allah and Mohammed is his prophet. Come to prayer! / Det finns inte någon Gud utom Allah och Mohammed är hans profet. Kommen till bön!”) are understood, one listens with a sense of respect. It is interesting that she terms this call to prayer ”much-needed / välbehövlig”, and also that she compares it to the Christian ringing of church bells. She compares the mosques, in terms of function, to Christian churches; both are holy spaces. She does not, thus, seem unreservedly contemptuous of the foreign religion, even if she cannot refrain from remarking that mosque prayer is only performed by \textit{men}; women are not welcome.\textsuperscript{81} She also shows up Islam’s attractive sides, such as the careful observation of the outer duties, the call to prayer and respect for God, and the beautiful thoughts and prayers in the Qur’an. Islam, further, fulfills the function of giving the ”people of nature / naturfolken”, by which she probably means black Africans, ”a certain superficial polish / en viss yttre polityr”.\textsuperscript{82}

None of this can really be interpreted as a positive re-evaluation of Islam. It is, rather, quite in line with what Holmberg writes of the Christian observers’ use of positive aspects of Islam to create the basis for an eventual harsh condemnation of the religion. Brusewitz continues, namely, with the complaint that the above-mentioned people of nature, once converted to Islam, become resistant to influences from other religions. Neither do they experience a deep

\textsuperscript{79} Brusewitz, p. 70f
\textsuperscript{80} Dreiwitz, p. 123
\textsuperscript{81} Brusewitz, p. 67f
\textsuperscript{82} Ibid., p. 71
conversion, with all that that involves: a joyful and humble trust in God, such as provided by true Christianity, which presents the Master’s person as a moral ideal.83

She describes, further, the dangerous competition to Christianity posed by Islam. Islam is a threat, for Muslims are driven to convert others; this because only by doing so can they assure themselves a place in Paradise. Her own finding, that there are twice as many Christians as Muslims, does little to comfort her. She is still worried about the rapid spread of Islam among heathen peoples, who become, after conversion, virtually immune to Christianity.84 In other words, one notes a fear that Christianity will lose in an ongoing Kulturkampf. Holmberg points out the similar, contemporary fear of The Yellow Peril, which embodied similar turn-of-the-century fears for the survival of European hegemony.85

Arnoldson gives, despite his retailing of the shooting of the two lady tourists, some very sympathetic images of Islam. He paints a picture of how the Christians in Jerusalem must be guarded by a thousand Turkish soldiers, to stop them from trampling each other to death when they crowd into a given holy place; the Muslims, by contrast, are altogether peaceful when visiting the Mosque of the Cliff. Like Dreiwitz, Arnoldson puts a historical perspective on this contrast between Muslim peacefulness and Christian violence. Arnoldson describes the crusaders’ cruelty, including their murder of children and dishonoring of women; this is contrasted to Mullah Omar’s peaceful takeover of Jerusalem in 637. He also gives the example of the Turkish sultan, who, during the Balkan wars of the early twentieth century, told his men to avoid shedding unnecessary blood; while his Christian opponents called for a new, anti-Turkish crusade.86

We find, once again, the description of a peaceful Orient, filled with goodwill. These benevolent descriptions of Muslim piety are primarily meant, however, as a backdrop to a critique of those elements of Christianity with which the author is discontent. The positive words about Islam are seldom, if ever, left to stand on their own. They are combined either with a comparative critique of historical Christian wrongdoings, or a description of the failings of various Christian communities. This pistocentric perspective uses Islam not only to describe Muslims, but also to criticize ”incorrect” Christians (in this case, largely non-Protestants). Such critique is recurring. Thus, for instance, Dreiwitz rails against, and reports his nausea at seeing, a Christian mass which crowds to kiss a pillar at which soldiers supposedly whipped Jesus.87 Brusewitz

83 Brusewitz, p. 71
84 Ibid., p. 70
85 Holmberg 1994, p. 30
86 Arnoldson, p. 208ff
87 Dreiwitz, p. 152
complains of the corruption of Palestine’s Christian communities by non-Christian religions (betraying, perhaps, her own Lutheran prejudices): "the spirit of outer form penetrated into the Christian churches / yttre formväsen trängt in i de kristna kyrkorna".\textsuperscript{88} This formulation can be taken to constitute a critique of the Orthodox, Catholic, and other church communities’ sacred decorations and liturgies.

\textbf{The Good Arabs}

Suddenly we read that:

People look neat and clean. Especially one sees a large number of children on the streets and among them many pleasant, lively boys. One of these we take with us. He is so happy to be allowed to carry our things and show us around, glad to help without immediately asking for reward, which is remarkable in this country. The women whom we meet are pretty, perhaps even prettier than in most other places.\textsuperscript{89}

\textsuperscript{88} Brusewitz, p. 71
\textsuperscript{89} [m]änniskorna se snygga och rena ut. Särskilt ser man en stor mängd barn på gatorna och bland dem många trevliga, pigga pojkar. En av dem ta vi med oss. Han är så glad att få bära våra saker och visa oss omkring, glad att få hjälpa \textit{utan} att genast fråga efter belöning, vilket är märkvärdigt här i landet. Kvinnorna, som vi möta, äro vackra, kanske t. o. m. vackrare än på de flesta andra håll. Brusewitz, p. 107f
Brusewitz is now in Nazareth and is praising the people! About the town itself she says, moreover, that it is "a clean, well-ordered and well-built town with less of an aged and Eastern imprint than most of the others in the country / en prydlig och välbyggd stad med mindre ålderdomlig och österländsk prägel än de flesta andra i landet." What explains these unexpected words about a people who, otherwise, are not treated with much good-will? The answer appears in the following observation, again on Nazareth:

Most of these, around 10,000 inhabitants, are Christian. /…/ The number of churches, cloisters, schools and foundations is large. One hears bell-ringing almost all through the day.91 That which stimulates admiration is, thus, these people’s Christianity. The Christian faith contributes to a sudden, positive reevaluation of the local population; the people are now handsome, well-groomed, clean, pleasant and energetic. Further, they do not display the general Oriental liking for begging; and their town is less Eastern than most of the others. Obviously, "Eastern" has become synonymous with disorderly, dirty, ill-built and aged. To be sure, not even the inhabitants of Nazareth are completely free of Eastern timelessness. Of the town’s well Brusewitz writes:

We see a large number of the town’s pretty women come, with large pots on their heads, to fetch water. Thus have they come and gone in all time, often with their small children on their arm.92

The unchanging Orient is thus still with us, but in this case, in a positive sense: Brusewitz associates the timelessness with Jesus’s time. In the above passage

90 Ibid., p. 107
91 De flesta av dess omkr. 10 000 invånare äro kristna. /…/ Kyrkornas, klostrens, skolornas och stiftelsernas mängd är stor. Klockringning hör man nästan hela dagarna. Ibid., p. 107
92 Vi se en mängd av stadens vackra kvinnor komma med stora krukor på huvudet för att hämta vatten. Så ha de kommit och gått i alla tider, ofta med sina små barn på armen. Ibid., p. 105f
we find, further, that Nazareth is less aged and Eastern than most towns – although this does not mean it is neither aged nor Eastern. Why is it difficult for Brusewitz to express complete approval of the people and the town? To be sure, they are Christian – but are they the right kind of Christians? Brusewitz is probably Protestant, while the bulk of the population of Nazareth is probably either Orthodox or Catholic. To this must be added the fact that its inhabitants, however Christian, are still Arabs, and thereby different in language, appearance and culture. Racism probably played a part. We can trace references to race in Brusewitz’s travel account, as when she describes Jerusalem as a strange society with people of the most different races and religions.93 She explains, later, that one should divide the different peoples into Arabs, Jews and Franks, and she describes the different peoples’ way of dressing.94 The categorization by race is, accordingly, important; and considering the way in which racism served the “white” person, and how it devalued all other “races”, it is understandably difficult for Brusewitz fully to accept the people of Nazareth, however Christian, well-groomed and clean they may be.

Dreiwitz also demonstrates a pistocentric re-evaluation of Arabs, similar to Brusewitz’s. The quote is taken from an account of an argument about races:

Bethlehem is a cleanly town, when one compares it to other Palestinian towns. This is because it is a Christian town. Wherever the Christian culture establishes itself, it recreates the way of life of the people. This has happened here. The people are of another sort than the usual. One has explained this as being because the Crusaders entered into marriages with native women and that it hence is, supposedly, a mixed race of Easterners and Westerns, that we meet here.95

Here we find beneficent Christian culture closely linked to the ”white race”. The native women have, at one point, been enriched with blood from white Christians, and this has given rise to a society to that is much better off than the others in Palestine.

Racial thinking can be traced in all of the travel accounts studied here. However, Colliander and Arnoldson, writing in 1913, are primarily pisto- and eurocentric; they never use the word race. By contrast, Dreiwitz and Brusewitz give clear signs of biological racism, possibly due to a broader acceptance of racism in inter-war Sweden.

93 Brusewitz, p. 52f
94 Ibid., p. 56ff
Like Brusewitz, Dreiwitz also visits Nazareth (and the similarity of their observations is another indication of the power of the travel paradigm for visits to the Holy Land). Dreiwitz’s interest in Nazareth is pistocentric; like Brusewitz, he starts his description of the place by pointing out that the majority of the inhabitants are Christian. He continues: “[t]he town is cleanly and well-built. One is not bothered, here, by begging, as in other places / [s]taden är renlig och bra byggd. Man besväras icke här av tiggeri såsom på andra platser.”96 Brusewitz reports the same things, in the same order: the inhabitants are Christian, the town is “well-ordered, clean, and well-built / prydlig och välbyggd”, and a boy carries water for her without asking for recompense, which is different from how things are in the rest of the country.97 The two travelers have probably been shown around the town by the same guide, or have immersed themselves in similar literature.

Finally, Arnoldson introduces us to another good Arab. He is actually an individual – “Mustafa”. Mustafa, whose task it is to take Arnoldson and his wife to the Jaffa hostel, has “a good-humored nature / ett gott lynne”. Immediately thereafter, Mustafa is shown arguing with a certain Professor Natan about whether Jaffa’s blooming commerce and industry are dependent on Christians and Jews. Mustafa criticizes the Christian Mission, and maintains that Muslims only let themselves be converted because of the temptation of Christian money; as soon as the money runs out, the conversions will end. He also criticizes the Christians for their belief that charitable gifts of money are sufficient to help suffering people. Here, it seems, Mustafa is being used to embarrass Arnoldson’s bourgeois friends in Sweden, who obviously think that they can make up for a weak faith by giving money to the church. A little later, Mustafa is shown criticizing Napoleon’s and the crusaders’ ill-deeds in Jaffa.98 Shortly thereafter he disappears from the story. The good-humored Mustafa fills a purpose in the account, thus, similar to that of the positive examples of pious Muslims: to criticize elements within Christianity with which the author is discontent.

Religion is thus an important influence in describing the Orient. But it enters in still another way – one which we will call the Biblical paradigm.

The Biblical Paradigm and the Holy Orient as Place and Time
As mentioned in the introductory discussion, the third paradigm or genre of importance I have termed the Biblical. In the following, we shall see how the Bible influences where one travels and what one sees; the establishment of

---

96 Ibid., p. 198
97 Brusewitz, p. 107
98 Arnoldson, p. 32f, 34f, 38
polarizations and opposites; and, generally, how one views animals, places, things and places as parts of eternal stories, as timeless symbols.

As the reader has doubtless already noted, the Palestinian travel accounts were deeply influenced by the Bible. They are filled with Bible quotations, references to biblical anecdotes and holy stories. Above all, they are marked by the fact that the traveler visits, and structures his or her narrative around, as many biblical places as possible. The Bible, in short, seems to dictate what things are to be emphasized. Consider the journey’s various stopping-points: Canaan, Jerusalem, Jesus’s grave, Bethlehem, Nazareth and so on. The chronology of these visits gives the travel account its structure; different chapters are named for these different stops. The journeys, and thereby the accounts of the journeys, in fact bear striking similarity to one another. All four pilgrim-tourists start with a visit to Egypt, where one visits and writes about Cairo, Alexandria and Port Said, and the pyramids. This visit to Egypt functions as a prelude to the more important part of the journey, to Palestine and Jerusalem (the traveler’s most important goal). The journey continues, then, northwards, with a visit first to Bethlehem and then Nazareth, and then returns to Jerusalem. In two cases the northward trip is extended to Damascus and Beirut; but generally, the Palestinian tours are very similar. The only exception is Arnoldson’s account, which concentrates on Jerusalem and its environs. This biblical geography is accompanied by Bible-inspired commentary; the whole is viewed as a sort of biblical museum, where the Bible (but also secular history) is constantly at hand. ”Who lived and died where? Who did what where? Look at that: here is the ruin of that-and-that! About this place it is said . .!” And so on.

The travelers, in short, are well-prepared for what they will see. The Bible has dictated where they will travel, and how they will experience it. The Bible, of course, was not the only pre-emptive influence. Guides and handbooks also stood between the pilgrim-tourists and their personal experience of the Holy Land. Their information, however, often overlapped. Baedeker’s travel books provide, as described above, Bible-rich instruction of how one was to experience Palestine. These handbooks, together with earlier travel accounts, include abundant biblical anecdotes and quotes which one was to bring to mind each time one observed a place, surviving monument or tradition. This is something our pilgrim-tourists have copied somewhat. Their pious expectations of the Holy Land were strengthened, further, by the many representatives of Christian culture, Swedish-Lutheran or other, that they met there. As mentioned above, in the case of Oscar Dreiwitz’s guide pater Taepper, most of the guides were, probably, monks who belonged to one of the many small Christian minorities in Palestine, or immigrated Westerners.

However, the Bible itself remained key to these travel accounts. We see, for instance, how it dominates Maria Brusewitz’s table of contents, where every chapter is enriched with up to a dozen page references to anecdotes and words
of wisdom in Holy Writ.99 This gives what is perhaps the most accurate idea of the goal of both the journey to, and the account of, the Holy Land: they are meant to make the biblical stories, with which the authors have grown up, come visually alive. This is touched on in Brusewitz’s description of how Christian tourists relate to Palestine:

If one has, on the other hand, previously a definite experience of how God Himself appeared on the earth through Jesus Christ, then this appearance becomes even more of a true reality through being able to see the places, where this has happened, especially the places, that are relatively unchanged since His time.100

The same motif appears in Oscar Dreiwitz’s account, where he, after having described Palestinian customs and ways, summarizes:

That which has been said is enough to show us, how all fits into the pictures and parables of the New Testament. This seems to us to belong to that which is most valuable in a trip to Palestine, to get a living picture of the Bible’s presentations, in a way that is impossible to gain from a description. A trip in this country is the best commentary to the Bible that can be given.101

In short, the pilgrim-tourists are wandering in the footsteps of evangelical teachers, local Christian guides, travel accounts and guides, and the Bible. Their accounts are formed, on the one hand, by the travel-route, which is inspired by the Bible and copied from earlier travel writings. On the other hand, they are studded with quotes and extracts taken directly from the Bible. The travel account is meant to make these texts come alive.

The Bible, thus, has told the travelers what they are seeing. This is the case with the various polarities around which much in the accounts is structured. One of the most important is the oft-cited contrast between the spiritual, and the dirty and every-day. The Palestinians’ spirituality is often emphasized, and Arnoldson even endows the act of arrival with awe: the first glimpse from the boat of Judah Mountain causes both Christians and Muslims to fall on their

---

99 Brusewitz, p. 164ff
100 Har man däremot på förhand en bestämd erfarenhet av att Gud själv uppenbarat sig på jorden genom Jesus Kristus, då blir denna uppenbarelse en ännu verkligare verklighet genom att man får se de platser, där detta skett, i synnerhet de platser, som äro jämförelsevis oförändrade sedan hans tid Ibid., p. 7
101 Det sagda är nog för att visa oss, huru allt passar in på Nya Testamentets bilder och liknelser. Detta synes oss vara bland det värdefullaste vid en resa i Palestina, att få en levande bild av Bibelns framställningar så, som det är omöjligt för en skildring att giva. En resa i detta land är den bästa kommentar till Bibeln, som kan ges Dreiwitz, p. 267
knees in prayer. Arnoldson underlines the persistent presence of the holy with references to religious anecdotes, as when the sight of a shark brings to mind Jonah and the whale, with the added observation that the episode must have taken place in the very water over which he was then sailing.102 The meeting with the physical Orient often betrayed expectations of a holy exoticism, not least in the disappointment over the actual world observed in Cairo, Jaffa or Jerusalem. The holy is quickly affected by brutal realities, such as those described above – crowded streets, loud noises, dirt, strange customs and the presence of a foreign religion, Islam. The difference between the spiritual, idyllic and the dirty and real is strengthened by the authors’ liking for the dramatic.

Another polarity concerns the arcadian contra modernity. The image of the stagnant, sleeping Orient derives, according to Holmberg, from the Western conviction that Orientals were unable to adopt Western-style development and progress; this was seen as betokening a fatalistic passivity. But we find a similar image of timelessness in our pilgrim-tourists, founded, here, on the expectation that the Holy Orient will have remained unchanged since the times of Jesus and the Old Testament. The impression of having stopped in time is strengthened by the Orientalist images of female water-carriers and grain-grinders, or the waterpipe-smoking male Arabs one sees on the streets.103 The women water-carriers because they connote an ancient society, where water is

---

102 Arnoldson, p. 21f
still fetched by hand, and the pipe-smokers because they are endowed with passive, resting characteristics.

The female water-carriers confirm both the biblical-arcadian picture, and the view of the Orient as unchanging and passive. The latter appears, again, when Arnoldson writes of his train-ride between Jaffa and Jerusalem. From the train window Arnoldson sees miles of fertile grain fields on both sides of the railway, which makes him happy because the country otherwise seems, to him, so "barren / förött". Thereafter we are informed that one has German colonizers to thank for this fertility, and that the railway between Jaffa and Jerusalem is owned by a French company. The image confirms the idea that life and modernity has been brought to Palestine by representatives of the West; the Orientals cannot, by themselves, become modern. In Arnoldson’s account of the train-ride it is also apparent that the picture of standing still is based primarily on an arcadian-biblical dream of the Holy Land:

To speak, here, on the issue of railways, is perhaps a little lacking in respect. But it cannot well be avoided /…/ and one should be informed, after all, about something so profaning for the Holy Land as a railway to Jerusalem. I am therefore to be told /…/ that this 87 kilometer-long

---

103 Arnoldson, p. 39
104 Ibid., p. 41f
railway was opened in the fall of 1892, to the terror of both natives, pilgrims and tourists.\textsuperscript{105}

Even if Arnoldson is a bit ironic here, he presents the railroad as a modern phenomenon that does not really fit into the Swedish, Western, or pilgrims’ picture of an original Holy Land.

This picture of motionlessness and stillness, which is linked to a holy original state, is confirmed time and again in all the travel accounts. A further example appears in Dreiwitz’s account of Palestinian customs and ways, which he actively compares with, and illustrates with extracts from, the Bible. Progress, argues Dreiwitz, has passed the people of Palestine by. Rather, customs and ways have remained unchanged since the time of Christ and the Old Testament, and Dreiwitz tells us about how this makes the Biblical pictures come very much alive for him. The life of the shepherd is the same as before, the housing the same and equally primitive, the cloaks of camel-hair the same, the clothing is unchanged, and so on. The unchanged is contrasted, moreover, to the modern, when Dreiwitz tells us that the scythe is still used for harvesting; only one or two Palestinian colonies boast harvesting-machines.\textsuperscript{106} The colonies seem to be experienced as islands of modernity and they are, of course, run not by Arabs but by Westerners, including Western Jews.

Let us return to an earlier quote. As a metaphor of the meeting between West and East, Colliander tells us of how she sees a car driving side-by-side with a camel on the streets of Cairo, a picture which, using strong contrasts, presents the West as modern, and the Orient as old-fashioned. In the picture we also find a critique of modernity and a longing for beautiful, unspoiled nature:

\begin{quote}
At the side of the forward-rushing, ill-smelling automobile, walks a camel with grave steps and with the little head with the large, beautiful eyes high-borne; the animal is, however, very submissive towards the Arab or negro, who sits up there on its back.\textsuperscript{107}
\end{quote}

Dreiwitz summarizes his account of Palestinian customs and ways by showing how it all as consonant with the pictures and parables of the New Testament, and the statement that this is one of the most valuable aspects of a journey to Palestine, because it makes the Bible come alive. After such a journey, he

\textsuperscript{105} Att här tala i järnvägsfrågor är ju litet vanvördigt. Men det kan inte gärna undvikas /…/ och man skall väl ha reda på något så för det heliga landet profanerande som en järnväg till Jerusalem. Jag får alltså konstaterat /…/ att denna 87 km. långa bana öppnades hösten 1892, till skräck för både infödingar, pilgrimer och turister. Ibid., p. 42

\textsuperscript{106} Dreiwitz, p. 265ff

\textsuperscript{107} Vid sidan av den framrusande illaluktande automobilen, vandrar en kamel med gravitetiska steg och det lilla hufvudet med de stora vackra ögonen högthuret; dock är djuret mycket undergivet den arab eller neger, som sitter därupppe på ryggen. Colliander, p. 23.
believes, each traveler will read the Bible “with a new eye / en ny syn”, he believes.  

But it is not only in the Bible that one seeks confirmation of the unchanging nature of the Orient. In the introduction to Dreiwitz’s chapter on Jerusalem there is much ancient history, which ends with the observation that Jerusalem went through its darkest time in the years 69-70 when, according to Dreiwitz, a million people died during the Roman siege of the town. “Since that time the city never again rose to its earlier glory / Från den tiden reste sig aldrig staden mer till sin forna glans.” Here is further evidence of the more typical picture of the Orient, as having a grand past which is at odds with the modern, stagnant, possibly regressive Orient. 

But most often, the sleeping, unchanging Orient is incorporated in the dream of an ancient arcadian idyll – a fertile land of milk and honey. This is the mental picture Arnoldson has in mind when he praises the German colonizers’ cultivation of a country which he otherwise experiences as barren / förött. This also makes it difficult to accept a Palestinian railway – the arcadian dreamer protests against modern alienation from nature.  

We find another clear example of idyllic expectations when Dreiwitz visits Jacob’s well:

How very much we would have wished to be able, here, to see the well in its original form. But that sort of thing is impossible in Palestine. One can not really say, that profane hands have been laid on that which is holy. But the monks and priests have been busy everywhere, and built a church or a chapel on every memorable place and thus ruined the original. /…/ Here we would have wished to be able to sit down at the edge of the well and look out over the landscape towards the town Samarie and thus dream ourselves back to the time, when our Master sat here and spoke the inimitable words on praying in spirit and truth. But now we could not. One had, with all the additions, destroyed the impression, one should otherwise have had here. Now we drank of the water, looked down into the well, as all the other travelers had done, paid the monk and travelled on.
He complains over the exploitation of Palestine’s holy places. As in the case of Arnoldson, this concerns a dream of an idyll, and sorrow over its recent falsification and change. Like the other authors, Dreiwitz is on a pilgrimage to something real, true, and original. To be authentic it must be as untouched as possible by modern human hands, and in particular left alone by representatives of the Western world. When reality betrays expectations there is great disappointment.

Virginal, unspoiled countryside seems to improve the pilgrim-tourists’ experiences (as it probably does for all tourists). This is especially the case for the pilgrim-tourists, however, for the entire trip is a flight from the unromantic reality of modern society. Palestine is expected to be a Holy Land, an unchanged arcadian idyll reserved for the individual Swedish pilgrim-tourist. This is why Dreiwitz gives lists of examples showing how unchanged and spontaneously natural the Palestinians’ lives are. The unchanging can – in contrast to its usual, dismissive, Orientalist coloring – be experienced as something positive. Brusewitz gives the same impression, in her statement that a certain garden she visits gives a good impression of the gardens of Jericho, or when she tells of how, in Egypt, water is pumped with an ancient tool – the schadouf – which is illustrated with a picture of a man using one. To his right is a palm, and in the background loom the pyramids, symbols which connote an ancient culture.\(^\text{112}\)

\(^{112}\text{Brusewitz, p. 22f, p. 17}\)
As we saw in Dreiwitz’s description of Palestinian customs, people are included in this vision of an original, unchanged idyll. This is true of Brusewitz’s description of the Bedouins, as well. Brusewitz’s description of these people occurs in the midst of her extensive descriptions of nature. Amongst valleys and deserts she discerns, far away, flaming camp-fires:

It must be some of these nomadic Arabs, who even today move around with their herds, as did the children of Israel, before they came into Canaan.  

Brusewitz links nature, and the original and Bible-like: by studying the Bedouins we can learn how the patriarchs and the people of Israel lived in the desert and heaths, before they settled down to farming. Simultaneously, the Bedouins are incorporated into the description of nature itself; as when she tells that she sees ”rich vegetation, and numerous Bedouins / rik växtlighet, och talrika beduiner”. The same linkage to ancient, Biblical times inspires Arnoldson’s vision of the women water-carriers at Jaffa:

It is a joy to see these powerful and handsome women, among whom some, who seem to have finished their work, shine with a white head-dress, embroidered in several different colors.

These pretty women have come and gone with their water-urns in just this way, in all times. They are beautiful primarily because they can successfully be integrated into the biblical-arcadian dream.

The dominance of the Bible also shows in the selective notations of Biblical trades and animals – such as the shepherd, sheep, and donkey; the women carrying water and grinding grain; and the greedy fortune-teller (see above), about whom Dreiwitz speculated whether she might be a descendent of the fortune-teller of Saul’s era. The biblical-idyllic vision even extends to things. Dreiwitz, for instance, describes the streets of Jerusalem after the fall of dark, and observes that many use a lamp on a stick to see their way. This picture, he tells us, makes it easier for him to understand the words: ”Your word is a lamp for my feet / Ditt ord är en lykta för mina fotter.”

113 Det måste vara några av dessa nomadiserande araber, som ännu idag flytta omkring med sina hjordar, liksom Israels barn gjorde, innan de kommo in i Kanaan. Brusewitz, p.17
114 Ibid., p. 19
115 Det är en fröjd att se dessa kraftiga och vackra kvinnor, bland vilka några, som tyckas ha slutat sitt arbete, lysa med en vit huvudbonad, broderad i flere olika färger. Ibid., p. 37
116 Brusewitz, op.cit. See, for instance, mules p. 108, sheep and shepherds p. 33, 91; Dreiwitz, above, shepherds and mules p. 265. For the greedy fortune-teller, see earlier quote.
117 Dreiwitz, p. 130
are trying to link what they see with what is written, and vice versa.

This constant harking back to a biblical idyll prevents Muslim culture from appearing in an independent form. Brusewitz gives an obvious example of this, when she relates how, because Muslims are prohibited from drinking wine, the country’s cultivation of wine has declined since the Muslims became the country’s main population group. But when did this actually happen – how many centuries back does her comparison reach? At the most recent, probably, to Byzantium times; but still more probably to the time around Year Zero – if not to times still more ancient. This comparison further strengthens the picture of the country as one which has degenerated, due to the presence of Muslims and Arabs – or it has, as Arnoldson put it when he looked out the train window, become "förött".

People and places in the travel accounts’ perspective are thus most often viewed as timeless symbols, as participants in an eternal saga. When they no longer represent this idyll – because of their Arab nature, or some other Oriental factor – they then represent the degeneration of this idyll. The travel accounts waver between an idealized, Bible-influence picture of an eternal, unchanging Holy Orient – an arcadian idyll where all has been preserved since the time of Jesus and the Old Testament – and a disturbing insight that something has changed: Islam and the Arabs (and the Turks) have occupied the Holy Land and mismanaged it. This perspective strengthens the polarization between the spiritual and the dirty-everyday. The comparison with the idyll is always with us, and people and things become either symbolic of it, or of the ruin of arcadia.

Conclusion

I have used these travel-accounts to see if there is a special, Swedish, late-imperialistic discourse of pilgrimism and tourism, as a means of nuancing and complementing our conception of European Orientalism. My study has presented two major means of nuancing our understanding of Orientalism: first, the effect of not being a colonial power; and second, the power of the Bible over the travelers’ imaginations.

The most recurring statement about Arabs and Muslims has to do with images of a sleeping, stagnant, unchanging and primitive Orient. Stagnation is attributed to Arabic-Oriental culture, and the description is supported by stereotypical pictures of, among others, passive, waterpipe-smoking Arabs or people still living according to unchanged, ancient customs and ways. This picture, which Holmberg also discusses, must, however, be seen as part of the overarching conception of the Orient as Holy, as a site of the arcadian Idyll. This picture, anchored in the biblical and the Lutheran culture’s image of

---

118 Brusewitz, p. 66f
Palestine and other countries in the Holy Orient, exercises a strong power over the pilgrim-tourists; it directs and informs their vision. The authors make constant comparisons with the Bible, and find that the people in the Orient have the same clothes, farming methods, customs and ways as in the Old Testament and in Jesus’s time; the various ways in which the Orient has remained unchanged are seen as evidence of how the Holy Land has preserved its ancient, biblical culture.

But we are met, almost equally often, with the image of a ruined Holy Land, which is implicitly contrasted with the original, untouched Land. The accounts, in other words, divide their observations binarily; they either present pictures that confirm the author’s biblical understanding of Palestine and its people, or they show how the original and idyllic has been polluted by an Arabic, Muslim, Turkish or other Oriental factor. This polarization is reinforced by modern, Orientalist prejudices. The romantic picture of the Holy Orient keeps company with exotic pictures of pretty Oriental clothes, and picturesque scenes of water-carrying, ancient means of farming, and bread-baking; while the view of its degeneration is reinforced by middle-class European town dwellers’ disgust with dirty, poor, inactive and begging people. Islam, in general, is viewed as a primitive, incomplete religion; its few merits do not make up for its fanatical and brutal side, which the authors find confirmed in their (stereotypical) observations of veiled, subordinate women, and anecdotes of Muslims’ violent deeds. Its demerits are, of course, further augmented by the fact that, as the pilgrim-tourists agree, the Muslims do not treat the Holy Land and the memory of Christ with proper respect. But this critique is general; it is directed not only against Muslims, but against corruption and injustice within Christianity, as well. Here, the meritorious sides of Islam can come into use, in a general critique of an erroneous Christianity. The use of Islam, here, is meant to show how a pure Christian faith is superior to both wrongheaded Christianity, and Islam.

The most positive statements about the East, besides those that celebrate the biblical and arcadian, concern both the modernizing efforts of Europeans and the admiration expressed of the ”good” Christian Arabs resident in Palestine. It is unclear, however, to what degree racism sets limits to the full approval of these ”good” Arabs.

All this indicates a way of nuancing Edward Said’s description of Orientalist discourse: the experiences of the French, British and Americans can be complemented by the case of the Swedish pilgrim-tourists. According to Said, Orientalism is a sign of the European power over the Orient, rests on intellectual authority (especially German Orientalism), and is deeply interwoven with socio-economic and political institutions. To this I would like to add, on the basis of the Swedish pilgrim-tourists, a sub-species of Orientalism that I term The discourse of the Holy Orient.

This discourse is based, I believe, less on colonial or intellectual power
claims, than on a claim to religious authority over the Orient. The pilgrim-tourists’ discourse shows a Christian assumption of a pisto-cultural pre-emptive right to the Middle East, that is, the Holy Land. The Bible dictated the way in which the Orient was to be viewed. The discourse is, of course, also influenced by Orientalist stereotypes; but these can be (more or less) easily incorporated into the discourse of the Holy Orient. Thus, my findings do not oppose those of Ajagán-Lester, Holmberg or Fazlhashemi; but they nuance them. Like them, and like Said, I find my authors describing the Orient not as a geographic place but as a topos, a collection of references and characteristics deriving from quotes and text fragments; but I find that the Bible is a key source in arranging and defining this topos.

There is, of course, further research to be done. It remains to be seen to what degree this discourse is unique to Swedish pilgrim culture. It is probable that we have, rather, caught sight of something that is to be found in large parts of Christian Europe, in a period when trips to the Holy Orient had become more accessible due to the industrialization of means of transport, and the democratization of travel. Another question is to what degree the discourse of the Holy Orient is anchored in Swedes’ geo-political consciousness. Does the fact that the Swede is a European lend the discourse its authority; that is, is it strongly affected by the fact that Europe dominated the Middle East? Would the discourse of the Holy Orient have existed, in short, without European colonialism?

That colonial discourse did have its influence is easily established. The pilgrim-tourists are forced to negotiate two, on the surface, incompatible views: the preference for the biblical-arcadian, with its implicit critique of modernization; and admiration for the modern ideals of progress. This could be interpreted as not less than a direct conflict between the old, abstract myth of the Holy Land, and a new understanding of its physical reality. Concretely, we can see how this is expressed in the pilgrim-tourist’s experience of the biblical idyll he or she has long dreamt of, complete with detailed descriptions of how this romantic illusion is made flesh through people’s timeless clothes, objects, trades and traditions, all of which is underscored by an Orientalist picture of the unchanging, stagnant Orient. All seems to show that the Holy Land has survived intact. But then the story-teller is disturbed by the insight that a poor Arab or Muslim has no place in this white, Christian middle-class dream. The pilgrim-tourists then clothe the Arab in the most dismissive Orientalist stereotypes, so as to sentence him or her to a life of stagnation, spiritual poverty and dirty passivity.

Translated and edited by Madeleine Hurd
Bibliography

Primary Sources
Klas Pontus Arnoldson, *Jerusalems själ*, Stockholm, 1913
Maria Brusewitz, *Från de Heliga Minnenas Land*, Stockholm, 1922
Yolanda Colliander, *Ögonblicksbilder från en resa i Orienten*, Helsingfors, 1913

Secondary Sources
Luis Ajagán-Lester, “*De Andra*”. *Afrikaner i svenska pedagogiska texter (1768-1965)*, Stockholm, 2000
Karl Baedeker, *Palestine et Syrie. Routes principales à travers la Mésopotamie et la Babylone. L’île de Chypre. Manuel du voyageur*, Leipzig/Paris, 1912, 4:e edition. (The use of a French edition, despite the fact that the authors probably used an English or German one [cf. transliteration, Colliander 65, Baedeker 250], is due to the fact that Swedish libraries seem to have only purchased French Baedekers. Differences in content are probably minimal.)
Åke Holmberg, *Världen bortom Västerlandet II. Den svenska omvärldsbilden under mellankrigstiden*, Göteborg, 1994


Svenska Orientsällskapets årsbok 1925, nr I, Stockholm, 1925

Svenska Orientsällskapets årsbok 1926/27, nr IV, Stockholm, 1927


**Periodical Literature**


East meets East in Swedish Media’s Afghanistan

SANJIN KOVACEVIC

In a sense the limitations of Orientalism are, as I said earlier, the limitations that follow upon disregarding, essentializing, denuding the humanity of another culture, people, or geographical region.¹

The Soviet invasion of Afghanistan on the 27th of December, 1979, was the culmination of a process that had started in the first half of the 1970s. Seen from an international perspective, the seventies meant the renewal of the rhetoric of the Cold War (“the new Cold War”) and a setback for the diplomatic and military rapprochement that had been achieved up to then.² During the 1970s, Afghanistan went through no less than three state coups, a communist revolution and an invasion. In the larger historical picture, the war in Afghanistan contributed to the Soviet Republic’s fall and the creation of a new system of international power relations. Soviet troops, pulled out in 1989, returned to an empire in dissolution. The U.S.A. remained as the sole superpower (to use the mass media’s term).

During the 1990s, however, new global enemies appeared from the East, replacing the “red threat”. Their contours were already discernable during the 1970s and 1980s, when mass media began to describe the new threat: the Muslim.³ This article will discuss how media – specifically, the Swedish evening tabloids Aftonbladet and Expressen – communicated stereotypes of the Muslim through their portrayal of Afghanistan, and of Afghans, as primitive, timeless, and fanatic. I will compare this picture to that of the invading Russians. I believe that the whole constitutes a sort of triptych: the Western journalist stands on one side, the Muslim on the other, and the Russian in some sort of middle. The Russian is, to be sure, also “East” – different; but he is also

³ Edward W. Said, Covering Islam. How the media and the experts determine how we see the rest of the world, Vintage, 1997 p. 36: "It is not too much of an exaggeration to say that before the sudden OPEC price rises in early 1974, ‘Islam’ as such scarcely figured either in the culture or in the media. One saw and heard of Arabs and Iranians, of Pakistanis and Turks, rarely of Muslims.”
portrayed as relatively modern (and frightening precisely because he is modern, effective, yet different). There is a geographical dimension here. The further one penetrates into the East, the more timeless and primitive the “Orientals” become – until one arrives at the in-born, unchanging “Islam-person”.

**Western Stereotypes of the East**

Edward Said’s *Orientalism*, published 1978 and today considered a classic, analyzes the relationship between “West” and “East”, Occident and Orient, Christianity and Islam. Said defines Orientalism as ”a discipline representing institutionalized Western knowledge of the Orient, Orientalism thus comes to exert a three–way force, on the Orient, on the Orientalist, and on the Western ‘consumer’ of Orientalism”.4 The Orient denotes, in this conceptual system, the area that stretches from Europe through North Africa, via the Middle East, to the Far East. But geography is of lesser importance. Said sees Orientalism primarily as a form of knowledge, a collection of different genres, a discourse that was created from a position of power.

The division of the world into a Western contra an Eastern half is central to Orientalism. Islam, which was identified with the East, was long seen by Europeans as a militant enemy of European Christianity. Christians had difficulties understanding the religion on its own terms. As Said describes it:

> It did not seem to matter that Muslims considered Mohammed a prophet and not a god; what mattered to Christians was that Mohammed was a false prophet, a sower of discord, a sensualist, a hypocrite, an agent of the devil. /…/ Even when the world of Islam entered a period of decline and Europe a period of ascendancy, fear of ‘Mohammedanism’ persisted.5

To overcome the threat, the Orient must first become known – or, rather, defined; and then, optimally, invaded and occupied. This happened in the nineteenth century. The East was then recreated by Western scholars, soldiers and judges, who excavated and exposed forgotten languages, biblical “realities”, historical processes, “races” and cultures. These were then used to construct a picture of the true, classic Orient, one which would assist the administration of the (modern, corrupted, and Muslim) Orient, now a colonial object.6

This may sound abstract, but an analysis of mass media shows that these

---

4 Said, 1995, p. 67
5 Said, 1997, p. 5
concepts have had significant impact on popular culture. The belief in the fundamental enmity of Islam vis-à-vis the West is, indeed, very much alive both in popular culture and in mass media today. It is strongly associated with a negative picture of the modern Muslim or Arab, who is seen as removed both from the classic (Greek, Roman, Christian) Orient of antiquity and the rational, cleanly, manly and industrious world of the modern West. As Said describes him:

In the films and television the Arab is associated either with lechery or bloodthirsty dishonesty. He appears as an oversexed degenerate, capable, it is true, of cleverly devious intrigues, but essentially sadistic, treacherous, low. Slave trader, camel driver, moneychanger, colorful scoundrel: these are some traditional Arab roles in the cinema.7

The Orient, as geographical entity, became stamped as the Orient with a capital O – something abstract and unchanging, inhabited by people who were locked in a corrupted, Muslim past, stubbornly attached to backward-looking values and behaviors. This set of stereotypes has persisted, and is, as we shall see, evident in modern media.

Stereotypes of Russians: The Geography of the Exotic

In this article, I also look at media stereotypes of Soviet Russians. These have another nuance than those of Arabs and Muslims. The Russians are, to be sure, Eastern – but not exactly the same type of East as the Muslim Orient. Here, Jan Ekecrantz’s article “Röster om öster” (Voices on the East) provides theoretical points of departure on how the media treats different degrees of Eastern ”non-Europeaness”.8 According to Ekecrantz, Swedish media, when writing on post-Communist Russia, uses the West as its point of reference for and measure of what is normal. Swedish newspapers, argues Ekecrantz, emphasize what happens in the spaces where the West meets the Russian East, as well as differences in place and time between the West and Russian East. When the West meets the Russian East, the modern meets the ancient and unchanging. Meanwhile, the significance of differences in space is presented either by comparing how life is “there” as opposed to “here at home” in Sweden or in the “West”; or created through underlying assumptions that structure an exoticized account of how it is “over there”. The differences in time are expressed in the description of “them” as existing in a different type of time than we do: those in the Russian East exist in a sort of steady state which, when you get as far out

---

7 Said, 1995, p. 286 - 287
as the Far East, is almost pre-civilizational. The Russian East is, thus, shown as a state of being, which grows more and more pronounced the further East one goes – as is evident in journalistic descriptions of the gradual deterioration of everything (nature, roads, railways, even people). This successive distancing and deterioration will be something we shall return to, as we go through the picture of the Russian East presented in my two newspapers.⁹ But before we proceed, a short discussion of discourse and stereotypes in general, and the discourse of media stereotypes in particular, is in order.

**About Stereotypes and Discourse**

Walter Lippmann, who minted the word ”stereotype”, was among the first to analyze media’s dependence on preconceived images. According to Lippmann, stereotypes are a fundamental ingredient in the relationship between journalists, media, and readers; indeed, in how humans conceive of and order their world in general. People, argues Lippmann, have only a limited ability to know the world directly; we seldom approach the world through direct, unmediated observation. Most of what we know we have learned through communicating with others. This communication provides us with the categories we need, to classify what we see. It is our culture that provides us with the ability to classify. As Lippmann puts it,

> Few facts in consciousness seem to be merely given. Most facts in consciousness seem to be partly made. A report is the joint product of the knower and known, in which the role of the observer is always selective and usually creative. The facts we see depend on where we are placed, and the habits of our eye. /…/For the most part we do not see, and then define; we define first and then see. In the great blooming, buzzing confusion of the outer world we pick out what our culture has already defined for us, and we tend to perceive that which we have picked out in the stereotypes of our culture. /…/ we pick recognizable signs out of environment. The signs stand for ideas, and these ideas we fill out with our stock of images.¹⁰

The second impulse towards stereotypes derives from the fact that communication is necessarily limited. None of us have time to acquaint ourselves with, or communicate, all the facts of a case: to enumerate and describe each leaf of every tree, every inch of a person’s skin. Conversation as well as texts rely, rather, on a verbal short-hand, based on commonly accepted symbols and categories – “oak forest” or “pine woods”, “Mexican” or

---

⁹ Ibid.
“Swede”. Here, also, we can take help from our culture: for we have a cultural conception of a “Mexican” even if we have never met one. Both media readers and journalists, accordingly, must fall back on this short-hand of categories, or stereotypes; they take help from simplified categorizations of the world. The readers recur to their stereotypes; this is facilitated by the fact that the journalists have done the same, as a sort of shorthand, when writing the news.

In order to understand the functioning of stereotypes in media, it is also useful to use the concept of discourse (hegemonic and/or subordinate). This concept applies to how certain stereotypes are maintained, spread, reinforced or challenged within a culture. Here, we can use Stuart Hall’s description of how discursive systems function. Certain stereotypes, he argues, are part of our culture; they are accepted as representations of the real; they are, in short, part of the “dominant discourse”. Discourse, in turn, is “a way of representing the knowledge about a particular topic at a particular historical moment.”

Orientalism, thus, can be seen as a powerful discourse that has influenced the West for centuries. Like other powerful discourses, it produces knowledge; it influences how we reason about and discuss a certain issue; it influences our behavior. It also shuts off and excludes, as irrational, unreal or untrue, other possible ways of reasoning, discussing, and behaving. These alternatives are excluded from the production of knowledge, from discourse, for according to discursive theory things that are left to fall outside the hegemonic discourse lack meaning.

A discursive form can often be traced within a group of texts, institutions, and means of behaving. Orientalism, thus, is a discursive formation, which has influenced, and is confirmed by, different types of texts, behaviors, and institutions. Western media are both influenced by it, and have become one of its prime expressions.

**Stereotypes and Discourse in the Media**

In Said’s *Covering Islam*, the author gives concrete examples of how Orientalism functions as a discourse in modern mass media. The book is a chilling case study of the U.S. media’s handling of the Iranian Revolution of the 1970s, as a concrete example of sloppiness, prejudices, and sometimes purely racist attitudes shown towards the part of the world known as the Orient. Said has looked at television, newspapers and books, as well as expert presentations of Islam within “learned circles”. He takes up many examples of how different newspapers, television channels and expert panels in both Europe and the U.S. have characterized Islam, Arabs and Muslims.

Throughout, Said finds traces of Orientalism. U.S. media describes Islam as a monolithic block, while modern Muslims are portrayed, perceived and

---

11 Stuart Hall, *Representation. Cultural representation and signifying practices*, p. 75
discussed either as oil producers or potential terrorists. Generally, Said continues, the media had little to say about Iran’s internal political processes (where, in fact, there was an internal conflict between religious and secular factions). Nuances and individual characteristics were lost, and as a result, a monolithic Iran emerged as symbolic of the U.S.’s relation to the entire Muslim world. Of course, Said reminds us, the Iranian hostages were Americans, and the U.S. was the Shah Pahlevi’s closest ally. The French newspaper *Le Monde*, which Said uses as a comparative foil, showed substantially more distance and analytical acuity.

Nonetheless, a clear and general picture emerges. In this U.S. media discussion, Muslims were associated with the “underdeveloped Third World” – in the grip of static, traditional ways of life. The Third World, it should be remembered, had since the end of the Second World War been defined as unstable and prone to Communism. This meant that ”modernization” became a key concept in politics and actions vis-à-vis the Islamic Third World. Large sums were invested in these countries, in order to stop Communism, develop local trade, and change these countries into some sort of mini-Americas. As time went by, still greater investments, and even military deployment, were necessary if the U.S.-friendly governments were to survive. This reinforced the prejudicial way of looking at both the Third World and Islam. Both became anchored in political and popular imagination as in need of help and guidance, incapable of autonomous, modern-style development – an image reinforced by the media’s continuing affection for pictures of Muslims as superstitious beggars, strange priests, and terrorist leaders. As Said puts it:

> Muslims were no more than fatalistic children tyrannized by their mind-set, their ulama [priesthood] and their wild-eyed political leaders into resisting the West and progress.14

It will be interesting, with this in mind, to see to what extent the Swedish press – which is very remote from immediate involvement in the Middle East – participates in similar monolithic and simplistic thinking.

Said’s quote also ties into the stereotypes that Lippmann identifies both in the media, and in our understanding of what we read. It shows how these function in categorizing different groups of people. This ties into the research

13 Said uses the French newspaper *Le Monde* for comparative purposes, and finds that *Le Monde*’s view of the situation is based on a more careful analysis, as well as greater distance to the crisis. *Le Monde*’s correspondent spoke the language (something that very few American journalists did; few stayed in one country for very long), and had lived in the Middle East for thirty years at the time of the crisis. All of this contributed to *Le Monde*’s more nuanced picture of Iran.
that examines how media stereotypes function socially and hierarchically, in identifying “us” and “them”, the groups of people who are different as opposed to those who, like us, are normal. On the one side, the “normal” Westerner—able to determined (his) fate, adult, free-thinking, secular, progressive and rational; on the other, wild-eyed, tyrannized children. The way in which this discourse, and others like it, assumes a quiet, disembodied normalcy, on the one hand, and contrasts this with a highly embodied and colorful otherness, is also part of how stereotypes appear in the media.

This aspect of discriminatory stereotypes is discussed in Madeleine Hurd’s article “Masculine Spirit, Feminine Flesh”. In her analysis of exclusionary prejudices in pre-War Prussian media, Hurd uses several Cultural Studies theories on the media and the body. One of the most useful of these is the thesis of “embodiment”. This derives from Michael Warner’s idea that newspaper readers, brought together in an imagined, anonymous community, see themselves as a special, disembodied public. This is reinforced by the tendency of journalists to use an impersonal tone in their writing, which thereby becomes more generalizable and thereby more authoritative. Warner calls this technique the “strategy of impersonal references”. As a result, those who are in the circle of readers, the community of readers, are disincorporated. They are without body, “disembodied”.

But the ability to “lose one’s body” is not available to all. Those who stand outside the social community, which is subsumed in the community of readers—criminals, foreigners, ethnic minorities, terrorists—are portrayed as an object to be observed: most often, with bodily attributes. We who are “regular citizens” have no visible gender, ethnicity, or race; we have no visible class belonging. We are “normal”—our significants of class are naturalized, they are not discussed, they are not “visible”. Those who have visible bodies are those who are excluded from the circle of readers.

Furthermore, as David Green has pointed out, to make the body visible makes possible the localization of social and cultural differences within the body. The body identifies social and cultural differences and becomes “the totemic object, and its very visibility the evident articulation of nature and culture”. To describe the body, Hurd argues, allows speculation about the “outcasts’” bodily functions, his or her bodily habits, smells, and appetites. Visibility can also be used to sexualize those who stand “outside”. The men are often portrayed as hypermasculine, while outcast women appear either as unfeminine, or oversexualized. The trope of embodiment is one we will look out for, in our analysis of Swedish newspapers.

---

15 See Hurd, in this volume.
Håkan Hvitfelt has written on the Swedish media’s picture of Islam, in an article which appears in *Mörk magi i vita medier* (Dark Magic in White Media). His research is based on telegrams from the news bureau TT and television news from the early 1980s and 1990s. He shows that Islam was discussed during the 1980s as a matter of foreign news; domestically, the primary focus was on the building of mosques and Radio Islam. Foreign news concentrated on the war in Lebanon and the death threat to Salmon Rushdie. The investigation showed that only 14% of the news programs on Islam that appeared between 1991 and 1995 were without some form of link to violence.17 Moreover, when violence was reported, if the perpetrators were Muslim, this was pointed out, and their “Muslim-ness” emphasized.18 Islam, accordingly, appeared as a particularly violent religion. TV 4’s news programs led in the number of violent reports (which can be explained by the channel’s commercial aspects, which mean that it focuses on dramatic news). Hvitfelt also analyses the media’s language. Certain words, such as fundamentalism, Allah, jihad, the Qur’an, Islam and ”Islamisist” were recurring symbols in the news reporting. These acquire a negative sound insofar as they are often used in association with violent and dramatic news reports. Certain pictures also recur, such as minarets, the ayatollah Khomeini (looking sinister), men in prayer and women in veils.19

Hvitfelt is analyzing television, not the press. He does say, in passing, that the morning newspapers had a more nuanced picture that did the evening press and television news. The morning newspapers have more space for deep-going analyses. A typical news item in the programs Hvitfelt analyzes lasted from two to three minutes. This meant that the analysis could not be very penetrating; it had to emphasize the dramatic. Newspapers, thus, might show different patterns.

**Afghanistan Through the Eyes of Two Swedish Newspapers**

Our two newspapers, the evening tabloids *Aftonbladet* and *Expressen*, have been chosen for several reasons. Both reach out to a broad group within the Swedish population, and are in the position of being able to create and transmit broad public ideas about conditions outside Sweden’s borders. Their way of writing is direct, passionate, and colorful – something that may facilitate the creation of stereotypes and the simplification of information. The newspapers have a particular narrative style, without much pretense to objectivity. Their emotional, dramatic language sometimes reads like a film script, complete with black-white polarities.

17 Hvitfelt, p. 79
19 Hvitfelt, p. 83
I have looked at about fifty articles from these newspapers, appearing in the period between 27 December, 1979 and 19 January, 1980. The most interesting articles were written by foreign correspondents, present in Afghanistan during the invasion; but domestic political analysts also provided useful material.

The analysis of these articles falls into four categories. The first is dominated by the image of the essential Afghani, the picturesque guerilla warrior, linked to wild nature, unchanging history, and religious fanaticism. The second deals with a middling group: the Communist Oriental. The third concerns the Soviet Easterner, modern and efficient but still not as civilized as ourselves. The Soviet soldier, finally, becomes steel, an armored masculine force that penetrates the timeless, and now feminized, Afghanistan. These four categories fall within an imaginary geography, where different types of people are linked to where they are, in the space between Sweden and Afghanistan – a picture drawn, not least, through the use of bodily portrayals. In conclusion, we see an imaginary geography of bodies: the most Oriental being the furthest away, those more similar to us being closer, but all participating in stereotypical Otherness.

I. The True “Oriental”

Wild and Timeless Mountains Breed Wild and Timeless People

Geography is a key component to the analyses of both Expressen and Aftonbladet. The journalists love to describe the visual impact of Afghanistan, its physical characteristics. The alienness of the country at once emerges, in tones that sometimes approach awe. The country is enormous, with great depths, primitive and impenetrable. No attempts to modernize it, even by the ideologically-driven Soviet regime, have succeeded. The countryside maintains, instead, its deadly character.

The radio station is /…/ placed deep within Afghanistan /../ has a reach over the entire mountainous country, which is one-and-a-half times as large as Sweden. /…/ The regimes have spoken so much about the proletariat. But there is no industry here, and no new industry has come. The roads are falling into ruin and there is not, in the entire country, a single kilometer of railway.20

Many enemies have beaten themselves bloody in the Afghani mountains. The mountain chain in the North-East, with tops that approach 7,000 meters, is called Hindu Kush. This is no coincidence. It means Murderer of Hindus. Now one is beginning to speak of Ruski-Kush.21

---

20 Aftonbladet, ”Varför gör man inget för folket”, 800116
21 Expressen, ”40 000 gerillamän väntar i bergen…”, 800107
Here, nature gains anthropomorphic characters, while remaining unchangingly rooted in history: once it was Hindus, now it is Russians who are threatened. This timelessness is part of the threatening impenetrability of the country. It is a recurring theme in the reports, where the frightening invasions and bloodthirsty warriors of ancient history are repeatedly brought up as relevant to the current conflict.

It is a primitive, inaccessible land, romantic and fascinating. Its rulers have come here from the North, West and East. Djingis Khan and Timur Lenk, figures out of the horror cabinets of history, have governed from the capital city Kabul. The Arabs invaded and converted the people to Islam. The British attempted to suck the country into their giant Indian Empire. The Russia of the Tsars pressed on from the North. Both British and Russians failed in their attempts to expand their empires. The Afghan chieftains continued, without hindrance, to govern over their tribes and their areas of land.22

---

22 *Aftonbladet*, "Gerillaledarens egna bilder inifrån Afghanistan", 800103. *Expressen* takes a similar view: Trots dem massiva insatsen är uppgiften [att kväsa upproret] inte lätt, i detta bergi-
Timelessness, “aggressive” geography and primitive people are united in a picture of wild clans (a picture with which Swedes were already familiar from coverage of Africa, and which they would meet again in the reports on the war in former Yugoslavia). Note the mystification and the aggressive rhetoric inherent in the dramatic language: the cabinet of horrors; Afghansis who are attacked and converted, the British who “suck the country in”; the pressure exerted by Russia. All failed, however, and the Afghan chieftains continue to rule over their clans – as they have done since time immemorial. The eternal clan and tribe can take on still clearer contours:

Afghanistan has, for thousands of years, been built on allegiances to tribe and clan. Behind every mountain is a king, Nassry [guerilla leader] explained, when he gave me the pictures of the guerilla’s fighting in war to me.23

This lawless anarchy is scarcely conducive to modernization, one would think. What little modernization of the impenetrable Afghanistan that has occurred has, in fact, derived from more advanced countries.

Afghanistan has extremely poor communication systems. No railway and, in fact, only one asphalted road that goes straight through the country from Iran to Pakistan. The Soviet Union has built one half, and U.S.A. the other.24

And now the Russians are at war with the people and landscape of Afghanistan. As we shall see, the latter two are not easily differentiated. The invading Russians are forced to use all their might, not only against the people in the mountains but also the desert. The (primitive) rebels are mentioned in the same sentence as the unfriendly geography. The country and the people share attributes.

They [the Russians] are now deploying all their might against the primitively-equipped soldiers in the deserts and mountains in the South. /…/ The Afghan mountains are as if made for guerilla warfare – inaccessible and inhospitable and with few roads. /…/ Afghanistan is a land virtually without roads – guerilla-land. About 40,000 Afghan guerilla men wait for the Russians when they leave the plains and roads.25
Again we find a linkage between roadless mountains and Afghan rebels who are waiting, there, for the Russians. A threatening picture is formed, where everything, both land and people, are in a state of war. The plains are associated with roads and security, while the mountains are characterized by chaos and lurking danger.

This text is accompanied by a picture (Picture 1) which symbolizes this linkage between the land and the people. The photograph is additionally captioned, “A group of Afghans wait in ambush behind a stone wall.” The landscape is stony and inaccessible; the men and their dress (the clothing is given special mention) are both exotic. The population functions as one with the wild countryside.

The Pass of Salang breaks through Hindu Kush, an inaccessible mountain landscape that stretches, like a finger, out of the massive Himalayas /…/. The trip was fantastic. The pass lies at a height of 3,479 meters and is one of the highest negotiable passes in the world. /…/ In the pass the Afghan guerilla also operates, recruited out of the mountain-chain’s tribes. One day the guerilla managed to shoot down isolated Soviet soldiers. Another day they managed to mine the roadway /…/. 26

This completes our pictures of warriors and clans, historically linked to grand barbarous conquerors who, like the people they ruled, are in their turn anchored in a grandly murderous nature. There is an air of far-off romantic exoticism about the whole. The guerrilla plays hide-and-seek with the Soviet troops, the battles are of low intensity, as if a group of intrepid, romantic bandits are making life sour for a giant army – a classic dramatic situation.

Mountains, Religion, Beards and Turbans: A Good Scenario
The scene, it seems, is set; the references pre-determined. The entire is reminiscent of a film, with a film’s use of individuals to portray stereotypical characteristics. In this case, the subject is the romantic, rebellious Arab-Muslim. He is strongly embodied, which further serves to fix, for the reader, his exotic otherness. In one article, the journalist describes how “The leader of the rebels, a gray-bearded, turban-clad giant, had laid down his carbine-rifle and rolled out his prayer-mat; turned towards Mecca, he lay deep in prayer.” The text continues in movie-like terms:

When the prayer was over and this morning’s sunrise had laid its spotlight on the Khyber-pass’s snow-clad mountain-top, Sibghatullah al-

26 *Aftonbladet*, ”Ryska soldater plundrade min chaufför” 800115
Mojajadeddi turned towards me and said: It is not easy to win wars against a super-power. But we shall try.27

The scene could be taken from a film: – the prayer (which is exotic), the spotlight on snow-clad mountaintops (wild nature); against this background a turban-clad, bearded giant of a man with an exotic name turns to the observer and states, laconically, that it is not easy to fight a superpower, but that a try will be made. The journalists continues with a film-like presentation. They describe the “wounded rebels” in the provisional sick-camp, with “their hawk-profiles and turbans”, as “a scene from a romantic old war-movie.” The men are heroic, if embodied: their constant refrain, “Doctor, take off the plaster.”28

No similar description of Soviet soldiers was to be found. The Soviet soldiers were not relevant; the film is about a romantic, primitive David versus a modern, secular Goliath. In the Bible, David has God on his side. But the God aiding Sibghatullah al-Mojajadeddi is, it transpires, an odd and frightening one, the description of whom might induce readers more readily to identify with Goliath.

The People, Islam and Tradition
The first linkage was between people, time, and geography. We can also find another linkage, that between people and religion – a religion, it appears, that is, like the people, both timeless and extreme. Indeed, the Afghani are often reduced to Islam and to Muslim traditions, something which renders them unchanging and primitive. It is, above all, the influence of Islam and Islamic traditions that fire the rebels.

The reforms which Taraki and his co-workers wished to put through in Afghanistan met with strong opposition from a people who are tightly bound to Islamic religion and tradition. The Muslim rebel groups represent, in this respect, least of all any progressive or democratic tendencies.29

The revolt out in the provinces against the, during recent years, Communist-led regimes in Kabul also has reactionary aspects – for instance, opposition against the new rulers’ attempts to put through land reforms and school-programs for all the young – which is a sort of defense for the Soviet’s sending in troops.30

---

27 Aftonbladet, "Vi är beredda på ett långt krig”, 800108
28 Aftonbladet, "Vi är beredda på ett långt krig”, 800108
29 Aftonbladet, "Sovjets marionett i Kabul”, 800103
30 Aftonbladet, "Carter kallar hem sin Moskva ambassadör i protest”, 800103
Here, to be sure, the guerrilla is presented as fighting against Russian Communists and Russian Communist-supported regimes. But its revolt is, it is emphasized, directed neither against the foreign power nor Communist system *per se* (as it might be, perhaps, were the journalists describing Swedish resistance to a Russian attack). The Afghani guerilla fights the Russians because the Russians are progressive and secular – and the Afghanis are neither.

Several of the guerilla groups are solely driven by religious fanaticism. They are fighting the Russians because Communism is ungodly [ogudaktig].

It is probable that the Afghanis themselves presented much of their battle as one of religion. Religion tends to be a rallying-point against imperialist aggression (as it was, for instance, in colonized Poland). Nonetheless, the emphasis on religion as the motivating factor seems to denote participation in Orientalist stereotypes. One can easily imagine an analysis of Afghanis’ resistance that is more secular – even, perhaps, more cynical. The journalists seem to revert rather easily to the “religious fanaticism” explanation. There is an over-arching failure to find more “rational” motives for resistance – motives that would resonate with Western readers, such as, for instance, political and economic power struggles, reactions to the redirection of scarce resources, localist dislike of centralized government, a conflict between rural and urban interests, even nationalist anger against foreign invasion. These are factors that one would expect in an analysis of a Western rebellion. In Central America, for instance, Western journalists have tended to discuss the spread of revivalist Christianity in terms of opposition to dictatorship and poverty. In the case of Latinos, then, journalists downplay the revivalist opposition’s own constant references to a more Christian order. One might ask oneself why this type of “secular” analysis was not applied to the Afghanis and Afghanistan. In the case of Afghanistan, by contrast, the journalists trace the guerilla’s *entire* behavior to their attachment to “irrational” factors such as backward tradition and fanatic religion (although, in one case, the journalist notes the existence of a minority of other, equally exotic, warriors – reactionary landlords, “feudal” clan chieftains, Maoists):

The rebels are an extremely variegated collection: from reactionary rich farmers and feudal tribal chiefs to pro-Chinese, Marxist revolutionaries. But the greatest part are fanatically believing Muslims, and therefore sworn anti-Communists /…/ The reforms shook the life

---

31. *Aftonbladet*, "Det här har vi tagit från Ryssarna", 800103
in the villages in one of the most tradition-bound societies in the world, and directly contradicted Muslims customs.\footnote{Aftonbladet, "Stormaktsspelet om södra Asien", 800108}

For almost two years, a war has gone on between a reactionary, religious guerilla and the former Communist government. /…/ One of the guerilla’s accusations against the regime is that it is godless, and that its heathendom has taken expression in, among other things, the abolition of bride-purchase and dowries. /…/ Afraid of New Thought. Afghanistan’s Muslim, tradition-bound population simply wants no part of modern thought, even though it would liberate millions of families from the economic imprisonment constituted by saving money for their sons’ bride-purchase.\footnote{Aftonbladet, "Här görs brudköp", 800107}

The guerrillas are “reactionary” and “religious”, fighting against the progressive aspects of modern society. The reforms instill fear into warrior Muslims. But not only into them. “Afghanistan’s Muslim, tradition-bound population” is also frightened – a generalization applying to fifteen million people. Once again, one wonders if this simplistic, mass categorization would have been used on a Western country. Perhaps, in the latter, journalists would have paid more attention to the very complex social relations that, one would imagine, exist in all countries.

In this coverage, both guerrilla and population appear as fanatically opposed to modern society as espoused by domestic Communists and the Soviet Union. By extension, they are also threatening other upholders of that modern society: the step is not far to seeing these (fifteen million) people as a potential threat to the community of readers, as well.\footnote{Said, 1978, p. 427} See, in this context, our second picture

\begin{figure}[ht]
\centering
\includegraphics[width=\textwidth]{Afghani_guerilla_men_ready_to_depart_on_the_holy_war_-jihad_-against_the_heathen_Russian_army._-_Expressen_7_Jan._1980}
\caption{“Afghani guerilla men ready to depart on the holy war – jihad – against the heathen Russian army. /…/ ” Expressen 7 Jan. 1980}
\end{figure}
of guerillas about to embark on a violent *jihad* (the term *jihad* does not, incidentally, in itself denote “war”; violent defense of the faith is only one of several options included in the term). Their appearance is exotic, their weapons outmoded, their appearance grim; they are, again, imbued with religious fanaticism. As such, and as fundamentally different from the modern West (and fairly modern Soviets), they form a polar opposite – an irreducibly, necessarily different category – to the “normal” actors on the international scene.

This type of Muslim fanatic is factored, indeed, into the international balance of power. More rational regimes, such as the Soviet and the U.S., have to take them into account. *Aftonbladet’s* and *Expressen’s* journalists attribute the U.S.’s support for Muslim fanaticism to its anti-Communism. The U.S., it is felt, might prefer what it considers a primitive (Muslim) type of state to a Communist state, for the latter seems to have much greater destructive capacity.

The U.S. does, to be sure, not have much liking for the primitive and unpredictable Muslim regimes in Iran and Pakistan, but they are to be preferred, at least, to Soviet vassal-regimes. In the East one hoped for a Communist revolt against the medieval regime of Khomeini; in the West one feared just that.35

---

35 *Expressen, ”Hökarna tar sig ton”,* 800108
The United States, according to this text, is to choose between two social systems: the unpredictable, primitive, and medieval, or the Communist (although even a Communist Muslim regime would remain a “vassal” – as in a medieval feudal system). It would be interesting, indeed, to have the writer’s definition of “Muslim regime”. Such terms are given no explanations. They are assumed to be natural, unchanging and timeless, to these countries and their population. The authors, in short, seem – in their analyses of Pakistan and post-1979 Iran – to have simply colored in the countries and populations, to make them conform with Orientalist discourse.

The Western newspaper reader might be invited to be cynical about the motivations of the U.S.; but Muslim religious fanaticism is not to be trifled with. The successful medieval could also be threatening. Other, only superficially modernized Muslims, incorporated within more modern, Western-like countries, might be tempted to regress. This might be the logical reason for the Soviet’s invasion of Afghanistan.

Now the Muslim guerilla is threatening to take power in socialist Afghanistan and must, therefore, be stopped, not only out of concern for Afghanistan but out of concern for the Soviet Union itself. Millions of Muslims live in Soviet Central Asia – were they to be inundated with the same wave of religious revivalism, there would be a great risk of severe inner unrest.\(^\text{36}\)

The invasion is seen as an answer to a situation wherein the Soviet Union is trying to protect itself against a Muslim rebellion – which, in its turn, is (as we have seen) associated with randomness, primitiveness and medieval values.

\(^\text{36}\) Expressen, ”Hökarna tar sig ton”, 800108
(The fact that the Soviet Muslim is seen as an unstable being – always in danger of reverting to his or her ur-Muslim nature – will be discussed further, below.) Both the U.S. and the Soviet Union are acting defensively. According to this picture, no-one, really, wants Muslims, for they are always dangerous. But the U.S. has a certain use for them, so they are tolerated, for the time being, despite their primitiveness.

This is a primitiveness born of religion. In other cases, the fear that a revolt within a Soviet-occupied country might spark other rebellions within the Soviet empire might be understood in terms of struggles for self-determination, patriotism or ethnic identity (tropes recognizable and accepted in the West). But different categories apply to the “Orient”; there, people are trapped in a timeless (if romantic) religious fanaticism. Take, for example, another article, which is introduced with a picture of two Muslims praying, with their foreheads towards the ground (Picture 4). The caption states: “The heads are bowed towards Mecca in prayer – and the unease is growing among the old rulers in the Kremlin.” The accompanying article cites, as the cause of the Russians’ “brutal attack”, the fact that a “fanatic Muslim neighbor” might spark “dangerous moods” within the Soviet. The article concludes:

Against this background, there is every reason in the world for the power-holders in the Kremlin to fear the repercussions which ayatollah Khomeini’s crusade might have within the Soviet borders. A hostile, strictly Muslim Afghanistan could have unheard-of consequences for the Muslim Soviet.37

Again, it is Islam that is the enemy, and the fanatics are faithful Muslims (or, as this article also terms them, “Mohammedans”). Again, one notes a basic difference in the mode of interpretation between analyses of revolts in the East, and the West. The Polish revolt against the Soviet Union was, in many ways, anchored in and justified as the defense of Catholicism. Nonetheless, few journalists have been tempted to ascribe the entire revolt to reactionary religious fanaticism, nor speculate on the repercussions of a Catholic-colored

37 Expressen, ”Islams hot mot Moskva”, 800112
38 The contempt for (and to some extent, echoes of the ancient fear of) the Muslims is, according to Said, to be traced in the term ”Mohammedanism”, which attributes Islam to one man, and implies that this man is worshipped. See Said, 1978, p. 138. In this article, the word appears five times: “Soviet Mohammedanism”, “Mohammedanian countries”, “40 million Mohammedans”, “the Mohammedan”, etc. Expressen, ”Islams hot mot Moskva”, 800112. It is, of course, unclear to what extent Swedish scholars and journalists had, at this time, been awakened to the insult implicit in this appellation. Nonetheless, by using this term, they were participating in an Orientalist view of Islam. In the same way, a man who refers to the women in his employ as “the girls” is participating in a sexist discourse, irregardless of whether or not he himself thinks the term insulting, has ever heard anyone say that the term is insulting, or whether the women referred to have ever protested.
rebellion upon minority Catholic populations elsewhere (e.g., in Ireland or Canada). This, it seems, is reserved for Afghans, Iranians, and their ilk.

II. The Oriental in Soviet or Proto-Western Guise

The (Superficially) Modernized Oriental

The picture of the classic Oriental incorporates, among other things, exotic clothes, names, and habits, as well as pronounced masculinity. But a second type of Oriental also appears – who could, perhaps, be termed the modernized Oriental. In the texts studied here, this Oriental appears in the guise of Babrak Karmal, Afghan President in 1980, and as Anahita Ratebzad, Karmal’s Minister of Education and, we are informed, mistress. This is how Karmal is described, first by Aftonbladet, and then by Expressen:

Babrak Karmal has a face like an eagle. He looks strong and violent.39

/.../ A short, corpulent man with graying, curly hair and a shiny, gray-brown suit enters the scene. He looks like a boxer who has put his boxing-gloves on the shelf. Smiles sneeringly but insecurely.40

Karmal wears modern (if slightly shiny) clothes, but keeps several Oriental characteristics: the hawk-profile, the strong, violent appearance, and his peculiar smile. Our second “modernized” Oriental is one of the few women to appear in the newspaper coverage, Anahita Ratebzad. Her modernity should be contrasted to the equally scarce newspaper references to the non-modernized Muslim woman, who is described in terms almost as stereotypical as the Muslim male. When women demonstrated outside a Kabul jail, they enacted “hysterical scenes of sorrow”, “cried and shrieked out the name of their relatives”; when their men-folk were freed, at least one – “A seventeen-year-old girl, Mira”– ran along the alley-way kissing her father’s hand.41 (One is reminded of contemporary coverage of Palestinian women who are shrieking, crying, and threatening with their fists – behavior that likewise appears as excited, hysterical and irrational.) “Anahita” (in accordance with common journalistic practice, women are referred to by their first names) is quite different. In an article on her and Karmal, we are shown a picture of Ratebzad clad in a suit-jacket and polo sweater, and a description of her “well-lighted and ice-cold office in the Afghan Department of Education”. In the waiting-room outside, by contrast, crowds the old female Afghanistan: “full-packed of women in head-to-toe, long, pleated ‘chadris’ with nets of cloth in front of their

39 Aftonbladet, ”Ryssarna regisserade Karmals premiär”, 800112
40 Expressen, ”Den konferensen går till historien”, 800113
41 Expressen, ”Jag snubblade över två döda Afghoner”, 800112; Aftonbladet, ”Uppretade anhöriga stormade skräckfängelset”, 800112
eyes”, while “an armed Russian soldier guards the corridor”. Ratebzad appears as a professional woman and politician, trying to reform the country through spreading the knowledge of writing. The whole situation is presented as calm, controlled, as is proper in a Ministry of Education in any country – were not it for the crowding veiled women and the armed guard outside the door.

These disturbing details are accompanied by information which seems further to threaten Ratebzad’s bid for normalcy. These are connected to illicit familial and sexual relationships. The article title – “‘The Red Lady’ and the President – the Love-Pair that Rules Afghanistan” – does much to promote this impression. So does the information provided. On the one hand, “Anahita’s daughter is married to Karmal’s son”; and on the other, Karmal refused to get a divorce, despite his intimate relationship to “Anahita”. They had gone underground, in Eastern Europe; “this secret love-pair had been Moscow’s reserve solution.” This is consonant with the picture of passionate, sexualized, rather infantile (as tools of Moscow) Orientals that Said describes. Both Karmal and Ratebzad are educated and modern; nonetheless, they still have characteristics at war with the Western concept of modern government. Neither are part of the disembodied community of readers. Both are embodied, if not sexualized – Karmal with his violent appearance, and Ratebzad as his mistress.

The Other Easterners – Russians in Afghanistan and Orientals in the Soviet Union

The article cited above, introducing Karmal, gives us several additional images. One of these is of the resident Russian.

In the assembly room there was, aside from dark-haired, black-eyed Afghans – also light-hued, short-haired gentlemen with blue eyes. They wore tight suits and pink shirts with striped neck-ties. They looked like dressed-up ice-hockey players from the 1950s. They made the decisions. The Russians.

In comparison to the dark, black-haired Afghanis, the Soviet bureaucrats seem almost normal; Germanic, with a sort of European dress, and with power over the Oriental. The journalist uses the Soviets as a semi-modern foil to the romantic Afghan rebels. But this does not make the Russians into altogether

---

42 Expressen, "’Röda ladyn’ och presidenten – kärleksparet som styr Afghanistan”, 800118.
43 Expressen, "’Röda ladyn’ och presidenten – kärleksparet som styr Afghanistan”, 800118.
44 Said, 1978, p. 427, points out that in film and television the Arab is portrayed either as passionate, or as bloodthirsty and dishonest, often, indeed, sex-crazy and degenerate.
45 Aftonbladet, "Ryssarna regisserade Karmals premiär”, 800112
normal Europeans. Their suits are from the 1950s; they look like clumsily overdressed ex-athletes – almost laughable. These men, carefully described and embodied, have been given a middle status, in a bridge position between Europe and the Orient. Between “them” and “us” we find some people who are more like us; but the further one gets from Europe, the greater the differences.

This is borne out by other peoples who are between us, but not in Afghanistan: such as the Eurasian soldiers of the Soviet Union. These, according to one journalist, “were it not for their superior clothing”, could often be “mistaken for soldiers from Afghanistan’s own war-troops.” Not surprisingly, for these were peoples “from tribes with family-ties to the Afghan tribes”, Farsi-speaking, who shared “the same hawk-profile, the same shiny, dark hair.”46 Here, the Soviet Oriental (hawk-profile, black hair, exotic language) is differentiated from his family clans in Afghanistan only by his superior uniform. As indicated above, however, the essential Muslim embodied in him might easily be re-awakened to life and, casting off the modern uniform, revert to the ways of timeless Islam.

In principle, we can conclude that the further East the people, the more they are seen as Orientals – and they become increasingly strange. They also become more exotically embodied, gaining characteristics that deviate further from the disembodied community of Western readers. The ranking could be described as follows: first, the Western journalist, who is the norm. Second, the suit-clad Russian bureaucrats, who are almost like “us”, with virtually Germanic attributes; but are still different, clumsy, weapon-bearing, and with outmoded clothing. Third are Babrak Karmal and Anahita Ratebzad, two educated, urbanized, upper-class Afghans. They wear Western clothing, and are progressive. They are different, however, because of his violent appearance, and their shared, abnormal family life: they are lovers, their children are married, and Karmal has not yet divorced his wife. Fourth, perhaps, are the Soviet Eurasian soldiers. With their blood-ties to Afghan tribes, their hawk-profiles, these soldiers are, in fact, essentially Orientals in Soviet uniform. The Oriental, here, is a stronger identity than the Soviet; it breaks through and obliterates the veneer of Soviet identity. Finally, we have the full Oriental male, with turban, beard, prayer-mat, and rifle on his back; his equivalent, the Oriental female, is publicly loud and emotional, but also wears the head-to-toe veil. These people, and their appearance, habits and ideology, are associated with Muslim fanaticism, primitive traditions, irrationalism and wildness, as well as opposition to modern society. On the whole, these characteristics unfold with the geography: the appearance, and hence the nature, of these peoples, is strongly linked to where the people are in the space between Sweden, and Afghanistan.

46 Aftonbladet, ”Så tänker en rysk soldat”, 800117
III. The Perverted Modern: The Soviet War-Machine

The Invasion of Afghanistan

The bulk of the Soviet troops are described in quite another way, however – if they are described at all. The most striking picture of the Russian is not the portrayal of individual soldiers, but the picture of a well-oiled war machine, where troops move massively and together with the most modern of weapons. If the picturesque and romantic Afghan guerilla fighter is associated with the wild and murderous Afghan geography and climate, the Soviet soldier has entered into an impersonal symbiosis with destructive technology and steel.

In describing the Soviet troops, one meets with none of the individuals, strange clothing, names, personal habits or quotes provided for the rebels. The emphasis, rather, is impersonal; the Soviets are described as mass numbers and in terms of heavy weaponry. The Soviets, in one article, have sent “close to 50,000 men, supported by airplanes and tanks”. In another, “The 50,000 Russians – equipped with Mig 23-jets, war-tanks and armed helicopters” control Kabul. In still another, Kabul is surrounded by at least 10,000 newly-arrived Russian soldiers. Over 300 war-tanks (type T54) build an effective siege-ring along the foot of the snow-covered mountain-chain that surrounds Kabul // Soviet troops, war-tanks, armored cars and enormous amounts of covered military vehicles continue to stream into all of Afghanistan.

Once again, the massivity of the war effort is emphasized. A siege is launched on Kabul, consisting of a ring of tanks – a steel ring along the great mountains, around the city. Movement and dynamism have arrived at this otherwise unchanging, immobile country. The reader can envision an enormous river of steel that streams into Afghanistan, and which seems to be unconquerable – much of the country is already under Soviet control. The journalist’s detailed description of the different weapons (T54, Mig 23) gives a special weight to the information presented to the reader. All of the Soviet equipment – including the uniforms – is modern, practical, and (implicitly) superior to that of the Afghans. The Russians’ uniforms, although described, are much less picturesque and individual, and more mass-technological, than those of their Afghani counterparts:

The [Soviet] soldiers’ uniforms were strikingly well-tailored and neat. // But even though the uniforms were not softly thick, they protect

---

47 Expressen, ”Sovjets våldtäkt”, 800103
48 Expressen, ”Ryska trupper tränger vidare”, 800104
49 Expressen, ”Ryska trupperna tränger vidare – hårda strider”, 800104

154
against cold better than the best-quality wool and on their heads they wore elegant fur-caps where the little mark with the hammer and sickle on red background glows like a stop-sign.\textsuperscript{50}

Here, we see further evidence of the \textit{relative} distance between the reader, the Soviets, and the Afghans. The Soviet soldiers are embodied, and their appearance is described. They have a shining red sign on their elegant fur caps, which symbolizes the Soviet Union and its massive power. Embodied, on the one hand; but modern, on the other, as are their neat, warm, technically modern uniforms. These soldiers are less Eastern than their counterparts, the Afghan rebels. These neat and warmly-clad Soviet soldiers meet Afghanistan, with its snow-clad mountains and very inhospitable climate, as well as its wool (typical for Afghanistan and the clothing of Afghans – the wool of the Karakul sheep).\textsuperscript{51} Although the Soviet soldier is not Western (his elegant fur cap, his hammer-and-sickle and hence his Communism, and what, after all, is he doing out there, encamped at the foot of the snow-clad mountains?) he is still – when compared, at least, to the Afghans – someone who reminds us of our own, modern West.

But this glimpse of an almost-like-us, yet different, soldier is atypical. On the whole, the Soviet is seen as a technological and impersonal machine. Here are no individuals, no Davids or even Goliaths; here is simply a super-power. Headlines, in themselves necessarily short and powerful, aid in this process of reduction. Those of January 3\textsuperscript{rd} and 4\textsuperscript{th} give a good portrayal of a penetrating, dangerous, impersonal power, on the one hand, and a romantic (and, perhaps, feminine and weak) Afghanistan, on the other: “Great-Russian Dreams in the Power-Play /…/ Soviet Forces Neighbor to its Knees /…/ Russian Troops Penetrate Further – Hard Fighting /…/ The Soviet Rape /…/ The Soviet Puppet in Kabul”.\textsuperscript{52} One could see the Soviet Union as the active, masculine actor here – with a rapist’s wet dream, which involves forcing the victim to her knees, penetrating her, and finally turning her into a doll or puppet. The contrast is clear: On the one side, the (brutal-masculine), modern-technology, impersonal and Communist superpower; on the other, the (romantic-masculine / feminine) timeless, snow-covered, mountainous Afghanistan and its equally unchanging, religiously fanatic, picturesque and individualistic tribal chiefs.

The Soviets’ role, at least, is graphically represented in \textit{Picture 5}, taken from \textit{Expressen} of January 1980. On the map of Asia we see troop movements, from the Soviet Union to Afghanistan. We see pictures of invading airplanes, tanks, tanks, tanks.
and military ships. That which dominates the picture, and which symbolizes the brutally superior Soviet war forces, is the clenched, armored fist. It bears a five-pointed star, and is directed, forcefully, against Afghanistan. Steel and man have again become one.

This impersonal, modern, steel-clad force is thus to conquer the timeless, embodied and exotic. Modern technology meets nature on the road, and modern technology takes the lead. As another journalist describes it:

There was snow in the air. The asphalt sparked, when the Russians’ T-62 war-tanks quickly and loudly hurried forward. The war-tanks passed carts, drawn by decorated horses and with men in fezzes and Persian-wool fur and with veiled women as passengers. The war-tanks met the camel caravans. The camels ignored the strange motor-driven things.53

---

53 Aftonbladet, ”Ryska soldater plundrade min chaufför”, 800115
The fez, the veil and the camels function, surely, as timeless symbols of Islam and the Orient, quickly passed by the T-62 tanks – “strange things” to be ignored. The Soviet modern-technological world is penetrating the Orient and its wild, snowy mountains – both, as portrayed by the Swedish journalists, odd and alien phenomena. A caricature (see Picture 6) summarizes the conflict and the situation in Afghanistan. It shows the impersonal hammer and sickle which has squashed Afghanistan, symbolized as a small human figure – a medieval person from 1001 Arabian Nights. Note the figure’s detailed portrayal in the otherwise simple picture: the turban, the long nose, the pointed slippers, the beard – even the sickle-shaped sword. This picture encapsulates three of the themes explored in this article. The perspective of timelessness and borderlines (the modern which destroys the ancient when it meets it); the Orientalist stereotypes; and the emphasis on the body of those who stand outside the community of the normal, are all present. This picture concludes our investigation.


Conclusion
Exotic landscapes and exotic peoples are at the center of the newspapers’ coverage. The investigation has discussed how humans are linked to geography, religion, and high-technical weapons; as well as to their specific appearances. It has also shown significant differences in different types of “Easterners”. While Muslims seem to resemble Rudolf Valentino’s sheik of the 1920s, the Soviet troops’ linkage with highly developed weaponry seems to echo the spirit of Terminator.54

The Soviet troops or “Russians” appear as a well-oiled, modern, disciplined war-machine that penetrates and destroys little Afghanistan. The Russians are placed between the disembodied community of readers, and the exotic Oriental

54 If any reader does not recognize this comparison, here the background: the term “Terminator” comes from a popular science-fiction film trilogy, where the old action hero Arnold Schwarzenegger acts (brilliantly, I might add) the part of a high-technology robot with steel skeleton and a computer instead of a brain, hidden under a “normal” human body.
– the Afghan. Nonetheless, the Russian troops appear as a modern army, in comparison with Afghans, who are more reminiscent of romantic road-bandits or individual Muslim warriors than of an organized guerrilla movement. The journalists seem to associate the Soviet troops with modern society and development, not least when it comes to their weapons, which are described, named, and enumerated with great interest. The modern weaponry meets, in Afghanistan, the outmoded rifles to which the rebels are so attached; the tanks drive past the camels and Mig-airplanes circle above the high, cold mountains. A meeting between (semi-) West and East, between modernity and timelessness, between well-tailored uniforms and woolen blankets.

This meeting, which is emphasized and symbolized, is done through presenting stereotypes of both the Russian and Afghan, Afghanistan as country and geographic entity, and Islam as religion. In this meeting, the romantically masculine Afghanis meet their superior in the steel-clad Russian, who dreams of empires and then rapes the small country. Both belong to the embodied world that betokens those who stand outside “our” community. If the Afghan is portrayed as a timeless, romantic representative of Bedouins and road-bandits, the Russian is seen as the modern, Communist soldier who is still more dangerous (because of his superior weaponry). The Russians play an active, manly role in the invasion, reducing Afghanistan, for the moment, to the passive, womanly role. The Afghan male must give up this uneven battle; he is too romantic and historical to combat the modern, technological Soviet soldiers. The country’s turban-clad fanatics seem to be doomed to exile in their snow-clad mountains.

I have characterized the rhetoric around this meeting as showing a confrontation between Terminator and Valentino. Both seem, repeatedly, to appear as symbolic opposites: modernized contra outmoded, developed contra primitive, atheistic contra religious, manly contra romantic. The romantic manliness of the Afghan male seems to be overshadowed by the impersonal brutality of the Russian male, who is aided by modern development and its highly technical weaponry. This is the Orient as it appears in Swedish press in 1980: the eternal Orient, while Soviet symbolizes the (almost) modern. The Russians appear as a bridge between us and the Orient, a middle-stage on the way to the timeless and exotic. In another way, however, the Oriental is the strongest. His identity is the least destructible; it resists all attempts to modernize, cultivate, incorporate. The Eurasians in the Soviet force are portrayed as Orientals. Their Soviet identity, symbolized by the uniform, is too weak, in the eyes of the writer, for them to be portrayed like other Soviets, or like Europeans. So even the Russian is Orientalized as long as he comes from Asia.

It can be said that we see a certain overlap of theories (Said and Ekecrantz) in this investigation. For instance, we find Orientalism where it should not, traditionally, be – in the portrayal of a European (Russian) power. The vision
of graduated changes that is applied to the population of Afghanistan resembles Ekecrantz’s description of the gradual deterioration, with distance, of the post-Communist infrastructure – both roads and morals seem to deteriorate, the further East one gets. This gradual change in everything, the further East it all is, is one of the most striking things to appear in the articles considered.

Space is, further, linked to embodiment. The further East we get, the more the changes in people’s bodily appearance are emphasized. We find a ranking, a hierarchy of people. On the top is the writer (and, implicitly, the reader), who represent the norm. This is made clear by the fact that neither the writer’s habits, appearance nor speech are discussed. The writer is a part of society, of the community of readers who use Aftonbladet and Expressen. Just beyond the writer are the secular and reformist “Russians” in their 1950s suits, who had control of modern and brutal technology. Their appearance is Western, but with the difference of outmoded or exotic clothes and emblems. And so we progress, until we meet the Afghan rebel, at the other end of the spectrum. These are not only continuously embodied. They are also essentialized as timeless fanatics. The Afghan rebels are, according to these articles, people who are ruled by their ancient traditions and religion – Islam is the driving motor in their battle. They do not appear as an organized movement of opposition, fighting for their country, but as an exotic gang of religious fanatics and reactionaries who are leading a bloody war against a regime they perceive as “godless”. It seems they have no higher goal than to maintain the traditional status quo in their country.

These Muslims are frightening in their exotic fanaticism. One can discern the idea of Islam as a threat. Afghanistan is not alone, in Western newspapers, in taking on the role of a dangerously ultra-conservative country. This can be seen in the description of Islam and of the Soviet Muslims; the former is seen as a medieval regime, the latter as a latent threat within the borders of the Soviet Union. This investigation lends further credence to Said’s argument about the existence of a continuous media discourse about Islam, with its fear of violent jihad and of a Muslim battle for world dominance. The Muslims’ problems with modernization, and their international dangerousness, seems, according to the descriptions given in the newspapers, to have as their essential source, an unopposed and fanatic loyalty towards Islam.

The problematic part of this portrayal is that it is trapped in vast generalizations – ticked out with exoticizing details – which make it impossible to see these people as normal, rational, like us. The individual problems, the political and social conditions, are ignored when the Muslims and their countries are described, analyzed and explained. Said poses the obvious question of whether the concept of Islam is really adequate for understanding such different countries as Morocco, Saudi-Arabia, Syria and Indonesia.55 If we

55 Said, 1997, p. lx
use Islam as our main explanation, Said points out, then Islam is also the primary motivation behind such different things as militarism, capitalism, fatalism and socialism, among other things. The conclusion one reaches is that Islam, when used as the great explanation for what is happening in Afghanistan, or any other country where Islam exists as a religion, is an expression of the West’s Orientalist tradition – one which ignores important local factors and falls back on a reduction of culture, people, regions and countries to the Orient.

*Translated and edited by Madeleine Hurd*
The Russian Intelligentsia in Focus

KERSTIN OLOFSSON

"I miss censorship..."
Yevgeny Yevtushenko 1991¹

"The intelligentsia entered into an alliance
with political egoists and ended,
as usual, as losers..."
Liberal literary critic 1993 (Natalya Ivanova)²

"The people felt, with justice, that Gorbachev
had a weakness – his sympathy for and trust
in the intelligentsia. But I am still proud of
this kind of weakness."
Mikhail Gorbachev 1997³

"The ‘radiation’ of the market has showed
itself more penetrating and murderous for the
intelligentsia than totalitarianism."
Sociologist 1999 (Nikita Pokrovsky, Moscow University)⁴

Russia in the 1990s was characterized by the struggle with the difficulties of renewal after the fall of the Soviet system in 1991. The intelligentsia came into focus in the cultural debate. This article provides a review of the stances and themes of this debate, and provides historical parallels. It ends with a close reading of Vladimir Makanin’s novella Escape Hatch, written 1991. In this novella, the intelligentsia takes a central place in the depiction of the problem of transformation.

The Debate in the Media

The Background: Perestroika
During perestroika (1985–91) a “civil war in literature” played itself out, among other things, in the so-called thick journals, which are an important Russian institution.

¹ Ogonyok 5/91, p. 24
² Znamya 11/93, p. 183
³ Dosye na tsenzuru 2/97, p. 12
⁴ Na pereputye (Moscow 1999), p. 49
There were three main camps – Westernizing liberalism, democratically inclined Slavophilism, and traditionalistic "national-patriotism", a stance hostile both to the West and to perestroika. The national-patriotic camp would eventually become what was, for a time, termed the red-brown coalition – communist and non-communist nationalists in cooperation. The primary opposition in the great debate was between Westernizing liberalism, and national-patriotism.

In a situation of increased pluralism in opinion, but without freedom of organization, the thick journals functioned as a sort of party organization before the parties. The journals’ role is an expression of what is considered the traditional role of the Russian intelligentsia, that is, to function as replacements for a more extensive civil society. Towards the end of perestroika, however, the importance of the thick journals decreased, and their circulation sank – their circulation had been enormous, especially in the case of the pro-perestroika journals.

A few years after the end of the literary “civil war”, which coincided with the end of the Soviet system, a liberal debater asked herself who had emerged victorious. She maintained that victory had gone to a completely unexpected third party, namely popular culture. This is one possible way of describing the result of the polemic. Another way to describe the result is to talk about a loss of influence for the liberals, who were at the height of their influence 1990–1991. You could, instead, award the palm of victory to the national-patriotic movement. According to debate participants this movement was in fact born within some of the thick journals.

Gennady Zyuganov, the leader of the Communist Party, figured among the national-patriots as one of the twelve signatories of the “Appeal to the People” that presaged the attempted coup of August 1991, which was meant to save the Soviet Union and the Soviet system. During 1992, the year that economic shock therapy was instituted, he continued his work for ideological rapprochement between communist and non-communist nationalists. He acknowledged the Orthodox Church as fundamental to Russia, and presented socialist ideals as deriving from the Bible and from the Russian village commune. In doing so, he distanced himself greatly from the atheism and anti-peasant stance of his mother party, the Soviet Communist Party. Meanwhile, a non-communist nationalist who had once described the Bolshevik Revolution of 1917 as the result of an anti-Russian conspiracy between Jews and Masons wrote in the December 1991 issue in the communist publication Pravda that socialism was the world’s luminous goal.

---

5 N. Ivanova, Znamya 9/93, p. 198
6 V. Sorgin, Politicheskaya istoriya sovremennoy Rossii (Moscow 1994), pp. 138, 139
In the subsequent years, there appeared a number of organizations that united right- and left-wing opposition. The People’s Patriotic Front, founded 1996, expressed the basis of the alliance as follows:

We do not divide ourselves up in red and white, rich and poor, believers and non-believers. We are Russian supporters of a strong state /…/ united in our love to our beautiful Russia, through concern for its welfare and its indivisibility, in unbearable sorrow over its fate.7

This important alliance began to form as soon as it was politically feasible during perestroika. There was much speculation on the fusion within the cultural debate. Many debaters, trying to explain the alliance, pointed to the fact that the intellectual traditions that underlay Russian communism and Tsarist-era Russian nationalism shared common characteristics, despite their historic opposition. Both traditions emphasize the primary importance of maintaining the empire. Both believe, albeit for different reasons, that destruction comes from the Western world. Both oppose pluralism, and support authoritarian rule and control of the mass media. Finally, both emphasize the special nature of Russia and Russia’s special developmental path, in ideological and nationalist terms respectively. The national-patriotic movement had its predecessor in so-called National-Bolshevism.

The cultural debate also mirrored another fundamental occurrence: the cultural ”paradigm shift” towards the end of perestroika. A new, more pluralistic public sphere had emerged, censorship was abolished and a multi-party system introduced. Literature and literary criticism were no longer special channels of information, bearing forbidden truths. The laws on how one should read and write during totalitarianism – that is, between the lines – no longer obtained. To read, acquire, discuss, and write about a divergent work was no longer a collective act of civil disobedience. Commercialism appears as a new unfreedom. The cultural intelligentsia and the thick journals had lost their role as leading opinion makers. They had been replaced by television, commercial culture, a political life with ”image makers” in prominent roles, media oligarchs.

The pro-perestroika writings showed a faith in the transforming power of the word, as pronounced truth. This belief in the word is generally considered to have survived within Russian culture. Within both the Tsarist Russian and the Soviet regime’s public sphere, both regime representatives and critics attached great importance to the word; hence a censorship of varying stringency and a struggle against censorship through different methods. This faith and the expectations that were attached to it during perestroika had been nourished by,

7 S. Kislitsyn, V. Krikunov, V. Kuraev, Gennady Zyuganov (1999), p. 255
among other things, the field of tension between the censorship laws and the struggle to outwit the censor. It had been given classic expression in Alexander Solzhenitsyn’s Nobel Prize speech in 1970: “A word of truth can move the entire world.”

The new Russian government, unlike the Soviet state, no longer depends on the power of authors and the cultural intelligentsia. The dependence of the old Soviet state on authors had its last, somewhat curious expression when, on the second (and penultimate) day of the August 1991 coup, the coup leaders sent a representative to the Secretariat of the Authors’ Association.

The paradigm shift is expressed when, in 1996, a liberal writer paints the cultural situation of 1986, that is, of a decade ago, as if it were a matter of another world. Another writes, in 1997, that something happened “an eternity ago” – that is, six or seven years ago – for “today we live in another land.”

The liberal debaters, who have fought for perestroika, repeatedly work through their disappointment. Formulations such as “we believed that if only the censorship were abolished and truth appeared all would be well, but...” are common.

There have been many attempts to explain why the liberal expectations of what would happen once censorship was abolished have been disappointed. Here is one of these attempts, from the journal Novyi mir, in 1995:

Censorship is abolished. The truth has stopped being dangerous, and flows forth. For a time there was a hope that this truth would purify and transform us, but this did not happen. Information about the horrors of the past did not diminish the horrors of the present /.../ We did not succeed in assimilating the truth about the past, and the unassimilated truth threatens to drown us. There appears enthusiasm, ecstasy over the disintegration, spiritual capitulation to chaos or still worse – a flight to new myths, a hunt for the guilty, an attempt to transfer the responsibility to other shoulders.

In the following, we will look at the question of how the debate of the 1990s mirrors what is seen as a basic problem in Russian political and social life: the historic significance of the intelligentsia. The problems experienced by Russia’s liberal intelligentsia during perestroika have historical precedents; as

9 N. Ivanova, Znamya 9/96, pp. 201-210
10 S. Chuprinin, Znamya 1/97, pp. 206, 207
11 For example S. Chuprinin, Znamya 5/92, p. 215
12 G. Pomerants, Novyi mir 8/95, p. 138
has their agonized and public self-examination. These historical antecedents illuminate the contours of the debate of the 1990s.

**History Reappearing**

Vissarion Belinsky was a literary critic and proponent of the 1840s "Natural School", which heralded the great Russian novels. He is considered the "father" of the (left-wing radical) Russian intelligentsia. He started his career by complaining that there existed no Russian literature. He then, during his short life, managed to write thirteen thick volumes of articles on this non-existent phenomenon. Similarly, during the 1990s and to this day, innumerable Russian books and articles have been written, just as scores of conferences have been arranged, discussing the intelligentsia – which has been declared dead by many. The supposedly dead intelligentsia was one of the central themes in the cultural debate, especially in the period before the mid-1990s.

This, as was also brought out in the great debate of the 1990s, is another recurring phenomenon in Russian cultural history: in times of change one discusses the intelligentsia, its contributions and above all its failings. The foremost reason for this is, presumably, the need to find a bearer of renewal within a society which had been censored and steered from above, and thus unable to bring forth independent forces.

This phenomenon is so striking that the liberal Russian literary critic and "historian of the intelligentsia" Dmitry Ovsianiko-Kulikovsky wrote, in 1908, that in other countries there were discussions on science, politics and art – in Russia there were only discussions on the nature of the intelligentsia.¹³ Note the term “historian of the intelligentsia”. In today’s Russian cultural and especially academic life, there exist *intelligentovedy* and *intelligentovedenie* – that is, intelligentsia scholars and intelligentsia studies.

The following is a summary of the beginning of one article: This revolution has not given that which was expected from it, the Russian society is exhausted from its earlier stresses and from all its failures and is currently in a condition of apathy, depression and spiritual disintegration; the Russian state has not been renewed and strengthened despite the fact that this was so necessary, Russian literature is drowning in a dirty stream of pornography and sensationalism; there is every reason to fear for Russia’s future.

This could have been an article from the 1990s, but is, in fact, the beginning of an article by the philosopher of religion, Sergei Bulgakov, published in 1909 in *Landmarks (Vekhi)*, with the subtitle “A Collection of Essays on the Russian Intelligentsia.”¹⁴ This is probably the most debated work of Russian twentieth-century culture. It appeared after the first, failed Russian revolution of

---

¹⁴ *Landmarks* (N Y 1977), 23ff.
1905–1907. This is one of the times when the intelligentsia was discussed in a manner similar to that of the 1990s. In many of the articles that appeared in the 1990s, discussing *Landmarks*, it is also emphasized that the type of reference points mentioned in the article are held in common.

The authors of *Landmarks* mostly defined the intelligentsia as consisting only of radical opponents to the autocratic state. The seven articles oppose positivism and materialism to the new idealism and philosophy of religion, and they want the intelligentsia to take a new road (given, of course, certain differences of opinion among the authors). The “landmarks” they establish for the intelligentsia are: investment in one’s inner self rather than in changing outer circumstances; morality rather than politics; repentance and humility rather than arrogance; religion (orthodoxy) instead of atheism; admitting the mystique of the state, instead of disassociating from, rejecting and struggling against it; and patriotism instead of ”cosmopolitanism”. They see the 1905 revolution as the work of the intelligentsia, and blame the intelligentsia for its failed and destructive elements. The meeting, in revolution, between the ideas of the intelligentsia and the people’s instincts had generated an ”enormous destructive energy.”

The book came out in several editions, and the debate after its publication was extremely extensive. It met opposition from liberals and socialists of various kinds, while its supporters came almost exclusively from certain deeply conservative supporters of the autocracy. This demonstrates the difficulties inherent in the “liberal conservatism” that *Landmarks* represents. Lenin was one of the most hostile critics. And during the Soviet Era the book was part of the condemned and forbidden heritage.

During the avalanche of publications of formerly forbidden works during perestroika, the turn also came to *Landmarks*. The introduction to one of the book’s new editions, in 1991, discusses the book’s relevance to current times. As in 1909, so also in 1991 there is a general feeling among the intelligentsia that the country has a historical need of renewal. The beginning of the century is seen as having been conscious of many aspects of such a radical renewal, which still are not realized. As long as the fundamental problems of renewal have not been solved, they will be the object of heated discussions. Therefore, the introduction continues, it is no coincidence that a number of publishing houses have reissued the book, and in very great numbers besides.

The 1991 introduction also expresses sympathy for the book’s authors, five of whom were expelled in 1922 on the so-called philosophical steamboat. It emphasizes the great harm that was caused to Russian culture through the persecution of dissidents and the importance of gaining knowledge of the interrupted intellectual traditions. Culturally, this retying of links to the period

---

15 Ibid., pp. 24, 26, 27, 41, 42, 51, 54, 72, 73, 141, 142 (and so on)
16 *Vekhi. Intelligentsiya v Rossii* (Moscow 1991), pp. 19, 21
between 1905 and 1917 had already happened to a great extent during perestroika. On the political plane one can refer to a detail such as the fact that Russia’s new parliament was, as of December 1993, termed the fifth State Duma – the first four being the (pseudo) parliaments of the years between 1906 and 1917.

The Problem of Renewal

In the cultural debate of the 1990s Landmarks had a very important role. Just as in the century’s beginning, so do many believe today that the situation is so threatening that it puts Russia’s future into question. In this dangerous situation there is, to cite Landmarks, “no subject more compelling than the nature of the Russian intelligentsia.” Then, as now, the intelligentsia is put at the centre of Russian modernization. In his 1909 article, Sergei Bulgakov gives a more poetical expression of what today is termed the problem of the uncompleted modernization. The soul of the intelligentsia, he writes in an oft-quoted expression, is the creation of Peter the Great:

Be it bad or good, the fate of Peter’s Russia is in the intelligentsia’s hands regardless of how hunted and persecuted it is /…/ The intelligentsia is that window on Europe that Peter cut out and through which we breathe in Western air, at once both life-giving and poisonous /…/ Russia cannot do without this enlightenment /…/ [T]here is no more agonizing and alarming concern than whether the Russian intelligentsia will rise to its task, whether Russia will acquire an educated class with a Russian soul /…/ For otherwise the intelligentsia, in conjunction with Tartar barbarism which is still so prevalent in our state and social systems, will ruin Russia.

A common feeling – with its modern antecedents among, amongst others, Alexander Solzhenitsyn in the samizdat of the 1970s – is that Landmarks is an “unheard prophecy”; and the ”price” or “result” of the intelligentsia’s unwillingness to change itself according to its precepts was Russia’s “catastrophe” with the Bolshevik revolution of 1917, the millions of victims of the “regime’s war on the people” and other damages to society. This judgement is an expression of the ”absolutist” view of the importance of the intelligentsia, which is typical if not universal. Continuity exists, thus, in the valorisation of the intelligentsia as responsible for Russia’s fate. There is also continuity in the discussion of the intelligentsia’s

---

17 Landmarks, p. 25
18 Ibid., p. 25
19 A. Solzhenitsyn, From Under the Rubble (London 1975), pp. 229, 236; M. Litvak, Intelligentsiya i mitotvorchestvo (St. Petersburg 2000), p. 6
function in society. The triad ”intelligentsia” – ”people” – ”power” is a concept
that has survived into modern times, with the intelligentsia in the role as the
people’s ”educators”, the mediators between the people and the power. Even
today one can find instances of the intelligentsia being termed the
”representatives” of the people – self-appointed representatives, it seems.20

The question of the importance of the intelligentsia in society is one of the
matters in the cultural debate. The traditional pattern, described above, is
defended and questioned. A liberal ”critic of the intelligentsia” writes, for
example, sarcastically that the people is suffering want, but that for the first
time the people seems to wish to suffer want independently, without
mediators.21 Complaints about the degeneration of culture, immorality, stupid
television series, Western and indigenous popular culture are common in the
cultural debate. Many of these articles throw an indirect light backwards, on the
Soviet system, as the promised land of true cultural values.22 On the other hand
the sociologists Lev Gudkov and Boris Dubin maintain in the book The
Intelligentsia (1995) that the intelligentsia makes ”imperialist” claims to decide
what is ”the only right culture”. Gudkov and Dubin explain that today’s
popular culture has a function: it socializes people into the values of the new
social system, something which traditional high culture cannot do.23

Many see the intelligentsia as decisive for the fall of Communism – looking,
in this case, at the dissident movement, as well as certain half-official cultural
expressions during the Brezhnev epoch. They also include the publication of
once-forbidden texts by pro-perestroika cultural journals and other media, and
their work to expand the frame for the permissible during the end of the 1980s.
These phenomena contributed to undermine the legitimacy of the Soviet power.
It is more unusual to hear anyone object that the system fell of its own weight,
its own inner weakness.24

A Novyi mir author criticized Landmarks for reducing the question of
freedom in Russia to a question of the consciousness of the intelligentsia.25
Another author presented similar criticism. Did the intelligentsia really have
such a monopolistic role in the 1905 revolution? Doesn’t the intelligentsia,
personified in the authors of Landmarks, give itself a little greater importance
than it in fact really has?26 This is a question one could put to many
intelligentsia debaters of the 1990s, as well.

20 Yu. Shreider, Novyi mir 5/93, p. 194
21 A. Ageev, Znamya 2/94, p. 168
22 Fenomen rossiyskoy inelligentsii (St. Petersburg 2000), p. 151, 153. Comments on this: A.
Ageev, Znamya 3/00, p. 198
23 L. Gudkov, B. Dubin, Intelligentsiya (Moscow 1995), pp. 6, 102, 132, 149, 150, 182, 188
24 Ibid., p. 90; D. Shturman, Novyi mir 2/95, p. 161
25 M. Kolerov, Novyi mir 8/94, p. 161
26 D. Shturman, Novyi mir 4/94, p. 174
Great numbers of texts published during the 1990s express the explicit or implicit expectation, that the intelligentsia would be the bearer of renewal, the power that leads the country out of its crisis. In the paradoxically depressed 1990s, the great weight given the intelligentsia took on grandiose expressions. This was especially evident in the abuse heaped on the intelligentsia, which became the great “genre” on the subject. All political shades united in this abuse. The mode was typically accusatory rather than self-critical. Russians often give, in self-irony, the two great questions of Russian history as “who is to blame?” and “what should be done?”

The questions above express difficulties with renewal and transformation. Historically, periods of enthusiasm are followed by periods of disappointment, when many feel the need to find a guilty party. This is the background to the remarkable “genre” where authors who “logically” themselves could be counted as part of the intelligentsia turn against it, as outsiders, with bitter accusations.

This “genre” is supported by the value-laden definition of the intelligentsia. According to their varying sympathies, authors include those they dislike in an intelligentsia which is negatively described, or those they like in an intelligentsia which is given positive characteristics. This includes the author him- or herself who can be either self-critical, or level accusations as if he or she stood outside the group. This feature characterized Landmarks, as well. The book is a bill of indictment against the intelligentsia by authors whom it would be natural to see as its members themselves. (The element of self-criticism is much weaker.)

The concept “intelligentsia” can cover a number of different entities – the entire educated layer, the critics of the regime, producers of culture, those who do not lie, the milkmaid or the peasant (but not the professor), depending on different ways of describing its ideal characteristics. Bolshevik leaders can be described both as typical members of the intelligentsia and as “renegades from the intelligentsia”. And most authors change back and forth freely and without warning between different definitions of the word. This means, as has also been pointed out in the Russian debate, that the intelligentsia can be blamed for anything at all.

Take, as an example of the fact that this “genre” of abuse also has its historical antecedents, an excerpt from the great debate that followed the publication of Landmarks in 1909: a debater declares himself solidaristic with Anton Chekhov, whose letter of 1899 is quoted: “I do not believe in our

---

27 A. Bystritsky, Novyi mir 3/93, p. 180; D. Shturman, Novyi mir 4/94, p. 153; in Literaturnaya gazeta 24/99 there is a roundtable, “The intelligentsia and those in power,” p. 3, where different contributions include different groups and persons in the intelligentsia or exclude them from it—journalists and politicians, not journalists and politicians, Gaydar, not Gaydar, and so on.
intelligentsia, hypocritical, false, hysterical, badly brought up and lazy, I do not believe in it even when it suffers and complains, because its oppressors come from within its own ranks.”

**Unitarianism**

Among the many who protested against *Landmarks* was Pavel Milyukov, the leader for the liberal party Constitutional Democrats. He explains, in an article published in 1910, that the intelligentsia is not uniform and that what the authors of *Landmarks* have done is to condemn one stream of the intelligentsia from the viewpoint of another. Instead of “intelligentsia”, the *Landmarks* authors should have written ”anarchy” or ”Russian socialism”. It was unjust to attribute enmity to the state and religion, to the intelligentsia as a whole. During the 1990s, the liberal journal *Znamya* and even the “liberal conservative” *Novyi mir* have advanced similar critique of *Landmarks*.

Nonetheless, the description of the intelligentsia as a unit is very common. There seems to be a reluctance, even on a linguistic level, to give expression to the idea that there might be different streams within the intelligentsia. Debaters of the most differing shades describe, rather, the intelligentsia in terms of unity, even when the meaning is that it contains differences – the ”liberal intelligentsia”, the ”totalitarian intelligentsia”, and so on. The liberal authors who do try to talk about different currents have a tendency nonetheless to at some point fall back into thinking of the intelligentsia as a unit. The value-laden moral definitions of the intelligentsia lead to arguments about ”the true intelligentsia”, and that one should “count some people out of the intelligentsia”. This last occurs in Alexander Solzhenitsyn’s well-known *samizdat* article, written in 1974 as a follow-up to *Landmarks* – ”The Smatterers.”

When Solzhenitsyn said that it was about time to exclude the one or the other from the intelligentsia, he was considering their moral behaviour. This consideration had its serious background in the battle for freedom against an oppressive regime. The risks of the battle against oppression, contrasted to adaptability and service to the former regime, are naturally important external reasons for the high emotional content of the debate about the intelligentsia. But there is also an inner cause: a lack of, or a conscious rejection of, pluralism. This appears when, for instance, Solzhenitsyn in an article of 1982 uses his term of abuse ”the smatterers” as the equivalent of the expression ”our pluralists”.

---

28 Vekhi. Pro et contra (St. Petersburg 1998), pp. 315, 316
29 Vekhi. Intelligentsiya v Rossii, pp. 299, 304, 329, 332
30 N. Ivanova, Znamya 11/93, p. 179; A. Kiva, Novyi mir 8/93, p. 160
31 A. Solzhenitsyn, From Under the Rubble, p. 251
32 A. Solzhenitsyn, Publitsistika v trekh tomakh, tom. I, pp. 431, 441, 442
Much of the debate is thus characterized by, on the one hand, the tendency to think in whole units, and, on the other hand, by an emotional coloration of concepts. Both of these factors collaborate to create a discourse which is opposed to pluralism, although the discourse is pluralistic insofar as different sides are allowed to express their views. The emotional coloration judges groups and persons either as good or bad. It is not seen as legitimate to have different opinions and worldviews.

The demand for unity has been discussed and criticized by various authors during the 1990s. One author writes that there is a tendency to declare all differing opinions as traitorous. Another presents the thought of the Russian culture’s uniformity as a firmly held mythic pattern – oppositions are erased, or differing elements are condemned as not belonging to true Russian culture. The sociologists Gudkov and Dubin write that “the intelligentsia” operates with concepts of totality, the extent of which has to do with terms of great pretensions – such as “the country”, “the people”, “the West”, and “culture”. This, according to them, is connected to the fact that the whole applies to the totalitarian consciousness. The operation of the concept “intelligentsia” is along similar lines.

There are a great number of negative and positive characterizations of the intelligentsia as a totality in the debate of the 1990s. This is connected to the constant treatment of “the intelligentsia” as an undifferentiated concept. The journal Novyi mir hosted an extensive debate on the intelligentsia. Articles on the subject were especially numerous in 1994. I will excerpt two characterizations of the intelligentsia, from two articles of that year. The first: ”The Russian intelligentsia has never served anyone – it has always, as far as its understanding reached, sought to serve the true, the good and the beautiful.” And the second: ”The Russian intelligentsia’s catastrophism, its apocalypsism, its shameless hysteria and psychopathy /.../ have, to a great extent, contributed to Zhirinovsky’s success in the Duma elections.”

The nationalists likewise have joined the totalising debate on the intelligentsia. Today’s nationalists join up with Landmarks and Solzhenitsyn but turn their arguments to their own ends. According to the nationalists, the Russian intelligentsia was born in the chasm which divided the country during the process of Peter the Great’s Europeanization. The intelligentsia as the bearer of Western ideas is foreign to Russia, and wages war on its own country. Russia cannot be conquered from without, so it is necessary to import a doctrine. The intelligentsia, by this reading, is a sort of fifth column in the

33 G. Andreev, Novyi mir 2/94, p. 185
34 M. Yampolsky, Novaya volna (1994)
35 L. Gudkov, B. Dubin, Intelligentsiya, p. 86
36 G. Andreev, Novyi mir 2/94, p. 167
37 D. Shusharin, Novyi mir 7/94, p. 186
country, which is how their argument ends. This is one of the occasions when people with intellectual professions count themselves out of “the intelligentsia” and view it as a foreign, hostile power. This does not stop them from recurring to the concept in other contexts, but then in the meaning of “the true intelligentsia”, which is Russian-nationalist and which consists of altogether different persons.38

I will present an article which exemplifies the fact that even those who talk of different currents within the intelligentsia, still tend to revert to unitarian thinking in wholes. In the article “The intelligentsia in the hour of trial” (Novyi mir August 1993), Alexei Kiva begins by distancing himself from the predominant view of the pre-1917 Russian intelligentsia as uniformly opposed to the Tsarist regime. One should, rather, speak of different streams, among them for instance the Westernizing and Slavophile. Nonetheless, the article goes on to establish a number of uniform characteristics, with the reservation that they apply to “the part of the creative intelligentsia which establishes the tone.” Whereupon even this reservation quietly disappears, and the author states: “It is we who are guilty of much, we who are united by the concept of ’the intelligentsia’. This is Kiva’s answer to the question of who bears the “guilt” for Russia’s lack of “uniform national spirit”, which he sees as having caused the October 1917 revolution and the subsequent “genosuicide”. The idea of “different streams” with which the article began has been replaced by the expression “splintering of the national spirit”, something of which someone is ”guilty”.39

Conception of uniqueness
Unitarianism can be said to be one of the most enduring thought patterns of Russian history of ideas. Another such thought pattern is the idea of Russia’s uniqueness. The debate on the intelligentsia is characterized by this idea as well. In Kiva’s article, analyzed above, the idea of uniqueness is treated in the same way as the unitarian idea. Kiva begins by maintaining that there is nothing unique about Russian history, whereupon he proceeds to make the “assumption” that European history can show no analogue to the Russian intelligentsia. To back this up he cites “No common yardstick can avail you” from Feodor Tyutchev’s emblematic (and constantly quoted) 1866 poem on Russian uniqueness: “Through reason Russia can’t be known.”40 Indeed, almost everything that is written on this theme has its roots in the nineteenth century, when the “Russian idea” was constantly debated within Russian cultural circles. The formulations of the arguments often bear word-for-word similarity.

38 V. Rasputin, Moskva 2/91, A. Panarin, Na pereputye, p. 11
39 A. Kiva, Novyi mir 8/93, pp. 160-177
The *intelligentsia*, unique to Russia, is often contrasted to *intellectuals*, a phenomenon seen as typical of the West. Kiva maintains that Western intellectuals are concerned with material well-being, so that their heirs will be able to “clip coupons” and “their wives bring up their children themselves”. The intelligentsia, on the other hand, seeks rather for the meaning of life and behaves according to the principle “all or nothing”. “We are a young nation”, as Kiva puts it, and behave like a teenager. But, he continues, there are people with high ideals in the West too.\(^41\) There is a strong tradition in Russian culture that sees the West in this way, as a sort of “anti-world”. Kiva, though, writes about ideals in the West, while many see the West (the whole of it) as completely governed by material interests.

Many thus paint the West as lacking moral and idealistic qualities. The sociologist Yevgeny Pokrovsky has expressed typical views: the Western intellectuals are first and foremost adapted to the market; morality comes second; they are preoccupied with their own problems, compete for personal success, they have no idealistic motivation, and they make no sacrifices. All this, implicitly, in contrast to the Russian intelligentsia. This line of argument is tied to a critique of Western pluralism and moral relativism (which is equated with immorality), as well as a general lack of spiritual values. The special role awarded the Russian intelligentsia even takes expression in messianic ideas, which trace their origins to the nineteenth century. These survive in a series of articles that maintain that the Russian intelligentsia will help the West to achieve a spiritual state, help the whole world achieve a higher level, give the world light.\(^42\)

Another common pattern still sees the West as an anti-world, but places the positive pole there instead of in Russia. The Russian critic-in-exile Pyotr Vail says in a 1999 newspaper interview: "Russia is convinced that there is nothing like the Russian intelligentsia anywhere else.” Vail maintains, on the contrary, that the traditional contrast between the Russian intelligentsia and the Western intellectuals is false: everywhere there are people whose intellectual and spiritual interests extend beyond work and family. That is his definition of a member of the intelligentsia. There are untold numbers who devote themselves to idealistic work in the West, says Vail, so the Russian boast is groundless. But its source is clear: the members of the Western intelligentsia fight for the owl and rescue it; but in Russia they fight for the owl sitting in their kitchens, and the owl perishes in peace and calm together with the Baikal lake; to explain

\(^41\) A. Kiva, *Novyi mir* 8/93, pp. 161, 167
\(^42\) N. Pokrovsky at the VI ICCEES World Congress, Tampere 2000. N. Pokrovsky, *Na pereputye*, p. 51, 62, 63, 64; *Fenomen rossiyskoy intelligentsii*, pp. 145, 148, 151, 153; *Novyi mir* 1/93, p. 20; *Znamya* 1/00, p. 195
away these facts myths are made up about the uniqueness of the Russian intelligentsia.43

The West is also seen as the positive pole by a group of liberal-minded writers and debaters, who declare the old intelligentsia to be poorly adapted to the new times. What Russia needs is intellectuals on the Western model. The sociologists Gudkov and Dubin write, for instance, of the Western intellectuals as unique. They are bearers of the European culture’s relativistic spirit, of modernity, where the individual is the constitutive element. They show an adult attitude, by relying on their own subjective understanding. They are functional as innovators and as culture-bearers. The Russian intelligentsia is, by contrast, they declare, authoritarian, and symbiotic to the old power system. “The comfort of violence” meant, among other things, that the intelligentsia could show off its potential possibilities during the era of censorship without having to prove anything, because they could refer to external obstacles. This gave the intelligentsia a feeling of being chosen, while in fact the elite was castrated as innovators. Under the new, freer conditions, the intelligentsia has shown itself to be incompetent to fulfil the role of elite that society needs, in order to come out of the crisis.44

Portrayal in Literature

Vladimir Makanin’s Escape Hatch

The question of the modern Russian intelligentsia has also been framed in literature. Vladimir Makanin’s much-noted novella Escape Hatch (Laz) has, as its thematic heart, the problem of transformation and change. The intelligentsia, as it is depicted here, is closely tied to this problem. Central features of this story are thus connected with the media debate. The novella was published in Novyi mir in May of 1991.45 Russian critics have termed the work one which both unites and divides Soviet and post-Soviet literature, a literary turning-point.46 Makanin is seen today as one of the foremost, or even the foremost, contemporary Russian author.47

Escape Hatch was published in 1991, the last year of perestroika, a difficult year for Russia. The stores were empty of goods, decay and crime were spreading, people feared starvation, civil war, a state coup, total collapse.

43 Literaturnaya gazeta 39/99, p. 11
45 Page references and quotations refer to the English translation of the novella – Vladimir Makanin, Escape Hatch & The Long Road Ahead (Dana Point 1995)
Chaos and changed social roles, pauperisation and its opposite, sudden wealth, created eschatological moods. *Escape Hatch* describes two worlds, one subterranean, and one on the earth’s surface. In the upper world fear rules, in half-dark, empty streets threatened by violence, in a city where streetlamps, telephones, collective traffic, electricity and waterworks have virtually ceased to function, where the houses stand with dark windows as "their dead glass eyes"(59). An enormous crowd in movement within the city, "with all its unpredictability and heightened suggestibility”(61), awakens horror.

If the world on the surface is darkness and duskiness, the subterranean world is always clearly illuminated. Here there is plenty in the stores and restaurants, gleaming cars are driven, here is health care, opinion polls, poetry readings, endless discussions among the intelligentsia, social life – all that is lacking on the surface. But here is also a lack of air, people spit blood and suddenly collapse, dead, an easy death it is said. Up there the air is fresh and the grass is green.

The two worlds are isolated from each other, except for a *laz* – translatable in English as gap, hole, or hatch – a narrow passage in the earth that sometimes contracts, sometimes widens itself, "[t]he earth breathes”(22). The main character, Viktor Klyucharyov, seems to be the only person who can pass through this *laz*.

Already on the story’s concrete surface plane there appear clear signals that this is to be read symbolically and/or allegorically. There is no demand, here, for Aristotelian probability. This is typical for allegories, as is a composition in which two parallel worlds are contrasted to each other, a doubling with an unavoidably allegorical effect.

*The Masses and the Minority*

The story’s first page establishes the opposition between the masses and the intelligentsia, the masses and the minority, death and life. Klyucharyov considers how two hundred people have been trampled to death by the crowd – ”The mob [crowd] doesn’t count”(9). He himself is presented twice, within the first two pages, as belonging to the intelligentsia (9, 10). He is completely alone in the silent and empty streets in the increasing duskiness, now and later. This, together with other connections, shows that he belongs to the minority. The masses kill [the crowd kills], Klyucharyov maintains life.

Normal world order has been inverted in this story – the world on the surface is characterized by chaos and duskiness, the subterranean world by order and light, albeit artificial illumination. The image of upside-down inversion is also allegorical. It can be linked to an essay by Vladimir Makanin, entitled "Kvazi" (published in *Novyi mir* July 1993). In this essay, Makanin wrote about how the

48 In the square parenthesis [ ] are found alternative translations, by author.
levelled-off masses live in chaos and darkness, and that these masses have come to the surface during the twentieth century. In this theoretical argumentation, Makanin does not distinguish between “the masses” and “the people,” something which is otherwise common in Russian cultural tradition. In this, he is in accordance with the Spanish philosopher José Ortega y Gasset, for whom he expresses admiration in ”Kvazi.”

The ideas of Ortega y Gasset are strikingly embodied in Escape Hatch. From this point of view, the Spanish philosopher is important in this context. This embodiment of ideas is one more feature of allegory. On the surface the masses rule, while in the subterranean world the intelligentsia sits and talks and talks. In accordance with Ortega y Gasset’s description in The Revolt of the Masses, written in 1930, members of the qualified minority have been shoved aside by the masses. The masses “do not obey them or respect them.” On the contrary, “they push them aside and supplant them.” But the modern intellectuals are disqualified too in many respects according to the Spanish philosopher. “[I]n the intellectual life one can note the progressive triumph of the pseudo-intellectual”, who is disqualified. In Escape Hatch this is apparent already in the fact that the subterranean world lacks air, is artificially lit and is closed off from the reality on the surface.

The book’s hero, Klyucharyov, belongs to the intelligentsia, and there is much that unites him with the subterranean world – the words and the social life of which are, for him, the life which is lacking on the surface. But he is also contrasted to the subterranean world. He is the only one who can pass between the underground and the surface, and thus constitutes an exclusive minority of one. His surname is allegorical, created, as several critics have pointed out, from the Russian world klyuch and, it can be added, even klyuchar – key and key holder, just as Saint Peter, the gatekeeper of heaven and hell, is called in Russian texts. He is shy in words, but great in his work of maintaining life, while the subterranean world’s intelligentsia is presented, in various ways, as not suiting action to its high-sounding words. Klyucharyov personifies those who, in Ortega y Gasset’s conceptual world, “make great demands on themselves, piling up difficulties and duties”, as opposed to the masses “who demand nothing special of themselves”.

The mass man is the ”average man” (a concept which Makanin picks up from Ortega y Gasset in the essay ”Kvazi”); as the Spanish philosopher writes, ”in the presence of one individual we can decide whether he is ‘mass’ or not.” Ortega y Gasset believes, as we have seen, that traditionally ”select minorities”, such as intellectuals, have degenerated. But, according to him, “it

49 V. Makanin, ”Kvazi,” Novyi mir 7/93, pp. 132, 134
51 A. Genis, Nezavisimaya gazeta 25.07.91
52 J. Ortega y Gasset, op. cit., p. 12
is not rare to find to-day amongst working men”, who have traditionally belonged to the masses, “noblly disciplined minds”. There are two motifs of *Escape Hatch*, which can serve as direct illustrations of these theses.

Both in the surface and in the subterranean world Klyucharyov is moving towards a definite goal. Up on the surface it is a voyage, undertaken through the danger-filled city together with the very pregnant Olya and with Chursin, who belongs to the intelligentsia but has a background as an orphanage child. The goal of the journey is a mortuary – they are going to bury Olya’s husband, Pavlov, who has died on the street of a heart attack. Among the barriers they encounter on the way is a bus driver who refuses to drive on to the end station in a dark, deserted quarter. He is a typical “mass man” in his behaviour and in his lack of respect for the minority.

’Sure she’s pregnant!’ the driver yells, his anger suddenly flashing out at these intellectuals [members of the intelligentsia] who were and are responsible for everything /…/ He’d probably been listening to their conversation and inasmuch as they hadn’t been swearing or talking about primuses and grub, it was clear that they were the ones who had brought the country to ruin. Destroyed it! (If not sold it out.) (56)

When the three arrive at the medical college where the mortuary is located they are taken care of by a small fellow with a number of folksy attributes – his name, Semyonych, quilted jacket, simple speech, shovel, skill in digging. The man shows a sense of responsibility and care when he helps them bury Olya’s husband in an old, deserted churchyard in the area – ”one of the last professionals doing a job honestly”(64). He is, furthermore, furnished with enormous rusty keys on a steel ring. He is still another possessor of keys, but his keys seem to belong to a past time. He is one of those with ”noblly disciplined minds” whom Ortega y Gasset found among workers. As the last of his kind he, too, belongs to the minority.

The most dangerous barrier on the way is the CROWD, which ”tramples anyone who’s not part of it”(62). It overflows a square that the three must cross to get to the medical college. They are close to being swallowed in the crowd’s maelstrom. The crowd’s great, threatening power and movement is described for five pages. In ”Kvazi” Makanin describes how the ”average man” undertakes a ”merciless cleansing of the square in social consciousness, so as to make room for temples and memorials dedicated to new idols.” Makanin praises Ortega y Gasset for daring to set culture against ”[t]he many-headed slave who has come out onto the square, that is to say, the crowd.”54

---

53 ibid., pp. 12, 13
54 V. Makanin, ”Kvazi,” *Novyi mir* 7/93, pp. 134, 135
Compare Makanin’s praise in “Kvazi” and the depiction of the crowd in *Escape Hatch* with this quotation from Ortega y Gasset: “The mass crushes beneath it everything that is different, everything that is excellent, individual, qualified and select. Anybody who is not like everybody /.../ runs the risk of being eliminated.”

The Subterranean World and the Word

Klyucharyov is in the beginning of the novella shown to have a strange way of moving – "he periodically makes a strange twitching movement with his body"(10). His body is covered with deep wounds, incurred during his passages through the narrow laz. He is on his way to the hole; and when he forces himself through he reopens his bleeding wounds. He descends into a beautiful, lit room, a "wine cellar", where people are sitting and talking and drinking wine (11, 12).

The two worlds structure a number of oppositions that have to do with the Word. High, valuable words are contrasted to low, destructive words, or the crowd’s "muffled drone" and "roar". A flawless but empty run of words is opposed to defective, but meaningful words, or to a silence filled with understanding (33, 35, 71). The first of these opposites characterizes the nether world, the second the world on the surface. It is not a matter of a simple division between “good” and “bad” between the worlds. It is a matter of what serves life and what serves death, and that pattern is a complicated one.

Klyucharyov passes through the laz and returns twice (10–11 + 22–25, 67–68 + 85–86). The longest episode of the story, of about forty pages, takes place in the upper world between the two descents, and contains, among other things, the hazardous trip to the mortuary. He exposes himself to this danger as a thoughtful friend, and his movements in both worlds is conditioned by his incessant care for the survival of himself, his friends, his wife, his son, and even unknown victims of violence. At the middle of the story he happens, during these movements, to end up next to the laz, and discovers that the hole has drawn itself tightly closed (49).

From below he hears "sublime [high] words”, song and the music of guitars, discussions on spirituality and the sound of someone ordering another "double shot" (of vodka). This is a collection of intelligentsia attributes. The combination of high words and vodka does not disturb Klyucharyov, on the contrary "he’s overcome by warmth, love, and a passionate human longing to be with them, to be there.” To be shut out from there is an enormous loss, loss of thought itself, the process of thought. None of them has final knowledge, but they speak, and, like Klyucharyov, attempt – "and this common attempt is their salvation"(50). The high words remind them that they are not going to die.

55 J. Ortega y Gasset, ibid., p. 16
Without the high words he cannot live, and neither can his wordless, mentally handicapped son. "We are words" (51).

In this section, characterized by Klyucharyov’s erlebte Rede, the expression "sublime [high] words" is linked to the sentence "The sublime [high] sky of ceilings over tables where people sit and talk" (50). The sky is artificial, as is the light. This, as one critic has pointed out, gives the high words a dubious aftertaste. 56

Klyucharyov is a bit of the way down the hole. When he gets back up he sees his wife on her way home to their son. He imagines how it would be, if he instead were to be "separated from this darkening street where his wife now walks and where Denis is, such an enormous and good boy, and the dead Pavlov, and where it’s impossible to buy either a battery or a nail on the dark streets" (52). He directs a pointless, furious shout down into the subterranean world. His wife will stay with his son in the apartment.

If he wakes up and no-one is right there, Denis cries out; he has a simple nature [soul], he’ll open a window looking out on the street and call in a crying voice, 'Mama! Mama!…’ a gift to anyone who loves profit and easy pickings. An empty, desolate street. A child’s cry – what could be easier! (52).

The subterranean world and the world on the surface are both, in their own ways, the realms of death and the realms of life. On the surface is the destructive crowd, dead streets, windows like dead glass-eyes. But this surface world also contains life. Here the grass is green and the air fresh. Here Klyucharyov sees, when he at one point emerges from the black earth, a "glimpse of the bright sky" (24), the only real light to appear in the entire story. Here Olya is pregnant, here is family and the friends, and his concern for them. Even “the dead Pavlov” can be seen as a sign of life – it is a matter of affection and fulfillment of duty that ties one to life and place. On the empty and threatening street Klyucharyov thinks to himself: "And this is life…” (9).

Yet, when Klyucharyov has forced his way down to the discussing representatives of the intelligentsia in his second visit to the subterranean world, his feelings are described as follows:

Klyucharyov, who felt numb (dead) on those desolate streets where the only active energy was the thief who sat on his victim and rummaged in his pockets – the numb Klyucharyov feels the presence of words. Like a fish landing in water again, he revives. (70)

---

56 P. Vail, Nezavisimaya gazeta 25.07.91
Once again, we find death above and life below. At the same time, however, the author demonstrates how words below do not tally with actions. Around the table the discussion is of Dostoevsky and the refusal to accept a fortune that is built on others’ misfortune. But Klyucharyov, who has just forced his way through laz with “unbearable pain”, has been completely forgotten by these glad companions (67). The contraption, the ladder-stairway (68) he needed to get down from the hole has been moved to make place for more tables; as a result, he almost falls to his death. These “sublime [high] words”, like others – about a community between the people in the two worlds, about their common misfortune if “the mob [crowd] will [should] completely lose its mind” (72) – are brought into question here and in the novella’s resolution.

The man who talks about community between the two worlds spits blood, sickened by the lack of air – “The blood’s not from his body but from his throat” (71) – in contrast to Klyucharyov. On his way back Klyucharyov stops, once again, in the wine cellar, caught up in the conversation. In this section, which takes up a little more than a page, the phrase “they talk” occurs five times, of which four are anaphor in a paragraph. The paragraph that immediately precedes Klyucharyov’s difficult passage up through the laz consists of this phrase alone, as the conclusion of the story’s account of the subterranean world’s discussion (86, 87). This further diminishes the reader’s faith in the underworldly intelligentsia’s discussions and words.

At the same time, nonetheless, the description seems to express respect for the speakers:

They talk sincerely and with pain /.../ Their sublime [high] words are vague and not very convincing, but they’re spoken with the hope that even approximately true sincere words will expand the soul (the gap [laz] in our soul), and the pain expelled from within will speak in words that are new /.../ And will the mob [crowd] become good? /.../

[Klyucharyov] feels connected to their words, they are dear to him. But man is finite. Man is mortal. (87)

Here, the word is contrasted to human mortality, as opposed to earlier statements that seem, rather, to posit the ability of the word to confer immortality on mortals.

Renewal as Rebirth
When Klyucharyov leaves the speakers in the subterranean world the story has just over six pages left. The last, painful, forced passage through the laz has associations to both birth, death and intercourse. Once up on the surface, Klyucharyov goes homewards, to the apartment in the five-story house, built during the Khrushchev era, a chhrushchevka – an emblematic late-Soviet home. He discovers that a cave he built, as a survival project, has been destroyed.
Next to the cave hangs a killed crow – that is how it goes when you build something of your own, it says (89).

   Well, he thinks, from biology and hatred they’ve progressed to concrete signs one can understand. This is already a sign. It’s already the beginning of a dialogue. (Signs and gestures are followed by words – isn’t that right?) /.../ He’s tired but he won’t complain; that’s the way he is. (90)

In his exhaustion he sits down very close to his home, falls asleep and dreams a short dream: The laz has closed itself. Through the little hole which remains he shouts down information about the misfortunes of the upper world (90). He shouts that the approaching dark is destroying the individual, that even thugs and thieves are afraid on the streets. He shouts about Denis, about starvation, about dark curtains in front of the windows. The people in the subterranean world have computers and can decode the information. They usually ask for all the information they can get, and from below comes the call: ”Speak! Speak!” (91). Klyucharyov lets down a thin cord to them, and feels them fastening something to it. He expects a text, but ”there’s not a single word in reply” (92). Instead of ”a reply directed to his soul”, however, he would be able to content himself with sausage links. But finally he understands what it is he is pulling up, by the thousands:

   canes for the blind. When total dark falls, you can keep on walking, tapping the sidewalk with your cane. This is their answer /.../ A terrible dream, and unjust, in Klyucharyov’s view, in its real lack of trust in reason. (93)

A good man in the twilight. (So few and so many.) [So little and so much.] He had woken Klyucharyov, this passer-by /.../ ‘Why have you fallen asleep?’ A simple voice. ’You shouldn’t sleep on the street.’ Still somewhat sleepy, Klyucharyov looks up. A man stands there. Middle-aged, with rather long hair that falls loosely, almost to his shoulders. /.../ ’Get up,’ he repeats just as firmly, with a calm and patient smile. /.../ Klyucharyov rises. ’Yes,’ he says, stretching. ’It’s gotten so dark.’ ’But it’s not night yet,’ the man says /.../ The man is still standing in the same place, and only as Klyucharyov begins to walk away does his figure in turn ever so slowly dissolve (though not completely) in the twilight. (93, 94).

These are the last words of the story.

   The sudden appearance of this Christ-like figure can, among other things, be contrasted to the section about the subterranean intelligentsia’s hope that
sincere words can open a painful and renewing passage/laz in our souls, which is followed by Klyucharyov’s objection that humans are mortal (87). The sleeping Klyucharyov is awoken by Christ, who also termed Lazarus’s death as sleep, and awoke him, saying “I am the resurrection and the life. He who believes in Me, shall live, even if he dies.”57 If one likes, one can point to the phonetic relation between the title of the story, and the name Lazarus in Russian – Laz and Lazar.

Both the conclusion of the story, and Klyucharyov’s passages through the laz, especially the last, painful forcing through to the surface, where it is said that it is perhaps he who holds the connection open with his crawling (89), are symbols for this passage in the soul, as in social consciousness. The fact that Klyucharyov in the end of Escape Hatch can be seen as the bearer of the possibility of renewal, in the form of rebirth traditional for Russian culture, has to do with his role as mediator between the worlds.

The story is permeated with mythical patterns and allusions. One critic has pointed out that the figure of the mediator Klyucharyov is reminiscent of the mythical “culture hero” who brings fire and work-tools to the human world, on the surface.58 Klyucharyov does in fact bring with him, from his visits to the subterranean world, a shovel, crowbar, pickaxe, material [cloth], tea, batteries, candles, and a kerosene stove.

Chaos rules in the surface world – mythical signs of chaos include the darkness and half-darkness, as well as the emptiness and silence, all phenomena which are mentioned again and again. Another sign of chaos is the fact that time stands still, both on the surface and in the subterranean world. All the events in the surface world take place in an unchanging half-darkness. It is twilight all the time, the light is failing – sometimes, it is added, “quickly”. The phrase “It’s not night yet”, spoken by “Christ” at the end of the story, recurs. Disturbance in the transition between night and day is an eschatological motif. The ordering of the world from chaos to cosmos involves, among other things, the culture hero’s institution of periods of time and means of reckoning time.

The “rebirth” of Klyucharyov at the end of the novella results in the time starting to pass. When he is awoken we receive, for the first time, exact information on time: “He had slept for four or five minutes” (93). The immobility of time can also be seen as symbolizing the Russian word bezvremenye (difficult times, stagnation) in its literal meaning of “no time”. The word is used when Klyucharyov thinks about how reluctant he is to journey out and bury Pavlov “in these difficult times” (29). In this way you can link the hero’s mythical role as the starter of time with a social role as the overcomer of crisis.

57 The Bible, Joh. 11:11, 25
58 P. Vail, Nezavisimaya gazeta 25.07.91
Conclusion

Escape Hatch shows us the subterranean world’s emptily talking intelligentsia, isolated from the reality of the surface world, on the one hand; and, on the other, the main character Viktor Klyucharyov, also a representative of the intelligentsia, whose actions affect the entire world order. When he wakes/is reborn time starts again, the bezvremenye/crisis can begin to be overcome. He lives up to his given name, Viktor (from the Latin victor). This is reminiscent of a pattern we find in Alexander Solzhenitsyn’s article of 1974, “The Smatterers,” as well as in articles of the 1990s debate. On the one side we are shown ”the semi-educated estate – the ‘smatterers’”, often termed just ”the intelligentsia”, who are a collection of empty and nihilistic chatterers. On the other, we are presented with “the nucleus of the intelligentsia” as the equivalent of ”the nucleus of goodness”. The “smatterers” have brought Russia to its ruin, ”the nucleus of the intelligentsia” is the only hope for its salvation.59 The difference lies in the way of answering the question, “who is to blame?”. Solzhenitsyn prioritises the intelligentsia, while Makanin focuses on the people/the masses.

Here the pendulum has swung fully between demonisation and idealization. But the two have in common the incredibly high evaluation of the importance of the intelligentsia. The elitism, which is often hidden in the arguments based on this ideological kernel, is obvious in Makanin, especially in his essay ”Kvazi”. Ortega y Gasset can be included in this context; the Spanish philosopher was important not only to Makanin in the Russian debate of the 1990s.

In 2000 a large conference was held in St. Petersburg on the Russian intelligentsia. In one of the contributions, the concept of ”intelligentsia” was declared to be an ”ideologem”, meaning that those who have the power to include themselves among ”the intelligentsia” are those who have the power to express themselves with authority in the public sphere. To search for a ”scientific” definition of the intelligentsia was equivalent, according to this contribution, to searching for an absent black cat in a black room. And, of course, someone (defined as member of the intelligentsia) will find this absent cat and give instructions about its place in the room.60

There is, in short, a certain circularity in the debate on the intelligentsia. It is a matter, after all, of a group that seeks to describe itself, even if some in the heat of polemic set themselves up as outsiders. The literary critic Natalya Ivanova has spoken of an intelligentsia that sought a new identity but ended up on the same old rails, unable to find a way out.61 In this article, we have looked

59 A. Solzhenitsyn, From Under the Rubble, pp. 229-278, 242, 271
60 E. Sokolov, Fenomen rossiyskoy intelligentsii, pp. 166, 167
61 At the VI ICCEES World Congress. Tampere 2000. This going in circles can be seen as symbolized by a number of circular definitions of the intelligentsia in the debate of the 1990s.
at different ways of dealing with this problem, which is a part of the identity crisis of post-Soviet Russian society.

The connection between the problem of renewal and the Russian intelligentsia’s crisis during the 1990s can be illuminated by the following “post-modern” comment. Viktor Yerofeyev’s *Encyclopaedia of the Russian Soul* of 1999 delivers a number of hard blows to the national Russian myths. He writes, with irony, that Westernisation has castrated the Russian element. The autocracy, by contrast, sustains Russianness. Russians should not be too educated and should not be allowed to go abroad. ”In that case new Belinskys will appear. Romantic underground. The Natural School. The intelligentsia will revive again. Everything will start functioning. Empty stores – full refrigerators. Life will be heavenly.”

*Translated by Madeleine Hurd*

---

References

Articles from the following journals and newspapers:
Dosye na tsenzuru 2/97
Druzhba narodov 7/98
Literaturnaya gazeta 24/99, 39/99
Moskva 2/91
Nezavisimaya gazeta 25.07.91
Novyi mir 1/93, 3/93, 5/93, 7/93, 8/93, 2/94, 4/94, 7/94, 8/94, 2/95, 8/95, 1/00
Ogonyok 5/91
Znamya 5/92, 9/93, 11/93, 2/94, 9/96, 1/97, 1/00, 3/00

Books (in English):
An Age Ago. A Selection of Nineteenth-Century Russian Poetry (N Y 1988)
The Bible, Joh. 11:11, 25
Landmarks (N Y 1977)
V. Makanin, Escape Hatch & The Long Road Ahead (Dana Point 1995)
C. Read, Religion, Revolution and the Russian Intelligentsia 1900-1912 (London 1979)
A. Solzhenitsyn, From Under the Rubble (London 1975)

Books (in Russian):
Fenomen rossiyskoy intelligentsii (St. Petersburg 2000)
A. Genis, Ivan Petrovich umer. Statyi i rassledovaniya (1999)
L. Gudkov, B. Dubin, Intelligentsiya (Moscow 1995)
S. Kisilitsyn, V. Krikunov, V. Kuraev, Gennady Zyuganov (1999)
M. Litvak, Intelligentsiya i mifotvorchestvo (St. Petersburg 2000)
Na pereputye (Moscow 1999)
A. Nemzer, Literaturnoe segodnya. O russkoy proze. 90-e (Moscow 1998)
Novaya volna (1994)
V. Sorgin, Politicheskaya istoriya sovremennoy Rossii (Moscow 1994)
A. Solzhenitsyn, Publitsistika v trekh tomakh (Yaroslavl 1995)
Vekhi. Intelligentsiya v Rossii (Moscow 1991)
Vekhi. Pro et contra (St. Petersburg 1998)
V. Yerofeyev, Entsiklopediya russkoy dushi (Moscow 1999)
In the Baltic Sea region, the 1990s were marked by a tremendous increase of East-West communication. Suddenly people had the courage to cross old borders and in the process curiosity mixed with contention, creativity with commerce, and cooperation with colonialist tendencies. New encounters came in different forms: as family reunions, shock therapy, prostitution, democracy export projects, scientific exchange, and tourism. Something that strengthened, and to a certain extent also shaped the flow, was the fact that post-communist openness coincided with the global Internet boom. The region soon gained status as one of the most connected in the world in terms of access to the Internet.1

A metaphor that has been used frequently in the context of the Net is that of ‘the frontier’. The Internet, it is argued, extends human capabilities and fantasies into new and hitherto unseen spaces. There is a sense that everything is possible and that the old laws of nature cease to matter. To put it in post-communist jargon: with the Internet, new ‘windows of opportunities’ are opened to the world.

This article is about three Baltic Sea region web sites: In Your Pocket, Shock Tourism, and Ballad. It discusses how they simultaneously promote globalization, regionalism, and images of the East as the Other.2 Among the more specific issues addressed are: How is the region delimited online? Can a regional web site, through naming and shaming practices, be said to encourage global norms and standards? Will post-communist Western paternalistic views of the East survive globalization? The analysis – cyber-geographical criticism with a globalization theory twist – is based on a study conducted in the fall of 1999. Material from the Web is supplemented with e-mail interviews with site producers.

1 This is explained both by domestic factors, such as employment and education profiles, and by the fact that Western aid agencies and NGOs (e.g., the Soros Foundations) identified connectivity as an efficient way to support democracy. Often it is Estonia that is singled out as a particularly positive example. On Estonia as forerunner, see the UNDP Human Development Report 1999 or the UN report A/55/75 from May 2000. For connectivity statistics, see NUA: www.nua.ie/surveys/how_many_online/europe.html.

2 As Neumann (1999:15) notes, there are many ‘Easts’ in the world. The focus here is the Baltic Sea region.
Presenting the Sites

Three sites are presented here: In Your Pocket, Ballad, and Shock Tourism. Especially In Your Pocket and Ballad are quite extensive sites. The focus here is on self-presentation, especially in top-level pages and ‘about the site’ sections. All facts and quotes are unless otherwise indicated taken from the Web.


In Your Pocket started in 1992 as a pocket-sized English language guide to Vilnius. The first online version was completed as early as 1995, which makes it the oldest of the three web sites discussed here.³ The founders of In Your Pocket were ‘four enterprising young men [from Germany and Belgium] out to conquer the world.’ At the time of the study, In Your Pocket covered Vilnius, Riga, Tallinn, Klaipeda, Minsk, Kaliningrad, Bucharest, Southern Transylvania, Budapest, and Crakow. The entire content of the paper versions was published on the Web. Web-specific elements included staff pages, letters from the readers, and a message board.⁴

I was the first Portuguese tourist to visit your country. I find your booklet absolutely remarkable. In Western Europe there are many cities which do not have such a condensed but valuable source of information.

/…/ There are very many places in the book where you simply mock Lithuania /…/ I’m very interested to know who wrote the text /…/ to laugh at Lithuania is not in the nature of a real Lithuanian /…/ I didn’t like your guidebook.

The latter posting deals with In Your Pocket’s irreverent style; a writing practice that could also be described as shaming (see Urry 1998). In Your Pocket publishes critical reviews of restaurants, tourist attractions and youth hostels for the world to see and laugh at. By doing this it participates in a media-directed global scrutiny. It is a very powerful practice; the consequences (not least economic) can at times be enormous and go way beyond actual shaming.

³ In Your Pocket began as a paper guide and continues to have a strong offline presence.
⁴ Who is the producer of a Web site? Is it the In Your Pocket editor responsible for getting the information about train schedules right? Is it the programmer who wrote the code? Is it the user who provides feedback in the guest book? Interactive networked media tend to introduce new levels of complexity. In many cases users are in fact co-producers.
Second: Shock Tourism. URL: www.outdoor.se/artiklar/chock/.

The second web site also addresses Baltic Sea-bound travelers, but from a very different perspective. Travel writer Anders Thorsell created the Shock Tourism site in fall 1996 as a separate part of outdoor.se (a Swedish webzine). In an e-mail interview he described it as ‘a travel story that kept growing’ and a big part of it is in fact made up of quite traditional travel stories with photo illustrations. Traditional in form, that is. The content can indeed at times be shocking, but then more for its cynicism and awkwardness than for the actual shock stories.

What is shock tourism? Thorsell coined the term after a Douglas Coupland-inspired trip to Estonia, Lithuania and Poland. On the site, shock tourists are proclaimed to be ‘a sub-group of Generation X’. Travel destinations are divided into three categories: easy (exemplified by Prague and Budapest suburbs), difficult (nuclear power plants in Estonia, Latvia or Lithuania), and ‘world class’ (Ukraine and Belarus). Of particular interest for shock tourists are train stations, trams, and taxis (especially in Kaliningrad). Important equipment include Adidas Gazelle with a high ‘Generation X feel’ and Russian army watches. Cigarettes (Aeroflot brand) are good as souvenirs but not necessary during actual travel. The shock tourist is likely to inhale enough smoke as it is, traveling in polluted areas. All this is according to the site.

The interactive ‘shock forum’ contains 30 postings from October 1996–March 1999. Almost all are in Swedish, written by a small group (several are actually from Thorsell himself, one under the easily deciphered pseudonym Andreijski Thorsellskijvksij cccp@cccp.ru). The ‘news and letters from the readers’ section contains 83 messages (table 1).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of posts</th>
<th>Period</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>46</td>
<td>1996 (June-Dec)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>1997</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>1998</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>1999 (Jan-Aug)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

I have classified the 83 messages as follows, based on their content: 31 from the press (either news about the shock tourists in other media or queries from journalists), 26 from shock tourists (sharing shock experiences), 23 updates by the webmaster and 5 from readers (comments on the site). Most striking is perhaps the declining tendency: Four messages January–August 1999,

---

5 The study was conducted in fall 1999. In 2000 the URL changed into: http://www.luffa.nu/shock/.
compared with 46 during June – December 1996. When asked why the site seems to be dying (it had in August 1999 not been updated since April 1999) the webmaster explained that it is time-consuming work and that adding new stories makes it even harder for him as a free-lance to sell articles.

Our third site is Ballad: URL: www.ballad.org. Title: ‘Ballad – the independent forum for networking in the Baltic Sea region’.

Ballad was originally an abbreviation of ‘The Baltic Sea region’s Library and Database’ but now presents itself as ‘Ballad – The Independent Forum for Networking in the Baltic Sea region’. Independent? Yes, Ballad ‘is a meeting place free from political power and authorities. No institute or organization controls Ballad.’ This might be a slight exaggeration. Ballad was created in 1997 by the Swedish ‘Baltic Institute’ and was initially co-funded by the Swedish ‘KK-foundation’.

Ballad’s board and production team is entirely Swedish. The site is built on databases that to a large degree depend on the web surfers’ input; it is thus partly produced by its users. The purpose is, as described on the web site, to promote regional integration and decentralized co-operation:

Ballad is the place for the vast amount of networks and cross-border initiatives now emerging. With the help of Ballad you can easily find all the information and contacts you need.

Mika Larsson (creator of the original Ballad concept) stated in an e-mail interview that Swedish democracy when it first took shape in the nineteenth century depended heavily on social movements. ‘The citizens of former communist countries need to learn from history.’ Swedish history, it is implied. Ballad is meant to contribute tools to those whom Larsson refers to as the ‘weakest’ participants in the Baltic Sea integration process.

Ballad lets the users contribute with links, events, and project presentations related to the Baltic Sea region. Other interactive elements include a mailing list ‘open to networkers in the Baltic Sea region’ and a discussion forum. Baltic Institute people have initiated several of the ‘discussions’. Eight of 18 postings resulted in zero replies. This is not unique for Ballad though; few web-based discussion forums achieve a high level of activity. The more popular topics concern the debate on Estonian and Latvian citizenship and a Youth Forum that took place in 1999 in Poland. The Ballad guest book contains 77 messages. People with the .se (Sweden) domain wrote 34 of the messages. This is a lot,

---

6 A minor reservation: in this section, Thorsell picked out what was to be published. It is possible that the declining tendency is partly explained, not so much by a decrease in the number of letters, but by the fact the site hasn’t been updated a lot recently.

7 In February 2002 the site was closed and the archive moved to www.balticinstitute.se/Ballad
considering the Swedish share of the Baltic Sea region population, and the bias is most likely explained by the fact that Ballad is produced by Swedes. At least five of the messages were from Ballad people themselves and some were personal communications directed specifically to the editor. What about the content? I classified 40 as congratulations, 23 as self-presentations, 16 as greetings, and 2 as queries. It is, to summarize, a fairly traditional guest book; most contributions are brief and have a very general and placid tone.

The context frames and sets limits to participation. Context includes both the other pages of the site (especially the self-presentational top page) and neighboring sites. On the web, placement, and thus a form of contextualization, is performed through linking. Another identity marker is something as simple as domain name. In Your Pocket is a .com, which in the www world means commercial. In Your Pocket is however also independent in the journalistic sense of the word, something that is reflected in its link policy (to link everyone for free) and in its irreverent language. The Shock Tourism site is a hybrid, something between a personal homepage, a virtual community and an advertising site – neither .com nor .org in other words. It can be found at the .se (Sweden) domain. The network-building Ballad, finally, is a .org (organization). Its intentions as expressed on the site are public-service oriented rather than commercial or private. The producers were, from the start, very conscious about strengthening the Baltic Sea region.

**Regionalism or Globalization?**

The Internet is sometimes referred to as the medium of globalization. It is described as having many of the characteristics associated with postmodernism (decentralization, juxtaposition and border-crossings are seen as important traits). What consequences does this have for In Your Pocket, the Shock Tourism site and Ballad? The sites deal with the Baltic Sea region. Does that make them regional rather than global? The topic of this section is the relation between cyber geography and earthly geography on the one hand, and regionalism and globalization on the other.

To start with, it should be emphasized that the three sites all have a heavy focus on the East. In the case of In Your Pocket the eastern focus is puzzling: It is a city guide – and thus it is perfectly appropriate to focus on cities (which

---

8 When it comes to the eastern Baltic Sea region it is worth recalling that the globalizing effects of the Internet initially caused some alarm. Many of the first Internet users were foreign residents, foreign companies and international institutions (see also Guylas, 1998 on the Hungarian case). To some ‘locals’, the Net itself was shocking; it came to represent an invasive force threatening newly gained national identity. To others, it was a life-line, as Miller and Slater (2000) put it, both a ‘premise and promise of freedom’. See Kluitenberg (1998:23) on the Net as easy target of hatred and skepticism in the Baltic republics. Miller and Slater’s argument on how the Internet’s development depends on freedom as both premise and promise is based on ethnographic work in Trinidad.
all happen to be in the East?). On the site, In Your Pocket claims that ‘We hope
that one day the In Your Pocket city guides will enlighten the masses in every
major city in the world.’ In Your Pocket is, also according to the site, especially
looking at Gdansk, St. Petersburg, Moscow, Siauliai, Raseiniai, Pärnu, Tartu,
than New York? Probably a combination of chance and opportunity.9

Something that makes In Your Pocket very different from the Shock Tourist site
is the fact that the texts are written by English-speaking writers (of local as well
as Western origin) living in the cities. It may to a large part be written for
foreigners but it is not written by tourists.10

All of Swedish shock tourist Thorsell’s shocking experiences (except for one
trip to Italy) took place in Eastern Europe and especially the eastern Baltic Sea
states. Approximately 90% of the ‘links to articles and other shocking sites’ are
to web sites about Lithuania, Poland, Russia, Ukraine or different kinds of
Soviet memorabilia’. The ‘shocktourist game’ (illustrated on the site with
photos taken by Anders Thorsell) is yet another example. The excerpt below
gives a good idea of what shock tourism is all about:

Play the shocktourist game! When you travel in Eastern Europe you
will find that some objects and places are harder to find than others.
This is a point scale of objects and things that is a must for a
shocktourist to visit. Use this scale and compete with your friends.

0,1p You travel by tram to a Soviet style suburb
3p You locate a wino with a bottle of Stolichnaya used as pillow. Add
10 points if you find him sleeping outside a nuclear plant with RBMK
reactors (Chernobyl type)
5p You find a surviving statue of Lenin
100p Congratulations! You manage to find a Stalin statue
GAME OVER You decide to go swimming in the surroundings of
Ignalina, Lithuania11

9 In spring 2003 guides to Helsinki, Florence, Stockholm, and Strasbourg had already been dis-
continued. All guides were to cities in Central and Eastern Europe (which was now also reflect-
ed in the title).

10 What do In Your Pocket server statistics tell us about the readers of the web version? In the
period June-September 1999, In Your Pocket had approximately 150,400 visits, (2,863,200 hits).
What about geography? The director quotes a survey showing that 35% are Americans and about
60% West Europeans (with Finns being the biggest group). The reasons for reading were, in
order: business trips, tourism and moving to the country. This was a very limited survey and
should not be given too much weight; it does however give us some idea of the Western domi-
nance.

11 The original scale was longer.
Ballad is presented as the best web site for networking in the Baltic Sea region. Ballad’s evident Orientalism cannot be dismissed with arguments concerning ‘ironic Generation X jargon’ or ‘banal popular culture’. At the time of the study the News archive contained 6,374 stories. The sources were: Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty (RFE/RL), Baltic News Service (BNS), Radio Racyja and Ballad. The archive had been storing news since October 1997 and was searchable by country and topic. Table 3, below, shows the total number of news items in September 1999, sorted by country.

Table 3: Ballad’s News by Country

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Russia</td>
<td>3,140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latvia</td>
<td>1,426</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Estonia</td>
<td>975</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lithuania</td>
<td>973</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poland</td>
<td>643</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Belarus</td>
<td>640</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Germany</td>
<td>153</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sweden</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finland</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Denmark</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Norway</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ukraine</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iceland</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Almost half of the stories concern Russia. The reason for this is not the size of the country, since Latvia is second while Germany ranks number seven. The eastern countries (with Ukraine as the only exception) top the list. There is, in other words, a clear bias towards the eastern part of the Baltic Sea region. One possible contributing reason could be the way in which the items are classified in the database, but that hardly explains it all. What about topics? The ‘politics and international relations’ category dominates with 4,199 items, only two items are about children and youth. Ballad is thus, judging from the news archive, grown-up and serious. It claims to have public service ambitions, and politics is traditionally seen as the most public sphere of human life. In the background there are also still the Cold-War days of conflict, when international relations carried a lot of weight.

Yet another key to Ballad’s geographical inclinations and view of the Baltic Sea is the ‘Makes me think’ section on the top page. It was originally, according to Larsson, one of many pieces meant to bring Ballad down to earth by giving

---

12 Many news items contain several states.
13 That is, domestic and international politics. The politics of the others is their private business.
a face to the region. Inspiration came from the Swedish tabloid *Aftonbladet*'s ‘We five’ section. Below, the most recent example.

**THE BALTIC SEA REGION MAKES ME THINK OF...**

…the biggest gift of nature that we have received, that we own now and that we will give to the next generations. That is why we must protect it and treat it as a real treasure.

*Tomasz Wiesak*

*Gdansk, Poland*

How are the ‘thinkers’ selected? According to programmer David Erixon, ‘Every time someone at the Baltic Institute travels abroad he or she brings along a digital camera…Which is why there are so many people and nationalities!’ A survey of the contributions up until fall 1999 shows that the nationalities were: Swedish 22, Polish 15, Latvian 13, Lithuanian 9, German 4, Estonian 4, Finnish 4, Russian 1, Belarus 1. Striking here is the low number of Russians and Germans and the overrepresentation of Swedish Baltic Sea region thinkers. Each thinker was granted one, maximum two, sentences. What did the Baltic Sea region make them think about? The most frequently recurring themes were community and peace (36), sea and environment (29) and states, society and economy (28). Fifteen mentioned the future and twelve associated the Baltic Sea region with its people. Specific Baltic Sea projects appeared ten times in the answers.

The *Ballad* web site has elements of what might be called banal regionalism (cf. Billig’s ‘banal nationalism’ [1996] and Urry’s ‘banal globalism’ [1998]). What makes it less banal is that the images and wordings are consciously designed to create Baltic Sea sensitivities. *Ballad* seems to be engaging in what Neumann terms region building.

The existence of regions is preceded by the existence of region builders. They are political actors who, as part of some political project, see it in their interest to imagine a certain spatial and chronological identity for a region and to disseminate this imagination to as many other people as possible (Neumann 1999, 115).

Neumann’s approach suggests that there are many similarities between nation- and region-building. Regions are, just like nations, imagined communities. A

---

14 Two irregularities were detected: a) the same person appeared twice b) one person was unidentifiable.

15 The construction work is effectuated through discourse and can therefore also be traced in discourse.
center is usually postulated: ‘a core area where the internal defining traits are more similar, and interaction more intense, than in the regional periphery’ (Neumann 1999, 117, emphasis in original).

There is one major difference between region- and nation-building. Region builders do not necessarily aim at forging a political entity. Region building is about the crossing of state borders, about networking. It is interesting that Ballad, as we have already seen, refers to itself as a network builder. I would suggest that these two terms (network- and region-building) overlap in Ballad’s case. The site explicitly addresses a regional audience. The same list of countries is used over and over again; all the databases seem to be organized around Russia, Ukraine, Latvia, Estonia, Lithuania, Poland, Belarus, Germany, Sweden, Finland, Denmark, Norway, and Iceland (sic!), as the Baltic Sea region. Region builders typically define the region in ways that suit their interests, and success usually entails being in the center of the region. The Ballad region builders operate from southeastern Sweden. This may explain why they have decided to include Iceland, Norway and Ukraine in the Baltic Sea region.

What about the connection between the regional and the global? As has already been pointed out, region building is about the crossing of state borders. This automatically opens up for non-regional influences as well.

/…/ the UN, the World Bank, Microsoft, CNN, Greenpeace, EU, News International, the Oscar ceremony, the World Intellectual Property Organization, UNESCO, the ILO, the Olympic movement, Friends of the Earth, Nobel Prizes, Bandaid, the Brundtland Report, the Rio Earth Summit, the European Court of Human Rights, British Council and the English language, and so on. (Urry 1998)

Those are John Urry’s examples of globalizers. Globalization is partly enacted through various standardizations. One such standardization is the dominant position of the English language, especially on the Internet. When Finns, Chilean-born Swedes, Polish-Lithuanians and Germans get together, they are likely to communicate in the non-Baltic Sea region language English. What is the situation at the three sites? Ballad and In Your Pocket are almost exclusively English-language sites, although there are a few postings in ‘local’ languages. The Shock Tourist site is mainly Swedish, the sections that are available in English include: The start up page, ‘Shocking images’, ‘Shock forum’ (but most of the postings are in Swedish), ‘Shock links’ and ‘Play the shocktourist game.’ Anders Thorsell has however (as of October 1999) prepared a new version of the site, now entirely in English.

It is important to point out that, when talking about globalization, we mean globalization in a strategic rather than a geographical sense. As Saskia Sassen (1998) has shown in her research on global cities, globalization installs itself in
very specific structures. Consider In Your Pocket. For every city there is a business section. The one for Vilnius includes daily exchange rates, economic snapshots and indicators with sources such as the European Union’s Transport Commission and the Canada-based Fraser Institute’s ‘Economic Freedom of the World’ study. The guide also lists accountants, consultants and lawyers. It covers conference facilities, libraries and international schools. There are headings such as: ‘Foreigners are free to invest’, ‘Baltic free trade’ and ‘Foreign land ownership’. Under ‘Business Connections’ you find the American Chamber of Commerce, European Community Phare Programme, UNDP, IMF, and finally BritBalt which offers to locate business partners, arrange accommodation and ‘generally assist’. Although there is a certain variation between the cities – the Minsk business section is, for instance, relatively much thinner and more like a regular business directory – it is the similarity that is emphasized. The business sections, written in English, are on the World Wide Web. They offer a chronicle of economic globalization in the various cities. By doing so, they in turn facilitate globalization. Every city should have its management consultants and international schools, and In Your Pocket will help you find them.

Filling Out the Blanks

Kern (1983:34) describes how human consciousness expanded across space in the period 1880–1914. New technologies made it possible to read about distant places in the newspaper, see them in movies, and travel more widely. It was also the period when the exploration of uncharted territory came to an end. There were no more blank spaces on the map. One hundred years later, after the end of the Cold War, there was a new sense of discovery of the Baltic Sea region.

No, you have not missed the boat. Although the boom years of phenomenal returns on investment are over in Estonia, it’s not too late to take advantage of this growing market.

The quote is the opening sentence of In Your Pocket’s ‘How to do Business in Estonia’ section. The starting point for In Your Pocket was that it was ‘impossible to find anything’ at the time (Hassan e-mail). Street names were constantly changing; there were no phone books. In 1992 In Your Pocket was quite simply the first to fill out the blanks; the guide had no serious competitor.16

16 What is meant by ‘filling out the blanks”? The term seems to presuppose a norm or model, assuming a normal and perhaps standardized and global way of life. I should probably be more explicit, but it is extremely difficult to define ‘normal’. Despite the problem, I still find the metaphor useful in this context.
Ballad also tried to take advantage of post-communist openness for region-building purposes. Its idea was to stimulate networking and encounters by providing new information tools. Shock tourists, finally, embarked on eastward journeys in the nineties partly for the simple reason that new areas opened for tourists.

Steven Sampson (1998:154) has pointed out that the transition following 1989 was about traffic in resources, people, discourses and symbols: ‘Capital and “projects” move from West to East as investment, together with accompanying Western specialists /…/ Even the word “transition” itself is part of the traffic, as are other key words such as ”Europe” and ”mafia.”’ This, however, was more than a decade ago, and according to Sampson, things have begun to change. There is increased respect for abstract law and principles and a new, specifically East European identity is taking shape. This, Sampson argues, represents a post-transition stage – a stage of post-post-communism.17

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Period</th>
<th>West for Easterners</th>
<th>East for Westerners</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Communism</td>
<td>Enemy/ideal</td>
<td>enemy/ideal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>post-communism</td>
<td>Shocking encounters (artifacts)</td>
<td>Shocking encounters (tourism)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Post-post communism</td>
<td>normality (structural presence)</td>
<td>Normality (future EU members)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4 builds on Sampson’s periodization. Post-communism gave Easterners access to Western commodities and Westerners the opportunity to discover the East as tourists. In post-post-communism the structures of the West enter the East in full force, and this happens in the context of globalization. The shock of the new is gradually replaced by a sense of normality.18

Is this alleged move from post-communism to post-post-communism visible on the three web sites? Let us start with an In Your Pocket flashback, excerpts from the first issues.

Foreign newspapers are hard to find in Lithuania. Even the Parliament, Government and the Ministries have to share one set of foreign

---

17 This can be compared with Neumann (1999:112) who concludes that the dominant representation of Russia is ‘as a learner that is forever just about to make the transition into Europe’. It is interesting how this seems to have been transferred to other Easterners; everyone is going through transition, though perhaps not quite as perpetually as the Russians.

18 It should be pointed out that the ‘normality’ concept was used many times as a slogan in 1989 revolutionary discourse, perhaps especially by Solidarity in Poland. Habermas (1991:45-48) discusses this shortage of innovative ideas and how revolutionary demands took their strength from human rights discourses. The people of the East demanded their share of the normality that the West represented.
During the bloody events of January 1991, the technicians in Parliament converted an FM emitter into a television emitter. For over a year now they have been transmitting Western programs from the Astra satellite (In Your Pocket, Issue No 1, May-June 1992).

Kitchens usually close early. After 20:00 you will often find it difficult to find a proper hot meal or even get into a restaurant whatever opening time is indicated on the door. Doormen, waiters and administrators will try to convince you that their empty restaurant is actually "full, reserved" or "about to close" (In Your Pocket, Issue No 3, Sep-Oct 1992).

Even in the most prestigious hotel you will most likely be left in the cold this winter as the energy crisis worsens. Due to the staggering prices of Russian fuel the government has decided to limit hot water supplies to weekends only. It might get worse (In Your Pocket, Issue No 4, Nov 92-Jan 93).

In the fall of 1999, one could read the following in the In Your Pocket index:

Percentage of hotels listed in our first issue still in operation: 55.5.
Percentage of eating establishments still around: 34.
Foreign representations in Vilnius at first printing: 14, Now: 23.

Foreign newspapers are now available, in the streets as well as online. Hot meals are served in the evenings and the energy crisis has passed. Vilnius is clearly not the same as when In Your Pocket started. How much of this change is In Your Pocket itself accountable for? What difference does it make to have a guide publishing reviews and phone numbers? On the Web it is fairly simple: what is not listed does not exist. In Your Pocket wrote the cities into being in cyberspace. What difference does it make for the locals, the people who actually live in these cities? I asked Matthias Lüfkens, one of the In Your Pocket founders, about his view on the guide’s impact.

The impact of Vilnius In Your Pocket was and still is enormous given the guide is the only one in Vilnius. In the early days restaurants wanted to know "why we wanted their address or opening times?" not understanding the importance of a free listing. Today any restaurant, bar, hotel which is not listed in Vilnius In Your Pocket simply doesn’t exist (in the eyes of the In Your Pocket reader that is). In my humble opinion we also created a new tourist attraction by mentioning the "resting place" of the Lenin and Stalin statues in the Monumental art workshop in Vilnius (Lüfken e-mail).
Hassan, the current director, has a similar perspective:

I’d like to think that we’ve helped raise the general level of the hospitality industry in Vilnius significantly: good places get more business, bad places get revealed and go bust quicker. I’m generally happier with the service in Vilnius than I am in many of the other cities where we are newer, and I’d like to think we’ve played a part in that (Hassan e-mail).

The key to the success of In Your Pocket is probably – apart from the fact that it started in the East, in the ‘blank areas’ of the map of globalization - its reputation for accuracy. In Your Pocket people are not supposed to accept free meals in exchange for good reviews; they are supposed to practice old-fashioned journalistic ethics. On the other hand, they do not have any explicit ‘public service’, ‘networking’ or ‘democracy building’ goals. I would, however, suggest that In Your Pocket, apart from being a journalistic product with all that that entails, should be interpreted as a globalizer and an actor in what Sampson (1998:167) calls system export. At its core are various Western ideologies and practices such as ‘time-is-money’, ‘transparent accounting procedures’ and ‘team-building’. System export is abstract and involves a specific language (the examples Sampson provides are ‘human resources’ for people and ‘capacity building’ for doing your job). Only those who are familiar with the key words have access to the resources. An unintended consequence of the system export is the emergence of a cosmopolitan identity among staff members. In Your Pocket can, in my view, be seen as a project in itself, but it also serves as a facilitator of other potential projects, not least through its business sections.

The founders of In Your Pocket were all Westerners ‘out to conquer the world.’ What about the people they hired to work with them? The site lists 50 staff members: the four founders, five ‘gone but not forgotten’ and the 41 members of the 1999 team. Below are three examples from the 1999 category:

Inga Ausekle (Latvian, 01.06.76, Ad manager/Riga In Your Pocket®)
Now studying for her masters in business at the University of Latvia, Inga Ausekle has also studied at the University of Wisconsin Au Claire and worked for EU PHARE programme. She enjoys hot air ballooning.

Kirke Raud (21, Estonian, Ad manager/Tallinn In Your Pocket®)
Kirke came back from four months in Italy fluent in the language and full of ideas for how to develop tourism in Estonia. Even her long, active workdays can’t wear her out, so she uses up her extra energy rollerblading and dancing.
Adrian Ojog (10-10-76, Romanian, Distribution manager, Bucharest In Your Pocket®) Life is one big adventure for Adrian, who enjoys revving up his car and swerving between Bucharest’s infamous potholes and policemen. Apart from getting the guides to the readers, we occasionally use him to climb across our fourth-floor downtown balcony to open the door from the outside.

Fifty staff members and fourteen nationalities. The ‘oldies’ (four founders plus the five not forgotten) were, with two exceptions, Westerners. At the time of the study, most offices were still run by Westerners, but they were now in minority. The average age of the 1999 team was 25; the Westerners were generally older than the locals. Judging from their self-presentations, In Your Pocket people are young, well educated, sophisticated, successful and cosmopolitan. This brings to mind Zygmunt Bauman’s description of the global elite: ‘[at] all times they tended to create a culture of their own which made little of the same borders that held fast for lesser folk; they had more in common with the elites across the borders than with the rest of the population inside them.’ (Bauman 1998:12). Do the web sites function, then, as Western ‘democracy-export’ projects?

The project setting is one where different identity structures of pan-Europeanism, Occidentalism and Orientalism meet. This is particularly true of projects to export democracy and civil society. The project structure, with its inherent inequalities and tensions, can turn even the best of intentions into a reproduction of Orientalist and Occidentalist discourse (Sampson 1998, 170).

Paternalism is often reproduced in projects to export democracy. The Easterners are given neither the autonomy nor the information needed to run organizations. The actual outcome is not democracy but ‘project thinking’. It is very hard to avoid treating democracy export targets as patients. Ballad has a semi-official, benevolent flavor to it and could be described as suffering from some of the same problems as the post-communist democracy and civil society building projects that Sampson analyses. It is saved from making the worst blunders by its focus on matchmaking (as opposed to enlightenment), and by its relative stability.

What about the tone of the sites’ descriptions of the regions?

After two hours of fairly drab and flat farmland, albeit with the odd sighting of a bucolic church or a farmer on a draft horse driven carriage, the train pulled into Kraków. More cement ugliness on its outskirts, and the bed and breakfast I checked into that night had all the glamour of a washing line in a retirement home.
Is this *Shock Tourism*? No, this is actually taken from an *In Your Pocket* weekly feature article by Scott Alexander Young, the Crakow *In Your Pocket* editor. The shock tourists express shock at experiences that are probably shared by many Western tourists visiting the post-communist East. But as far as East-West encounters in the Baltic Sea region are concerned, the heyday of shock tourism seems to be coming to an end. When asked why the *Shock Tourism* site had not been updated for months, Thorsell replied that the Swedish market for shock stories has been saturated. There are still shock tourists around, but Thorsell himself has been too busy on other projects. As we have already seen, Thorsell plans to release a new version of the site, this time in English only. Another novelty is a note, ‘Some last words’, where he explains that there are dramatic changes going on, especially in the Baltic countries, and that things aren’t really that bad: ‘it’s just that I have concentrated myself to find horrofying (sic!) or strange places with a cult status.’ Thorsell ends the note by saying that it is important to respect people who live in shocking environments and that a few locals have complained about the bad publicity *Shock Tourism* gives their country. Why this new section? To clarify that ‘we don’t go to shocking places and laugh at people, on the contrary, that’s where we meet the nicest people.’ The page is illustrated with a picture of ‘friendly Russians in Moscow’.

How to explain this normalization? Let us return to the *In Your Pocket* piece on Crakow. Here is the end of the sentence that was cut short above:

/…/ but, after a quick stroll into the Old Town, my spirits were somewhat restored. I found a cybercafé just a minute from the oldest medieval square in Europe and tore off emails to my friends in the west, surrounded by a veritable Babel’s tower of languages and accents. There were tourists everywhere, and ‘the season’ hadn’t even started /…/

The author is reassured when he discovers a cybercafé, a global island in the East.

**Conclusion**

*In Your Pocket*, the *Shock Tourism* site and *Ballad* each took advantage of the window of opportunity post-communism offered. The Baltic Sea region had for a long time been closed for East-West traffic and when it first started to open up, shock of the new was the immediate reaction. It seemed almost natural that the focus of all three web sites should be on the East, where most of the blank spots on the map of globalization were.

John Urry (1998) has argued that the public sphere has been transformed into a global public stage where the media produces shame. Most vulnerable to this global scrutiny are the actors (be it Shell, Britney Spears or Andersen
Consulting) who possess a global brand. *In Your Pocket* and the *Shock Tourism* site can be said to participate in a process of global shaming, through reviews and shock pictures. This is not necessarily a bad thing; it can be seen as consumer pressure, a form of citizenship. Bad restaurants get bad publicity. Guidebooks, reviews, or journalism are not new phenomena. It is the global scale and the method (interactive and hyper-linked) that make it a novelty.

All three sites present and frame the Baltic Sea region through a global medium and in the language of globalization. Shock tourists can be seen as extreme examples of what Zygmunt Bauman (1998) calls global tourists. In Bauman’s view, the freedom to move is an important stratifying factor. To be local is a sign of social deprivation, imprisonment even. The global elite is a remote royalty (here represented by the shock tourists and to some degree also the *In Your Pocket* writers) that guides and seduces through the display of extravagant tastes. To watch the elite is a form of consumerism. This is how the shock tourists initially got attention, by sticking out. However, shock cannot last, especially not if we are to believe Bauman’s description of how mankind, in the age of global consumerism, has become ‘easily excitable’ and is capable of ‘equally easily losing interest.’ So, what comes after shock? Normality, and today there are indeed signs of something new, of what one (for lack of a better term) may describe as a post-post-communist phase. *In Your Pocket* expands to the West. Shock tourists start to talk about friendly Russians.

In the beginning of the article I pointed to the similarity between post-communist jargon about the ‘Wild East’ and cyber-hype about new virtual realities to conquer. Although I acknowledge that the presence of the Net can at times make a real difference, I do not mean to exaggerate the impact of the web sites. Something that I have not examined here (except for the passages on co-production through postings, etc.) is the user perspective. Ultimately, this is what the impact comes down to. *In Your Pocket* and *Ballad* participate in system export. The web version of *In Your Pocket* and *Ballad* also offer arenas where cities, states, and to a certain extent also cultures, can be compared. 19 Comparison (which city is the coolest and most visitable, which potential partner has the highest potential?) is closely related to standardization and thus to globalization. Web sites like *In Your Pocket* simultaneously produce cultural difference and structural similarity, but of course only to the extent that they are consulted. The same goes for *Ballad’s* banal regionalism. Certain actors and certain issues are highlighted at certain times. It is in *Ballad’s* region-building interest to disseminate a certain identity for the region, but its success depends entirely on whether people are interested.

In conclusion: the sites are active in reproducing both local regional identity, and the Western view of the East. But in neither case is it as simple as either

---

19 This is something that makes it different from the paper version of *In Your Pocket*. 202
‘creating the Other’, or ‘contributing to democracy, prosperity, and understanding’. The sites teach us about post-post-communism, as well as about ourselves, and our ability to use cyber geography to visualize and create new areas and peoples. My final point is specifically concerned with geography. The focus of the web sites is, as we have seen, on the eastern part of the Baltic Sea region, which to shock tourists undoubtedly equals East. Still, by juxtaposing the three sites, one gets a sense that there are no sharp Baltic Sea region borders. Cyber geography is variable. So where is the post-post-communist gap? Between East and West, South and North, or between the local and the global? Do they in fact overlap in East-South-local versus West-North-global constellations? No, it is not as neat and simple as that, especially since the global, for instance, can be found in the East as well as in the West.

A note on methodology
When selecting the sites I had three main search criteria, first of all that the sites should cover several Baltic Sea region states. I wanted to avoid the official (state tourist information sites) and the old (only post-communist phenomena!). It should also be pointed out that I started out by using English search terms; the conclusions would most likely be different if I had picked Russian, Latvian or Icelandic language sites. No web site is the other like, this is also true for In Your Pocket, Ballad and the Shock Tourist site. I let the research questions guide me when choosing what to analyze on the sites. This is an eclectic, exploratory and intuitive approach with parallels to traditional ethnography. The researcher usually starts out with open observation and then gradually focuses on more narrow aspects. I read letters from the readers, did a survey of staff member profiles, performed site search engine searches and used email interviews. The latter was very convenient, especially since some of the informants lived in other countries and since email interviews don’t require transcription – they are textual from the start. This brings me to citation policy. Web quotes have in the article been left in original; e-mails have been lightly edited for typos/spelling, and, in the Swedish language cases, translated.
Bibliography


Web sites

*Ballad* www.ballad.org (consulted 990912).

In Your Pocket www.inyourpocket.com (consulted 990912).

Shock Tourism www.outdoor.se/artiklar/chock (consulted 990912).

NUA: www.nua.ie/surveys/how_many_online/europe.html (consulted 990903).

E-mail interviews
Erixon David, VD, Doberman Digital Agency AB, 990912.
Hassan Kamal, Director of UAB In Your Pocket, 990921, 991012.
Larsson Mika, Creator, Ballad, 990928.
Lüfkens Matthias, Founder, In Your Pocket, 990916.
Thorsell Anders, Editor, Shock tourism, 990913, 990921.
About Our Contributors

Alexander Cavalieratos has studied history at Södertörns högskola and is currently completing his education as a Gymnasium teacher in Art and History. His B-uppsats concerned the Swedish government’s registration of Roma during the Second World War; a shortened version of his kandidatuppsats appears in this volume; his qualifying paper in teacher education concerned the image of Arabic and Chinese history in contemporary Swedish high-school textbooks. He has also studied at the Institute of Advanced Art Studies of St Luc in Brussels and at Stockholm’s Konstfack. He is author of “Mediebilder och historiska bilder” in Jalla! Nu klär vi granen, edited by Gufran Al-Nadaf (Stockholm 2002), and has, together with journalist Edna Eriksson, lectured on the creation of the Other at the Stockholm’s Ethnographic Museum (January 2002) and at a Teachers’ Continuing Education in Jönköping (October 2002). Cavalieratos has also complemented his academic education with work as a guide at Stockholm’s Army Museum and as a cartoonist and illustrator. His last cartoon series, “De elaka små djuren i skogen”, appeared in Galago, 2002:2.
Email: cavalieratos@swipnet.se

Madeleine Hurd is Lecturer in History at Södertörns högskola. After receiving her Ph.D. from Harvard University in 1993, she worked, until 1998, as Assistant Professor for the University of Pittsburgh. Her publications include Public Spheres, Public Mores, and Democracy in Hamburg and Stockholm, 1870–1914 (Univ. of Michigan, 2000); her recent work has been done as a member of the Södertörn högskola project group Media Societies Around the Baltic Sea, in which context she has published, among other things, “Class, Masculinity, Manners and Mores: Public Space and Public Spheres in Modern Europe”, Social Science History (Spring 2000) and “Reasonable Speakers, Those Who Can’t Talk: Defining People In and Out of the Public Sphere in Pre-War Prussian Poland”, in Storylines: Media, Power and Identity in Modern Europe, eds. Madeleine Hurd, Tom Olsson, and Patrik Åker (2002). Her next project will continue to focus on the logics of communication and systems of representation that inform different genres of media, as well as different discourse communities, with special attention to methods of normalization and exclusion.
Email: madeleine.hurd@sh.se

Kajsa Klein is completing a Ph.D. in Media and Communication at Stockholm University. Her undergraduate background is in East European studies. She participated in the Media Societies Around the Baltic Sea project between 1998–1999 (during which time most of the research for the article in this volume was completed). Klein was a contributing member of the Demokratitutredning (SOU; 1999:117) and a project member of Digital Borderlands: as such, she co-edited Digital Borderlands: Cultural Studies of Identity and Interactivity on the Internet with Johan Fornäss, Martina Ladendorf, Jenny Sundén and Malin Sveningsson (New York: Peter Lang Publishing, 2002). She dances raqs sharqi Egyptian style and is interested in theories about world citizenship and in different kinds of mediated action. Email: klein@jmk.su.se
Sanjin Kovacevic was born in Sarajevo, Bosnia and Hercegovina. His high-school studies (in natural sciences and chemistry) in Mostar were interrupted by the war. Kovacevic spent the following two years “moving around” (as he puts it) between Bosnia, Slovenia, and Germany, before settling in Sweden. Here, he began high-school afresh, with focus on the social sciences and on languages. He then enrolled in Södertörn’s program Culture, Society, History. His B-uppsats, co-authored with Elin Vadelius, was entitled “The Soviet Invasion of Afghanistan: A Study of the Positions Taken to the Invasion by Norrbottens Kuriren and Norrskensflamman”. A shortened version of his kandidatuppsats is included in this volume. He plans to continue his research, both at the D-level in history, and, if possible, at graduate level, on the media’s (newspapers’, radio, and television’s) construction of ethnic and religious minorities in Sweden, Germany and the Balkans, as well as multi-cultural encounters between “our” continent and the world.

Email sanjin_76@hotmail.com

Kerstin Olofsson is Lecturer in Russian at Södertörns högskola. She received her Ph.D. in contemporary Russian literature at Stockholm University in 1988. As a member of the project Media Societies Around the Baltic Sea (1998–2002), she studied Russia’s cultural debate on perestroika and on the post-Soviet era; one of her foci was the Russian intelligentsia. She has presented her findings at various conferences, and has written “The Cultural Debate on Abolishing Censorship” in Russian Reports: Studies in Post-communist Transformations of Media and Journalism (2000), “‘We’ and ’They’ in the Russian Press” in Media Societies 2000 (2002), some minor articles, as well as the article in this volume. She plans to continue the study of contemporary Russian culture in the project The Portrayal of Men and Women in Contemporary Russian Prose.

Email: kerstin.olofsson@sh.se

Christian Widholm has taken 80 points in history, and 50 in Political Science, at Södertörns högskola. His kandidatuppsats concerned the creation and re-creation of collective identities in Swedish daily newspapers (conservative, social-democratic and socialist) in connection with the Army Bill proposed in 1901, the dissolution of the Union in 1905 and the collection of warship money in 1912. A shortened version of his magisteruppsats appears in this volume. While studying Political Science Widholm worked on gender aspects of modern Swedish political party programs and on the paradigms of masculinity to be found in Dagen Nyheter’s analysis of the bombing of Afghanistan after September 11th, 2001. Widholm is currently writing a doctoral thesis at Lund University, in which he discusses Swedish newspapers’ construction of masculinity around public events (e.g., the Olympics) in the years immediately preceding the First World War. His thesis is especially concerned with Swedish discourses and semiotics of nationalism, class struggle, militarism, colonial rivalry and social darwinism.

Email: Christian.widholm@hist.lu.se
Encounters

Representations of the Others in Modern European History

This anthology utilizes the concept of encounters to investigate the linked constructions of identity and difference in modern European history. The articles use representations of others to ask basic questions about identity: how is the encountered group described, and what does this description say about the observer and about the cultural group and discourse that the observer represents?

The studies span 150 years and a wide geographical area (Germany, the U.S., Sweden and Russia). Importantly, they also demonstrate how descriptions of the “other” vary according to the media used. The form in which the representation is placed – in novels, travel literature, websites, newspapers or World Fairs – affects the way in which its messages on identity and otherness are conceptualised and conveyed. These articles, thus, not only present insights into how the discourses of, e.g., race, Orientalism, educational, gender and class hierarchies affect concepts of “us and the others”. They also show how the medium functions as an integral part of that message.

The book is written by a range of authors ranging from advanced students to professors. It is, accordingly, aimed not only at experts in the field, but also those starting out in identity and cultural studies – serving both as a textbook, and as a work for seasoned scholars looking for recent and innovative investigations in the field of identity studies.